

MINUTES

STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION

Ladislaus B. Dombrowski Board Room  
John A. Hannah Building  
608 West Allegan  
Lansing, Michigan

November 10, 2015  
9:30 a.m.

Present: Mr. Brian J. Whiston, Chairman  
Mr. John C. Austin, President  
Dr. Casandra E. Ulbrich, Vice President  
Ms. Michelle Fecteau, Secretary  
Dr. Pamela Pugh, Treasurer  
Ms. Lupe Ramos-Montigny, NASBE Delegate  
Mrs. Kathleen N. Straus  
Mrs. Eileen Weiser  
Dr. Richard Zeile

Also Present: Mr. Rick Joseph, 2015-2016 Michigan Teacher of the Year

Absent: Mrs. Karen McPhee, representing Governor Rick Snyder, ex officio

**REGULAR MEETING**

I. CALL TO ORDER

Mr. Whiston called the meeting to order at 9:40 a.m.

II. INFORMATIONAL FOLDER ITEM

1. Information on the Special Education Advisory Committee Annual Report for 2014-2015

III. APPROVAL OF AGENDA AND ORDER OF PRIORITY

**Mr. Austin moved, seconded by Mrs. Weiser, that the State Board of Education approve the agenda and order of priority.**

The vote was taken on the motion.

**Ayes: Austin, Pugh, Ramos-Montigny, Straus, Weiser, Zeile  
Absent During Vote: Fecteau, Ulbrich**

**The motion carried.**

IV. INTRODUCTION OF STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MEMBERS

Mrs. Marilyn Schneider, State Board Executive, introduced members of the State Board of Education and the 2015-2016 Michigan Teacher of the Year. Mrs. Schneider invited guests to introduce themselves.

V. PERSONAL PRIVILEGE – BRIAN J. WHISTON

Mr. Whiston said Board members Michelle Fecteau and Eileen Weiser, and Special Education Director Teri Chapman have been named to Lieutenant Governor Brian Calley's Special Education Task Force. He said there will be weekly meetings through the end of the year with the charge of recommending reforms for Michigan's special education system.

Mr. Whiston congratulated Lupe Ramos-Montigny who was honored with a scholarship and endowment fund in her name, which was announced at the Hispanic Scholarship and Awards Gala on October 14, 2015.

Mr. Whiston congratulated Kathleen Straus on receiving the Mel Miller Award for Outstanding Social Studies Leader during the Joint Social Studies Conference on November 6, 2015.

VI. RECESS

The Board recessed the Regular Meeting at 9:42 a.m. to convene the Committee of the Whole.

**COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE MEETING**

VII. CALL TO ORDER

Mr. Whiston called the Committee of the Whole Meeting to order at 9:45 a.m.

VIII. PRESENTATION ON HEAD START AND EARLY HEAD START IN MICHIGAN

Susan Broman, Deputy Superintendent, Great Start; Kaitlin Ferrick, Director, Head Start State Collaboration; and Lucy McClintic, Director, Capital Area Community Services Head Start; presented on Head Start and Early Head Start in Michigan.

Mr. Whiston said the federal Head Start program serves thousands of Michigan's most at-risk children each year and is a key partner in the state early childhood system. He said the presentation will provide an overview of Head Start in Michigan, MDE's Head Start Collaboration Office, and new federal initiatives, such as the Early Head Start-Child Care Partnerships that focus on providing high-quality, comprehensive services to children and families.

Information was shared via a [PowerPoint presentation](#).

Board member comments included family participation and supports in work force development and education opportunities, suspension and expulsion, and opportunities for students with special needs.

IX. PRESENTATION ON 2015 MICHIGAN STUDENT TEST OF EDUCATIONAL PROGRESS (M-STEP) ASSESSMENT RESULTS

Dr. Venessa Keesler, Deputy Superintendent, Accountability Services, presented the 2015 Michigan Student Test of Educational Progress (M-STEP) Assessment Results.

Mr. Whiston said on October 27th, the MDE released the statewide assessment results for the inaugural M-STEP assessment. He said the results from this new, more rigorous assessment measure Michigan's career and college ready standards, and provide a new baseline from which to understand the current readiness of Michigan students. He said the presentation focuses on the statewide results.

