
5.0 DRAFT SECTION 4(f) EVALUATION

The purpose of this section is to analyze the potentially adverse impacts of the Practical Build Alternatives on sites that are potentially regulated by Section 4(f) of the Department of Transportation Act of 1966. Section 4(f) sites include public parks, recreation lands, wildlife and waterfowl refuges, and historic sites. The six sites evaluated in this section all fall under the classification of potential 4(f) sites.

Section 4(f) states that no highway project should be approved which requires the “use” of any publicly owned land from a public park, recreation area, wildlife and waterfowl refuge, or historic site unless there is no feasible or prudent alternative to the use of such land. In addition, adverse impacts to these 4(f) sites must include all possible planning to minimize harm resulting from such use. This Section 4(f) evaluation provides facts about each site to determine whether there are prudent and feasible alternatives to the use of the site, and to identify measures to minimize harm. In the context of Section 4(f), “use” can be either a direct impact (taking of property), or a “constructive use”, which may not actually require acquisition of land, but otherwise impairs the function of the resource through changes in access or surroundings.

5.1 Proposed Action

The Michigan Department of Transportation (MDOT) is studying improvements to US-131 between the Indiana Toll Road in Elkhart County, Indiana, and a point one mile north of Cowling Road in St. Joseph County, Michigan. On this 17-mile segment of US-131, the existing road varies between two-lane, four-lane, and four-lane divided/boulevard cross-sections. Motorists experience a variety of roadway inefficiencies that vary by type and location throughout the project corridor. **Section 1.0, Purpose of and Need for a Proposed Action** discusses the proposed action in detail. The Practical Alternatives are illustrated in **Appendix E** at the back of this document, and on an aerial photographic base on **Figure 4.10 (sheets 1-4)** at the end of **Section 4.0**.

5.2 Purpose of and Need for a Proposed Action

As noted in **Section 1.0, Purpose of and Need for a Proposed Action**, the purpose of this study is to identify potential alternatives that: 1) support the safe and efficient movement of goods and people, and that 2) cost effectively support the economic growth of the region and the State, by improving traffic operations within the study corridor. The needs are to improve US-131 highway system operations, assure sufficient capacity to accommodate future traffic growth, and improve roadway inefficiencies.

5.3 Alternatives Considered

The alternatives evaluation process has already followed many steps:

- Preliminary corridor study
- Illustrative Alternatives
- No-Build and low cost alternatives (including Transportation System Management, multi-modal alternatives, etc.)

- Preliminary alignments
- Initial Practical Alternatives screening
- Development of Practical Alternatives found in the Draft Environmental Impact Statement (DEIS).

A detailed discussion of all of the alternatives considered in this project, including alternatives no longer under consideration, is found in **Section 2.0, Alternatives Considered**. At this stage, six Practical Alternatives (PA-1, PA-2, PA-3, PA-4, PA-5, and PA-5 Modified) are under consideration, along with the No-Build Alternative. The six Practical Build Alternatives vary by alignment, cross-section, and access-control. They are described in greater detail in **Section 2.0, Alternatives Considered** and are depicted in **Appendix E**.

5.4 Section 4(f) Resources

A complete description of existing public parks, recreation areas, wildlife and waterfowl refuges, and historic sites is given in **Sections 3.21, Cultural Resources** and **3.22, Parks and Recreation**. The proposed action has potential impacts on five historic sites, and one historic and recreational site (the Wahbememe Memorial Park). Refer to **Sections 4.21, Cultural Resource Impacts** and **4.22, Parks and Recreation Impacts** for more detail. An archaeological survey will be completed upon the selection of a Recommended Alternative. MDOT will coordinate with the State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) regarding any potential avoidance, minimization, and mitigation measures that may be necessary for affected resources encountered. The following discussion gives a detailed description of each historic site and the elements of which contributed to their designation of being on, or potentially eligible for, the National Register of Historic Places (NRHP).

To be eligible for the NRHP, properties typically must be at least 50 years old, remain fairly unaltered, and meet one or more of the National Register criteria for significance as follows:

- A) Property is associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history.
- B) Property is associated with the lives of persons significant in our past.
- C) Property embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction or represents the work of a master, or possesses high artistic values, or represents a significant and distinguishable entity whose components lack individual distinction.
- D) Property has yielded, or is likely to yield, information important in prehistory or history.

5.4.1 Site A - Michigan State Police Post, White Pigeon

The Michigan State Police (MSP) Post, located at the north east corner of US-131 and US-12, is one of just a dozen surviving posts constructed as a Works Progress Administration (WPA) project. Of the initial 24 posts constructed as WPA projects, six were at new locations, and the remaining 18, including White Pigeon, replaced old and unsuitable buildings. The location of this property relative to the Practical Alternatives is found in **Figure 4.2**.

