

## MINUTES

### STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION

Ladislaus B. Dombrowski Board Room  
John A. Hannah Building  
608 West Allegan  
Lansing, Michigan

March 14, 2017  
9:30 a.m.

Present: Mr. Brian J. Whiston, Chairman  
Dr. Casandra E. Ulbrich, Co-President  
Dr. Richard Zeile, Co-President  
Ms. Michelle Fecteau, Secretary  
Mr. Tom McMillin, Treasurer  
Ms. Nikki Snyder, NASBE Delegate  
Dr. Pamela Pugh  
Ms. Lupe Ramos-Montigny  
Mrs. Eileen Weiser  
Mr. Tyler Sawher, representing Governor Rick Snyder, ex officio

Also Present: Mrs. Tracy Horodyski, 2016-2017 Michigan Teacher of the Year

### REGULAR MEETING

#### I. CALL TO ORDER

Mr. Whiston called the meeting to order at 9:30 a.m.

#### II. INFORMATION FOLDER ITEMS

1. Information on Nominations to the Special Education Advisory Committee
2. NASA STEM Challenge Showcase Invitation from Michigan Department of Education 21<sup>st</sup> Century Community Learning Centers

#### III. APPROVAL OF AGENDA AND ORDER OF PRIORITY

**Dr. Ulbrich moved, seconded by Mr. McMillin, that the State Board of Education approve the agenda and order of priority.**

The vote was taken on the motion to approve the agenda and order of priority.

**Ayes: McMillin, Ramos-Montigny, Snyder, Ulbrich, Zeile**  
**Absent: Fecteau, Pugh, Weiser**

**The motion carried.**

Mrs. Weiser arrived at 9:33 a.m.

IV. INTRODUCTION OF STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MEMBERS AND STAFF

Mrs. Marilyn Schneider, State Board Executive, introduced members of the State Board of Education.

Mr. Whiston welcomed Sheila Alles, Chief Deputy Superintendent, who joined the Michigan Department of Education on March 1, 2017.

Mr. Whiston asked that newly hired staff members of the Michigan Department of Education be introduced.

Mr. Kyle Guerrant, Deputy Superintendent of Finance and Operations, introduced Ms. Linda Isaacson from the Library of Michigan; Ms. Angela Bolan and Ms. Kyle Kirkby from the Office of School Support Services; Ms. Lynsey Welmers from the Office of Special Education; and Ms. Christine Wearsch from Early Childhood Development and Family Education.

Mr. Whiston invited the audience to introduce themselves.

V. RECESS

The Board recessed the Regular Meeting at 9:36 a.m. to convene the Committee of the Whole.

**COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE MEETING**

VI. CALL TO ORDER

Mr. Whiston called the Committee of the Whole Meeting to order at 9:37 a.m.

VII. PRESENTATION ON 2017 STATE EDUCATION TECHNOLOGY PLAN

Ms. Linda Forward, Director of Education Improvement and Innovation; Ms. Michelle Ribant, Director of 21<sup>st</sup> Century Learning; Ms. Ann-Marie Mapes, Technology Planning Coordinator and Communications Consultant; presented the 2017 State Education Technology Plan.

Mr. Whiston said the 2017 State of Michigan Technology Plan, MI Roadmap, was last revised in 2010. He said the proposed revisions align with the Top 10 in 10 and the national Education Technology Plan – Future Ready. He said the report provides a vision for transforming education through technology and supports the Top 10 in 10 focus areas of learner-centered supports, effective education workforce, strategic partnership and systemic infrastructure.

Information was provided via a [PowerPoint presentation](#) and video.

Dr. Pugh arrived at 9:48 a.m. and Ms. Fecteau arrived at 9:59 a.m.

Board member comments included connectivity available via cellular telephone, digital literacy; addition of data in report to include facts, figures and costs; data privacy; concerns with credentialing and badges as a means to employment; teachers and parents as primary data holders; parental opt out of data sharing; student participation without data sharing; collaborative effort of credible sources; aligned to Top 10 in 10; educators are key; and open education resources.

VIII. PRESENTATION ON PROPOSED STANDARDS FOR THE PREPARATION OF TEACHERS OF HEALTH AND PHYSICAL EDUCATION

Dr. Sarah LaVan, Manager of Professional Preparation and Learning; and Dr. Sean Kottke, Education Consultant, Professional Preparation Services; presented on Proposed Standards for the Preparation of Teachers of Health and Physical Education. Ms. Mary Teachout, Health and Physical Education Consultant, joined the presenters at the table to answer questions.

