



RICK SNYDER
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MICHIGAN
DEPARTMENT OF NATURAL RESOURCES
LANSING



RODNEY A. STOKES
DIRECTOR

SUBMITTED: April 7, 2011
RESUBMITTED: April 11, 2011

MEMORANDUM TO THE DIRECTOR

Information: Natural Resources Commission

Subject: Order to Close State Forest Campgrounds
Land Use Orders of the Director Amendment No. 2 of 2011

Authority:

The Natural Resources and Environmental Protection Act, 1994 PA 451, as amended, authorizes the Director to issue orders to implement land use rules.

Discussion and Background:

State forest campgrounds (SFCs) and their associated boating access sites populate state forest land throughout the Upper Peninsula and the Northern Lower Peninsula (refer to Attachment #1 Map of Michigan State Forest Campgrounds). Operating capital for these campgrounds comes from the General Fund (GF), user fees (campsite fees), and gasoline tax revenues (restricted funds) to support boating access sites across the state. In 2007 and 2008, approximately 33% of the operating capital for SFCs and boating access sites came from the GF, 46% came from user fees, and 20% came from gasoline tax.

The GF appropriation to the Forest Recreation Program (FRP) line item budget was reduced by \$72,200 in 2009 and \$24,100 in 2010. Public Act 189 of 2010 further reduced the GF appropriation for FY 2011 by \$314,700, the largest reduction imposed thus far. These three consecutive year reductions have resulted in a 63% total loss of GF support to the FRP line item budget. For FY 2011 there is a total of \$242,000 GF in the FRP budget.

Revenues from user fees over the last decade have remained even, helped by campground fee increases in 2002 and in 2007. The SFC user fees are at the high end of this market value, eliminating the option of raising user fees in the short-term as a way of raising revenues. In addition, the number of registrations and number of campers have consistently declined over the last decade. Given the long-term trend of declining use and the inability to raise camp fee revenues, the SFC program will not be able to absorb the significant reduction in GF support defined for FY 2011 without initiating further management reductions. A market adjustment is necessary.

The need for these reductions is clearly illustrated when daily operational costs are compared against user fee revenues. Computing only the salaries and wages for facility caretakers, the Department's day-to-day operational cost for managing SFCs is an average of \$8,060 per campground or \$309 per campsite. These costs do not reflect vehicle and travel charges, campground licensing and inspection fees, contract services, supplies, materials, long-term capital improvement needs, or program administration costs. Compared to revenues received from user fees, the average revenue of \$9,397 per campground and \$423 per campsite provides little buffer to cover all operational costs needed to run this program.

To address the reduced camping demand and insufficient funding to maintain all of the SFCs, the Department must close underutilized campgrounds. However, the selection of which campgrounds to close must take particular care to preserve the system's revenue generating base and provide a broad range of opportunity for the recreational user. Those facilities that generate the most revenues are critical in providing the funds needed to cover the management of lower revenue generating facilities. With a range of \$40,737 between the highest revenue generating campground to the lowest revenue generating campground \$306, it is critical when adjusting the program that the selection of which campgrounds to close must come from those that are not supporting the system.

The Department began its evaluation of campgrounds by reviewing the information gathered in 2010 when the public was asked to respond to an online survey that would define their priorities for closure criteria. These criteria included Associated Recreation Opportunities, Campground Quality, Financial Sustainability, Fire Risk, Use and Occupancy, Proximity to Other Campgrounds, and Renovation Needs. All cabins, open campgrounds and campgrounds closed in 2009, were evaluated based on the public's criteria priorities. The evaluation also considered the relationship of the SFCs to other recreational opportunities such as proximity to trails that provide back packing, mountain biking or equestrian riding, and proximity to rivers that provide for canoe camping. Seventy-two campgrounds were selected to consider for closure.

Of the 72 campgrounds, 58% are located within the Upper Peninsula and 42% in the Lower Peninsula. The following graph reflects the location of all SFCs in each region and how many of these were selected for additional review

Region	Total Number of SFCs	Number of SFCs Considered for Closure
Western Upper Peninsula	19	16
Eastern Upper Peninsula	39	26
Western Northern Lower Peninsula	40	12
Eastern Northern Lower Peninsula	49	18

The final review looked for ways to reduce operational costs while preserving critical user fee revenues. Efforts were taken to disperse closure impacts statewide so no one region was overly burdened with closures, and to ensure that other camping opportunities in the area still existed. The final selection ensures that a camper will not need to drive more than 45 minutes to reach an alternative SFC, and in the majority of cases this drive will be much less. For more information on camping opportunities refer to Attachment #2 Other Camping Opportunities.