The MSP was formed in 1917 with their initial posts located in vacant houses. In 1928 the MSP erected their first major building, which inspired a desire to develop uniformity in design for all posts. It was felt that a single building design would permit Michigan residents and out-of-state visitors to quickly identify the local police barracks and offices. In 1931, state funds were used to construct the prototype police post and barracks in Traverse City. Unfortunately, due to the severe economic pressure of the times, funding for continuation of the program was limited. An answer to the funding problem was found in the federally funded WPA program (the WPA was an active program from 1935 to 1943). A proposal was made to the WPA for the construction of police posts across the state.



Figure 5.1 Michigan State Police Post

MSP post locations were carefully selected. Demographic factors, such as crime rates, traffic volume on major highways, seasonal tourist influxes and the availability of local police protection in rural towns, resort areas, agricultural belts, and industrial centers were all considered in site selection.

The MSP Post at White Pigeon is a medium-size post containing 2,250 square feet including three offices, accommodations for 10 officers, a recreation room, a storage room, and a garage for up to six cars. Other examples of this post type are located at St. Clair, Centerline, Flat Rock, Ypsilanti, Keego Harbor, East Tawas, Flint, Blissfield, Jonesville, Battle Creek, Mt. Pleasant, Grand Haven, Cheboygan, Alpena, Manistee, St. Ignace, and Iron Mountain.

The White Pigeon brick WPA building was completed in 1936 (**Figure 5.1**). Since its construction, there have been relatively few changes. The only major exterior changes have been the replacement of the front door and original casement windows. The current front door retains the sidelight configuration, but the wood frame door was replaced with a commercial glass and metal door. Since 1978, the multi-light casement windows have been replaced with a combination of double hung windows on the front façade, with fixed and awning lights utilized on the side facades. After 1980, the use of the upper floors of the post as a barracks was discontinued and the rooms were converted into offices. The garage was also converted into a combination communications center and exercise room.

The MSP Post in White Pigeon is eligible for listing on the NRHP under Criterion A for its association with the broad patterns of our history. This is based on the important role the post has played in the history of the MSP and its establishment as a recognizable presence at the junction of two major transportation routes, as well as its association with the WPA. The post is also eligible under NRHP Criterion C. Although minor exterior changes have been made to the building, it retains a high level of its original architectural integrity, and stands as a distinctive representative of a type and period of construction.

5.4.2 Site B - Wahbememe Memorial Park, White Pigeon

The one acre Wahbememe Memorial Park, located in the northwest quadrant of the existing intersection of US-131 and US-12 in the Village of White Pigeon, is a roadway pull-off with a monument (**Figure 5.2**), a parking area, a picnic table, two benches, and an historic marker. There are no active recreational facilities within the park. The site is listed on the NRHP. The location of this park relative to the Practical Alternatives is found in **Figure 4.2**.



Figure 5.2 Chief Wahbememe Monument

According to the St. Joseph County Park and Recreation Master Plan 2000-2005, the property is currently owned by the county and maintained by the neighboring Welders Supply and Gas, with the County Parks and Recreation Commission only performing limited repairs and oversight of the property.

The plan notes that according to legend, in the 1830s, Chief White Pigeon [Wahbememe] was on a hunting trip near Detroit when he heard of a brewing Indian uprising and plans to attack settlers. He ran all the way to White Pigeon in two days. After delivering his message, he collapsed and died from his exertions. In 1909, the Alba Columba Club installed a monument at the Chief's burial site.

The Wahbememe Memorial Park is a Section 4(f) site for both historic and recreational value. In addition to the listing on the NRHP, it provides a passive recreational function, with one acre of open space, two benches, and a picnic table.

Public access to the site currently is provided from existing US-131. Wayfinding signage to the site is generally poor.

It does not appear that the park is heavily used by either the surrounding communities or travelers passing through on either US-12 or US-131.

5.4.3 Site C - 63280 US-131, Constantine

The property at 63280 US-131 was originally the farmstead of John Gibson, who arrived in the area around 1849, became a prominent figure in the Constantine area farming community. The location of this house relative to the Practical Alternatives is found in **Figure 4.3**. The Gibsons worked hard to make their farm one of the showplaces of the county. The elegant Gothic Revival house (**Figure 5.3**), constructed ca. 1860, was also highly regarded by the community. It wasn't until the mid-1930s that the farm was sold outside the family, ending almost 90 years of Gibson ownership of the property.



Figure 5.3 Gibson Farmhouse

In 1936 a fire destroyed a large barn with all of its equipment and eight smaller buildings

on the farmstead. Due to the brick construction of the house and its slate roof, the house was spared from the fire.

