

Effectiveness Review of Medicaid Non-Emergency Medical Transportation (NEMT)

(FY2015 Appropriation Bill – Public Act 252 of 2014)

September 30, 2015

Section 1861(1): The department shall conduct a review of the efficiency and effectiveness of the current nonemergency transportation system funded in part 1. For nonemergency transportation services provided outside the current broker coverage, the review is contingent on available detailed travel data, including methods of travel, number of people served, travel distances, number of trips, and costs of trips. The department shall report the results of the review required under this subsection to the house and senate appropriations subcommittees on community health and the house and senate fiscal agencies no later than September 30 of the current fiscal year.



Michigan Department of
Health & Human Services

RICK SNYDER, GOVERNOR
NICK LYON, DIRECTOR

**Michigan Department of Health and Human Services
Effectiveness Review of Medicaid Non-Emergency Medical Transportation (NEMT)
September 30, 2015**

Overview

The Michigan Medicaid and Healthy Michigan Plan programs, administered by the Medical Services Administration (MSA) within the Michigan Department of Health and Human Services (DHHS), are federally mandated to assure transportation of beneficiaries to medical care.¹ Nonemergency medical transportation (NEMT) services are administered by both the Medicaid Health Plans (MHP) and the fee-for-service system (FFS).

In Wayne, Oakland and Macomb counties, NEMT is arranged by LogistiCare Solutions, LLC under a contracted brokerage program with MSA. NEMT services covered under the broker contract include transportation for beneficiaries not enrolled in an MHP, and transportation for MHP enrollees to services that are not covered under the MHP contract.

Data

Table 1 represents MHP transportation expenditures fiscal year (FY) 2014.

Table 1

MEDICAID HEALTH PLAN TRANSPORTATION EXPENDITURES - FY 2014			
Medicaid Health Plan	Total members who received NEMT services	Total Trips Provided	Transportation/Mileage /Parking & Meals/Lodging Costs
Blue Cross Complete	7,397	75,116	\$1,444,608
Coventry Cares	6,774	128,384	\$1,917,162
Harbor Health Plan	2,686	5,730	\$181,897
HealthPlus Partners	2,735	15,716	\$552,714
McLaren Health Plan	10,573	25,566	\$2,091,145
Meridian Health Plan	25,841	336,375	\$7,199,217
HAP Midwest Health Plan	4,301	482,117	\$1,779,390
Molina Healthcare	17,807	287,907	\$3,675,858
Sparrow - PHP	1,768	5,525	\$28,220
Priority Health Choice	2,509	21,463	\$1,582,814
Total Health Care	8,968	89,219	\$2,065,511
United Healthcare Community Plan	19,997	303,300	\$4,493,497
Upper Peninsula Health Plan	2,014	13,328	\$557,830
Grand Total	133,370	1,789,746	\$27,569,863

Data collected from the MHPs indicate that most health plans utilize a transportation broker (e.g., LogistiCare Solutions, MTM) to manage the Medicaid transportation benefit. Depending on the geographic region covered the broker uses volunteer, commercial, non-profit, or public transit providers.

The average high for miles traveled per health plan trip is at, or around, 90 miles, while the average low is less than a half of a mile. An outlier exists for health plan enrolled Medicaid beneficiaries residing in the Upper

¹ 42 CFR 431.53

Michigan Department of Health and Human Services
Effectiveness Review of Medicaid Non-Emergency Medical Transportation (NEMT)
September 30, 2015

Peninsula as there is often times a significant distance to specialty or dental treatment often residing in the Lower Peninsula, in some cases as far as Grand Rapids or Ann Arbor. The average costs of the trip range from an average high of \$373 to an average low of \$0.23.

Table 2 represents FY 2014 Medicaid FFS transportation expenditures administered locally via DHHS county offices. Depending on local resources, similar to the MHPs, DHHS county staff may build a provider base that includes volunteers, commercial, non-profit, or public transit providers. Data pertaining to the number of unique beneficiaries served, travel distances and number of trips for locally administered FFS NEMT is not available.