The Department is recommending the closure of 23 SFCs. These campgrounds have generated an average revenue of \$3,207, with the highest being \$6,156 and the lowest being \$306. These selections meet the objective of selecting sites that are in the lower tier of revenue generation, while also falling within the closure objectives identified by the public and dispersing closures throughout the state in locations where other camping opportunities still exist.

The Department is recommending that the closure of these 23 SFCs go into effect May 19, 2011. These campgrounds and the counties in which they reside are:

ATLANTA MANAGEMENT UNIT

Black Lake Trail Camp - Cheboygan County
Little Wolf Lake - Montmorency County

BARAGA MANAGEMENT UNIT

Beaufort State Forest Campground - Baraga County
Big Lake State Forest Campground - Baraga County

CADILLAC MANAGEMENT UNIT

Bray Creek State Forest Campground - Lake County
Long Lake State Forest Campground - Wexford County

CRYSTAL FALLS MANAGEMENT UNIT

Deer Lake State Forest Campground - Iron County

GRAYLING MANAGEMENT UNIT

Manistee River Bridge State Forest Campground - Crawford County
McCollum Lake State Forest Campground - Oscoda County

NEWBERRY MANAGEMENT UNIT

Blind Sucker #1 State Forest Campground - Luce County
High Bridge State Forest Campground - Luce County
Holland Lake State Forest Campground - Luce County
Natalie State Forest Campground - Luce County
Reed & Green Bridge State Forest Campground - Luce County

PIGEON RIVER COUNTRY MANAGEMENT UNIT

Pigeon Bridge State Forest Campground - Otsego County
Round Lake State Forest Campground - Otsego County

SAULT STE MARIE MANAGEMENT UNIT

Black River State Forest Campground - Mackinac County
Lime Island State Forest Campground and Cabins - Chippewa County
Munuscong River State Forest Campground - Chippewa County

SHINGLETON MANAGEMENT UNIT

Canoe Lake State Forest Campground - Schoolcraft County
Cusino Lake State Forest Campground - Schoolcraft County
Mead Creek State Forest Campground - Schoolcraft County
South Gemini Lake State Forest Campground - Schoolcraft County

There are 110 SFCs that will remain open and available for rustic camping throughout the Upper Peninsula and the Northern Lower Peninsula. Dispersed camping on state forest lands will also continue to be permitted one (1) mile from these designated campgrounds, unless otherwise prohibited. There are no user fees for dispersed camping.

This amendment also makes a technical amendment involving the SFCs that were closed in 2009 by removing their listing from Section 4.2.

Recommendation:

This order was submitted for information on April 7, 2011, at the Natural Resources Commission Meeting. This item appeared on the Department's April 2011 calendar and may be eligible for approval on May 12, 2011.

Lynne M. Boyd, Chief
Forest Management Division

Gary Hagler, Chief
Law Enforcement Division

Ronald A. Olson, Chief
Parks and Recreation Division

Russ Mason, Ph.D., Chief
Wildlife Division

Kelley D. Smith, Ph.D., Chief
Fisheries Division

Mindy S. Koch, Deputy Director
Resource Management

LAND USE ORDERS OF THE DIRECTOR

Amendment No 2 of 2011

By authority conferred on the Director of the Department of Natural Resources by section 504 of 1994 PA 451, MCL 324.504, and pursuant to R 299.671 and R 299.921 of the Michigan Administrative Code, it is ordered that the following order of the Land Use Orders of the Director shall read as follows:

4.2 Open state forest campgrounds, designated by director.

Order 4.2 The following are designated state forest campgrounds open to camping:

(1) In Alger county:

- (a) Forest lake state forest campground.
- (b) Kingston lake state forest campground.

(2) In Alpena county:

- (a) Ossineke state forest campground.

(3) In Antrim county:

- (a) Graves crossing state forest campground.
- (b) Pinney bridge state forest campground.

(4) In Baraga county:

- (a) Big Eric's bridge state forest campground.
- (b) King lake state forest campground.

(5) In Benzie county:

- (a) Garey lake trail camp.
- (b) Grass lake state forest campground.
- (c) Lake Ann state forest campground.
- (d) Platte river state forest campground.
- (e) Veterans memorial state forest campground.

(6) In Cheboygan county:

- (a) Black lake state forest campground.
- (b) Haakwood state forest campground.