Information was shared via a [PowerPoint presentation](#).

There were no comments by State Board of Education members.

X. UPDATE ON THE PROCESS FOR SOCIAL STUDIES STANDARDS

Ms. Norma Jean Sass, Deputy Superintendent, Education Services; and Ms. Linda Forward, Director, Education Improvement and Innovation; provided an Update on the Process for Social Studies Standards.

Mr. Whiston said the presentation will provide an overview of the feedback received as well as modifications to the standards based on this feedback. He said the presentation will also provide an update on the process for gaining additional feedback based on the modifications made to the standards.

Mr. Whiston said a focus group will be convened to provide feedback on the modifications to the standards and allow for one additional public comment period before providing a final recommendation to the State Board of Education early next year.

Information was shared via a [Keynote presentation](#).

Board member comments included transparency in development of standards, public input, ensuring academic progression of learning is comprehensive, continuity of standards and appropriate length of time before revision, instructional proof, and meeting with social studies teachers regarding changes that may be viewed as non-essential.

XI. PRESENTATION ON SAFE AND SUPPORTIVE SCHOOLS GRANT OUTCOMES

Mr. Kyle Guerrant, Deputy Superintendent, Administration and School Support Services; and Ms. Marla Moss, Director, School Support Services; presented on Safe and Supportive Schools Grant Outcomes.

Mr. Whiston said staff from the Coordinated School Health and Safety Programs unit at the Michigan Department of Education have just completed a five-year U.S. Education Department grant working with 22 Priority high schools to improve conditions for learning and academic achievement. He said results from this grant are available and will be highlighted in the presentation.

Mr. Whiston said the School Health Committee is involved in this work, and Pam Pugh, Kathleen Straus and Richard Zeile serve on the School Health Committee.

Information was shared via a [PowerPoint presentation](#).

Board member comments included promoting cultures diminishing bullying and increasing learning outcomes, positive behavior support, restorative justice, seclusion and restraint, obstacles to expansion, reduction of suspensions and expulsions, suspension and expulsion data, report on bullying, correlation of data, grant funding, results from other states, and parent participation.

XII. DISCUSSION REGARDING CRITERIA FOR GRANT PROGRAMS

There were no Board member comments regarding criteria for grant programs.

XIII. ADJOURNED

The Board adjourned the Committee of the Whole at 11:34 a.m. and reconvened the Regular Meeting.

**REGULAR MEETING**

XIV. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION IN STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MEETING

A. Ms. Tawanna Simpson, Detroit, Michigan. Ms. Simpson, Member, Detroit Board of Education, shared verbal comments and written information regarding Detroit Public Schools.

B. Mr. Herman Davis, Detroit, Michigan. Mr. Davis, President, Detroit Board of Education, shared verbal comments and written information regarding Detroit Public Schools.

- C. Mr. William M. Davis, Detroit, Michigan. Mr. Davis, President, Taxpaying Residents United for Education (T.R.U.E.), shared verbal comments and written information regarding Detroit Public Schools.
- D. Ms. Tracy Arneau, Warren, Michigan. Ms. Arneau, representing T.R.U.E., shared verbal comments and written information regarding taxpayers, residents and educators of Detroit Public Schools.
- E. Ms. Beth Kubitskey, Northville, Michigan. Ms. Kubitskey shared verbal comments regarding science standards.
- F. Ms. Jane Wilson, Marshall, Michigan. Ms. Wilson, representing Constitutional Conservative Americans, shared verbal comments regarding the science standards.

XV. RECESS

The Board recessed the Regular Meeting at 12:00 p.m. and reconvened at 1:00 p.m.