Mr. Whiston said the standards for the Preparation of Teachers of Health and Physical Education were updated to improvement alignment between educator preparation policy in Michigan and the Top 10 in 10 Strategic Goal 3 to develop, support and sustain a high-quality, prepared and collaborative education workforce. He said upon board approval, the standards will replace Michigan's current endorsement standards and will guide initial teacher preparation in health and physical education. He said following public comment, standards will be presented to the Board for approval at its May meeting.

Information was provided via a [PowerPoint presentation](#).

Board member comments included program requirements; characteristics of an effective health curriculum; addressing individual values and beliefs; sexuality education and parental opt out provision; professionalism in standards; reasons for educators not in agreement on survey regarding retooling and capacity; transition plan for students in educator pipeline; basic skills assessment and professional readiness exam; and combination of health and physical education.

IX. PRESENTATION ON INTERMEDIATE SCHOOL DISTRICT ROLE, FUNCTION AND STRUCTURE

Dr. William Miller, Executive Director of the Michigan Association of Intermediate School Administrators (MAISA); and Dr. Lisa Hagel, 2016-2017 MAISA President, and Superintendent of Genesee Intermediate School District; presented on Intermediate School District Role, Function and Structure.

Mr. Whiston welcomed Dr. Miller and Dr. Hagel, who shared information via a [PowerPoint presentation](#). The following documents were distributed: Michigan-Made ISDs; and Fifty-Five Years – Michigan Intermediate School Districts.

Board member comments included how intermediate school districts ensure their services meet local district needs; metrics and goals; accreditation process; passion and great work of intermediate school districts; technology; career and technical education training; early colleges; evaluation of intermediate school districts by local educational agencies including data from all levels; movable boundaries for partnerships; gaps in community college service areas; certifications available before high school graduation; career and technical education opportunities with private sector partnerships; consistency of services across intermediate school districts; supports for special education; combining of intermediate school districts in the past; sizes and budgets of intermediate school districts; relationships with intermediate school districts have improved; continuous quality improvement; diversity of districts require diverse supports; diversity in staffing; parents at forefront; key community members to better design and ensure access; coaching support from intermediate school district through job-embedded professional learning; parent involvement opportunity through diversity of staffing, which is a cornerstone of Head Start by bringing people up through the system.

X. PRESENTATION ON EVERY STUDENT SUCCEEDS ACT PLAN

Dr. Venessa Keesler, Deputy Superintendent of Educator, Student and School Supports, presented on the Every Student Succeeds Act (ESSA) Plan.

Mr. Whiston said the presentation provides a summary of the public comment process and comments received for Michigan's Draft Consolidated State Plan for the Every Student Succeeds Act, as well as updates on discussion related to the draft plan. He said the period of public comment will continue through March 16, 2017. Mr. Whiston said he continues to meet with organizations and is receiving comments from them related to the ESSA Plan.

Information was provided via a [PowerPoint presentation](#).

Board member comments included the ability of districts to calculate their ranking; local control; inappropriate uses of test results; growth data for students; submission date for ESSA Plan; federal guidance template; letter grading of schools; transparency for parents; complexity of dashboard; equal weighting for school quality and academic factors; subgroup size for special education; accountability factors; state legislation pending; and items to be included on school accountability dashboard.

XI. RECESS

The Board recessed the Committee of the Whole Meeting at 12:07 p.m. to reconvene the Regular Meeting.

## REGULAR MEETING

### XII. VOTE TO CONVENE CLOSED SESSION TO DISCUSS ANNUAL EVALUATION OF STATE SUPERINTENDENT

**Dr. Ulbrich moved, seconded by Dr. Zeile, that the State Board of Education convene in closed session at the request of Brian Whiston, Superintendent of Public Instruction, in order to consider a periodic personnel evaluation of the Superintendent of Public Instruction, as provided in Section 8(a) of the Open Meetings Act.**

A roll call vote was taken on the motion.

