



RICK SNYDER
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MICHIGAN
DEPARTMENT OF TREASURY
LANSING

R. KEVIN CLINTON
STATE TREASURER

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE STATE TAX COMMISSION

***Holiday Inn Express and Okemos Conference Center,
Stadium Room
2187 University Park Drive, Okemos, Michigan***

***Monday, April 8, 2014
9:00 a.m.***

***PRESENT: Douglas B. Roberts, Chair STC
Barry S. Simon, Member STC

Kelli Sobel, Executive Director
LaNiece Densteadt, Recording Secretary***

The item numbers referred to in the minutes correspond to the agenda items as numbered.

It was moved by Simon, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to adopt the minutes of February 10, 2014. (Item 1 on agenda)

Chairman Roberts stated the following: Our third member Robert Naftaly will not be joining us today. Mr. Naftaly has been replaced on the Commission by William Howard Morris who will be attending the next meeting. I cannot have an event happen like this without making a personal statement that will go into the record. I have served with Mr. Naftaly on the Commission for almost a decade and he has made a significant positive contribution to the State Tax Commission both as a Member and as Chair. I believe and I can speak for myself and the other members that have worked here; that we will all miss his insight and his demeanor to calm things down when it was needed. I want to thank him personally for all his years of service and for the support that he has given me as Chair. If the record will show I think he has done a terrific job for this Commission and for the State.

Commissioner Simon stated the following: I have only worked with Mr. Naftaly for four years but it has been a pleasure. He was very knowledgeable and has a lot of experience. He was very familiar with property taxes and he will be missed. I second what the Chairman has said.

It was moved by Simon, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to amend the meeting schedule and cancel the September 23, 2014 and October 28, 2014 meetings and reschedule for October 13, 2014. (Item 2 on agenda)

It was moved by Simon, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved the 2014 Values for DNR PILT Properties. (Item 3 on agenda)

It was moved by Simon, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved Bulletin 3 of 2014 Millage Requests and Rollbacks and the applicable forms. (Item 4 on agenda)

It was moved by Simon, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved Bulletin 4 of 2014 County Multipliers. It was also mentioned that the Commission has contracted with Marshall & Swift in developing a new Assessors Manual. (Item 5 on agenda)

It was moved by Simon, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved Memorandum 1 of 2014 required by P.A. 18 of 2014. This Act requires the Commission to define substantially same construction for the purpose of determination of taxable value of replacement construction for property damaged or destroyed by an accident or Act of God. (Item 6 on agenda)

It was moved by Simon, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved Memorandum 2 of 2014 regarding the Qualified Forest Program and how to handle parcels that qualify for the program and have structures or buildings on the parcel. (Item 7 on agenda)

It was moved by Simon, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to remove one of the examples in the Transfer of Ownership Guidelines. (Item 8 on agenda)

It was moved by Simon, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to adopt the revised State Tax Commission Complaint Process. (Item 9 on agenda)

It was moved by Simon, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to accept the corrective action plan as submitted by the City of Detroit and require the City to submit monthly reports to the Commission updating them on the reappraisal work. The Commission also approved to direct staff to explore options for STC oversight of the reappraisal including the option to issue a contract to an individual or group to provide oversight of the reappraisal. (Item 10 on agenda) Gary Evanko and Alvin Horn appeared before the Commission to answer any questions regarding the corrective action plan.

It was moved by Simon, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to adopt the official order to overturn the actions of Empire Township, Leelanau County December Board of Review for parcel 45-004-136-002-02 for the 2011 tax year. (Item 11 on agenda)

It was moved by Simon, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to adopt the official order to overturn various actions of Wilson Township, Alpena County December Board of Review. (Item 12 on agenda)

It was moved by Simon, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to adopt the 2014 State Average Tax Rate. (Item 13 on agenda)

It was moved by Simon, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to adopt the 2014 Railroad and Car Line Cap Rates. (Item 14 on agenda)

It was moved by Simon, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to adopt the staff recommendation to approve the request for issuance of the Act 328 Exemption Application for Hamtramck Recycling Inc. (Item 15 on agenda)

It was moved by Simon, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to adopt the staff recommendation on the Re-certifications and New Certifications of Computerized Tax Rolls for the following: (Item 16 on agenda)

These certifications will expire on **May 1, 2017**.

