



**STATE ASSESSORS BOARD
REGULAR MEETING MINUTES OF APRIL 28, 2009
State Treasurers' Board Room, Richard H. Austin Building
430 West Allegan Street, Lansing, Michigan**

CALL TO ORDER: The April 28, 2009 meeting of the State Assessors Board was called to order at 9:30 a.m. in the State Treasurers' Board Room in the Richard H. Austin Building, 430 West Allegan Street, Lansing, Michigan.

ROLL CALL: Members present: Lisa A. Hobart, Chairperson
Raman A. Patel, Vice Chairperson
Henry O. Allen, Member
Frederick W. Morgan, Member

Member absent: Allan J. Berg, Member (excused)

Staff present: David C. Lee, Executive Secretary

APPROVAL OF MINUTES: It was moved by Patel, seconded by Morgan, and unanimously approved to adopt the regular meeting minutes of the March 20, 2009 meeting of the State Assessors Board as presented.

PUBLIC COMMENT: There was no public comment.

FINANCIAL REPORTS: It was moved by Allen, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to receive and file financial reports for February and March 2009 relating to State Assessors Board operations.

EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMS:

1. It was moved by Allen, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to receive and file a communication from the Executive Secretary regarding State Assessors Board Course 2 instructors for 2009.
2. It was moved by Allen, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to approve six hours of elective educational renewal credit for the Oakland University courses titled "Course REA520 Mortgage Fraud – A Dangerous Business" and "Course REA521 Mastering Unique and Complex Properties" and to approve four hours of elective educational renewal credit for the Oakland University course titled "Course REA522 Dynamic Presentation Skills for the Professional Appraiser and Assessor".
3. It was moved by Allen, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to approve three hours of elective educational renewal credit for a seminar titled "BS&A .Net and GIS Capability".
4. It was moved by Patel, seconded by Allen, and unanimously approved to approve six hours of elective educational renewal credit for an Appraisal Institute seminar titled "Appraisal Curriculum Overview".

5. It was moved by Patel, seconded by Allen, and unanimously approved to approve six hours of elective educational renewal credit for a McKissock seminar titled "Appraising in a Changing Market".
6. It was moved by Patel, seconded by Allen, and unanimously approved to approve six hours of elective educational renewal credit for a program developed by Norman J. Daniels titled "Overview of Property Tax Administration" with feedback to be provided to Mr. Daniels regarding certain program content matters.
7. It was moved by Allen, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to approve six hours of elective educational renewal credit for an Appraisal Institute seminar titled "Litigation Appraising: Specialized Topics and Applications".
8. It was moved by Patel, seconded by Allen, and unanimously approved to grant approval to the level 3 experience qualification requests of Dana McMurray, Anthony E. Meyaard, Matthew J. Smith, and Tyler A. Tacoma.
9. It was moved by Patel, seconded by Morgan, and unanimously approved to grant approval to the level 4 experience qualification request of Karen K. Oppeneer.

CERTIFICATION APPLICANTS:

1. It was moved by Morgan, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to grant formal approval to the list of certification applicants provided to the Board. The list of certification applicants which was approved by the Board and the certification totals presented to the Board were as follows:

**Certification Applicants
April 14, 2009**

Level 1

Crowe, Patrick M.
Green, Yvonne M.
Harris, Kevin S.
Kellogg, James E.

Laido, Michael
Marshall, Kenneth
Morse, Michelle
Mussatto, Steve D.

Preston, Michelle
Preston, Peter
Stewart, Kelly R.
Townsend, Evangeline

Level 2

Alpers, Hilary K.
Anderson, Juan
Chandler, Dionne
Ford, Valerie A.

Laido, Michael
Marshall, Kenneth
Mussatto, Steve D.
O'Neal, Stefanie A.

Richmond, Anne M.
Ross, Patricia K.
Shauver, John
Smith, William E.

Level 3

Markes, Michael W.

Certification Totals
April 14, 2009

| | |
|--------------|--------------|
| Level 1 | 552 |
| Level 2 | 959 |
| Level 3 | 897 |
| Level 4 | <u>147</u> |
| Total | 2,555 |

2. It was moved by Morgan, seconded by Allen, and unanimously approved to grant the certification reinstatement request of Gerald Plourde for 2009 contingent upon Mr. Plourde paying the same penalties that are prescribed in the Board's late renewal session completions policy/procedure.

