

STATE HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW BOARD MEETING
SEPTEMBER 5, 2003
MICHIGAN HISTORICAL CENTER

Elisabeth Knibbe, President, called the meeting to order at 10:06 a.m.

Board Members Present:

Janese Chapman, Lynn Evans, Alison (Kim) Hoagland, Elisabeth Knibbe, Carolyn Loeb, Jennifer Radcliff

Board Members Absent:

Richard Harms

Staff Members Present:

Amy Arnold, Laura Ashlee, Robert Christensen, Brian Conway, Brian Grennell, Ted Grevstad-Nordbrock, Paul Janostak, Martha MacFarlane-Faes, Robbert McKay, Alexandra Raven, Elizabeth Szufnar, Todd Walsh

Members of the Public Present:

Maura Johnson, concerning Boy's Club Building
Silva Freeman, concerning Kinross Township Hall and School
Jim Morse, concerning Kinross Township Hall and School
Marylinn Harrington, concerning Kinross Township Hall and School
Fred Wilson, concerning Lincoln Park Post Office
Leslie Lynch-Wilson, concerning Lincoln Park Post Office
Ray Fahlsing, concerning Orchard Beach State Park
Joyce & Hugh Drake, concerning St. Michael and All Angels Episcopal Church
Michael Eerdmans, concerning 640 S. Union Street, Grand Rapids, appeal

Approval of minutes of May 9, 2003:

Hoagland moved approval of minutes. Radcliff seconded. Vote 6-0.

Staff Reports:

Brian Conway

- Introduced himself and explained role of the review board.
- Marriage of Laura Ashlee and Dean Anderson.
- Appointment of Denise Sachau as SHPO Grants Manager.
- Resignation of Elizabeth Szufnar
- Addition of student volunteer from Eastern Michigan University, Mary Jo Burns.
- Temporary office move to Ottawa Building during reconstruction.
- Land Use Leadership Council (LULC) presented report to Governor Granholm. Report was very supportive of preservation.
- SHPO is working with the Department of Consumer and Industry Services (CIS) to enhance state tax incentive program.
- SHPO is working with Department of Management and Budget to determine feasibility of locating state offices and departments within historic buildings.
- SHPO is approaching the completion of contract with the Michigan Land Use Institute (MLUI) to fund publication entitled "A Civic Gift..."

- Reported the rapid success of the Michigan Main Street (Main Street) program, a partnership with the SHPO, Michigan Economic Development Corporation (MEDC) and Michigan State Housing Development Authority (MSHDA).
- Main Street has selected 4 communities from first round of applicants: Calumet, Boyne City, Portland and Marshall.
- SHPO has participated in Main Street workshops supporting the four selected communities.
- Main Street communities are in the process of hiring Main Street managers.
- SHPO will be conducting a Main Street workshop at Michigan State University's Kellogg Center September 29th and 30th for new Main Street applicants.
- Working with MEDC to provide funds to the SHPO to hire a Main Street design employee rather than outside consultants.
- Arnold will be participating in Michigan Society of Planners meeting October 15th through 18th in Traverse City.
- SHPO is in process of developing its annual work plan and has put out a call for public comment.
- SHPO has scheduled meeting with Michigan Historic Preservation Network (MHPN) to discuss better ways of working together.
- Completion of Fayette Field School, the 5th season at Fayette. Building 4 has been successfully rehabilitated, and is now being interpreted as a rehabilitation in process.
- FY04 budget still undecided. State portion is sure to be reduced. Federal portion undetermined.
- John Halsey, State Archaeologist, unable to attend meeting.

National Register Nominations

Site: St. Michael and All Angels Episcopal Church and Cambridge Township Cemetery, Cambridge Township, Lenawee County

Presented By: MacFarlane-Faes

Moved for Approval: Loeb

Seconded: Chapman

Vote: 6-0

Criteria: B, C; exc a, d

Level of Significance: local

Knibbe commented that the nomination should have included a site plan.

Letter of support from the Reverend Sandy Benes, Pastor, St. Michael and All Angels' Episcopal Church. Letter notes support from congregation.

Site: Kinross Township Hall and School, Kinross Township, Chippewa County

Presented By: Christensen

Moved for Approval: Hoagland

Seconded: Evans

Vote: 6-0

Criteria: A; b

Level of Significance: local

Knibbe commented that in the Statement of Significance it is stated that the "building" was closed when in fact, at the time, only the school portion of the building had been closed.

Letter of support from Jim Moore, Chippewa County Commissioner, District 6.

