City of Ecorse

Receivership Transition Advisory Board Meeting Minutes

Tuesday, May 10, 2016

Ecorse City Hall

Council Chambers

Albert B. Buday Civic Center

3869 West Jefferson

Ecorse, Michigan 48229

RTAB MEMBERS PRESENT: ROBERT BOVITZ JOAN BROPHY

JEFFREY SYKES

ALSO PRESENT:

DREW VAN de GRIFT Michigan Department of Treasury

Reported by:
Nina Lunsford (CER 4539)
Modern Court Reporting & Video, LLC
SCAO FIRM NO. 08228
101-A North Lewis Street
Saline, Michigan 48176
(734) 429-9143/nel-ajsn

1	Tuesday, May 10, 2016
2	Ecorse, Michigan
3	Called to Order at 9:03 a.m.
4	MR. SYKES: We're going to try and do this
5	without the benefit of the audio, so we'll try and speak
6	up. Let us know if anybody can't hear what we're talking
7	about. So I'll call to order the City of Ecorse
8	Receivership Transition Advisory Board meeting for
9	Tuesday, May 10th, 2016.
10	Mr. Van de Grift, roll call, please?
11	MR. VAN de GRIFT: Robert Bovitz.
12	MR. BOVITZ: Here.
13	MR. VAN de GRIFT: Joan Brophy.
14	MS. BROPHY: Here.
15	MR. VAN de GRIFT: Jeffrey Sykes.
16	MR. SYKES: Here.
17	MR. VAN de GRIFT: All present.
18	MR. SYKES: I'll entertain a motion to approve
19	the agenda.
20	MS. BROPHY: Mr. Chairman, I'd like to add an
21	item of new business, before approving. It would be to
22	add the contract for catch basin improvements with CI
23	Contracting, Inc. It appeared, I guess, before the
24	council on April 26th, Resolution 127.16.
25	MR. SYKES: Okav, we need a second.

1	MR. BOVITZ: Support.
2	MR. SYKES: All right, okay. I see, here, so we
3	need to approve this? Move to approve, any discussion,
4	so, folks
5	MR. VAN de GRIFT: Would you like to take a
6	vote?
7	MR. SYKES: Yes.
8	MS. BROPHY: Aye.
9	MR. BOVITZ: Aye.
10	_
	MR. SYKES: Aye.
11	Thank you. Okay, I'd also like to remind the
12	audience that if anyone intends to speak during the public
13	comment portion of the meeting, that it's necessary for
14	you to sign in to this meeting at the podium.
15	Okay.
16	MR. VAN de GRIFT: Would you like to introduce
17	yourself?
18	MR. SYKES: Yes. That's another thing. My name
19	is Jeff Sykes, I this is obviously my first meeting.
20	I've worked with the State of Michigan for a little more
21	than 20 years now; I'm the chief financial officer of the
22	Michigan State Housing Development Authority. Really
23	looking forward to this opportunity.
24	I have sat on a few boards; this is my first
25	time chairing a board, so, this might not be as smooth as

1	it has been in the past, but I promise you I will get
2	there. Thank you.
3	Okay.
4	So we're going to look to approve the RTAB
5	minutes of April 12th; I'll entertain a motion.
6	MR. BOVITZ: So moved.
7	MS. BROPHY: Support.
8	MR. SYKES: No discussion. Seeing that there's
9	no discussion, all in favor of the motion say aye.
10	Aye.
11	MS. BROPHY: Aye.
12	MR. BOVITZ: Aye.
13	MR. SYKES: Opposed, same sign. Okay, the
14	minutes are approved. The next item is old business,
15	which there is none, so we'll move on to new business.
16	In new business, there's the approval of the
17	resolution and ordinance of city council meeting,
18	resolution from the special city council meeting of May
19	4th, 2016.
20	While reviewing of this city council meeting the
2	1 is outside the normal review period for today's board
22	meeting, the mayor's request to bring these items forward
23 24	in early review are merited. While review of the city council meeting is
25	outside the normal review period oh, I'm sorry.

1 Entertaining a motion to approve the resolution 2 from May 4th, 2016, special city council meeting. 3 Any discussion? 4 MR. VAN de GRIFT: Was there a motion? 5 MS. BROPHY: So, I'll move to approve this 6 motion. 7 MR. VAN de GRIFT: Is there a second? 8 MR. BOVITZ: I'll support, but I have 9 discussion. 10 MR. SYKES: Okav. 11 MR. BOVITZ: You know, I've been on this board 12 since the very beginning; the city's gone through a lot of 13 transition. I thought that the city was going the right direction; I will point out that in my view, the city 14 administrator is the CEO or chief executive officer of the 15 16 city; reports to the mayor and council, but is not in the 17 employ of the mayor and council; he is employed by the 18 City of Ecorse. 19 So I'm not very happy with the turn of events. 20 I don't know all of the circumstances, but all I'm saying is I'm going to make a comment on this, and in order to 21 22 move the city forward, it apparently is the city council's 23 intent is to replace the city administrator immediately. 24 And I'm not sure the best course of action, as far as 25 what, you know, from my personal point of view, so.

MR. SYKES: Well, it's come to my attention that we've gone through this process of -- with city managers about four times, with three different individuals, over the last three years. And so one of the things that I did want to ask is if, Drew, if you could talk a little about whether or not this board has done anything to inhibit the mayor and city council's decision in this regard?

