



STATE OF MICHIGAN

JENNIFER M. GRANHOLM  
GOVERNOR

EMERGENCY TELEPHONE SERVICE COMMITTEE  
EAST LANSING

SHERIFF DALE GRIBLER  
CHAIR

**EMERGENCY TELEPHONE SERVICE COMMITTEE**  
**MSP Training Academy**  
**Lansing, Michigan**  
**February 19, 2008**  
**11:00 a.m.**  
**MEETING MINUTES**

<b>MEMBERS PRESENT</b>	<b>REPRESENTING</b>
Sheriff Dale Gribler, Chair	Michigan Sheriffs' Association
Mr. John Bawol	Assn. of Public Safety Comm. Officials
Lt. Col. Kriste Etue (Capt Charles Bush, Alternate)	Department of State Police
Mr. Lloyd Fayling	Public Member, Senate Appointee
Mr. James Fyvie, Vice Chair	Michigan Communications Directors Assoc.
Ms. Suzan Hensel Clark	National Emergency Number Association
Chief Kay Hoffman	Michigan Association of Chiefs of Police
Undersheriff Jim Hull	Deputy Sheriff's Association
Mr. John Hunt	Public Member, Governor's Appointee
Mr. Dan Kearney	Michigan Public Service Commission
Tpr. Chris Bommarito	Michigan State Police Troopers Association
Mr. Dave Piasecki	Telecommunications Association of Michigan
Mr. Robert Struck (Mr. James Loeper, Alternate)	UP Emergency Medical Services Corporation
Mr. Scott Temple	Commercial Mobile Radio Service

<b>MEMBERS ABSENT</b>	<b>REPRESENTING</b>
Ms. Jeannine Benedict	Dept. of Labor and Economic Growth
Mr. Dale Berry	Michigan Association of Ambulance Services
Mr. John Buczek	Fraternal Order of Police
Mr. Hugh Crawford	Michigan Association of Counties
Mr. Miles Handy II	Public Member, House Appointee
Mr. Paul Hufnagel	Michigan Professional Firefighters Association
Chief Paul Trinka	Michigan Association of Fire Chiefs

<b>STAFF SUPPORT</b>	<b>REPRESENTING</b>
Ms. Harriet Miller-Brown	Department of State Police
Ms. Janet Hengesbach	Department of State Police

**ROLL CALL**

The Emergency Telephone Service Committee (ETSC) meeting was called to order by Chair Dale Gribler at 11:20 a.m.

Association of Public Safety Communications Officials • Commercial Mobile Radio Service • Department of Labor and Economic Growth •  
Department of State Police • Deputy Sheriff's Association • Fraternal Order of Police • Michigan Association of Ambulance Services •  
Michigan Association of Chiefs of Police • Michigan Association of Counties • Michigan Communications Directors Association • Michigan Association of Fire Chiefs •  
Michigan Professional Firefighters Union • Michigan Public Service Commission • Michigan Sheriffs' Association • Michigan State Police Troopers Association •  
National Emergency Number Association • Telecommunications Association of Michigan • Upper Peninsula Emergency Medical Services •  
Members of the general public appointed by the Governor, Speaker of the House, and Majority Leader of the Senate

714 SOUTH HARRISON ROAD • EAST LANSING, MICHIGAN 48823  
www.michigan.gov/mmsp • (517) 336-6163

Printed by members of:



**NEW BUSINESS**

B. Review of County Surcharge Applications

Kristin Smith from the AG's office was invited to today's meeting to explain to the members the surcharge process that has taken place thus far and how the process today will work.

The Certification Subcommittee was to make their decision based on what is "necessary and reasonable". This subcommittee is the body that can determine what it takes to implement and operate a 9-1-1 center. The ETSC will make consider the Certification Subcommittee's final recommendations based on counties' presentations.

There were many factors used in determining calculations. The subcommittee members were to take these items into account when making their decision.

Mr. Fayling inquired if the MPSC did not approve the counties request, would it be adjusted back to the 2.7% level? Yes, if the amount of requested surcharge is rejected, that amount will be adjusted to insure revenue generated does not go above 2.7%.

Ms. Hensel Clark requested a **MOTION** to approve the recommendation of the Certification Subcommittee to approve the 400A applications as submitted. While the 400A applications submitted were assumed to be requesting less than 2.7% surcharge. Those applications were reviewed to make certain they were 2.7% or less. In doing so, six came into question and were requested to appear earlier today (Tuscola, Osceola, Gratiot, Genesee, Cass and Oakland) before the Certification Subcommittee because the applications they submitted varied from the population to device ratio per person of .93. Representatives appearing earlier today gave explanations resulting in the subcommittee's approval of the six 400A applications. Chief Hoffman inquired which counties submitted 400A applications. Those counties are as follows: Alger, Allegan, Antrim, Arenac, Branch, Cass, Clare, Clinton, Genesee, Gladwin, Gratiot, Houghton, Ingham, Ionia, Iron, Kalkaska, Lenawee, Livingston, Luce, Mackinac, Mason, Mecosta, Montmorency, Oakland, Oceana, Ontonagon, Osceola, Oscoda, Otsego, Presque Isle, Shiawassee, Tuscola, and Wexford. Mr. Bawol supported, Mr. Kearney, as a representative of the MPSC, abstained from voting. Following discussion, the **MOTION** carries by voice vote.