In 1939, with the farm now under new ownership, a new barn was constructed on the foundation of the original barn. The 1939 Rural Property Inventory (RPI) completed for the farm also noted two concrete silos, each constructed in 1932 and in good condition. Additional construction included a new milk house and a second barn parallel to the site of the original barn in the 1940s. The pole barn west of the house, which originally served as a machinery/tool shed, was erected in the 1960s.

The Gibson family was important to the community for their farming efforts on their extensive agricultural holdings, as well as being involved in real estate development and banking. The house on the Gibson farm property is therefore eligible for inclusion on the NRHP under Criteria A and B. The property's significance is derived from its association with the broad patterns of settlement and a person significant in our past. The house, a well-maintained example of the Gothic Revival style, is also potentially eligible for the NRHP under Criterion C for its embodiment of the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction.

While the present outbuildings are at least 50 years old, as is typically required for inclusion on the NRHP, they are not considered eligible for listing. Constructed in the late 1930s following the devastating fire that destroyed all of the farms original outbuildings, the present structures lack any association with the time period when the property was held by the Gibson family. Although representative of the agricultural efforts of the community, other, more complete farms in the area survive and are better representatives of farming from the late 1930s through 1950. Therefore, the farm (exclusive of the house) is not considered eligible under NRHP Criterion A. Furthermore, none of the outbuildings exhibit the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction to be eligible under NRHP Criterion C.

5.4.4 Site E - 62249 US-131, Constantine

The property at 62249 US-131 is currently the farm and residence of Ernest A. Willman. The location of this property relative to the Practical Alternatives is found in **Figure 4.5**. The farm was established by George W. Hamilton ca. 1870, a second generation Constantine Township resident. George's father, John Hamilton, was recognized as an industrious farmer and was respected throughout the community, eventually serving a term as a Michigan State Representative beginning in 1879. Although the date the farm was established by George W. Hamilton is unknown, a house was present on the land owned by John Hamilton in 1872.

Although little information on the early farm buildings is available, the 1939 RPI provides some information. The house was described as having a stone foundation, brick walls, and a patent shingle gable roof (**Figure 5.4**). The farm included a general purpose barn, another barn, a chicken coop, and a pair of corn cribs. The condition of all the outbuildings was indicated to be poor, with the exception of one corn crib that was described as in fair condition. The date



Figure 5.4 Hamilton/Willman Farmhouse

recorded on the RPI for the house is 1860 and the two main barns as 1862. The house is architecturally typical of homes constructed a decade later (ca. 1870) suggesting that the RPI dates are wrong.

Most of the original buildings noted on the RPI survive today (**Figure 5.5**). The exception is one of the corn cribs, which was demolished between 1939 and 1954 when the RPI was updated. Additional buildings were also constructed on the farmstead. The first major addition to the farm came in the 1940s with the addition of a second barn perpendicular to the original. The new barn includes a small milk house at the northwest corner. In support of his dairy business, Mr. Willman, the current owner, constructed a pole barn east of the dairy barn to provide shelter for the dairy herd, and eventually added four silos, three of which were Harvestores, and a silo house. The most recent addition to the property, made within the last 20 years, is a large pole barn situated immediately east of the house and used for machine storage.



Figure 5.5 Hamilton/Willman Farm Buildings

Ernest Willman has owned and operated the farm for the past 50 years. Once a large dairy operation, the Willman's discontinued the dairy operation in 1962 when they switched to raising beef. Mr. Willman continues to farm the property and raises some sheep and a couple of race horses.

The Hamilton/Willman farmstead is eligible for listing on the NRHP under both Criteria A and C. The determination of eligibility is based on the long association of the property with an important member of the farming community in Constantine. The farm, which continues its agricultural function, retains elements from each of its major periods of farming. These include its original function as a family farm, its use as a dairy farm and for subsequent beef production, and its current focus on field crops. Although the house has undergone some alterations, including enclosure of the porches and conversion of the rear portion to a garage, it retains the ornamental elements and simple form of the original Italianate style Gabled Ell farmhouse.

5.4.5 Site F - 15303 W. Broadway, Three Rivers

The property at 15303 W. Broadway was identified in the initial reconnaissance of above-ground resources as being potentially eligible for listing on the NRHP. An intensive level investigation has not been performed as of the date of this Draft, but will be completed prior to the Final Environmental Impact Statement, pending further investigation. The property at 15303 W. Broadway is a former farm located on the south side of West Broadway, west of US-131. The location of this property relative to the Practical Alternatives is found in **Figure 4.6**.

The property consists of the house (**Figure 5.6**), a gambrel roof style barn (**Figure 5.7**), a small shed, and a garage erected ca. 1960 that does not contribute to the significance of the property. The house is potentially significant as a well-preserved brick example of the Greek Revival where the great majority of examples of Greek Revival houses in the study area have been severely altered. The entire property has been recommended for further research.