MR. VAN de GRIFT: No, this board has never intervened to prevent the termination. I'll note that with one exception, this board has deferred to the city council's decisions for both hiring and terminations. The one exception was, in 2014, Rob, you'll recall, the current city controller, Tim Sadowski, had been appointed to be the city administrator, and this board had acted under the opinion and concern of the city attorney with the determination that he was not qualified for that position. So that was the lone exception for when this board has historically intervened.

MR. BOVITZ: My experience has been the city administrator, whether it was Mr. O'Neal on an interim basis, or when he came back a second time, or to, from the start, we've been faced with contracted controllers. We finally have a controller who's on board, who actually works for the city and is not contracted and is here on a regular basis. Understands municipal accounting.

And we have a city administrator who really wasn't able to act freely, under the emergency manager act, and with Joyce Parker's -- I just feel like it wasn't fair to Mr. O'Neal to kind of saddle him with the restrictions that we placed on him, and as far as the state, you know, TAB.

And as far as the city council and the mayor, I hate to see them micro managing the day-to-day operations of a city employee. If there's no trust, then what do you do? I hate to see a termination based on either personalities or politics. I think we're all here for the best interests of the City of Ecorse.

MR. SYKES: I think from my standpoint, my concern would be more so as a board member about the hiring, and making sure that we're hiring somebody that is an individual that is qualified to take on these types of duties.

One of the issues that I think from the standpoint of once the city council or the mayor have determined that this isn't an individual that they want to help them move the city forward, I think that's something that we would, I would, would rather lean upon their judgment. They're the ones that would have to work with these folks.

MR. O'NEAL: Mr. Chairman? If I may?

1	MR. SYKES: Um
2	MR. O'NEAL: My name is Wayne O'Neal, I'm the
3	city administrator until you terminate. And I'd like to
4	have an opportunity to address some of the items that
5	you're talking about. I think they're germane and
6	pertinent.
7	If you would allow me to?
8	MR. SYKES: Just a few moments. And then if you
9	would like to discuss more, then there would be public
10	comment at the end of the meeting. But go ahead, sure.
11	But please, keep it brief.
12	MR. O'NEAL: I, before you, have a my
13	comments and my response to the resolution, from the city
14	council. I would like to make that part of the record, is
15	I could, get a vote from the board, at least make that
16	part of the record? That I've made this so I can keep it
17	brief? Would you do that?
18	MR. SYKES: I can do that.
19	MR. O'NEAL: Thank you very much. I would just
20	point out some of the highlights that are in there, that
21	Mr. Bovitz was very succinct and exact, when he spoke to
22	the fact that I was saddled with the orders left by the
23	emergency manager. And as such, comporting with those
24	orders put me in the deleterious situation with my mayor

and my council, because they don't want a city

25

1 administrator.

They don't like to be under receivership, and I don't blame them. My job is to get them out of receivership, and I've done everything I could to do that. With that said, there are things I have brought to the mayor and council's attention relative to scrutinizing contractor's bills, employees working here for the City of Ecorse, and I feel as though I, because I've blown the whistle, that they've terminated me because I've done that.

I have all the evidence there is, that are needed. I've comported with order number 94; all of the orders. Some of the things they talk about in the resolution, engaging what appears to be capricious employment decisions. All the employment decisions that I have made have been approved by the RTAB. The hirings and the firings.

The only amendment that was made to order -- in the order since Joyce Parker left, was order number 94, when RTAB decided it was in their best wisdom to take it under their jurisdiction, that they approve any terminations.

They did that just prior to the 2015 election, knowing full well that the elections can be very contentious here in Ecorse, and they wanted to protect the

employee, the administrative employees, from any wrongdoing, okay. Here we stand, a year after those elections, and boom, we've got the same situation.

Again, my decisions have all been by and through the city attorney, they've been approved by the TAB board. I have terminated employees at all levels of the organization. I don't take pleasure in doing that, but I will tell you that, and point out and remind the board, because I know Ms. Brophy wasn't here, and Mr. Sykes, you weren't here.

But the mayor and the council voted to approve a deputy chief, and a deputy city treasurer, at the council meetings, without any input from the city administrator. There was not any input given to me, or support, at the TAB board, and the TAB board denied those.

I feel those are some of the reasons that I've been terminated, for that, alone. I have a -- currently, I have told the mayor about some problems that I've got, with one of my billing clerks. And the problems associated with that. Happens to be a cousin of the mayor. And I believe that I've been terminated because of the, because, we're in the process of looking at termination for this employee.

The -- let me just finish, Mr. Sykes, and I'll get you this, and I appreciate you giving me the chance.

But these are important points to make. I'm blowing the whistle on contractors and their bills, and those types of things; it's all there in the record for you.

I believe because I have done that, and the council doesn't like it, it's not politically favorable to them, that they've terminated me for those items, and you'll see, as they go on, and the record speaks for itself, and all the things that we have done.

One last thing. I was called by Ed Koryzno, and Randy Byrne, to Lansing, and I believe it was November the 8th, 2014, before I was appointed in my second stint as an interim city administrator, okay. You have to understand, I was appointed to be interim city administrator in 2013.

I had to terminate the city engineer and a building official; it did not curry favor with the city council at that time, and they would not appoint me as permanent city administrator. The -- I was called back, because the mayor fought hard, and I appreciate what the mayor did. To this day, I don't know why he's mad at me, exactly, but it can only be for the items I said.