Ms. Hensel Clark provided a brief explanation of the counties requesting increases above the state standard of 2.7%. She advised that these counties were invited to present their case before the Certification Subcommittee with data and justification for their county's request for a surcharge above 2.7%. Ms. Hensel Clark requested a **MOTION** to approve the recommendation to the MPSC from the Certification Subcommittee to approve the 400B applications requesting surcharge above 2.7%. Mr. Bawol supported. Mr. Loeper inquired if the voting would be for each individual county and if so, he would abstain from voting for his county. Chair Gribler indicated that since the AG's office noted one motion would include all of the counties filing 400B applications, Mr. Loeper could participate in the voting. Mr. Piasecki was concerned that because the motion included all counties rather than an individual motion for each county, he may have to abstain from voting. Mr. Hunt inquired who sits on the Certification Subcommittee – Ms. Miller-Brown read a list of members and their affiliation. Following discussion, the **MOTION** carries by voice vote. Mr. Kearney, Mr. Temple and Mr. Piasecki abstained from voting.

**Members then heard from representatives of the four counties whose surcharge requests were previously denied by the Certification Subcommittee.**

**Dickinson County** (requesting .70)  
Pete Schlitt (9-1-1 Director)

The subcommittee rejected this application based on the fact the equipment estimates used were "best guess". The current equipment was purchased in 1991 and installed in 1992. Parts are no

longer available and is no longer being supported by the manufacturer. There was question at last week's Certification Subcommittee meeting if the population to device factor of .93 was used. Mr. Schlitt contacted AT&T last year regarding billable lines and was told he has 19,600 billable lines but has been receiving monies for 12,400 lines. Because of this difference, Dickinson County is losing approximately \$60,000 per year. They have one of the lowest surcharges in the state of Michigan. They have no millage and have a negative \$12,000 in their fund balance. They receive G/F monies but all money received does not cover operational costs - just payroll and personnel. Mr. Piasecki is concerned about the fact this is a 38% increase in this county. Undersheriff Hull made a **MOTION** to overturn the decision of the Certification Subcommittee and approve Dickinson County's surcharge application, Mr. Hunt supported. Mr. Schlitt stated the county believes this increase is necessary and reasonable to operate their 9-1-1 center.

Yes	No	Abstain	Absent
Bawol	Temple	Kearney	Benedict
Bush	Piasecki		Buczek
Hull			Handy
Hunt			Berry
Hoffman			Crawford
Fyvie			Trinka
Gribler			Hufnagel
Bommarito			
Hensel Clark			
Fayling			
Loeper			

The **MOTION** carries by roll call vote.

**Montcalm County** (requesting \$2.00)

Jeff Troyer (9-1-1 Director)

Mr. Troyer noted the estimates noted on Montcalm's 400B application was the second lowest increase requested. They are asking for 1.9% increase over the 2.7%. They are 4 months into their capital improvements. They are in debt by \$210,000 over next three years on their building; they have a fund balance of \$900,000 – of that - \$220,000 is earmarked for a new CAD system, as the current system was purchased in 1991. They also keep 4 months of operating costs in their fund balance. Their dispatch center is a separate authority. Mr. Bawol made a **MOTION** to overturn the decision of the Certification Subcommittee and approve Montcalm County's surcharge application, Mr. Fyvie supported. Mr. Troyer stated the county believes this increase is necessary and reasonable to operate their 9-1-1 center.

Yes	No	Abstain	Absent
Bawol	Temple	Kearney	Benedict
Bush	Piasecki		Buczek
Hull			Handy
Hunt			Berry
Hoffman			Crawford
Fyvie			Trinka
Gribler			Hufnagel
Bommarito			
Hensel Clark			
Fayling			
Loeper			

The **MOTION** carries by roll call vote.

**Saginaw County** (requesting \$2.65)

Tom McIntyre (9-1-1 Director) appeared along with members of Saginaw County Fire, Police, and EMS.

Saginaw County is requesting a surcharge increase to replace their aging radio system. It is deteriorated and will no longer be supported by Motorola. Mr. McIntyre referred to their county Board of Commissioners resolution where in 2003, a fund was established with .80 deposited strictly for the continued replacement of this system. They have received quotes and would like to replace the system sometime in 2008, but need a commitment to proceed further with this project. Chief Nelson further explained the need for a new system. The failures on this system are becoming more and more frequent. It is rapidly becoming outdated. Parts will be available for just a short time longer. If funding is not available, this debt will fall onto local units of government. Hensel Clark confirmed that they are putting away .80 into a fund for the radio system. The surplus noted in the application documents is this fund. Captain Bush made a **MOTION** to overturn the decision of the Certification Subcommittee and approve Saginaw County's surcharge application, Mr. Hunt supported. Mr. Fayling confirmed that by being in the next county they indeed are in need of a new radio system. Mr. McIntyre stated the county believes this increase is necessary and reasonable to operate their 9-1-1 center.