XVI. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION IN STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MEETING  
(continued)

- G. Ms. Melanie Kurdys, Plainwell, Michigan. Ms. Kurdys, representing Stop Common Core in Michigan, provided verbal comments regarding science and social studies standards.
- H. Ms. Tamara Carlone, Novi, Michigan. Ms. Carlone provided verbal comments and written information regarding science standards.
- I. Dr. Joe Krajcik, Ann Arbor, Michigan. Dr. Krajcik provided verbal comments on science standards.
- J. Mr. James Emmerling, representing the Michigan Math and Science Centers Network and Genesee Intermediate School District, shared verbal comments on science standards.
- K. Ms. Michelle Frederick, White Lake, Michigan. Ms. Frederick provided verbal comments on science standards.
- L. Senator Patrick Colbeck, representing Michigan's 7<sup>th</sup> State Senate District, shared verbal comments regarding science and social studies standards.
- M. Ms. Emily Pohlonski, Novi, Michigan. Ms. Pohlonski, President, Network of Michigan Educators, provided verbal comments and written information regarding science standards.

- N. Ms. Robby Cramer, Grand Haven, Michigan. Ms. Cramer, Executive Director, Michigan Science Teachers Association, provided verbal comments and written information on science standards.
- O. Ms. Michelle Cline, Garden City, Michigan. Ms. Cline, representing HOPE for K-8 Education, provided verbal comments on science standards.
- P. Ms. Sandra Fischer, Crosswell, Michigan; and Ms. Tabitha Kaboni, Lexington, Michigan; provided verbal comments on science standards.
- Q. Ms. Jen Arnsward, Lowell, Michigan. Ms. Arnsward, President-elect, Michigan Science Teachers Association, provided verbal comments on science standards.

XVII. PERSONAL PRIVILEGE – MR. BRIAN J. WHISTON

Mr. Whiston asked Deputy Superintendents to introduce employees recently hired by the Michigan Department of Education.

Mr. Kyle Guarrant, Deputy Superintendent, Administration and School Support Services, introduced Ms. Jodi Woodman from Financial Management.

Ms. Susan Broman, Deputy Superintendent, Great Start, introduced Ms. Elizabeth Redding from the Great Start Administrative and Fiscal Unit.

XVIII. APPROVAL OF STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MINUTES

F. Approval of Minutes of Regular and Committee of the Whole Meeting of October 13, 2015

**Dr. Ulbrich moved, seconded by Dr. Pugh, that the State Board of Education approve the Minutes of the Regular and Committee of the Whole Meeting of October 13, 2015.**

The vote was taken on the motion.

**The motion carried unanimously.**

XIX. PRESIDENT’S REPORT

Mr. Austin said he participated in a press conference and presentation of the report “Adolescents’ Reporting of Bullying and Peer Victimization in School” on October 26, 2015. He said the Wayne State University report provides insights on the status of adolescent bullying in Michigan and responses to bullying.

Mr. Austin said “Reaching for Opportunity – An Action Plan to Increase Michigan’s Postsecondary Credential Attainment” will be released the first

week in December. Mr. Austin said the plan has been developed during the past year by a workgroup of stakeholders in Michigan's higher education system. He said the report is focused on how to help more Michigan youth and adults participate in postsecondary education, and complete degrees and credentials.

Mr. Austin invited Mrs. Weiser and Ms. Fecteau to share an update on the Special Education Task Force. He said that Mrs. Weiser and Ms. Fecteau are members of the task force, which is convened by Lieutenant Governor Brian Calley. Mrs. Weiser and Ms. Fecteau said the task force is meeting through December 22, and a report should be finished in January. They said the task force follows a summer listening tour by Lieutenant Governor Calley, and Ms. Fecteau attended most of the sessions. They said discussion includes revision of the process for rules promulgation to include more outreach and inclusion and student-focused resolution of disputes in school districts. They said Teri Chapman, Director, Special Education, Michigan Department of Education, is also on the task force, and a report will be shared with the Board in the future.

## XX. REPORT OF THE SUPERINTENDENT

### Reports

G. Human Resources Report

H. Report on Property Transfer

### Grants

I. Report on Grant Awards

1. 2015-2016 Title I, Part C Migrant Education Programs – Amendment; \$3,628,358
2. 2015-2016 Title I, Part D, Subpart 1, Neglected and Delinquent Program for State Agencies - Initial; \$1,018,398
3. 2015-2016 Title X, McKinney-Vento Homeless Students Assistance Grant - Initial; \$1,256,879
4. 2015-2016 IDEA, Part B Grant Funded Initiatives - Initial; \$20,075,000
5. 2015-2016 State Personnel Development Grant Under the IDEA - Initial; \$1,386,000
6. 2014-2015 1003(g) School Improvement Grant - Amendment; \$53,040,272
7. 2014-2015 1003(g) School Improvement Grant - Amendment; \$53,434,372
8. 2014-2015 ISD Collaboration Grant - Amendment; Continuation; \$419,600
9. 2014-2015 Section 22.i: Technology Readiness Infrastructure Grant - Amendment; \$25,437,500