Is that I was called to the state, on November the 8th, to speak with Ed Koryzno and Randy Byrne about these orders that are in place, and the problems associated with Ecorse. And moving Ecorse out of receivership, and that would I be strong enough to comport

1	with these orders. And do what was right, because they've
2	had the revolving door with these city administrators.
3	And I assured them that I could do that. They
4	even changed that one order, as a protection for the
5	employee. I'm asking for that protection, from this
6	board. Because this is arbitrary and capricious, what the
7	mayor and the council have done.
8	MR. SYKES: Let me ask the city attorney. Mr.
9	Wyckoff, do you believe that all of the appropriate steps
10	have been taken in this process of looking at this
11	termination, from the city council, with the mayor? Are
12	there any anything that you know of, within this
13	process, that you should make us aware of?
14	MR. WYCOFF: I am satisfied that everything was
15	done appropriately.
16	MR. SYKES: Okay.
17	MR. WYCOFF: I might tell you, Mr. Sykes, I was
18	not allowed to speak at my termination. I was not allowed
19	to make a statement; I was not given a copy of the
20	resolution. Nothing. Nothing. I asked to make a
21	statement and was told no.
22	MR. SYKES: I can appreciate that this is very
23	frustrating.
24	MR. O'NEAL: It's not frustrating, it's illegal
25	and it's wrong.

1	MR. SYKES: And one of the things that we've
2	done, in going through this process, is to try and
3	determine whether or not we're going to allow the city and
4	the city council to make these types of decisions, and as
5	long as the city council as long as the city attorney
6	believes that all the appropriate steps have been taken,
7	then, I believe that we're going to move forward and vote
8	on this issue.
9	MR. O'NEAL: That's fine, just keep one thing in
10	mind. There is no due process whatsoever. My rights are
11	violated all the way along. I have asked for help from
12	the State of Michigan, from this treasurer, the deputy
13	treasurer, and members of the RTAB board. Sent emails
14	out; you should note that approximately 2:00 on the
15	Tuesday before the Wednesday when they had the special
16	meeting, I sent out an email to the mayor and the council
17	and the city attorney, asking for questions about those
18	bills, what have you. At 4:30, after they were closed,
19	they posted a meeting to terminate me. And that speaks
20	for itself.
21	MR. WYCOFF: Mr. Sykes, may I have an
22	opportunity to speak?
23	MR. SYKES: Absolutely.
24	MR. WYCOFF: Mr. O'Neal has told you correctly,
25	that he was not allowed to speak during the course of the

meeting, which is normally the same practice that we have
at TAB board meetings. However, at the end of the
meeting, the mayor did offer him an opportunity to speak
at length; he could have as much time as he wanted and he
chose not to do so. That's number one.
Number two, the meeting that took place to
terminate Mr. O'Neal occurred on a Tuesday night; the
letter dated Tuesday came after the notice of the meeting.
And you will also note that I fully responded to his
inquiries, not only to him but to every member of the
mayor and the council.
MR. SYKES: Thank you for your comment. So I'll
entertain a motion to approve this resolution?
MR. VAN de GRIFT: We have a motion; and a
second we can either continue discussion or vote.
MR. SYKES: I would suggest that we vote at this
time. Okay.
MR. BOVITZ: I just one more comment. Even
though the city administrator is an employer of the city,
and I think you had the support of the department heads
and the employees for the most part, from what I've heard
over the last few months.
Technically, you're the appointee of the mayor,
and if the mayor and council chooses to go in a different

direction, I can't see where we can reinstate or at least

25

1	not approve your termination. But what I disagree with is
2	termination for the behavior.
3	I don't think that Mr. O'Neal acted outside his
4	behavior in his duty as city administrator, so I would not
5	like to see that as part of the termination. But I don't,
6	not even sure that we can do that.
7	MR. O'NEAL: I would ask that you do that,
8	please, not accept that the "for cause" in the resolution.
9	I've done nothing. I would ask that you omit that from
10	the resolution.
11	MR. SYKES: Mr. Wyckoff, would you address that
12	issue?
13	MR. WYCOFF: Address what, now?
14	MR. SYKES: On whether or not this could be
15	separated in any way, shape, or form? I don't I
16	actually believe that it, at this time, we should vote
17	with what's on the table, but can you at least address
18	that issue? Essentially what he's asking, I believe, is
19	to not
20	MR. WYCOFF: I understand.
21	MR. SYKES: Okay.
22	MR. WYCOFF: Mr. O'Neal's contract was somewhat
23	unique. I have never before seen a perpetual labor
24	contract or employment contract. This contract is
25	perpetual. There are termination provisions for cause,

1 and there are termination provisions which would allow the 2 city council to terminate at will, subject to a penalty clause that's contained in the contract. 3 4 The city council was made aware of both; they 5 have copies of the contract, as well, after all they're 6 the ones who approved the contract. They determined that 7 the interests of the city was to terminate him for cause. I don't believe that the issue before you is different 8 9 than whether or not he should be terminated for cause. 10 MR. SYKES: Okay. I appreciate that. 11 MR. WYCOFF: No problem. 12 MR. SYKES: So I think at this point, the motion 13 is to approve as is, and so with that, all those in favor 14 of this motion, say aye. Aye. 15 MS. BROPHY: Aye. 16 MR. SYKES: Opposed, the same. 17 MR. BOVITZ: Aye. 18 This motion is approved. MR. SYKES: 19 Next, we have resolutions from the regular city 20 council meeting of March 29th, 2016. Entertain a motion to approve the resolutions from the March 29th, 2016, 21 22 regular city council meeting, with the exception of 23 resolution number 101.16, which is the proposed budget 24 amendment number five for the year end final. 25 MR. BOVITZ: So moved.