Site: Pickle Barrel House, Burt Township (Grand Marais), Chippewa County
Presented By: Grevstad-Nordbrock
Moved for Approval: Evans
Seconded: Hoagland
Vote: 6-0
Criteria: A, C; exc. b
Level of Significance: local

Radcliff noted typo in 3rd paragraph of Statement of Significance (Marais is spelled Marias). Hoagland noted additional misspellings of Marais as Marias. Knibbe also noted typos.

Site: Orchard Beach State Park, Manistee Township, Manistee County
Presented By: Janostak
Moved for Approval: Radcliff
Seconded: Loeb
Vote: 6-0
Criteria: A, C
Level of Significance: state

Chapman questioned why use of pavilion is not available to general public.

Radcliff inquired about architect's involvement with other state parks and whether this Hartwick was related to the Hartwick for whom Hartwick Pines is named. Evans noted that Hartwick Pines is named for WWI veteran.

Conway introduced guest from Department of Natural Resources (DNR), Ray Fahlsing.

Fahlsing detailed preservation plan for state parks. Fahlsing also presented a request that decision for nomination be tabled until next Review Board meeting.

Knibbe questioned rationale of exclusion of ½ of park.
Janostak explained that the part currently covered by the nomination is the only part connected with the CCC. The later, excluded portion of the park was developed after the second world war.

Hoagland asked about the National Park Service's (NPS) role in relation to the park. Noted that nomination doesn't validate the assertion of the NPS's role in planning of the park. Arnold stated that the NPS's common practice when work began in the mid 1930s was to be heavily involved in the early planning stages of park creation; within the next few years NPS began to delegate more and more responsibility to the states.

Radcliff questioned the DNR's reasoning for tabling nomination. Fahlsing stated that he was instructed to request delay in decision from his superiors. Conway asked what an acceptable time frame would be. Chapman asked if January 9th, which is the next Review Board meeting, would be enough time for DNR to complete necessary tasks. Fahlsing replied that January would be acceptable.

Site: Lincoln Park Post Office, Lincoln Park, Wayne County
Presented By: Ashlee
Moved for Approval: Hoagland
Seconded: Radcliff
Vote: 6-0

Criteria: A, C

Level of Significance: local

Radcliff asked if other post offices built during the same time period as this one had similar engraved limestone panels.

Radcliff inquired about the status of the mural taken from the post office. Lynch-Wilson responded that the mural is now in a museum on Beaver Island.

Wilson stated that the post office is also significant because of the bomb shelter located in the basement of the building.

Site: Boys Club Building, Battle Creek, Calhoun County

Presented By: Johnson

Moved for Approval: Chapman

Seconded: Loeb

Vote: 5-0 (Knibbe Abstaining)

Criteria: A, B, C

Level of Significance: Local

Hoagland asked whether windows being installed were similar to original windows. Johnson verified that new windows are of same kind as original.

Historic District Committee Study Reports:

Arnold presented the reports and staff comments to the board.

Report: Ebenezer AME Church Historic District, Detroit

Radcliff questioned whether list of board members was accurate. Chapman indicated the list needed updating. The board had no additional comments.

Report: Crescent Brass and Pin Historic District, Detroit

The board made no additional comments.

Report: Elimination of Demay-Potere Historic District, Rochester Hills

Radcliff noted that map shows only 4 buildings but report lists 5. The board had no additional comments.

Report: Hilzinger Block Historic District, Royal Oak

Radcliff questioned whether this was significant enough on its own to be a single resource historic district. Arnold responded that she felt Hilzinger seems significant only as part of a larger downtown. The board had no additional comments.

Report: Individual Historic Properties Historic District (Apartments, Churches, Industrial, Commercial, Transportation), Ann Arbor

Knibbe asked whether buildings in "thematic districts" have to be individually eligible or only contribute to the overall significance of the district. Arnold expressed the opinion that they must only contribute.

Knibbe questioned why the historic district commission that prepared report did not take into account neighborhoods and the downtown.

The board had no additional comments.

Appeals:

Michael Eerdmans v. Grand Rapids Historic District Commission

Knibbe noted that the response to the proposal for decision was only received by two of the board members. Proposed two courses of action: 1) adjournment for a brief time period to let people read the response, or 2) table the decision until next the Review Board meeting.

Evans felt that tabling the decision until next meeting made the most sense.

Chapman moved to table the nomination until next Review Board meeting, January 9th, 2004.

Radcliff seconded motion.

Vote: 6-0

Knibbe explained to Eerdmans that the board does not permit additional testimony regarding appeals.

Eerdmans spoke about his concerns regarding the circumstances of the hearing. He felt he did not have with him at the hearing all of the information he needed to present his case.

Dates of Next Meeting:

January 9, 2004.

Adjournment:

Chapman moved that the meeting be adjourned.

Hoagland seconded.

Vote: 6-0.

The meeting adjourned at 11:50 a.m.

Prepared by T. Walsh