**Fecteau – Aye  
McMillin – Aye  
Pugh – Aye  
Ramos-Montigny – Aye  
Snyder – Aye  
Ulbrich – Aye  
Weiser – Aye  
Zeile – Aye**

**The motion carried unanimously.**

### XIII. RECESS

The Board recessed at 12:09 p.m., at which time the Board met in closed session until 1:10 p.m. The Board reconvened in open session at 1:30 p.m.

Mr. Sawher left the meeting at 12:30 p.m.

### XIV. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION IN STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MEETING

1. Rogelio Landin, PerformancED, Detroit, Michigan, provided comments on the Every Student Succeeds Act Plan and 21<sup>st</sup> Century Education Commission Report.
2. Mark McWilliams, Michigan Protection and Advocacy Service Inc., Lansing, Michigan, provided comments supporting the seclusion and restraint policy.
3. Julie Dye from Jackson, Michigan, provided comments on Native American themed high school sports names, mascots and logos.
4. Redbird, representing Real Americans, North America, provided comments on Native American themed mascots.

Mr. Whiston left the meeting at 1:47 p.m. to attend a meeting with Governor Snyder. Dr. Zeile and Dr. Ulbrich chaired the meeting in Mr. Whiston's absence.

5. Chad Swan-Badgero, Michigan Council for the Arts and Cultural Affairs, Lansing, Michigan, provided comments supporting the inclusion of the arts in the Every Student Succeeds Act Plan.
6. Cory Micheel-Mays and Karen Salvadore, Michigan Music Education Association, Jackson, Michigan, provided comments and written information on music education, certification and the Every Student Succeeds Act Plan.
7. LaMar Lemmons, Detroit, Michigan, provided comments on Detroit schools.

XV. RECESS

The Board recessed the Regular Meeting at 2:00 p.m. to reconvene the Committee of the Whole.

**COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE MEETING**

XVI. PRESENTATION ON TOP 10 IN 10

Ms. Sheila Alles, Chief Deputy Superintendent; and Mr. Stephen Best, Director of Strategic Planning and Implementation; presented on the Top 10 in 10.

Dr. Zeile said Michigan's efforts to become a Top 10 education state within the next 10 years have led a number of individuals and groups to ask exactly how that is defined. As the Top 10 strategies are being planned and implemented, the metrics for identifying progress are continuing to be refined as well. Dr. Zeile said the presentation will provide additional insight and information on how Michigan will monitor progress toward the goal, and how the efforts align with other major initiatives taking place in Michigan's education system.

Information was shown via a [Keynote presentation](#).

Mr. Whiston and Mr. Sawher rejoined the meeting at 2:35 p.m.

Board member comments included the definition of economically disadvantaged; side effects of testing; allowing for creativity and local control; empowering teachers through educator preparation and certification to improve reading literacy; National Assessment of Educational Progress (NAEP) scores of 8<sup>th</sup> graders compared to the same students' 4<sup>th</sup> grade scores; alignment to Top 10 in 10; training motivation; clarification of NAEP proficiency; consideration of Michigan's high poverty rate; consideration of absenteeism; and average SAT total.

XVII. DISCUSSION REGARDING CRITERIA FOR GRANT PROGRAM

There were no Board member comments regarding grant criteria.

XVIII. ADJOURNMENT

The Board adjourned the Committee of the Whole at 2:57 p.m. to reconvene the Regular Meeting.

**REGULAR MEETING**

XIX. APPROVAL OF STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MINUTES

H. Approval of Minutes of Special Meeting of February 6, 2017

**Dr. Ulbrich moved, seconded by Mr. McMillin, that the State Board of Education approve the Minutes of the Special Meeting of February 6, 2017.**

The vote was taken on the motion.

**The motion carried unanimously.**

I. Approval of Minutes of Regular and Committee of the Whole Meeting of February 14, 2017

**Mr. McMillin moved, seconded by Dr. Ulbrich, that the State Board of Education approve the Minutes of the Regular and Committee of the Whole Meeting of February 14, 2017.**

Dr. Ulbrich said at the February 14 meeting, she said that people offering public comment may wish to consider contacting the Office of Civil Rights. She said she was referring to the federal office rather than the state office.

The vote was taken on the motion.

**The motion carried unanimously.**

XX. REPORT OF THE CO-PRESIDENTS

Dr. Ulbrich said she, Ms. Fecteau and Mr. McMillin visited Osborn High School in Detroit. She said it is an educational complex housing three separate high schools that use Title I funds to keep class sizes small.