1	MS. BROPHY: Support.
2	MR. SYKES: Any discussion? Seeing none, all
3	those in favor say aye. Aye.
4	MS. BROPHY: Aye.
5	MR. BOVITZ: Aye.
6	MR. SYKES: Opposed, the same.
7	(No response)
8	MR. SYKES: This motion is approved. Okay,
9	resolution from closed session city council meeting of
10	April 5th.
11	MR. VAN de GRIFT: Pardon me, Chair.
12	MR. SYKES: Yes.
13	MR. VAN de GRIFT: Because 101.16 was accepted
14	from that blanket resolution the Board may wish to address
15	it.
16	MR. SYKES: Oh, okay.
17	MR. VAN de GRIFT: Individually.
18	MR. SYKES: Absolutely. Okay.
19	With the new city administrator appointment I'd
20	entertain a motion to postpone approval of resolution
21	number 101.16.
22	MR. BOVITZ: So moved.
23	MS. BROPHY: Support.
24	MR. SYKES: Any discussion?
25	(No response.)

```
1
                  MR. SYKES:
                              Seeing none, all those in favor of
2
         the motion, aye? Aye.
3
                  MR. BOVITZ: Aye.
4
                  MS. BROPHY: (No response.)
5
                  MR. SYKES: Opposed the same?
6
                  (No response.)
7
                  MR. SYKES: Motion is approved.
8
                  Thank you, Drew.
9
                  MR. VAN de GRIFT: Uh-huh. Mr. Sykes:
10
                  MS. BROPHY: Resolution from closed session city
         council meeting of April 5, 2016. This resolution from
11
12
        the city council were addressed at the last month's RTAB
13
        meeting, therefore no action is necessary on number three.
14
                  Number four, resolution from the regular city
15
         council meeting of April 12, 2016. Entertain a motion to
16
        approve the resolution from the regular city council
17
        meeting of April 12, 2016.
18
                  MR. BOVITZ: So moved.
19
                  MS. BROPHY:
                               Support.
20
                  MR. SYKES: Any discussion?
21
                  (No response.)
22
                  MR. SYKES: Seeing none, all of those in favor
23
        of the motion say aye?
                  MS. BROPHY: Aye.
24
25
                  MR. BOVITZ:
                               Aye.
```

1	MR. SYKES: Aye.
2	Opposed the same?
3	(No response.)
4	MR. SYKES: This motion is approved.
5	Number five, claims and accounts for regular
6	city council meeting's drafted minutes of April 26, 2016.
7	I'll entertain a motion to approve the claims and accounts
8	from the regular city council meeting draft minutes of
9	April 26, 2016.
10	MS. BROPHY: So moved.
11	MR. BOVITZ: Support.
12	MR. SYKES: Is there any discussion?
13	(No response.)
14	MR. SYKES: All right. Seeing none,
15	MR. SYKES: Any discussion?
16	(No response.)
17	MR. SYKES: Seeing none, all of those in favor
18	of the motion say aye?
19	MS. BROPHY: Aye.
20	MR. BOVITZ: Aye.
21	MR. SYKES: Aye.
22	Opposed the same?
23	(No response.)
24	MR. SYKES: This motion is approved.
25	There is one additional item which is the catch

1 basin contract. At this point this is something that was 2 added just recently before this meeting yesterday. 3 MR. VAN de GRIFT: Yes. 4 MR. SYKES: Could we get comment? Is --5 somebody give us a little bit more understanding of what this contract is for? 6 7 MR. VAN de GRIFT: Certainly. I would imagine 8 perhaps the city attorney would be a resource for the 9 Board. 10 MR. WYCKOFF: I can or I understand Mr. Strouss is here (sic). Or Mr. Kern. 11 12 MR. KERN: Yes, I can speak. 13 MR. SYKES: Perfect. 14 MR. KERN: Ryan Kern, NSC Engineers, the city's 15 contracted engineer. 16 Recently back in 2012 the city received an S-2 grant to do a sanitary sewer study and as part of that 17 18 we've come up with a phased approached to correct the 19 issue with the sanitary sewer system. We've been 20 receiving letters from Wayne County as far as exceedances into their system from Ecorse as far as the sanitary sewer 21 22 system. Last year we completed a relief sewer project on 23 15th Street as well as installed a storm sewer on Quality 24 Drive where there was seven acres of parking lot that was 25 draining into the sanitary sewer system. We completed

1	that last year as part of phase one. This program in
2	front of you would be phase two which is to basically
3	disconnect approximately 25 catch basins from the system
4	and reroute them into the storm sewer as well as
5	installing bulkheads blocking off several catch basins
6	that have outlets to both the sanitary and sanitary sewer
7	system. We did put this out to bid. We had five
8	contractors pick up the contract documents. We received
9	one bid from CI Contracting at \$570,000. Our estimate for
10	the project was \$650,000.
11	MR. BOVITZ: Do you know what the source of
12	funds are for this contract?
13	MR. KERN: I believe it's all water and sewer
14	funds.
15	UNIDENTIFIED VOICE: Water and sewer funds.
16	MR. BOVITZ: Were there any grants associated
17	with
18	UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: (Undiscernible)
19	MR. KERN: The grant was for the study work that
20	we did back in 2012.
21	MR. SYKES: Okay.
22	MR. KERN: No grants as part of the project.
23	MR. SYKES: Not for the work part of the study
24	MR. KERN: Correct.
25	MS. BROPHY: So there's no time what's the

1	time timing issue?
2	MR. KERN: Well, trying to get it done as soon
3	as possible because we are still getting exceedances when
4	there's heavy rain events and the county has been
5	threatening possible fines for the exceedances. They
6	haven't gone that far yet.
7	MS. BROPHY: Okay.
8	MR. SYKES: Any other questions?
9	(No response.)
10	MR. SYKES: No?
11	Thank you. Okay. I'll entertain a motion to
12	approve the catch basin contract.
13	MS. BROPHY: Motion to approve.
14	MR. BOVITZ: Support.
15	MR. SYKES: All those in favor of this motion
16	MR. BOVITZ: One discussion. I think the
17	interpretation from an engineer was much more appropriate
18	than an interpretation from legal or financial so thank
19	you for the it's over my head, so.
20	MR. SYKES: Thank you. All those in favor of
21	the motion say aye?
22	MS. BROPHY: Aye.
23	MR. BOVITZ: Aye.
24	MR. SYKES: Aye.
25	Opposed the same?