10. 2015-2016 ISD Collaboration Grant - Initial; \$180,000
11. 2015-2016 ISD Collaboration Grant - Initial; \$634,700
12. 2015-2016 Mathematics and Science Centers - Initial; \$1,999,972
13. 2015-2016 Mathematics and Science Partnership (MSP) Grant Program (Title II, Part B) - Initial; \$3,546,972
14. 2015-2016 Title I Statewide System of Support Technical Assistance Grant - Initial; Continuation; \$5,484,346
15. 2015-2016 Evaluation for 21st Century Community Learning Centers (21st CCLC) Program - Initial, Continuation; \$388,330
16. 2015-2016 Great Start Readiness Program Evaluation Grant - Continuation; \$300,000
17. 2015-2016 Individuals with Disabilities Education Act Preschool Indicators Grant - Initial; \$250,000
18. 2015-2016 Statewide Systems Collaboration for Technical Assistance Supports Grant for 21st CCLC - Initial; \$150,000
19. 2013-2014 Safe and Supportive Schools Grant - Amendment; \$1,921,298
20. 2015-2016 Child and Adolescent Health Centers - Initial; \$5,557,300
21. 2015-2016 Hearing and Vision Screenings - Initial; \$5,150,000
22. 2015-2016 Safe Schools/Healthy Students State Planning, Local Educ. Agencies, & Local Communities - Initial; \$1,660,500

Mr. Whiston said input has been gathered from a wide variety of sources regarding developing Michigan into a Top 10 Education Performing State. He said the input is being considered, a stakeholder meeting will be held, and the plan will be finalized. He said Board action is anticipated at the December 8, 2015 meeting.

Mr. Whiston said committees on Funding, Accountability and Assessment continue to meet, and their input will also be included in the Top 10 plan.

Mr. Whiston said he is thankful for the support and kindness his family has received during the past month.

XXI. REPORT OF MICHIGAN TEACHER OF THE YEAR

Mr. Rick Joseph, the 2015-2016 Michigan Teacher of the Year, provided his report. Mr. Joseph shared a video presentation highlighting his activities during the past month as the Michigan Teacher of the Year.

XXII. DISCUSSION AND APPROVAL OF MICHIGAN SCIENCE STANDARDS

Ms. Norma Jean Sass, Deputy Superintendent, Education Services; Ms. Linda Forward, Director, Education Improvement and Innovation; Mr. Stephen Best, Assistant Director, Education Improvement and Innovation; presented Discussion and Approval of Michigan Science Standards.

Mr. Whiston said the presentation is an overview of the results of the public information sessions and public comment feedback for the proposed Michigan K-12 Science Standards. He said the Board will be requested to approve the updated Michigan K-12 Science Standards.

Information was shared via a [Keynote presentation](#).

**Mr. Austin moved, seconded by Dr. Ulbrich, that the State Board of Education adopt the updated Michigan K-12 Science Standards, as described in the Superintendent's memorandum dated October 27, 2015.**

Mr. Austin said Michigan has the ability to be a leader in science and engineering. He said the standards were developed with strong Michigan leadership. He said science standards should be updated.

Mr. Joseph said it is critical that the standards are informing practice and curriculum that is decided at a local level. He said teachers will be supported and nurtured and parents and community members will be able to understand the creative aspect of science. He said he endorses the standards.

Dr. Ulbrich said she appreciates science teachers coming to Board meetings for more than a year encouraging the Board and Department to move the process forward. She said Michigan Student Test of Educational Progress (M-STEP) numbers reflect that what is currently being done is not producing the desired results. She said science should be hands on and she is excited about the new standards.

Mrs. Straus said she supports the new standards which show that science can be exciting.