Dr. Zeile said the Governor's 21<sup>st</sup> Century Education Commission Report was released on March 10, 2017. He said the Board will have one agenda item related to the report later in the meeting, and other details of the report at a future meeting.

XXI. REPORT OF THE SUPERINTENDENT

J. Governor's 21<sup>st</sup> Century Education Commission Report

Reports

K. Human Resources Report

L. Report on Approved Changes to the Calhoun Intermediate School District Plan for the Delivery of Special Education Programs and Services

M. Report on Approved Changes to the Midland County Educational Service Agency Plan for the Delivery of Special Education Programs and Services

N. Report on Approved Changes to the West Shore Education Service District Plan for the Delivery of Special Education Programs and Services

O. Report on Cosponsorship

Grants

P. Report on Grant Awards

1. 2016-2017 Safe Schools/Healthy Students State Planning, Local Educational Agencies and Local Communities - Amendment; \$306,563
2. 2016-2017 Section 31b Year-Round School Grant - Initial; \$375,000
3. 2016-2017 ISD Collaboration Grant - Amendment; \$658,215
4. 2016-2017 Science Olympiad - Initial; \$250,000
5. 2016-2017 Section 99h: Competitive FIRST Robotics Grants - Amendment; \$2,049,000
6. 2015-2016 Title I, Part A - Improving Basic Programs - Amendment; \$467,184,843
7. 2015-2016 Title I, Part D, Subpart 2 - Prevention and Intervention for Neglected and Delinquent - Amendment; \$7,302,881
8. 2015-2016 Title III, English Language Acquisition - Amendment; \$9,200,185
9. 2015-2016 Title III, English Language Acquisition – Amendment (2); \$9,200,185



10. 2015-2016 Title III, English Language Acquisition - Amendment (3); \$9,200,185
11. 2016-2017 Title I, Part A - Improving Basic Programs - Amendment; \$459,781,732
12. 2016-2017 Title II, Part A - Teacher and Principal Training and Recruiting - Amendment; \$84,199,529
13. 2016-2017 Section 104(4) - Kindergarten Readiness Assessment Pilot Project - Initial; \$185,000

Mr. Whiston provided a verbal report on Partnership Agreements with school districts to improve achievement levels, Native American mascots and logos in schools, special education, and the Governor's 21<sup>st</sup> Century Education Commission.

#### XXII. REPORT OF MICHIGAN TEACHER OF THE YEAR

Mrs. Tracy Horodyski, 2016-2017 Michigan Teacher of the Year, presented the Report of the Michigan Teacher of the Year.

Mrs. Horodyski shared information on professional learning communities, school visits, conferences, and visits to educator preparation programs.

#### XXIII. PERSONAL PRIVILEGE – TYLER SAWHER

Mr. Tyler Sawher, Senior Strategy Advisor for Education and Career Connections, Governor's Office, said Governor Snyder continues to support an A-F grading system for school accountability, and looks forward to talking about A-F and working through the details with the State Superintendent and State Board of Education.

#### XXIV. STATE AND FEDERAL LEGISLATIVE UPDATE

Mr. Martin Ackley, Director, Public and Governmental Affairs; and Mrs. Eileen Weiser, Chair of the State Board of Education Legislative Committee; presented the State and Federal Legislative Update.

Mr. Ackley provided an update on pending legislation. He said the appropriations process is continuing with meetings in the Senate and House of Representatives.

Mr. Ackley said the Board's Legislative Committee met on March 3 and Mrs. Weiser was elected Chair of the Committee. He said one of the topics of discussion was the report prepared for Governor Snyder by the 21<sup>st</sup> Century Education Commission.

Mrs. Weiser said, because the report, The Best Education System for Michigan Success, was not released until March 10, 2017, the State Board

of Education Legislative Committee met on March 13, 2017 to consider a statement regarding the report. Mrs. Weiser asked Mrs. Schneider to distribute a draft statement for consideration by the Board. Ms. Snyder distributed and read an alternate version of the statement.

Mr. Sawher left the meeting at 3:18 p.m.

**Mr. McMillin moved, seconded by Dr. Zeile, that the State Board of Education adopt the State Board of Education Statement on the Governor's 21<sup>st</sup> Century Education Commission, as presented at its March 14, 2017 meeting.**

Mrs. Weiser said she supports the draft statement provided by Ms. Snyder. Mrs. Weiser proposed a friendly amendment to the title, noting that the Board's statement is responding to only one aspect of the report, Guiding Principle 9 – Update K-12 Governance.