1	(No response.)
2	MR. SYKES: This motion is approved.
3	Based on city council's decision to appoint a
4	new city administrator we're going to look forward to his
5	report, his or her report in the following month.
6	At this time I would like to open things up for
7	public comment.
8	(No response.)
9	MR. SYKES: Okay. It appears that there's no
10	public comment.
11	MR. VAN de GRIFT: Oh, no, there is.
12	MR. SYKES: Oh, there is.
13	MR. VAN de GRIFT: Oh, absolutely.
14	MR. SYKES: Oh, I'm sorry.
15	MR. VAN de GRIFT: Yes, sir.
16	MR. SYKES: Brand new. Brand new.
17	MR. VAN de GRIFT: The first name is difficult
18	to read.
19	MR. SYKES: You are the timekeeper?
20	MR. VAN de GRIFT: I am. Two minutes.
21	MR. SYKES: Okay. Thank you, Drew.
22	MR. O'NEAL: I just want to make sure that my
23	response to the resolution is in the minutes verbatim.
24	MR. SYKES: Okay.
25	MR. O'NEAL: Thank you.

Mr. Wyckoff made an indication when he came up here and spoke after I did about the fact that the meeting was already posted before any emails came out and stuff like that.

Dana, when was that meeting posted?
UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Four-thirty.

MR. O'NEAL: Thank you. It was not during the day. It was 4:30 after the city hall had closed. I was gone. I didn't get notification of that meeting until I got to work the next day at 8:30 in the morning so it was incorrected then (sic).

What is really frustrating to me, I've been doing this 40 years. You talk about getting somebody in here that knows what they're doing. I don't know everything. I don't know anything. But one thing I do know is how to be a city administrator, what the jobs and duties are. The orders that are in place are succinct. Joyce Parker was the city administrator. And when she wrote those orders she was specific as the duties and responsibilities of the city administrator and the mayor and the council and that everybody answer to the city administrator. Not that it was a dictatorial thing but that's the way a city administrator form of government works. I did those jobs. I did that according to the rules and regulations as promulgated under Public Act 436

1	and I got crucified for it. Terminated. Out of hand for
2	doing my job. Because of nepotism and corruption.
3	Mr. Moore, how many times have we had the state police and
4	the FBI in here?
5	UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Several.
6	MR. O'NEAL: Several times. Ongoing
7	investigations. They know that. I've told my mayor and
8	council about these investigations. I won't specifically
9	tell them what's going on, I can't. Under the advice of
10	the law enforcement, (Indiscernible) and I'm not going to
11	tell them. But this is a travesty. And you guys should
12	be ashamed of yourself. You need to read those orders.
13	You've got me hanging out on a limb and I'm doing my job.
14	I'm not mad. I don't mean to be yelling. But I'm
15	compassionate about the fact that I know what I'm doing.
16	Now comes the one last thing and I've thought
17	about this.
18	MR. VAN de GRIFT: That's two minutes.
19	MR. O'NEAL: I don't care.
20	What happens is when I'm interviewed to get a
21	job, every job I've ever been interviewed for, when
22	they're looking for a seasoned manger, they're going to
23	ask you the question, if I call your past employees what
24	are they going to tell me about you? My answer is this:
25	MD CVVEC. We need to be fair

1	MR. O'NEAL: are you going to call the person
2	that I terminated or are you going to call the person that
3	I promoted? Okay. I have a job to do and I did my job
4	and I did it right.
5	MR. SYKES: Okay.
6	MR. O'NEAL: I blew the whistle and I'm looking
7	for this protection and got it and I hope to God that
8	because of this stuff and what happened in Flint that
9	you're not abandoning the people in Lincoln Park and
10	Hamtramck and Highland Park like you abandoned me. This
11	is a travesty. You haven't seen nothing yet.
12	UNIDENTIFIED AUDIENCE MEMBER: Amen.
13	MR. O'NEAL: The difference between Flint and
14	Ecorse is Flint they're going after the EFM because he did
15	something illegal.
16	MR. SYKES: Okay. We're going to go ahead and
17	let the next person
18	MR. O'NEAL: I'm doing something to try to right
19	a wrong here and I got crucified.
20	MR. SYKES: All right. Who do we have next?
21	MR. VAN de GRIFT: Thank you.
22	Marilyn Oliver.
23	MS. OLIVER: Good morning. As a taxpaying,
24	current up-to-date resident of the City of Ecorse I am
25	very disappointed in this movement by the mayor and

council. Now, they're the mayor and council did not
take action on a civil on a circuit court order to deem
the office of treasurer vacant because we had no treasurer
that shows up and doing anything and still getting paid
but yet they find action in support to terminate the city
manager that has brought us through leaps and bounds. I
don't understand that at all and I appreciate your vote of
"No", Mr. Bovitz because you've been with us through these
trying times and you know, I have given I've supported
every initiative to move this city forward. I've given of
my time freely. And without compensation. And this is
like a slap in the face and you've termed it correctly,
it's politics and personality. And unless they can prove
that Mr. O'Neal committed grand larceny, this is
ludicrous. This is ludicrous to actually terminate him
and I'm very, very disappointed in our mayor and council
for taking this action. I was hoping that it could have
been stopped by the Board but I guess it can't. But every
time we take a leap forward we jump back two, three times.
And the mayor and council don't take any action on
anything that actually supports the city that would
sustain the city.