Table 2

FY 2014					
Medicaid Fee-for-Service Non Emergency Medical Transportation (NEMT) Expenditures					
via DHHS County Offices (In dollars)					
<small>(Also includes Healthy Michigan Plan NEMT starting 4/1/14)</small>					
County Name	Contractual Amount	Private Vehicle	Public Transportation	Out of State	Total
ALCONA COUNTY	-	22,761	-	-	22,761
ALGER COUNTY	-	9,137	-	545	9,682
ALLEGAN COUNTY	6,161	6,660	83,976	-	96,797
ALPENA COUNTY	-	36,241	1,140	-	37,381
ANTRIM COUNTY	-	12,280	27,707	154	40,141
ARENAC COUNTY	-	48,669	89	-	48,758
BARAGA COUNTY	-	7,540	670	1,087	9,297
BARRY COUNTY	-	6,983	-	-	6,983
BAY COUNTY	-	19,557	4,484	-	24,041
BENZIE COUNTY	-	30,513	1,157	-	31,670
BERRIEN COUNTY	-	3,462	278,978	-	282,440
BRANCH COUNTY	-	29,569	3,883	-	33,452
CALHOUN COUNTY	-	25,553	772	-	26,325
CASS COUNTY	-	31,236	31,320	-	62,556
CHARLEVOIX COUNTY	-	9,376	994	-	10,370
CHEBOYGAN COUNTY	-	51,750	817	-	52,567
CHIPPEWA COUNTY	-	103,022	4,802	-	107,824
CLARE COUNTY	-	104,256	3,202	-	107,458
CLINTON COUNTY	-	12,326	2,107	-	14,433
CRAWFORD COUNTY	-	16,631	35,085	337	52,053
DELTA COUNTY	-	28,996	1,958	2,948	33,902
DICKINSON COUNTY	-	14,642	-	1,371	16,013
EATON COUNTY	-	17,928	1,486	-	19,414
EMMET COUNTY	-	14,229	9,501	-	23,730
GENESEE COUNTY	-	-	15,691	-	15,691
GLADWIN COUNTY	-	40,557	4,452	-	45,009
GOGEBIC COUNTY	-	14,829	187	22,462	37,478
GRAND TRAVERSE COUNTY	-	12,888	5,404	-	18,292
GRATIOT COUNTY	-	44,877	13,216	-	58,093
HILLSDALE COUNTY	-	45,359	6,582	-	51,941
HOUGHTON COUNTY	-	33,330	32,826	3,009	69,165
HURON COUNTY	-	16,337	5,409	-	21,746
INGHAM COUNTY	-	1,540	43,505	-	45,045
IONIA COUNTY	-	26,001	652	-	26,653
IOSCO COUNTY	-	68,921	1,910	-	70,831

Michigan Department of Health and Human Services
Effectiveness Review of Medicaid Non-Emergency Medical Transportation (NEMT)
September 30, 2015