Dr. Ulbrich proposed a friendly amendment to add gubernatorial in the last sentence of the statement to read, "Therefore, we oppose the elimination or gubernatorial appointment of the State Board of Education."

Dr. Zeile said the committee's report is a list rather than a plan, so the elimination of this recommendation would not affect the other recommendations in the report.

The vote was taken on the motion, as amended by discussion.

**The motion carried unanimously.**

The State Board of Education Statement on the Governor's 21st Century Education Commission, Guiding Principle 9 – Update K-12 Governance is attached as Exhibit A.

Mr. Whiston said as reported at last month's meeting, the State Board of Education Legislative Committee reviewed the 2015-2016 Annual Legislative Report for School Improvement Plans at its January 25, 2017, meeting. He said the Board is required to submit the report to the Legislature annually, and it is on the agenda for approval by the Board today.

**Dr. Pugh moved, seconded by Mrs. Weiser, that the State Board of Education approve the 2015-2016 Annual Legislative Report for School Improvement Plans, as attached to the Superintendent's memorandum dated February 28, 2017, and submit the report to the Senate and House Committees on Education.**

The vote was taken on the motion.

**The motion carried unanimously.**

Dr. Pugh said earlier in the meeting there was discussion regarding Native American mascots. She asked if this was the proper time to discuss addressing the issue through a legislative effort.

Mrs. Weiser said Mr. Whiston had previously reported that he has asked the Attorney General if the State Superintendent has the authority to withhold state aid funding for a district that has an offensive Native American mascot or logo and refuses to change it. Mr. Whiston said is awaiting a response from the Attorney General.

Discussion followed.

**Dr. Pugh moved, seconded by Ms. Ramos-Montigny, that state school aid funding be withheld from school districts that have Native American mascots, nicknames and logos that are offensive.**

Mr. Ackley said Department staff would need to request the appropriations committees in the legislature to include boilerplate language in the state School Aid Budget to allow the Michigan Department of Education to withhold funds for schools that have Native American mascots, nicknames and logos that are offensive.

Mr. McMillin said offensive Native American mascots and logos would need to be defined, and include an appeals process.

Ms. Ramos-Montigny said there is an urgency to address racism.

Mr. Whiston said his recommendation for the process would be that the State Superintendent would send a letter to the school district allowing 60 days for the district to take action, and if no action is taken the State Superintendent could direct the Department to withhold school aid funding. He said the demeaning mascot names would need to be defined.

Dr. Pugh said she accepts the recommendations as a friendly amendments.

Mrs. Weiser said the Civil Rights Commission and other appropriate parties should be involved.

Ms. Ramos-Montigny called for the question.

Mr. Whiston read the motion to direct the State Superintendent to direct the Office of Public and Governmental Affairs to work with the legislature to include boilerplate language in the state School Aid Budget giving the State Superintendent the authority to withhold funding from a local school district that receives notice and does not change its demeaning Native American mascots, nicknames and logos, after being given 60 days to respond.

The vote was taken on the motion.

**Ayes: Fecteau, McMillin, Pugh, Ramos-Montigny, Snyder, Ulbrich, Weiser**  
**Abstain: Zeile**

**The motion carried.**

Mrs. Weiser said there is a National Association of State Boards of Education Legislative Conference on March 19-21 that she, Dr. Zeile and Ms. Ramos-Montigny will be attending. Mrs. Weiser said Michigan is receiving a NASBE stipend to work on developing teachers for preschool, and she will be attending that meeting.

XXV. DISCUSSION AND APPROVAL OF POLICY FOR EMERGENCY USE OF SECLUSION AND RESTRAINT

Mr. Whiston said on December 29, 2016, Lt. Governor Brian Calley signed Public Act 394-402 mandating requirements for the emergency use of seclusion and restraint. He said the Board is being asked to approve the Policy for the Emergency Use of Seclusion and Restraint, which would replace the previous policy approved by the State Board of Education on December 12, 2006. He said the new proposed policy reflects changes to the current board policy, as determined by the statute's requirements, and no additional changes have been made. He said the policy was discussed by the Board's Legislative Committee during its March 3, 2017, meeting.