New Certifications:

Alcona County

Caledonia Township

Montcalm County

Bloomer Township

Crystal Township

Douglass Township

City of Carson City

City of Stanton

Otsego County

Otsego Lake Township

Recertifications

Antrim County

Banks Township

Central Lake Township

Chestonia Township

Custer Township

Echo Township

Elk Rapids Township

Forest Home Township

Helena Township

Jordan Township

Kearney Township

Mancelona Township

Milton Township

Star Township

Torch Lake Township

Warner Township

Village of Bellaire

Village of Central Lake

Village of Elk Rapids

Village of Ellsworth

Village of Mancelona

Genesee County
Grand Blanc Township

Kent County
Ada Township

Newaygo County
Ensley Township

It was moved by Simon, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved the OPRA Qualified Local Governmental Units. (Item 17 on agenda)

It was moved by Simon, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved the revised Application for Industrial Facilities Tax Exemption Certificate, FAQ for Water Pollution Control Tax Exemptions, FAQ for Air Pollution Control Tax Exemptions, FAQ for Commercial Redevelopment Act, FAQ for Commercial Rehabilitation Act, FAQ for Plant Rehabilitation and Industrial Development Act (Industrial Facilities Exemption), FAQ for New Personal Property Exemption, FAQ for Neighborhood Enterprise Zone (NEZ) Act, and Obsolete Property Rehabilitation Act. (Item 18 on agenda)

It was moved by Simon, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to adopt the staff recommendation on the Special Exemptions Agenda. (Item 19 on agenda) ([See attached link for file identification.](#))

It was moved by Simon, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to adopt the staff recommendation on the Exemptions Agenda. (Item 20 on agenda) ([See attached link for file identification.](#))

It was moved by Simon, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to adopt the MCL 211.154 **Concurrences**. (Item 21 on agenda) ([See attached link for file identification](#))

It was moved by Simon, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to postpone petition 154-13-0170 until May 12, 2014. It was moved by Simon, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to amend the taxable value to \$50,000 on petition 154-13-0842. It was moved by Simon, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to dismiss petitions 154-12-0325, 154-12-1491, 154-12-1492, 154-12-1493, 154-12-1494, 154-13-0187, and 154-13-1112. It was moved by Simon, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to adopt staff recommendations on the remaining MCL 211.154 petitions on the **Special Items Agenda**. (Item 22 on agenda) ([See attached link for file identification](#))

It was moved by Simon, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to **postpone** the following MCL 211.154 petition until **May 27, 2014**. (Item 23 on agenda)

City of Southfield, Oakland County

154-13-1126 CVS PHARMACY #8233; 76-99-57-009-500; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2011 AV from \$ 46,980 to \$ 55,320 TV from \$ 46,980 to \$ 55,320
2012 AV from \$ 40,960 to \$ 55,040 TV from \$ 40,960 to \$ 55,040
2013 AV from \$ 36,950 to \$ 49,750 TV from \$ 36,950 to \$ 49,750

154-13-1127 CVS PHARMACY #8034; 76-99-28-100-011; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2011 AV from \$ 155,360 to \$ 215,010 TV from \$ 155,360 to \$ 215,010
2012 AV from \$ 131,130 to \$ 182,830 TV from \$ 131,130 to \$ 182,830
2013 AV from \$ 112,730 to \$ 157,880 TV from \$ 112,730 to \$ 157,880

154-13-1128 CVS PHARMACY #8143; 76-99-76-389-500; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2011 AV from \$ 40,910 to \$ 61,220 TV from \$ 40,910 to \$ 61,220
2012 AV from \$ 37,090 to \$ 61,220 TV from \$ 37,090 to \$ 61,220
2013 AV from \$ 39,740 to \$ 62,570 TV from \$ 39,740 to \$ 62,570

It was moved by Simon, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to **postpone** the following MCL 211.154 petition. (Item 23 on agenda)

Elmer Township, Oscoda County

154-13-0966 DELTA ENERGY CORP; 68-004-900-094-00; Personal-Utility Property

2011 AV from \$ 31,400 to \$ 267,500 TV from \$ 31,400 to \$ 267,500
2012 AV from \$ 29,500 to \$ 267,500 TV from \$ 29,500 to \$ 267,500
2013 AV from \$ 29,500 to \$ 267,500 TV from \$ 29,500 to \$ 267,500

154-13-0967 DELTA ENERGY CORP.; 68-004-900-124-00; Personal-Utility Property

2011 AV from \$ 0 to \$ 459,000 TV from \$ 0 to \$ 459,000
2012 AV from \$ 0 to \$ 459,000 TV from \$ 0 to \$ 459,000
2013 AV from \$ 0 to \$ 459,000 TV from \$ 0 to \$ 459,000