Figure 5.6 Greek Revival Style House



Figure 5.7 Gambrel Roof Barn

5.4.6 Site G - 59019 US-131, Three Rivers

The property at 59019 US-131 was identified in the initial reconnaissance of above ground resources as being potentially eligible for listing on the NRHP. An intensive level investigation has not been performed as of the date of this Draft. During the site visit on August 22, 2002, the SHPO requested additional data regarding the date the building was constructed and the initial use of the building. A final determination of eligibility will be made prior to the Final Environmental Impact Statement.

The property at 59019 US-131 is located at the southwest corner of US-131 and M-60 on the outskirts of Three Rivers. The building is a simple version of an Art Moderne factory which is characteristic of the style popular between 1930 and 1945 (**Figure 5.8**). The building features a smooth brick front façade with rounded corners. The windows, evenly spaced across the front façade, have been replaced with black shaded glass and a single rounded awning added above each major section of windows. The utilitarian factory portion of the building has four large barrel vaulted elements placed side-by-side, with later concrete block sections added to the north, east, and south facades.



Figure 5.8 Art Moderne Factory Building at 59019 US-131, Three Rivers

5.5 Impacts to Section 4(f) Resources

5.5.1 Site A - Michigan State Police Post, White Pigeon

PA-1, PA-5, and PA-5 MOD will not have any direct effect on the MSP Post in White Pigeon since the existing five-lane cross section will remain as part of the proposed improvement with no additional widening. Therefore, access to the post will remain as it is today, with one entrance on US-131, and one entrance on US-12. Based upon a preliminary assessment, noise levels associated with the 2025 traffic volumes will not approach or exceed noise abatement criteria at the post building (NAC "C", 72 dBA), based on the building's current usage.

PA-2 will require the demolition of the MSP Post building, as well as acquisition of the entire parcel for right-of-way purposes.

PA-3, and PA-4 do not have any direct impact to the MSP Post in White Pigeon, as the entire US-131 corridor will be realigned a half mile to the west. An indirect impact will result from removing the designation of US-131 from the existing highway and moving it to the new alignment. One of the original criteria for selecting this post location was the fact that it was at the intersection of two major routes, which will no longer be that case with either PA-3 or PA-4. However, access from the post to US-12 will remain unchanged, and a full interchange will be provided at US-12, providing easy access to either highway for the MSP vehicles. PA-3 and PA-4 will have no adverse effect on the MSP Post.

5.5.2 Site B - Wahbememe Memorial Park, White Pigeon

PA-1, PA-5, and PA-5 MOD will not create any direct impact on the park or its function as the dimensions of the existing US-131 five-lane cross section will remain unchanged; access to the park will also remain unchanged. Based upon a preliminary assessment, noise levels will be expected to increase about 1 dBA over No-Build conditions for PA-5 and PA-5 MOD and 2 dBA for PA-1. Since noise levels associated with the 2025 traffic volumes will already exceed the NAC for parks (NAC "B", 67 dBA), for the No-Build Alternative, the effects of these three alternatives will not create an additional perceptible adverse impact, and would be considered to have no adverse effect.

PA-2 will require the relocation of access and parking facilities in the park to serve US-12 instead of US-131, but will not impact the recreational purpose of the park or the monument (refer to **Figure 4.2**). The edge of pavement will not encroach closer to the park than currently exists today along US-131. If PA-2 was selected, there will be a net increase in contiguous open space in the park, as the access and parking will be relocated to come off of US-12, and the existing parking area and entrance will be converted to open space. This will offer opportunities to improve the passive recreational value of the park.

Indirect impacts from PA-2 on the park's passive recreation and historic functions will come from the visual effect of a new elevated US-12 structure passing over US-131, and from a widened US-131 facility.

PA-3, and PA-4 do not impact the park in any way, as the entire US-131 corridor will be realigned a half mile to the west. Furthermore, these Alternatives will divert much of the traffic on existing US-131 to the new facility, having a beneficial effect on the property context.

In summary, PA-1, PA-3 PA-4, PA-5 and PA-5 MOD will have no adverse effect on the Memorial Park. PA-2 will have no adverse effect as long as the parking area was replaced and appropriate coordination with Native American interest groups took place during design.

5.5.3 Site C - 63280 US-131, Constantine

The Gibson farmhouse is located on the eastern edge of a 275 acre parcel (refer to **Figure 4.3**). PA-1, PA-2, and PA-3, and PA-5 share the same alignment as they pass the farmhouse, and will each have a direct impact on the overall property. Under PA-1, PA-2, and PA-3, approximately 26 acres of land will be required for new right-of-way behind the house. The proposed edge of pavement will be approximately 264 feet, and the right-of-way line will be approximately 120 feet from the closest part of the house. Based on a preliminary assessment of traffic noise, there will be a reduction in traffic-generated noise levels from the new road because of its additional distance to the farmhouse. In contrast to the No-Build Alternative which is expected to exceed the Noise Abatement Criteria (NAC) in 2025, noise levels associated with the 2025 traffic volumes will drop below noise abatement criteria under PA-1, PA-2, and PA-3. There will be no change in access to the house, which will remain at its current location off of existing US-131.