Mrs. Weiser said implementation of any change in Kindergarten through Grade 12 is complicated, but not necessarily costly. She said schools are used to the ten-year cycle, and it is built into budgets. She said teachers of science and mathematics are excited, because teaching in subject silos isn't as effective. She said M-STEP scores in science are low, and the standards have Michigan-centric information. She said Project Lead the Way (PLTW) is in 118 Michigan schools, and PLTW is using the standards which bring science, engineering and mathematics alive to students.

Dr. Zeile said he read the framework in 2014. He said there is a report that says that most college graduates who majored in science don't understand science. He said he wonders where the expertise will be found. He said he also has questions about continuity and if the vision itself is coherent. He said no one in the K-12 system has had the benefit of 12 years of the same standards.

Ms. Ramos-Montigny said the current standards are ten years old. She said everything changes in ten years, and changes to the standards are overdue. She said she supports the standards.

The vote was taken on the motion.

**Ayes: Austin, Fecteau, Pugh, Ramos-Montigny, Straus,  
Ulbrich, Weiser**

**Nay: Zeile**

**The motion carried.**

XXIII. STATE AND FEDERAL LEGISLATIVE UPDATE

Mr. Martin Ackley, Director, Public and Governmental Affairs; Dr. Casandra Ulbrich, Chair, State Board of Education Legislative Committee; and Mrs. Kathleen Straus, NASBE Governmental Affairs Committee; presented the State and Federal Legislative Update.

Mr. Ackley said the Board's Legislative Committee met on November 2, 2015. Dr. Ulbrich said the committee discussed the Detroit Education Proposal. She said the legislation has not been introduced.

Dr. Ulbrich read the draft Statement on the Detroit Education Proposal.

**Mr. Austin moved, seconded by Mrs. Straus, that the State Board of Education adopt the Statement on the Detroit Education Proposal.**

**Mrs. Weiser moved, seconded by Dr. Zeile, that the following amendments be made to the statement:**

**5<sup>th</sup> paragraph, delete "; and"**

**6<sup>th</sup> paragraph, delete "It's time to restore political accountability to the people of Detroit." and**

**6<sup>th</sup> paragraph, add "educationally and" politically accountable to Detroit residents.**

Mr. Austin accepted the amendments.

The vote was taken on the amendments to the statement.

**There was unanimous approval to include the amendments.**

Discussion followed.

**Mrs. Weiser moved, seconded by Ms. Ramos-Montigny, that the second sentence of the first paragraph be deleted.**

Mr. Austin accepted the amendment.

The vote was taken on the amendment to the statement.

**There was unanimous approval to include the amendment.**

Discussion followed.

**Mrs. Straus moved, seconded by Mr. Austin, that "leadership" precede enrollment in the fourth paragraph.**

Mr. Austin accepted the amendment.

The vote was taken on the amendment to the statement.

**There was unanimous approval to include the amendment.**

Dr. Pugh said the statement is ambiguous. She said that although she appreciates the Governor discussing the proposal with the Board, she cannot agree with the plan. She said the Detroit community asked for an audit during Public Participation at the Board meeting, and she wants to make sure that is considered as part of the discussion.

Discussion followed.

**Ms. Ramos-Montigny made a motion to table the statement.**

**There was no second on the motion to table.**

Discussion followed.

Mr. Guerrant said an independent financial audit is being presented to the Detroit Board of Education at its next meeting.

The vote was taken on the motion, as amended.

**Ayes: Austin, Ramos-Montigny, Straus, Ulbrich, Weiser, Zeile**  
**Nay: Pugh**  
**Abstain: Fecteau**

**The motion carried.**

The Statement on the Detroit Education Proposal is attached as Exhibit A.

Mrs. Straus said the Elementary and Secondary Education Act may be reauthorized in the near future, based on information she received from the National Association of State Boards of Education. Mr. Whiston said he will

send a letter to Michigan's Congressional delegates urging them to vote yes on the reauthorization of the Elementary and Secondary Education Act.

Dr. Pugh requested further clarification on the Detroit Public Schools audit, and Mr. Whiston said staff will follow up on the request.