Table 2 continued

FY 2014 Medicaid Fee-for-Service Non Emergency Medical Transportation (NEMT) Expenditures via DHHS County Offices (In dollars) <small>(Also includes Healthy Michigan Plan NEMT starting 4/1/14)</small>					
County Name	Contractual Amount	Private Vehicle	Public Transportation	Out of State	Total
IRON COUNTY	-	14,369	-	1,349	15,718
ISABELLA COUNTY	-	35,857	11,695	-	47,552
JACKSON COUNTY	-	9,458	13,236	-	22,694
KALAMAZOO COUNTY	-	2,070	181,537	-	183,607
KALKASKA COUNTY	-	10,577	4,493	-	15,070
KENT COUNTY	-	52,910	329,207	-	382,117
KEWEENAW COUNTY	-	13,639	1,804	678	16,121
LAKE COUNTY	-	6,055	9,750	-	15,805
LAPEER COUNTY	-	8	358	-	366
LEELANAU	-	280	-	-	280
LENAWEE COUNTY	-	45,229	95,442	-	140,671
LIVINGSTON COUNTY	-	2,905	727	-	3,632
LUCE COUNTY	-	54,198	4,052	1,433	59,683
MACKINAC COUNTY	-	26,893	294	-	27,187
MANISTEE COUNTY	-	74,126	4,955	-	79,081
MARQUETTE COUNTY	-	31,929	2,989	736	35,654
MASON COUNTY	-	81,994	2,634	-	84,628
MECOSTA COUNTY	-	108,284	23,490	-	131,774
MENOMINEE COUNTY	-	22,339	-	12,109	34,448
MIDLAND COUNTY	-	30,676	21,678	3,292	55,646
MISSAUKEE COUNTY	-	119,980	11,814	-	131,794
MONROE COUNTY	-	-	12,922	-	12,922
MONTCALM COUNTY	-	64,070	909	-	64,979
MONTMORENCY COUNTY	-	26,496	2,991	-	29,487
MUSKEGON COUNTY	-	90,887	165,716	-	256,603
NEWAYGO COUNTY	-	67,955	13,703	-	81,658
OCEANA COUNTY	-	73,078	416	-	73,494
OGEMAW COUNTY	-	29,108	1,056	-	30,164
ONTONAGON COUNTY	-	32,480	-	4,337	36,817
OSCEOLA COUNTY	-	127,389	7,860	-	135,249
OSCODA COUNTY	-	38,474	1,524	-	39,998
OTSEGO COUNTY	-	11,174	2,259	-	13,433
OTTAWA COUNTY	-	7,168	83	-	7,251
PRESQUE ISLE COUNTY	-	15,683	-	-	15,683
ROSCOMMON COUNTY	-	77,854	1,258	-	79,112
SAGINAW COUNTY	-	2,643	5,272	-	7,915
SANILAC COUNTY	-	1,286	2,772	-	4,058
SCHOOLCRAFT COUNTY	-	34,405	632	1,516	36,553
SHIAWASSEE COUNTY	-	6,071	634	-	6,705
ST CLAIR COUNTY	-	38,737	1,543	-	40,280
ST JOSEPH COUNTY	-	32,076	26,894	-	58,970
TUSCOLA COUNTY	-	8,706	3,222	-	11,928
VAN BUREN COUNTY	-	103,344	37,215	-	140,559
WASHTENAW COUNTY	-	-	778,304	-	778,304
WEXFORD COUNTY	-	2,342	210	-	2,552
Grand Total	\$6,161	\$2,603,158	\$2,411,512	\$57,636	\$5,078,194

Michigan Department of Health and Human Services
Effectiveness Review of Medicaid Non-Emergency Medical Transportation (NEMT)
September 30, 2015

Table 3 represents Medicaid FFS transportation expenditures incurred as a result of the brokerage program operating in Wayne, Oakland, and Macomb counties during fiscal year (FY) 2014.

Table 3

MEDICAID REIMBURSEMENT to NEMT BROKER (LogistiCare) - FY 14	
County Name	Total
MACOMB COUNTY	2,782,990
OAKLAND COUNTY	3,095,880
WAYNE COUNTY	11,834,607
Grand Total	\$17,713,477
Note: Effective 12/1/13 the NEMT Broker contract became a capitation based agreement	
BROKER ADMINISTRATIVE CONTRACT (LogistiCare)	\$371,936

Table 4 represents Medicaid FFS transportation utilization data as a result of the brokerage program operating in Wayne, Oakland, and Macomb counties during fiscal year (FY) 2014. As mentioned earlier, the broker may use volunteer, commercial, non-profit, or public transit providers.