Ms. Teri Chapman, Director, Special Education; and Ms. Joanne Winkelman, Program Accountability Supervisor; came to the board table.

**Ms. Snyder moved, seconded by Mrs. Weiser, that the State Board of Education approve the Policy for the Emergency Use of Seclusion and Restraint, as identified in the Superintendent's memorandum dated March 3, 2017.**

There were no Board member comments.

The vote was taken on the motion.

**The motion carried unanimously.**

XXVI. APPROVAL OF STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION STATEMENT OPPOSING A-F SCHOOL GRADING CURRENTLY IN THE EVERY STUDENT SUCCEEDS ACT PLAN AND SUPPORT OF AN ALTERNATIVE INCLUDING A NON-LETTER GRADE ACCOUNTABILITY DASHBOARD

Dr. Ulbrich said she and the Board appreciate the work being done to develop Michigan's Every Student Succeeds Act Plan, and input received from the public. She said one of the major components of the plan is reimagining the state school accountability system. She said as the plan is being finalized, it is important for the Board to provide direction and feedback, specifically as it relates to the state school accountability system.

She thanked Mr. McMillin for drafting the Statement Opposing A-F Grading of Schools and in Support of a Non-letter Grading Accountability System. Dr. Ulbrich said the statement opposes the A-F grading system for schools and supports a transparency dashboard which provides information for parents and taxpayers without creating a weighting system.

Copies of the draft statement were distributed.

**Dr. Ulbrich moved, seconded by Mr. McMillin, that the State Board of Education adopt the Statement Opposing A-F Grading of Schools and in Support of a Non-letter Grading Accountability System.**

Ms. Ramos-Montingy asked to see the transparency dashboard, which was displayed. Dr. Keesler came to the Board table to provide clarification and answer questions from Board members.

Ms. Ramos-Montigny said she does not believe all parents will understand the dashboard. She asked how the dashboard will increase student achievement.

Mr. McMillin said the dashboard can be altered to make it easier to understand. He said parents should be able to determine what is important to them, rather than having it predetermined for them with an arbitrary grade assigned to the school.

Dr. Ulbrich said the weighting done behind the scenes would not be in the transparency dashboard.

Discussion followed.

Dr. Ulbrich called for the question.

The vote was taken on the motion.

**The motion carried unanimously.**

Mr. Whiston said the Department will submit to the Legislature, as promised, an A-F school accountability system with a summed up grade; an A-F school accountability system with no summing of the grade; and a transparency report with no grades and just reporting of the items on a dashboard. He said it will be made clear that the Board's position is the transparency reporting, which will be the default if the Legislature does not take action on an A-F school accountability system.

Discussion followed.

The State Board of Education Statement Opposing A-F Grading of Schools and in Support of a Non-letter Grading Accountability System is attached as Exhibit B.

XXVII. EVALUATION OF SUPERINTENDENT OF PUBLIC INSTRUCTION AND APPROVAL OF ADDENDUM TO THE AGREEMENT BETWEEN THE BOARD AND THE STATE SUPERINTENDENT

Dr. Ulbrich said the State Board of Education met in closed session earlier in the meeting to consider the evaluation of the Superintendent of Public Instruction. She said there was good discussion, and Mr. Whiston's evaluation was positive. She said Board members expressed appreciation for Mr. Whiston's responsiveness, effective leadership, accessibility, listening skills, and effective work style.

Dr. Ulbrich said as a result of the positive evaluation of State Superintendent Whiston the Board will vote on three amendments: (1) extending the contract by one year to July 31, 2020; (2) updating technical language regarding the state-established mileage reimbursement system; and (3) amending the evaluation clause stating that all Board members shall participate in an annual evaluation of the State Superintendent, but new board members with less than one year on the Board, may opt their scores out of the final tabulation.

**Dr. Ulbrich moved, seconded by Dr. Zeile, that the State Board of Education approve the Second Addendum to the Agreement between the Board and Brian J. Whiston which extends the agreement between the Superintendent and the Board to July 31, 2020, updates the transportation clause, and amends the evaluation clause.**

The vote was taken on the motion.

**The motion carried unanimously.**

Mr. Whiston thanked the Board for the evaluation, and the relationship of working together. He said he encourages them to continue to work toward moving education forward. He said it may result in disagreements, but that is healthy and will result in better decisions.