XXIV. CONSENT AGENDA

- L. Approval of Michigan Standards for the Preparation of Teachers of World Languages
- M. Approval of Criteria for Mental Health and Wellness Commission Funding, \$250,000
- N. Approval of Grant Criteria for Office of Special Education Adolescent Literacy model Demonstration Projects, \$1,600,000
- O. Approval of Grant Criteria for Section 55 Conductive Education Evaluation Project Grant, \$150,000

**Ms. Lupe Ramos-Montigny moved, seconded by Mrs. Weiser, that the State Board of Education approve the Superintendent's recommendation for the consent agenda as follows:**

- L. approve the Michigan Standards for the preparation of Teachers of World Languages, as attached to the Superintendent's memorandum dated October 27, 2015;**
- M. approve the Criteria for Mental Health and Wellness Commission Funding, as attached to the State Superintendent's memorandum dated October 27, 2015;**
- N. approve Grant Criteria for Office of Special Education Adolescent Literacy Model Demonstration Projects, as attached to the Superintendent's memorandum dated October 27, 2015; and**
- O. approve the Grant Criteria for Section 55 Conductive Education Evaluation Project, as attached to the Superintendent's memorandum dated October 27, 2015.**

The vote was taken on the motion.

**The motion carried unanimously.**

XXV. COMMENTS BY STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MEMBERS

Mr. Austin thanked Board members for working together toward resolution regarding difficult issues during the Board meeting.

Dr. Pugh asked if the timing of State Board of Education meetings has been discussed. Mr. Austin said meetings are recorded and archived so that they may be viewed on demand.

Dr. Pugh said parents may have a difficult time expressing themselves without seeming adversarial, and she urged people to be cognizant of that when relating and communicating with school districts.

XXVI. TENTATIVE AGENDA FOR NEXT MEETING

Mr. Whiston asked the Board to notify him of agenda topics they would like included on a future agenda. He provided the upcoming State Board of Education meeting dates.

XXVII. FUTURE MEETING DATES

- A. Tuesday, December 8, 2015, Regular Meeting (9:30 a.m.)
- B. Tuesday, January 12, 2016, Regular Meeting (9:30 a.m.)
- C. Tuesday, February 9, 2016, Regular Meeting (9:30 a.m.)

XXVIII. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 3:24 p.m.

The video archive of the meeting is available at [www.michigan.gov/sbe](http://www.michigan.gov/sbe).

Respectfully submitted,

Michelle Fecteau  
Secretary

**STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION  
STATEMENT ON DETROIT EDUCATION PROPOSAL**

The children of Detroit deserve and are entitled to a quality education. The State Board of Education agrees that it is time to instill a sense of normalcy, stability and respect to the educational framework in Detroit. We welcome a public dialogue on how best to improve educational outcomes for students.

The State Board of Education eagerly awaits the release of draft legislation depicting the Governor's announced plan for Detroit schools. Having been briefed on the direction of proposed legislation, the State Board of Education shares the following areas of support, and recommendations for improvement in the plan:

Quality Schools – the focus must remain on providing a quality education for all children of Detroit, regardless of economic status, disability, language barriers and other challenges. Improvement is always a difficult task, but is even more so under conditions that create instability in leadership, enrollment, services, and access. With 95 Detroit Public Schools (DPS) schools, 97 charter schools, and 15 Education Achievement Authority schools, Detroit parents have plenty of “choices.” What they often lack are easily-accessible, quality choices. We support proposals that better ensure quality education across all public schools, and the ability of all Detroit children and parents to access them.

Debt Reduction – The State of Michigan has had direct oversight of DPS for over a decade, during a time of growing deficits. The State Board of Education supports proposals whereby the State assumes responsibility for paying off this debt before it grows larger without penalizing other schools and students in Michigan.

Governance – Detroit Public Schools has been under state control for nearly 15 years, and currently is experiencing its fourth Emergency Manager. In addition, 15 former DPS schools are now controlled by the state-created Education Achievement Authority. The current plan calls for additional state control in the form of a majority-Governor appointed Detroit Education Commission, as well as an initial majority-Governor appointed Detroit Community School District Board. The State Board of Education is concerned about the continuing lack of citizen oversight over their own schools. We support proposals that provide democratic governance and oversight of Detroit's public schools that is educationally and politically accountable to Detroit residents.

Adopted November 10, 2015