PA-5 will have somewhat lower levels of direct impacts than those described above for PA-1, PA-2 and PA-3, because the roadway facility for PA-5 will be a two-lane section, with no median and narrower right-of-way. Approximately 14 acres of land will be required for new right-of-way behind the house and to provide an access to existing US-131 to the south. Measured from the closest part of the house, the proposed edge of pavement will be approximately 325 feet away, and the right-of-way line will be approximately 262 feet away. Noise levels associated with the 2025 traffic volumes will not approach or exceed noise abatement criteria under PA-5. There will be no change in access to the house, which will remain at its current location off of existing US-131.

Indirect impacts from PA-1, PA-2, and PA-3 will come from the visual effect of having the new four-lane divided roadway behind the house. Views from the back of the house to the west will change dramatically, the pavement will be relatively close, the terrain rises in that direction, and the road will be higher than the ground surrounding the house. However, the existing stand of mature trees that surround the back of the house will remain and help to mask the view of the road. Likewise, the tree line will help lessen the visual impact of the new road when viewing the house from existing US-131. Indirect impacts from PA-5 will be similar to those of PA-1, PA-2, and PA-3, but slightly reduced in magnitude from the visual effects described above, since the scale of the roadway facility under PA-5 will be reduced.

PA-4 will also have a direct impact on the overall property, requiring 33 acres of land for new right-of-way behind the house. PA-4 lies further to the west than the other alternatives, making the proposed edge of pavement and right-of-way approximately 1000 feet and 910 feet respectively, from the closest part of the house. The increased distance will lessen the traffic-generated noise levels from the new road compared to PA-1, PA-2, and PA-3, and as before, the noise levels associated with the 2025 traffic volumes will not approach or exceed noise abatement criteria at the house. There will be no change in access to the house, which will remain at its current location off of existing US-131.

Indirect impacts from PA-4 will come from the visual effect of having the new four-lane divided roadway behind the house. Views from the back of the house to the west will change somewhat, since the proposed highway will appear in the distance, but because the terrain rises

in that direction, the road will appear higher than the ground surrounding the house. However, because of the greater distance compared to PA-1, PA-2, and PA-3, the existing stand of mature trees will provide more of a mask for the view of the road. Likewise, because of the tree line behind the house, it is unlikely that the new road will be noticeable when viewing the house from existing US-131.

PA-5 MOD will utilize the existing US-131 roadway in this area and will not result in any direct impact on this property. Noise levels are anticipated to be one dBA higher than No-Build conditions; noise levels will exceed the residential NAC of 67 dBA in both scenarios.

PA-1, PA-2 and PA-3 will have an adverse effect on the rural landscape, which contributes to the National Register significance of this property. PA-5 will have a similar adverse effect on the rural landscape, but at a reduced scale. PA-4 will be far enough away so as not to adversely affect the rural nature of the landscape, and noise levels will be much quieter than under all other alternatives. PA-5 MOD will not have any effect on the rural landscape, as the facility will be limited to the existing US-131 roadway right-of-way.

5.5.4 Site E - 62249 US-131, Constantine

As depicted on **Figure 4.5**, the farmstead associated with the Hamilton/Willman property is located on the east side of US-131 and occupies approximately five acres at the west end of the 222 acre parcel. Adjacent to the farm, the northbound and southbound lanes for PA-1, PA-2, and PA-3 will be constructed to the west of US-131, and existing US-131 will remain as a service drive in its present location. Therefore, there will be no direct impacts from the proposed mainline freeway or US-131 service drive on this Section 4(f) resource, and access will remain unchanged. However, to maintain access for vehicles originating on the west side of the alignment to the existing Withers Road Bridge over the St. Joseph River, a new bridge structure will be constructed to carry Drummond Road over the proposed alignment and service drive, and a new roadway will be extended east from this bridge to intersect with Withers Road south and east of the farmstead. This alignment is shown in detail on **Figure 4.10 Sheet 3 of 4**. The new roadway will follow the north property line of the farm and then curve to the south until it meets Withers Road, requiring 7.1 acres for new right-of-way from the 222 acres of the overall farm parcel. The proposed edge of pavement will be over 1,100 feet from the closest building on the farmstead.