There are at least three members of council that have mentioned that they thought we were being triple-billed by our current law firm. That was Councilman

1	Hellar, Councilman Sammons and the mayor. But and still
2	now our law firm is
3	MR. VAN de GRIFT: That's two minutes.
4	MS. OLIVER: crazy. I don't get it.
5	MR. SYKES: Thank you.
6	MR. VAN de GRIFT: Ms. Mexico.
7	MS. MEXICO: Hi, I'm Barbara Mexico and I've
8	lived in Ecorse a long time. And I just to tell you and
9	the council that they were wrong in firing Mr. O'Neal. We
10	finally have a good and honest city administrator, city
11	controller and we have a DPW gentleman who is finally
12	working for the city. And now the council fires them.
13	They're pushing us back. They're pushing us back into
14	receivership and you're letting them do it. And you're
15	letting them do it. Shame on you. I am so sorry that our
16	council acted the way they did and I'm shame on you for
17	letting them get away with it.
18	Thank you.
19	MR. VAN de GRIFT: Thank you.
20	Katherine Semos.
21	MS. SEMOS: Hi.
22	I stand before you disappointed like the
23	previous people that stood up here and talked. I have to
24	begin by saying that I moved here to the City of Ecorse as
25	a tenant about three years ago this June. I've seen like

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Marilyn Oliver said, the city through leaps and bounds.

I've attended every single council meeting except for this past month.

Not one time have I seen the city attorney there. Mr. O'Neal was brought in, again, doing the city a favor. If they ask you to come back again, Wayne, don't.

Anyways, the council itself, I've seen act in vigorous ways. To me, I feel like this is personal. And I'm lost for words right now but I take it as personal. As a vendetta from day one. There is corruption in the I know of it. I've seen it but I can't do anything because I'm only one person. I stand behind Mr. Wayne O'Neal because you've got some slumlords in this city that gets away with murder because they know certain council people. And if I know Mr. O'Neal like I know Mr. O'Neal he spoke before you the truth that he brought out corruption and people don't like it. I guess because of the color of his skin and because he's too honest. He got terminated. So I want to just tell you also that you're making a big mistake. Because every time we take two or three steps forward and I get the sniggering now because they know it's the truth and the demon does that. demon does that (sic).

So, again, I want to reiterate that this was personal. It was a vendetta from day one. It was a setup

from day one. And Mr. O'Neal had nothing but good intentions for this city. But once he brought forward criminal activity and corruption like it is and I knew the past year since I moved here it existed.

MR. VAN de GRIFT: That's two minutes.

MS. SEMOS: This is why it happened. So, with your decision I hope you can sleep good at night. Because the city is now going to go downhill because of it.

MR. VAN de GRIFT: Thank you.

City Controller Timothy Sadowski.

MR. SADOWSKI: The last city administrator and the current new interim city administrator had said that the TAB had questions of me for financial concerns. I didn't hear any questions today. At our meeting with the state I did prepare our last five-year history and I did prepare the questions asked on the community evaluation criteria. I bet you guys have not seen those.

There is pretty much just the answers, where we've been and where we're going. And I'd like to if you'd like copies of them it's just my answers to the community evaluation criteria for your use, this year audit. It's talking about financial information that's been reported. It basically says that -- where we're going and the five-year forecast analysis. And that's what all I came here for today was I heard you guys had

1	questions and I didn't know what they were so I prepared a
2	financial packet and that's what I've got right here.
3	MR. SYKES: Thank you.
4	UNIDENTIFIED PERSON: (Indiscernible.)
5	MR. VAN de GRIFT: Thank you.
6	City councilman Nathaniel Elam.
7	MR. ELAM: Good morning.
8	One of the things I've heard here continuously
9	that this is a personal matter. This is not a personal
10	matter. This is a disagreement on how the city's being
11	ran. Under the emergency manager orders. We have a
12	different opinion on a lot of things that's being done.
13	We have difference of opinion on for instance how
14	contracts are put out, how things were we had a \$24,000
15	job that the council was not notified about and over
16	\$10,000 was supposed to come to the TAB for their
17	approval. Now, I just heard here something about the
18	catch basins which is on the agenda for tonight if I'm not
19	mistaken, that's a \$30,000 job and that should have went
20	to the Council even before they came to the TAB so what's
21	the big hurry?
22	UNIDENTIFIED VOICE: (Indiscernible)
23	MR. ELAM: To do what? We were doing one way and
24	then we turn around and do another way which is kind of
25	screwy to me.