- (c) Maple bay state forest campground.
- (d) Pine grove state forest campground.
- (e) Stoney creek trail camp.
- (f) Weber lake state forest campground.
- (7) In Chippewa county:
 - (a) Andrus lake state forest campground.
 - (b) Detour state forest campground.
- (8) In Clare County:
 - (a) Mud lake state forest campground.
- (9) In Crawford county:
 - (a) 4 Mile trail camp.
 - (b) AuSable river state forest campground and canoe camp.
 - (c) Burton's landing state forest campground.
 - (d) Canoe harbor state forest campground and canoe camp.
 - (e) Goose creek state forest campground.
 - (f) Goose creek trail camp.
 - (g) Jones lake state forest campground.
 - (h) Keystone landing state forest campground.
 - (i) Lake Margrethe state forest campground.
 - (j) Rainbow bend state forest campground and canoe camp.
 - (k) Shupac lake state forest campground.
 - (l) Upper Manistee river state forest campground and canoe camp.
 - (m) Walsh road equestrian state forest campground and trail camp.
 - (n) White pine canoe camp.
- (10) In Delta county:
 - (a) Portage bay state forest campground.
- (11) In Dickinson county:
 - (a) Carney lake state forest campground.

(b) Gene's pond state forest campground.

(12) In Gladwin county:

(a) House lake state forest campground.

(b) Trout lake state forest campground.

(13) In Grand Traverse county:

(a) Arbutus lake state forest campground.

(b) Lake Dubonnet state forest campground.

(c) Lake Dubonnet trail camp.

(d) Scheck's place state forest campground.

(e) Scheck's place trail camp.

(f) Spring lake state forest campground.

(14) In Houghton county:

(a) Emily lake state forest campground.

(15) In Iosco county:

(a) Van Etten lake state forest campground.

(16) In Iron county.

(a) Glidden lake state forest campground.

(17) In Kalkaska county:

(a) C.C.C. bridge state forest campground.

(b) Guernsey lake state forest campground.

(c) Pickerel lake state forest campground.

(d) Rapid river trail camp.

(18) In Lake county:

(a) Carrieville state forest campground.

(b) Leverentz lake state forest campground.

(c) Lincoln bridge state forest campground.

(d) Silver creek state forest campground.

(19) In Luce county:

- (a) Bass lake state forest campground.
- (b) Blind sucker no. 2 state forest campground.
- (c) Bodi lake state forest campground.
- (d) Culhane lake state forest campground.
- (e) Lake Superior state forest campground.
- (f) Mouth of Two Hearted river state forest campground.
- (g) Perch lake state forest campground.
- (h) Pike lake state forest campground.
- (i) Pretty lake state forest campground.

(20) In Mackinac county:

- (a) Big knob state forest campground.
- (b) Garnet lake state forest campground.
- (c) Hog island point state forest campground.
- (d) Little Brevort lake north state forest campground.
- (e) Milakokia lake state forest campground.
- (f) South Manistique lake state forest campground.

(21) In Manistee county:

- (a) Healy lake state forest campground.

(22) In Marquette county:

- (a) Anderson lake state forest campground.
- (b) Bass lake state forest campground.
- (c) Little lake state forest campground.
- (d) Little Presque isle cabins.
- (e) Squaw lake state forest campground.

(23) In Menominee county:

- (a) Cedar river north state forest campground.

(24) In Midland county:

- (a) Black creek state forest campground.

(25) In Missaukee county:

- (a) Goose lake state forest campground.
- (b) Hopkins creek state forest campground.
- (c) Hopkins creek equestrian state forest campground and trail camp.
- (d) Long lake state forest campground.
- (e) Reedsburg dam state forest campground.

(26) In Montmorency county:

- (a) Avery lake state forest campground.
- (b) Ess lake state forest campground.
- (c) Jackson lake state forest campground.
- (d) Town corner state forest campground.

(27) In Ogemaw county:

- (a) Ambrose lake state forest campground.

(28) In Osceola county:

- (a) Sunrise lake state forest campground.

(29) In Oscoda county:

- (a) Mio pond state forest campground and group camp.
- (b) Parmalee bridge state forest campground and canoe camp.

(30) In Otsego county:

- (a) Big bear lake state forest campground.
- (b) Big bear pointe state forest campground.
- (c) Elk hill equestrian state forest campground and trail camp.
- (d) Johnson's crossing trail camp.
- (e) Pickerel lake state forest campground.
- (f) Pigeon river state forest campground.

(31) In Presque isle county:

- (a) Ocqueoc falls state forest campground.
- (b) Shoepac lake state forest campground.

(c) Tomahawk creek flooding state forest campground.

(d) Tomahawk lake state forest campground.

(32) In Roscommon county:

(a) Houghton lake state forest campground.

(33) In Schoolcraft county:

(a) East branch of Fox river state forest campground.