Due to the distance to the new roadway, and the abundance of mature trees surrounding the farm, it is unlikely that the new roadway will be noticeable from any area within the farmstead. However, there will be an indirect impact from the visual effect of the introduction of a new elevated structure to carry Drummond Road over the proposed facility. This effect will be minimal though, since the structure will be over 1,000 feet from the farmstead and shielded by the existing mature trees along the east side of the farmstead. As part of a preliminary assessment of noise under PA-1, PA-2 and PA-3, there will be a decrease in traffic-generated noise levels from the new road compared to No-Build; however, the noise levels associated with the 2025 traffic volumes will still approach the noise abatement criteria under PA-2 (66 dBA), whereas PA-1 and PA-3 will experience lower levels. Furthermore, these Alternatives will divert much of the traffic on existing US-131 to the new facility, having a beneficial effect on the property context.

PA-5 and PA-5 MOD will keep US-131 on its existing alignment at this location, with two travel lanes, and will not require new access roadways or grade separations as in PA-1, 2, and 3 since existing at-grade access to both Drummond Road and Site E will be maintained as it is today.

Therefore, the ROW and visual impacts described previously will not be an issue under PA-5 and PA-5 MOD. Under PA-5 and PA-5 MOD, a truck-climbing lane will be added to the existing two-lane roadway to handle the steep northbound grade heading towards Drummond Road, but this will be accommodated within existing ROW and will not create any adverse direct impact on Site E. There will be a decrease in traffic-generated noise levels under PA-5 and PA-5 MOD compared to No-Build, however, the noise levels associated with the 2025 traffic volumes will approach the noise abatement criteria (66 dBA). The effects of the project are be considered as having no adverse effect.

5.5.5 Site F- 15303 W. Broadway, Three Rivers

As depicted on **Figure 4.6**, the house and barn associated with the property at 15303 Broadway Road is located on the south side of Broadway Road at the north end of a 34-acre parcel. PA-4 will be constructed on the west side of the parcel, with the proposed right-of-way line running through the center of the house. This will require demolition or moving of the structure. Broadway Road will remain in its current location with a bridge over the proposed facility, and therefore access to the property will not change. There will be a significant direct impact to the overall property, since approximately 23 acres of the 34 acre parcel will be required for right-of-way purposes.

Indirect impacts from PA-4 will come from the visual effect of having the new four-lane divided roadway and an elevated bridge structure for Broadway Road at the west end of the narrow property, in close proximity to the where the house sits. There are no indirect impacts on the barn, as its use will not be affected in any way.

PA-4 will create an adverse effect on the property by introducing a freeway into an area which is generally rural in nature.

PA-2 will be constructed over 1,500 feet to the east of the property, however, a new two-lane service drive will be constructed along the east property line to provide access to the existing commercial developments west of US-131. The service drive will be approximately 300 feet east of the house. Gleason Road will remain in its present location and will have an at-grade intersection with the service drive. Therefore, access to the property will not change. There will be a direct impact to the overall property, since approximately two acres of the 34-acre parcel will be required for right-of-way purposes for the new service drive.

Indirect impacts from PA-2 will come from the visual effect of having the new service drive east of the house. However, the service drive will be a low volume, low speed facility. There are no indirect impacts on the barn, as its use will not be affected in any way. PA-2 will not have an adverse effect on the property.

PA-1, PA-3, PA-5, and PA-5 MOD will not affect the property in any way.

5.5.6 Site G - 59019 US-131, Three Rivers

The factory building at 59019 US-131 currently fronts on US-131 near the western city limits of Three Rivers. There is an existing right turn lane for northbound US-131 traffic to eastbound M-60 which curves around the west side of the building (see **Figure 4.7**). The curve in the right turn lane makes the existing edge of pavement vary from 89 feet to 50 feet from the face of building. PA-2 will require a service drive on the east side of the alternative, adjacent to the existing factory building. As shown on **Figure 4.7**, the new service drive will replace the right turn lane, and will be at a constant 50 feet from the closest part of the building, making it, in general, closer than the existing US-131 pavement. However, it should be noted that through traffic will travel on the proposed mainline, and therefore traffic volume on the service drive will be less than those associated with existing US-131 under the No-Build alternative. Access from the service drive will be at the same location as existing, however, some of the existing parking spaces will be removed, but this will not affect the use of the building. A preliminary assessment of noise levels at the property indicates that noise will approach the industrial noise abatement criterion (72 dBA). However, this noise is not incompatible with the ongoing historic use of the property, and given the comparatively low level of direct effect, PA-2 will not have an adverse effect on the property.

PA-5 and PA-5 MOD will use the existing US-131 corridor, as will PA-2. Access from Millard Road will be maintained in an at-grade intersection as it is today, and therefore no service drives will be necessary, nor will any change be made to the geometrics of the junction between US-131 and the east leg of M-60. Since the existing US-131 is four lanes wide in this area, there will be no direct impacts on Site G. Noise levels at the property will not approach or exceed noise abatement criteria. Therefore, PA-5 and PA-5 MOD will not have an adverse effect on the property.