1	Now, we have a lot in the city hall we only
2	have a few minutes, a few employees and the way you come
3	in here, everybody's upset on how things are being done.
4	And we have to go by that, we are elected officials. We
5	are elected by the people, not by one person but by the
6	whole community. And I have no dog in this fight. But
7	what I do want to see is things being done in the correct
8	manner. Like I told you a long time ago about work order
9	94, about different jobs that should be appointed by the
10	council with the incoming administration. And that's not
11	that's kind of come click with the work order number
12	94 that the attorney told you about that. So, and I don't
13	want people to think that we are hiding something or we
14	are crooks.
15	MR. VAN de GRIFT: That's two minutes.
16	MR. ELAM: But the city is equal I've been
17	here for 82 years.
18	AUDIENCE MEMBER: Amen.
19	MR. ELAM: Eighty-two years. And I surely want
20	to see Ecorse get back and do well. It's not about me.
21	It's about this community.
22	Thank you.
23	MR. VAN de GRIFT: Thank you.
24	Linda A. Lozer.
25	MS. LOZER: Linda Lozer.

1	I was here on Wednesday and I did miss the first
2	few minutes of the meeting but what I saw was our city not
3	this one, but our city attorney read a letter about the
4	new intern and Mr. O'Neal wanted to get up and talk and he
5	was told that he had to wait. After the letter was read
6	then it was opened up to the council which Gary Sammons
7	said he wanted to adjourn it quickly but the audience
8	still needed to talk. And then it was our turn to talk.
9	I was the only one that was here and I said to the council
10	that I know you guys have your differences, I understand
11	that. I come to just about every council meeting. I see
12	Mr. O'Neal in a different eye. He is very honest. He
13	at the TAB Board meeting he represents us. He doesn't
14	have an easy job. It's not his rules that he's following.
15	It's the state and Ms. Parker who no longer is here. I
16	see we have a couple new people on board. It's sad that
17	you have to come today when the other gentleman knew the
18	background.
19	Mr. O'Neal really didn't get a chance to say
20	what he wanted to say. The letter spoke against him so
21	the way he looked at it, at least that I saw, why speak
22	about it when you had told me I'm being terminated.
23	AUDIENCE MEMBER: (Indiscernible.)
24	MS. LOZER: As far as our city attorney I do

have to disagree. He has been here at a few council

25

1	meetings. Not that many but I feel bad that we're losing
2	Mr. O'Neal. I feel he's very honest. I come, like I
3	said, to a lot of council many council meetings. And a
4	lot of the council people have no input about it. Ms
5	Marilyn talked about the city treasurer. She's right.
6	She hasn't been here. But we still pay her. Mr. O'Neal
7	has been here. He's here all the time. You can walk up
8	and down the hallway and see him and talk to him and he
9	acknowledges you. When you call him, he calls you back.
10	When you have a problem he gets you the answer. I think
11	that's only being honest.
12	I've been in the city I'm not going to say how
13	many years but I've been in the city many, many years and
14	he is very honest with the city. And we've had mayors
15	that have lined their pockets. We've had city controllers
16	that have lined their pockets. And I feel this gentleman
17	has our back and Mr. O'Neal, if you get another job you
18	can use me as a reference because I'll speak very highly
19	of you.
20	MR. VAN de GRIFT: That's two minutes.
21	MS. LOZER: I've very disappointed in the city.
22	MR. SYKES: Thank you.
23	MR. VAN de GRIFT: Thank you. That concludes
24	public comment.
25	Board comments?