(b) Fox river state forest campground.

(c) Merwin creek state forest campground.

(d) North Gemini lake state forest campground.

(e) Ross lake state forest campground.

(34) In Wexford county:

(a) Baxter bridge state forest campground.

(b) Old US-131 state forest campground.

4.3 Closed state forest campgrounds, designated by the director.

Order 4.3 The following designated state forest campgrounds are closed to camping:

(1) In Alger county:

(a) Laughing whitefish, section 35, T48N R22W.

(2) In Alpena county:

(a) Thunder bay river, section 11, T30N R7E.

(3) In Baraga county:

(a) Beaufort lake state forest campground, section 21, T48N, R31W.

(b) Big lake state forest campground, section 28, T49N, R34W.

(4) In Cheboygan county:

(a) Black lake trail camp, section 2, T36N, R1E.

(b) Twin lakes, section 2, T36N R1E.

(5) In Chippewa county:

(a) Lime Island state forest campground, section 36, T43N, R3E.

(b) Lime Island cabins, section 36, T43N, R3E.

- (c) Munuscong river state forest campground, section 15, T44N, R1E.
- (d) Shelldrake dam, section 21, T50N R6W.
- (6) In Clare county:
 - (a) Pike lake, section 27, T18N R6W.
 - (b) Temple, section 21, T19N R6W.
- (7) In Crawford county:
 - (a) Manistee river bridge state forest campground, section 31, T27N, R4W.
- (8) In Dickinson county:
 - (a) Lower dam, section 27, T44N R27W.
 - (b) West branch, section 25, T44N R28W.
- (9) In Grand Traverse county:
 - (a) Forks, section 4, T26N, R9W.
- (10) In Iron county:
 - (a) Deer lake state forest campground, section 4, T45N, R32W.
 - (b) Lake Ellen, section 35, T44N R31W.
- (11) In Lake county:
 - (a) Bray creek state forest campground, section 35, T18N, R13W.
- (12) In Luce county:
 - (a) Blind sucker no. 1 state forest campground, section 2, T49N, R12W.
 - (b) Headquarters lake, section 19, T49N R10W.
 - (c) High bridge state forest campground, section 31, T49N, R10W.
 - (d) Holland lake state forest campground, section 26, T49N, R11W.
 - (e) Natalie state forest campground, section 29, T46N, R10W.
 - (f) Reed & Green bridge state forest campground, section 11, T49N, R10W.
 - (g) Two Hearted river canoe camp, section 22, T49N R10W.
- (13) In Mackinac county:
 - (a) Bay city, section 16, T42N R1W.
 - (b) Black river state forest campground, section 19, T43N, R9W.

(c) Little Brevort lake south, Section 24, T42N, R6W.

(14) In Marquette county:

(a) Escanaba river, section 32, T43N R24W.

(b) Horseshoe lake, section 22, T45N R30W.

(c) Pike lake, section 28, T45N R26W.

(d) Porterfield, section 19, T45N R29W.

(e) South horseshoe, section 22, T45N R30W.

(f) Witbeck rapids, section 18, T45N R29W.

(15) In Missaukee county:

(a) Dyer lake, section 14, T21N R6W.

(16) In Montmorency county:

(a) Big oaks, section 9, T29N R2E.

(b) Lake 15, section 22, T30N R2E.

(c) Little wolf lake state forest campground, section 35, T29N, R1E.

(17) In Ogemaw county:

(a) Rifle river, section 27, T23N R3E.

(18) In Oscoda county:

(a) McCollum lake state forest campground, section 36, T28N, R4E.

(b) Muskrat lake, section 7, T27N R2E.

(19) In Otsego county:

(a) Lake Marjory, Section 32, T29N, R3W.

(b) Pigeon bridge state forest campground, section 17, T32N, R1W.

(c) Round lake state forest campground, section 29, T32N, R1W.

(20) In Schoolcraft county:

(a) Canoe lake state forest campground, section 22, T47N, R16W.

(b) Cusino lake state forest campground, section 24, T47N, R16W.

(c) Mead creek state forest campground, section 13, T44N, R14W.

(d) South Gemini lake state forest campground, section 9, T47N, R16W.

(21) In Wexford county:

(a) Clam river trail camp, section 23, T22N R9W.

(b) Long lake state forest campground, section 3, T22N, R9W.

This amended order shall be posted on or after May 19, 2011.

Issued on this 12th day of May, 2011.

Rodney A. Stokes
Director

Michigan State Forest Campgrounds

Attachment #1
Memorandum to the Director
LUOD No. 2 of 2011