Yes	No	Abstain	Absent
Bawol	Temple	Kearney	Benedict
Bush	Piasecki		Buczek
Hull			Handy
Hunt			Berry
Hoffman			Crawford
Fyvie			Trinka
Gribler			Hufnagel
Bommarito			
Hensel Clark			
Fayling			
Loeper			

The **MOTION** carries by roll call vote.

Ms. Miller-Brown also indicated to the members that Macomb and Schoolcraft County have not made communication with her office regarding surcharge requests.

A. Dispatcher Training

1. Course Approval Process

Under the new statute, the approval and tracking process of ETSC training courses will be moved from MCOLES to the ETSC/State 9-1-1 office. One of the new requirements is that providers submit courses for approval 6 weeks prior to the training presentation. Suggesting a 6 week turnaround will not reject any vendor applications sent in sooner. The time frame suggested is necessary for approval from the work group and issuance of course numbers prior to the class being presented. Currently in some cases, course requests are being submitted just days before the presentation and course numbers have not been issued by the time the training is presented.

Ms. Bianconi inquired if there will be notice to the providers of the transition and if a course is approved by MCOLES during this process can still be utilized by DT monies. A notice was sent to the course providers advising of these changes. If a course is approved by MCOLES during the transition, DT monies can be used.

The Dispatcher Training Subcommittee made a recommendation that courses are submitted to the State 9-1-1 office 6 weeks prior to the presentation/expiration date.

Undersheriff Hull made a **MOTION** to accept the recommendation from the DT subcommittee, Chief Hoffman support. The **MOTION** carries by voice vote.

2. State 9-1-1 Office ability to approve courses

The Dispatcher Training Subcommittee made a recommendation that the transition process from MCOLES to the State 9-1-1 office move forward and the State 9-1-1 office be authorized to approve classes on behalf of the ETSC. Mr. Hunt made **MOTION** to accept the recommendation of the Dispatcher Training Subcommittee, Undersheriff Hull support. The **MOTION** carries.

The meeting adjourned for a 15 minute break at 12:40 p.m. Meeting was reconvened at 12:55 p.m.

**Continuation of Approval of Surcharge Applications**

**Lake County** (requesting \$5.37) Larry Collier, County Commissioner, Sharon Myers, County Clerk, and Sharyn McGreehan, Chief Deputy Clerk/Register (by conference bridge)

Lake County has a population that depends on the 9-1-1 system – unemployed, elderly and some with no health insurance. They have an interim director and 9 full time dispatchers. Lake County officials have met with Newaygo County to discuss contract dispatching services. If the consolidation does take place, they anticipate it to be a long process. Mr. Temple noted that the numbers presented in regards to population, income and unemployment represents nearly a 2000% increase to wireless customers vs. what they are paying today. Lake County is not looking forward to charging the residents of this county this surcharge. They are well aware of burden this places on people but they are a resort county with many tourists that depend on 9-1-1 service. They have had 2 millage requests with the most recent being 2 years ago – 1 ¾ mil that fell to defeat. A surcharge request in November 2003 passed 994-270. They have no fund balance in 9-1-1 funds, supported by G/F and other sources to balance at the end of the year. The latest increase was to \$4.00 in January 2007 from \$2.61.

Commissioner Collier further explained the budget prompted this request. Their proposed budget of \$655,154 includes \$65,000 in capitol improvements. They noted approximately 10,261 devices in their county.

Following discussion with members, Mr. Bawol made a **MOTION** to overturn the decision of the Certification Subcommittee and approve Lake County's application, Mr. Hunt supported. They believe this increase is reasonable and necessary to operate their 9-1-1 center. Mr. Fyvie inquired if the committee approves this will it slow down talks of consolidation. Commissioner Collier does not think it will. If the requested \$5.37 is approved, it will only give them enough money to operate for one year but their residents cannot afford to pay this indefinitely.

Yes	No	Abstain	Absent
Bawol	Temple	Kearney	Benedict
Bush	Fyvie		Buczek
Hull	Hensel Clark		Handy
Hunt	Piasecki		Berry
Hoffman			Crawford
Bommarito			Trinka
Fayling			Hufnagel
Loeper			

The **MOTION** carries by roll call vote.

**PUBLIC COMMENT**

None

**NEXT MEETING**

The next regular ETSC meeting will be held at 10:00 a.m. on March 17, 2008 at the State Capitol Building in the Senate Appropriations Meeting Room. A group photo of the committee members will be taken that day.

**ADJOURN**

Mr. Loeper made a **MOTION** to adjourn, Mr. Bawol supported, the **MOTION** carries. The meeting was adjourned at 1:10 p.m.

Approved,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Dale R. Gribler". The signature is written in a cursive style with a large initial "D".

SHERIFF DALE GRIBLER, CHAIR