PA-1, PA-3, and PA-4 will not affect the property in any way.

Table 5.1 summarizes the impacts of the six practical alternatives on the historic properties.

Table 5.1 Summary of Impacts on Section 4(f) Historic/Recreational Resources

Resource	PA-1	PA-2	PA-3	PA-4	PA-5	PA-5 MOD
Site A Michigan State Police Post, White Pigeon	Low Slight traffic noise increase	Demolition	Low Slight access change	Low Slight access change	Low Slight traffic noise increase	Low Slight traffic noise increase
Site B Wahbememe Memorial Park, White Pigeon	Low Slight traffic noise comparable to No-Build	Moderate Access change	None	None	Low Traffic noise comparable to No-Build	Low Traffic noise comparable to No-Build
Site C 63280 US-131, Constantine	Moderate ROW acquisition, traffic noise reduction, visual change	Moderate ROW acquisition, traffic noise reduction, visual change	Moderate ROW acquisition, traffic noise reduction, visual change	Low ROW acquisition, slight visual change	Low-Moderate ROW acquisition, traffic noise reduction, medium visual change	Very Low No ROW acquisition, traffic noise comparable to No-Build
Site E 62249 US-131, Constantine	Low ROW acquisition	Low ROW acquisition	Low ROW acquisition	None	Very Low Traffic noise reduction	Very Low Traffic noise reduction
Site F 15303 West Broadway	None	Low ROW acquisition, slight visual	None	Demolition	None	None
Site G 59019 US-131	None	Low ROW acquisition	None	None	Very Low Traffic noise comparable to No-Build	Very Low Traffic noise comparable to No-Build

5.6 Avoidance Alternatives

The No-Build Alternative will avoid any direct impact on identified potentially historic properties, but will not fulfill the Purpose of and Need for the project. Alternative PA-5 MOD is the only alternative that avoids direct impacts at all historic properties evaluated in this section, although indirect impacts from traffic noise increases are anticipated with this alternative at most locations, just as they are with the No-Build Alternative. The following provides a discussion of specific Build Alternatives that will avoid impacts to each of the potentially historic properties.

5.6.1 Site A - Michigan State Police Post, White Pigeon

PA-1, PA-5, and PA-5 MOD will avoid any direct impacts to the MSP Post at White Pigeon. PA-3 and PA-4 do not directly impact the post, but as described above, will change access from the post to US-131.

5.6.2 Site B - Wahbememe Memorial Park, White Pigeon

As noted above, PA-1, PA-3, PA-4, PA-5, and PA-5 MOD will avoid any direct impact on the park. Alternatives PA-3 and PA-4 will also minimize impacts from the existing US-131 facility.

5.6.3 Site C - 63280 US-131, Constantine

As **Table 5.1** indicates, all of the Build Alternatives will impact Site C (the Gibson Farm), which is a Section 4(f) resource. Alternative PA-5 MOD will avoid direct impacts to Site C, while all other alternatives affect this property to varying levels of direct impact.

5.6.4 Site E - 62249 US-131, Constantine

PA-4, PA-5, and PA-5 MOD will avoid any direct impacts to the Hamilton/Willman Farm. However, as noted above, PA-4 and PA-5 will directly impact another potential Section 4(f) resource, Site C.

5.6.5 Site F - 15303 W. Broadway, Three Rivers

PA-1, PA-3, PA-5, and PA-5 MOD will avoid any direct impacts to the property at 13577 Quarterline Road, however as shown in **Table 5.1**, PA-1, PA-3, and PA-5 will directly impact other potential 4(f) resources.

5.6.6 Site G - 59019 US-131, Three Rivers

PA-1, PA-3, PA-4, PA-5, and PA-5 MOD will avoid any direct impacts to the property at 59019 US-131, however as shown in **Table 5.1**, with the exception of PA-5 MOD, these Build Alternatives will directly impact other potential 4(f) resources.

5.7 Measures to Minimize Harm

5.7.1 Site A - Michigan State Police Post, White Pigeon

PA-1, PA-5, and PA-5 MOD will not have any direct impacts on the MSP Post at White Pigeon. PA-1, PA-5, and PA-5 MOD will only have an indirect impact on the post due to increased noise levels. However, these noise levels will not exceed the noise abatement criteria, and therefore mitigation measures are not required, nor could noise barriers be practically constructed at this location.

The proposed interchange with US-12 and both PA-3 and PA-4 will minimize the effect of the change in access, which will result from removing the US-131 designation from the existing facility. With a full interchange only one half mile to the west, the post vehicles will continue to have ready access in both directions on US-131.