Table 4

FY 2014 Medicaid Fee-for-Service NEMT Broker Trip Data													
	October	November	December	January	February	March	April	May	June	July	August	September	Total
Description													
Total Denials	50	79	84	186	79	64	112	59	162	123	64	147	1,209
Total Net Authorized Trips (Reservations minus Cancellations)													
Net Authorized Ambulatory Trips	50,611	47,714	48,784	49,078	49,994	55,880	56,514	59,151	57,237	54,809	52,325	52,813	634,910
Net Authorized Lodging Trips	58	22	1	20	32	28	4	11	0	5	3	4	188
Net Authorized Meals Trips	5	3	1	6	5	5	4	4	6	11	4	8	62
Net Authorized Medivan Trips	6,726	6,251	6,563	5,950	5,648	5,995	5,839	6,198	5,777	6,018	5,944	6,085	72,994
Net Authorized Wheelchair Trips	5,722	5,345	5,384	5,384	5,232	5,928	5,904	5,956	5,283	5,664	5,446	5,488	66,736
Net Commercial Air Trips	0	0	0	5,384	5,232	5,928	5,904	5,956	5,283	5,664	0	2	39,353
Total Net Authorized Trips (Reservations minus Cancellations)	63,122	59,335	60,733	65,822	66,143	73,764	74,169	77,276	73,586	72,171	63,723	64,400	814,244
Total Miles for all Reservations													
Ambulatory Miles	366,812	342,009	339,609	342,317	349,856	388,770	401,159	423,691	410,919	410,796	393,575	401,244	4,570,757
Lodging Miles	18,987	11,922	157	11,660	14,041	14,488	198	2,148	0	842	860	157	75,460
Meals Miles	401	298	47	252	472	461	197	172	230	1,767	692	301	5,290
Medivan Miles	42,786	39,129	39,981	36,277	33,758	35,589	34,048	35,476	33,160	33,996	32,871	34,862	431,933
Wheelchair Miles	38,398	34,885	35,172	36,823	34,628	40,305	40,129	39,922	35,785	38,332	36,683	37,008	448,070
Commercial Air Miles	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	46
Total Miles for all Reservations	467,384	428,243	414,966	427,329	432,755	479,613	475,731	501,409	480,094	485,733	464,681	473,618	5,531,556
Average Trip per Reservation													
Average Miles per Ambulatory Trip	7.25	7.17	6.96	6.97	7.00	6.96	7.10	7.16	7.18	7.50	7.52	7.60	7.20
Average Miles per Lodging Trip	327.36	541.91	157.00	583.00	438.78	517.43	49.50	195.27	0.00	286.67	39.25	261.35	
Average Miles per Meals Trip	80.20	99.33	47.00	42.00	94.40	92.20	49.25	43.00	38.33	160.64	173.00	37.63	79.75
Average Miles per Medivan Trip	6.36	6.26	6.09	6.10	5.98	5.94	5.83	5.72	5.74	5.65	5.53	5.73	5.91
Average Miles per Wheelchair Trip	6.71	6.53	6.53	6.84	6.62	6.80	6.80	6.70	6.77	6.74	6.74	6.74	6.71
Average Miles per Commercial Trip	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
Average Mileage per Reservation	7.40	7.22	6.83	6.49	6.54	6.50	6.41	6.49	6.52	6.73	7.29	7.35	6.82

Michigan Department of Health and Human Services
Effectiveness Review of Medicaid Non-Emergency Medical Transportation (NEMT)
September 30, 2015

Conclusion

The Medicaid NEMT program utilizes varying mechanisms to administer the NEMT benefit to beneficiaries, with significant operational and payment differences between FFS, the broker, and managed care components. The ability to evaluate efficiency and effectiveness of the entire Medicaid NEMT program would require developing a methodology that would allow comparison of each program component against a single defined set of criteria. Additional research and resources are needed to complete a comprehensive program evaluation of Medicaid's NEMT program.