MR. SYKES: So we move on to board comments? MR. VAN de GRIFT: Yes, sir. MR. SYKES: Comments? AUDIENCE MEMBER: (Indiscernible) Criminals up here on the MR. BOVITZ: I have nothing more. MR. SYKES: I have no comments. There being no further business I'll entertain a motion to adjourn. MR. BOVITZ: So moved. MS. BROPHY: Support. MR. SYKES: Those in favor of the motion say aye? MS. BROPHY: Aye. MR. BOVITZ: Aye. MR. BOVITZ: Aye. MR. SYKES: Aye. Opposed the same? (No response.) MR. SYKES: Motion's been approved. (At 9:47 a.m. meeting adjourned.)		
MR. SYKES: Comments? AUDIENCE MEMBER: (Indiscernible) Criminals up here on the MR. BOVITZ: I have nothing more. MR. SYKES: I have no comments. There being no further business I'll entertain a motion to adjourn. MR. BOVITZ: So moved. MS. BROPHY: Support. MR. SYKES: Those in favor of the motion say aye? MS. BROPHY: Aye. MR. BOVITZ: Aye. MR. SYKES: Aye. Opposed the same? (No response.) MR. SYKES: Motion's been approved. (At 9:47 a.m. meeting adjourned.)	1	MR. SYKES: So we move on to board comments?
AUDIENCE MEMBER: (Indiscernible) Criminals up here on the MR. BOVITZ: I have nothing more. MR. SYKES: I have no comments. There being no further business I'll entertain a motion to adjourn. MR. BOVITZ: So moved. MS. BROPHY: Support. MR. SYKES: Those in favor of the motion say aye? MS. BROPHY: Aye. MR. BOVITZ: Aye. MR. SYKES: Aye. Opposed the same? (No response.) MR. SYKES: Motion's been approved. (At 9:47 a.m. meeting adjourned.) 22 23 24	2	MR. VAN de GRIFT: Yes, sir.
here on the MR. BOVITZ: I have nothing more. MR. SYKES: I have no comments. There being no further business I'll entertain a motion to adjourn. MR. BOVITZ: So moved. MS. BROPHY: Support. MR. SYKES: Those in favor of the motion say aye? MS. BROPHY: Aye. MR. BOVITZ: Aye. MR. SYKES: Aye. Opposed the same? (No response.) MR. SYKES: Motion's been approved. (At 9:47 a.m. meeting adjourned.) 22 23 24	3	MR. SYKES: Comments?
MR. BOVITZ: I have nothing more. MR. SYKES: I have no comments. There being no further business I'll entertain a motion to adjourn. MR. BOVITZ: So moved. MS. BROPHY: Support. MR. SYKES: Those in favor of the motion say aye? MS. BROPHY: Aye. MR. BOVITZ: Aye. MR. SYKES: Aye. Opposed the same? (No response.) MR. SYKES: Motion's been approved. (At 9:47 a.m. meeting adjourned.) 22 23 24	4	AUDIENCE MEMBER: (Indiscernible) Criminals up
7 MR. SYKES: I have no comments. 8 There being no further business I'll entertain a 9 motion to adjourn. 10 MR. BOVITZ: So moved. 11 MS. BROPHY: Support. 12 MR. SYKES: Those in favor of the motion say 13 aye? 14 MS. BROPHY: Aye. 15 MR. BOVITZ: Aye. 16 MR. SYKES: Aye. 17 Opposed the same? 18 (No response.) 19 MR. SYKES: Motion's been approved. 20 (At 9:47 a.m. meeting adjourned.) 21 22 23 24	5	here on the
There being no further business I'll entertain a motion to adjourn. MR. BOVITZ: So moved. MS. BROPHY: Support. MR. SYKES: Those in favor of the motion say aye? MS. BROPHY: Aye. MR. BOVITZ: Aye. MR. BOVITZ: Aye. MR. SYKES: Aye. Opposed the same? (No response.) MR. SYKES: Motion's been approved. (At 9:47 a.m. meeting adjourned.) 22 23 24	6	MR. BOVITZ: I have nothing more.
motion to adjourn. MR. BOVITZ: So moved. MS. BROPHY: Support. MR. SYKES: Those in favor of the motion say aye? MS. BROPHY: Aye. MR. BOVITZ: Aye. MR. SYKES: Aye. Opposed the same? (No response.) MR. SYKES: Motion's been approved. (At 9:47 a.m. meeting adjourned.) 21 22 23 24	7	MR. SYKES: I have no comments.
MR. BOVITZ: So moved. MS. BROPHY: Support. MR. SYKES: Those in favor of the motion say aye? MS. BROPHY: Aye. MS. BROPHY: Aye. MR. BOVITZ: Aye. MR. SYKES: Aye. Opposed the same? (No response.) MR. SYKES: Motion's been approved. (At 9:47 a.m. meeting adjourned.) (At 9:47 a.m. meeting adjourned.)	8	There being no further business I'll entertain a
MS. BROPHY: Support. MR. SYKES: Those in favor of the motion say aye? MS. BROPHY: Aye. MS. BROPHY: Aye. MR. BOVITZ: Aye. MR. SYKES: Aye. Opposed the same? (No response.) MR. SYKES: Motion's been approved. (At 9:47 a.m. meeting adjourned.) 21 22 23 24	9	motion to adjourn.
MR. SYKES: Those in favor of the motion say aye? MS. BROPHY: Aye. MR. BOVITZ: Aye. MR. SYKES: Aye. Opposed the same? (No response.) MR. SYKES: Motion's been approved. (At 9:47 a.m. meeting adjourned.) 21 22 23 24	10	MR. BOVITZ: So moved.
aye? MS. BROPHY: Aye. MR. BOVITZ: Aye. MR. SYKES: Aye. Opposed the same? (No response.) MR. SYKES: Motion's been approved. (At 9:47 a.m. meeting adjourned.) 21 22 23 24	11	MS. BROPHY: Support.
MS. BROPHY: Aye. MR. BOVITZ: Aye. MR. SYKES: Aye. Opposed the same? (No response.) MR. SYKES: Motion's been approved. (At 9:47 a.m. meeting adjourned.) 21 22 23 24	12	MR. SYKES: Those in favor of the motion say
15 MR. BOVITZ: Aye. 16 MR. SYKES: Aye. 17 Opposed the same? 18 (No response.) 19 MR. SYKES: Motion's been approved. 20 (At 9:47 a.m. meeting adjourned.) 21 22 23 24	13	aye?
MR. SYKES: Aye. Opposed the same? (No response.) MR. SYKES: Motion's been approved. (At 9:47 a.m. meeting adjourned.) 21 22 23 24	14	MS. BROPHY: Aye.
Opposed the same? (No response.) MR. SYKES: Motion's been approved. (At 9:47 a.m. meeting adjourned.) 21 22 23 24	15	MR. BOVITZ: Aye.
(No response.) MR. SYKES: Motion's been approved. (At 9:47 a.m. meeting adjourned.) 21 22 23 24	16	MR. SYKES: Aye.
MR. SYKES: Motion's been approved. (At 9:47 a.m. meeting adjourned.) 21 22 23 24	17	Opposed the same?
20 (At 9:47 a.m. meeting adjourned.) 21 22 23 24	18	(No response.)
 21 22 23 24 	19	MR. SYKES: Motion's been approved.
222324	20	(At 9:47 a.m. meeting adjourned.)
23 24	21	
24	22	
	23	
25	24	
	25	

```
1
    STATE OF MICHIGAN
 2
    COUNTY OF WASHTENAW ).ss
 3
 4
 5
     I certify that this transcript is a complete, true, and
 6
    correct transcript to the best of my ability of the RTAB
 7
    meeting held on May 10, 2016, at the City of Ecorse. I also
 8
    certify that I am not a relative or employee of the parties
    involved and have no financial interest in this case.
 9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
    RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED:
                                  Dated: May 18, 2016
18
    s/Amy Shankleton-Novess
19
20
21
    Amy Shankleton-Novess (CER 0838)
22
    Certified Electronic Reporter
23
24
25
```