



Report on the Wind and Health Technical Work Group

Mark H. Clevey, MPA, Manager

Consumer Education & Renewable Energy Programs

Bureau of Energy Systems (Energy Office)

State of Michigan, Department of Energy, Labor & Economic Growth

Ottawa Office Building, 4th Floor

611 West Ottawa Street

P.O. Box 30221

Lansing, MI 48909

Office Tel: (517) 241 6280, Office Fax: (517) 373 6734,

Office email: cleveym@michigan.gov

The Setting:

Michigan has *great potential* to become a world leader in the **research, development & commercialization** (*manufacturing*) of breakthrough wind energy-related technology, product, process and service innovations.

Similar to other durable-goods related industries (automotive, furniture, etc.) a **local market** is a **necessary condition** on which to launch such an effort.

- See: Andrew N. Liveris, Chairman/CEO, The Dow Chemical Company, *Make it in America: The Case for Re-Inventing the Economy*, 2011.

The Concern:

- There is no generally accepted scientific proof associated with positive and/or negative health effects associated with Wind Turbines (i.e., noise, flickering).
- Disputes over alleged negative health effects, however, have the *potential* to dampen and/or destroy the local wind energy market in the state.
 - Negative Impacts on Jobs, Economic Reinvention, Environment and Community Development.

Wind and Health Technical Work Group

The Michigan Public Service Commission (*Julie Baldwin*) and the Bureau of Energy Systems (*Mark H. Clevey*) have convened a **Wind and Health Technical Work Group.**

- Members represent academia, health, government and industry.
- The purpose of the committee is to recommend health-related changes to the Sample Zoning for Wind Energy Systems (April 2008).

Wind and Health Technical Work Group

The group has reviewed scientific literature, received technical briefings, surveyed best practices and reviewed issues associated with common disputes.

Some key findings:

- There is no **consistent, definitive** “*industry standards*” for measuring wind noise, Shadow Flicker, etc.
 - Local governments must therefore establish their *own standards* as part of Zoning Ordinances for Wind Turbines. (See: recommendations from BES, Great Lakes Renewable Energy Association, American Wind Energy Association and others...).
- There is a lack of ***definitive research*** on *positive* and/or *negative* health effects of wind – **if any**.
 - Findings from ***other industries and situations*** are guiding thinking (e.g., health effects of noise from non-wind energy sources, methods of measuring sound, etc.).

Wind and Health Technical Work Group

➤ **Some key findings (continued):**

- Some Michigan companies are establishing new standards for **Best Practices** associated with community engagement that *alleviate most concerns* over wind turbine siting
 - See ***Mackinaw Power, LLC*** project in Gratiot County.
- ***Community Dispute Resolution*** has potential for Wind (See Handout).

Wind and Health Technical Work Group

Based largely on best available scientific literature, technical briefings, best practices and review of related issues the Wind and Health Technical Work Group expects to make final recommendations soon to the MPSC/BES in three areas:

Physical Safety

Limitations on Shadow Flicker

Conflict Resolution

Wind and Health Technical Work Group

For more information on the *Wind and Health Technical Work Group* please contact:

Julie Baldwin, Manager
Renewable Energy Section
Michigan Public Service Commission
517 241-6115, 517 241-9784 (fax)
baldwinj2@michigan.gov