XXVIII. CONSENT AGENDA

U. Approval of Criteria for Library Services and Technology Act Public Library Services Grant Program, \$100,000

**Mr. McMillin moved, seconded by Mrs. Weiser, that the State Board of Education approve the consent agenda as follows:**

**U. Approve the Grant Criteria for Library Services Technology Act Public Library Services Grant Program as attached to the Superintendent's memorandum dated February 28, 2017.**

The vote was taken on the motion.

**The motion carried unanimously.**

XXIX. COMMENTS BY STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MEMBERS

Ms. Fecteau thanked the Board members for approving the Policy for Emergency Use of Seclusion and Restraint.

Mr. McMillin congratulated Mr. Whiston on working with the Governor and other parties involved to provide the opportunity for Partnership Agreements with schools that were slated for closure. He said he has appreciated the opportunity to visit schools with Ms. Fecteau and Dr. Ulbrich.

Ms. Ramos-Montigny shared information on César E. Chávez. She invited her colleagues to attend the various events sponsored by the Committee to Honor César E. Chávez in support of students and their families.

XXX. FUTURE MEETING DATES

- A. Wednesday April 19, 2017 (9:30 a.m.) Regular Meeting
- B. Tuesday, May 16, 2017 (9:30 a.m.) Regular Meeting
- C. Wednesday, May 24, 2017 (9:30 a.m.) State Board Retreat
- D. Tuesday, June 13, 2017 (9:30 a.m.) Regular Meeting

XXXI. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 4:24 p.m.

The video archive of the meeting is available at the [Michigan State Board of Education website](http://www.michigan.gov/sbe) (www.michigan.gov/sbe).

Respectfully submitted,

Michelle Fecteau  
Secretary

**STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION STATEMENT ON  
GOVERNOR'S 21<sup>ST</sup> CENTURY EDUCATION COMMISSION  
GUIDING PRINCIPLE 9 – UPDATE K-12 GOVERNANCE**

The State Board of Education acknowledges the March 10, 2017 release of the Governor's 21<sup>st</sup> Century Education Commission Report. The document is comprehensive and displays the significance of educational leadership in improving education outcomes. The State Board of Education is committed to doing its part well: providing leadership in K-12 and higher education through its constitutional authority.

We believe that the Constitution's provision for a publicly elected body supervising public schools is a critical component for transparency and continuous oversight of education policy. It is essential that the voice of Michigan's citizens – including its families, students and educators – be respected and heard as part of the state's framework for improving our education outcomes. An elected State Board of Education ensures community engagement, and provides the strongest possible conduit between the state's financial and policy making responsibilities with local instructional control.

Therefore, we oppose the elimination or gubernatorial appointment of the State Board of Education.

Adopted March 14, 2017



**STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION STATEMENT OPPOSING A-F GRADING OF SCHOOLS  
AND IN SUPPORT OF A NON-LETTER GRADING ACCOUNTABILITY SYSTEM**

Whereas, the Every Student Succeeds Act (ESSA) signed into law December 10, 2015, was heralded as the federal government, among other things, giving back to states the ability to determine and even rethink their school accountability system;

Whereas, ESSA does not require states to implement an A-F school grading system;

Whereas, an A-F school grading system significantly increases the high-stakes nature of the statewide assessment and thereby negatively affects the education of students;

Whereas, the measurements in an A-F school grading system are arbitrary;

Whereas, the weight given to measurements in an A-F school grading system is arbitrary;

Whereas, an A-F school grading system can assign poor grades to schools where significant learning is being accomplished and where parents are pleased with their school;

Whereas, the American Statistical Association cautions against using high-stakes standardized tests to evaluate teachers and schools;

Whereas, historically, Michigan's primary form of school accountability has been democratically elected local school boards, citizen participation with school leadership, and access to school choice options;

Whereas, a non-letter grading accountability system can give meaningful measurements to parents and taxpayers;

Now, therefore, be it resolved that the State Board of Education opposes an A-F school grading system, including component letter grades, and further;

Finally, be it resolved, the State Board of Education supports a statewide, non-letter grading accountability system that provides families and caregivers meaningful data to make educational decisions on behalf of their children. This data could include such things as class size, teacher retention, and availability of arts, athletics, vocational programs, and services supporting special education and other at needs students as well as completion rates, scholarship attainment and employment outcomes of high school graduates.

Adopted March 14, 2017