It was moved by Simon, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to **amend** the following MCL 211.154 petitions. (Item 23 on agenda)

Moffatt Township, Arenac County

154-13-1174 NORMAN & JONNA WINTER; 008-0-009-100-005-25; Real Property

2011 AV from \$ 14,600 to \$ 19,323 TV from \$ 13,984 to \$ 19,323
2012 AV from \$ 13,500 to \$ 18,900 TV from \$ 13,500 to \$ 18,900
2013 AV from \$ 12,100 to \$ 17,600 TV from \$ 12,100 to \$ 17,600

City of Ann Arbor, Washtenaw County

154-13-1132 AMERICAN HONDA MOTOR CO INC; 09-90-00-001-688; Personal Property
****This was also a concurrence.**

2011 AV from \$ 606,900 to \$ 1,585,700 TV from \$ 606,900 to \$ 1,585,700

Canton Township, Wayne County

154-13-1099 YAZAKI NORTH AMERICA, INC.; 71-999-99-1738-111; Personal Property

2012 AV from \$ 3,023,700 to \$ 3,052,340 TV from \$ 3,023,700 to \$ 3,052,340

It was moved by Simon, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to allow the **withdrawal** of the following MCL 211.154 petitions. (Item 23 on agenda)

City of Fraser, Macomb County

154-13-1138 FRANK AND BARBARA PIRRELLO; 14-05-127-012; REAL PROPERTY

2011 AV from \$ 40,767 to \$ 64,750 TV from \$ 40,767 to \$ 65,767
2012 AV from \$ 37,417 to \$ 62,417 TV from \$ 37,417 to \$ 62,417
2013 AV from \$ 37,505 to \$ 62,505 TV from \$ 37,505 to \$ 62,505

City of Bloomfield Hills, Oakland County

154-13-1074 WIRELESS VISION LLC; 12-99-00-007-013; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2013 AV from \$ 115,250 to \$ 406,070 TV from \$ 115,250 to \$ 406,070

City of Wixom, Oakland County

154-13-1094 ANCA INC; 96-99-00-005-066; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2012 AV from \$ 78,920 to \$ 101,390 TV from \$ 78,920 to \$ 101,390

Canton Township, Wayne County

154-13-1099 YAZAKI NORTH AMERICA, INC.; 71-999-99-1738-111; Personal Property

2011 AV from \$ 3,907,610 to \$ 3,998,320 TV from \$ 3,907,610 to \$ 3,998,320

It was moved by Simon, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved the following MCL 211.154 petitions as **concurrences**, initially noticed as non-concurrences. (Item 23 on agenda)

City of East Lansing, Ingham County

154-13-0973 DUANE HILDEBRANDT; 33-20-90-41-391-500; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2013 AV from \$ 600 to \$ 0 TV from \$ 600 to \$ 0

154-13-1061 AMERICAN INTERNATIONAL FACILITIES; 33-20-90-52-013-610;
PERSONAL PROPERTY

2012 AV from \$ 69,100 to \$ 58,800 TV from \$ 69,100 to \$ 58,800

City of Ionia, Ionia County

154-13-1136 ROGER DUANE FLINN II; 34-202-170-000-050-00; REAL PROPERTY

2011 AV from \$ 39,408 to \$ 83,268 TV from \$ 39,408 to \$ 83,268

City of Clawson, Oakland County

154-13-1119 THE CHRIST CHILD SOCIETY; 16-20-33-351-041; REAL PROPERTY

2011 AV from \$ 0 to \$ 27,330 TV from \$ 0 to \$ 27,330

2012 AV from \$ 0 to \$ 25,850 TV from \$ 0 to \$ 25,850

2013 AV from \$ 0 to \$ 25,410 TV from \$ 0 to \$ 25,410

City of Madison Heights, Oakland County

154-13-1077 HEIDE PERFORMANCE PRODUCTS; 44-99-01-016-047; Personal Property

2011 AV from \$ 26,930 to \$ 55,220 TV from \$ 26,930 to \$ 55,220

2012 AV from \$ 51,430 to \$ 78,520 TV from \$ 51,430 to \$ 78,520

2013 AV from \$ 68,850 to \$ 87,330 TV from \$ 68,850 to \$ 87,330

City of Novi, Oakland County

154-13-1080 MELEXIS INC.; 50-99-00-013-043; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2013 AV from \$ 2,500 to \$ 46,720 TV from \$ 2,500 to \$ 46,720