5.7.2 Site B - Wahbememe Memorial Park, White Pigeon

While Alternative PA-2 will create impacts to the park, the design of this interchange was selected to minimize impacts on the park. Previous configurations that were considered had greater impact to the property.

If PA-2 is selected as the Recommended Alternative, the access into the park will change from the west side of existing US-131 to the north side of US-12. The existing parking area and entrance area will no longer be usable. The access and parking area will be re-configured in such a way that there will not be a net loss of open space in the park; but rather it will afford a modest increase in the area of open space available. This will also provide the benefit of increasing the buffer distance from the parking area to the burial site.

Under PA-2, landscaping improvements will be implemented to improve the visual quality in the park and mitigate the effects of elevated roadway structures. Improved signage and wayfinding will be used as a way to improve the park's recognition to local and out-of-town motorists in the area.

5.7.3 Site C - 63280 US-131, Constantine

PA-1, PA-2 and PA-3 all share the same alignment, as they pass to the west of the Gibson Farm. This alignment has been located to avoid taking the Gibson farm house while still allowing an alignment which maximizes the use of the existing US-131 right-of-way north of Garber Road. The alignment has also been located as far to the west as possible, and the profile of the new roadway has been established as low as possible to make it less of a visual impact when viewed from the farmhouse. Alternative PA-4, being located further west, will minimize impacts compared to PA-1, PA-2, and PA-3.

Alternative PA-5 will have a lower scale of impacts than PA-1, PA-2, and PA-3, since it will only entail constructing a two-lane roadway facility, in a narrower area of disturbance, although it will still be closer to the house than Alternatives PA-1, PA-2, and PA-3. The lowest level of direct impact, however, will be under PA-5 MOD, which will only create indirect impacts from traffic noise along the existing US-131 corridor. This alternative will have comparable levels of noise to the No-Build Alternative (estimated 1 dBA increase), although indirect impacts from traffic noise will be greater under this alternative than under PA-1 through PA-4 which will move most of the traffic much further away from the house.

5.7.4 Site E - 62249 US-131, Constantine

To minimize effects, PA-1, PA-2, and PA-3 are aligned so that the current two-lane pavement of US-131 will be maintained as a service drive and the proposed four-lane divided pavement will be located to the west of the existing highway, thereby minimizing the impact to the farm property. This configuration will still require that some of the farm's 222 acres be acquired for new right-of-way for the extension of Drummond Road, but the majority of the improvements will occur off of the farm's property. Landscaping improvements will be implemented to help shield the visual effect of the highway from the farmstead.

PA-5 and PA-5 MOD will minimize direct effects on this property compared to PA-1, PA-2, and PA-3 since no overpass at Drummond Road will be necessary and the corridor will continue to provide two travel lanes. If truck climbing lanes are warranted in this area, they will be constructed within the existing ROW to avoid direct impacts on the property.

5.7.5 Site F - 15303 W. Broadway, Three Rivers

The PA-4 alignment will require either moving or demolishing the farm house. Due to other constraints within the vicinity of the property, there is no opportunity to change the alignment

and avoid the impact. If the house is moved, landscaping improvements will be implemented to help shield the visual effect of the highway from the farmstead.

5.7.6 Site G - 59019 US-131, Three Rivers

To minimize effects, the profile of PA-2 was depressed in the vicinity of the property at 59019 US-131 and a service drive provided. These measures allowed access to be maintained and avoided demolition of the building.

5.8 Coordination

Coordination has taken place on this project between MDOT and SHPO. MDOT has received a coordination letter from the St. Joseph County Parks and Recreation Commission concerning relocation of the drive and other changes at Wahbememe Memorial Park (see **Appendix D.1**)

The following is a chronological listing of regular coordination that has taken place to date between MDOT and the Indiana and Michigan SHPOs:

- 10/1/99 - Initial Archaeological Site File Review at MI SHPO.
- 3/15/00 - Second Archaeological Site File Review at MI SHPO.
- 3/24/00 - Project Area Visit with MDOT, MI SHPO, and project team.
- 6/21/00 - Letters to IN SHPO and MI SHPO indicating that project is underway.
- 6/29/00 - Native American consultation letters sent to 13 historic and federally recognized tribes with potential historic association with the project area..
- 7/12/00 - Section 106 Public Meeting in Constantine
- 11/8/00 - Archaeological and above-ground file review at IN SHPO.
- 7/11/01 - Meeting with MDOT concerning preliminary results of above-ground survey.
- 8-1-02 - Meeting with FHWA to discuss status of cultural properties
- 8-22-02 - Project Team field review with SHPO of the 15 potentially historic properties, the one monument listed in the NRHP, and one historic district on the NRHP that could be affected by the project.