City of Royal Oak, Oakland County

154-13-1082 CAREERBUILDER.COM; 72-99-00-009-067; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2013 AV from \$ 23,090 to \$ 29,290 TV from \$ 23,090 to \$ 29,290

154-13-1083 FAITHFUL COMPANION; 72-99-00-008-000; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2013 AV from \$ 37,130 to \$ 63,140 TV from \$ 37,130 to \$ 63,140

City of Royal Oak, Oakland County

154-13-1084 SOUTHERN MICHIGAN SERVICES; 72-99-01-970-070; Personal Property

2013 AV from \$ 13,080 to \$ 20,790 TV from \$ 13,080 to \$ 20,790

154-13-1085 STERLING OIL & CHEMICAL CO.; 72-99-00-003-042; Personal Property

2013 AV from \$ 4,130 to \$ 8,030 TV from \$ 4,130 to \$ 8,030

City of Southfield, Oakland County

154-13-1116 W H GREENWALT; 76-99-64-383-813; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2011 AV from \$ 0 to \$ 1,730 TV from \$ 0 to \$ 1,730

2012 AV from \$ 2,180 to \$ 1,840 TV from \$ 2,180 to \$ 1,840

154-13-1120 KROGER #1800658; 76-99-76-298-000; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2011 AV from \$ 376,260 to \$ 421,220 TV from \$ 376,260 to \$ 421,220

2012 AV from \$ 321,950 to \$ 401,360 TV from \$ 321,950 to \$ 401,360

2013 AV from \$ 287,460 to \$ 366,180 TV from \$ 287,460 to \$ 366,180

City of Troy, Oakland County

154-13-1087 CADILLAC LOOSELEAF PRODUCTS; 88-99-00-217-500; Personal Property

2011 AV from \$ 264,820 to \$ 280,050 TV from \$ 264,820 to \$ 280,050

2012 AV from \$ 349,440 to \$ 368,610 TV from \$ 349,440 to \$ 368,610

2013 AV from \$ 320,740 to \$ 356,560 TV from \$ 320,740 to \$ 356,560

City of Port Huron, Saint Clair County

154-14-0013 ASPEN LIMITED DIVIDEND; 74-06-027-3001-027; REAL PROPERTY

2013 AV from \$ 0 to \$ 1,627,900 TV from \$ 0 to \$ 1,627,900

City of Dearborn Heights

154-13-1133 ROSE GARDEN RESTAURANT; 82-33-999-00-2492-000; Personal Property

2011 AV from \$ 6,870 to \$ 15,800 TV from \$ 6,870 to \$ 15,800

2012 AV from \$ 6,950 to \$ 15,800 TV from \$ 6,950 to \$ 15,800

2013 AV from \$ 7,000 to \$ 15,800 TV from \$ 7,000 to \$ 15,800

City of Detroit, Wayne County

154-13-0981 MCLESKEY, DARIN; 09002384; REAL PROPERTY

2011 AV from \$ 7,425 to \$ 790 TV from \$ 3,554 to \$ 790

It was moved by Simon, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to adopt all other MCL 211.154 petitions. ([See attached link for file identification.](#)) (Item 23 on agenda)

Public Comment (Item 24 on agenda):

Dean Babb from Chesterfield Township appeared before the Commission regarding the Disabled Veterans Exemption. Mr. Babb believes the Commission did not have the authority to allow the July 2013 Board of Review to grant Disabled Veterans Exemptions or to change the taxable status in the middle of the year. Mr. Babb would like the Commission to rescind Bulletin 22.

Brad Vauter from Lansing appeared before the Commission on behalf of Robert Anderson who is in Marquette regarding the Transfer of Ownership Guidelines. Mr. Vauter and Mr. Anderson would like the Commission to make a series of changes to the Guidelines and the Property Transfer Affidavit.

It was moved by Simon, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved the Neighborhood Enterprise Zone Homestead Exemption Report for the 2012 tax year.

It was moved by Roberts, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to solicit comments on the draft bulletin regarding Reporting of Oil and Gas Personal Property. The Commission stated the comments must be provided in writing and be received by June 8, 2014.

The next Commission meeting will be held May 12, 2014 at the Okemos Conference Center in the Okemos A & B Rooms, 2187 University Park Drive, Okemos.

It was moved by Roberts, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to adjourn the meeting of the State Tax Commission at 11:00 a.m.

DATE TYPED: April 9, 2014

DATE APPROVED: May 12, 2014

Douglas B. Roberts, Chair
State Tax Commission

Barry N. Simon, Member
State Tax Commission