CLOSED MEETING: A closed meeting was permissible under the Open Meetings Act, Michigan Compiled Law 15.268(h). A motion was made by Morgan and seconded by Patel to go into closed session. A roll call vote occurred: Hobart—yes, Patel—yes, Allen—yes, and Morgan—yes. The motion was unanimously approved.

A closed session was held for the following items:

1. Discussion of the closed meeting minutes from March 20, 2009
2. Discussion of official order relating to revocation petition 08-0036
3. Discussion of official order relating to revocation petition 09-0008
4. Formal revocation hearing for revocation petition 08-0039
5. Formal revocation hearing for revocation petition 09-0009
6. Discussion of revocation petition 07-0021
7. Informal revocation hearing for revocation petition 09-0018
8. Discussion of revocation petition 09-0011
9. Discussion of revocation petition 09-0017
10. Discussion of revocation petition 09-0019
11. Discussion of revocation petition 09-0020
12. Discussion of revocation petition 09-0021
13. Discussion of course examination results
14. Discussion of a level 4 demonstration appraisal subject property request
15. Discussion of narrative appraisal 196

A motion was made by Morgan and seconded by Allen to return to open session. A roll call vote occurred: Hobart—yes, Patel—yes, Allen—yes, and Morgan—yes. The motion was unanimously approved.

OPEN MEETING ACTIONS ON CLOSED MEETING ITEMS:

1. It was moved by Morgan, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to approve the closed meeting minutes of March 20, 2009 as presented.
2. It was moved by Morgan, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to approve the official revocation order as presented for revocation petition 08-0036.
3. It was moved by Morgan, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to approve the official revocation order as presented for revocation petition 09-0008.
4. It was moved by Morgan, seconded by Allen, and unanimously approved to place the assessing officer named in revocation petition 08-0039 on probation for a period of three years and to restrict the assessing officer from certifying an assessment roll, performing a revaluation, or performing a reappraisal during that time period.
5. It was moved by Patel, seconded by Morgan, and unanimously approved to place the assessing officer named in revocation petition 09-0009 on probation for a period of one year.
6. It was moved by Morgan, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to end the probationary status of the assessing officer named in revocation petition 07-0021 since the specified length of the probationary period had passed and the assessing officer had met the educational requirements imposed by the Board for the probationary status to end.
7. It was moved by Morgan, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to hold revocation petition 09-0018 in abeyance, to require the assessing officer named in that petition to provide a copy of the corrective action plan for the Township that had been submitted to the State Tax Commission, and to require that the assessing officer submit to the State Assessors Board copies of the quarterly progress reports submitted to the State Tax Commission.
8. It was moved by Morgan, seconded by Allen, and unanimously approved to ask the assessing officer named in revocation petition 09-0011 to submit an additional written response to the petition.
9. It was moved by Allen, seconded by Morgan, and unanimously approved to dismiss revocation petition 09-0017.
10. It was moved by Morgan, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to ask the assessing officer named in revocation petition 09-0019 to respond in writing to the allegations contained in the petition.
11. It was moved by Allen, seconded by Morgan, and unanimously approved to ask the assessing officer named in revocation petition 09-0020 to respond in writing to the allegations contained in the petition and for the written response to include the year of the appeal (i.e., the appeal mentioned in the petition) to the Michigan Tax Tribunal as well as the year of the Tribunal's decision.

12. It was moved by Morgan, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to dismiss revocation petition 09-0021.

13. It was moved by Morgan, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to receive and file the course examination results from February and March 2009.

14. It was moved by Patel, seconded by Morgan, and unanimously approved to approve the subject property approval request with appropriate cautions provided to the level 4 candidate.

15. It was moved by Patel, seconded by Allen, and unanimously approved to approve the grader's failing grade for the second grading of narrative appraisal 196. Morgan recused himself in this matter.

OTHER BUSINESS: It was moved by Morgan, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to adopt the Ethical Conduct Policy/Procedure with a minor modification.

ANNOUNCEMENTS: The next meeting of the State Assessors Board is scheduled for May 15, 2009 at 9:30 a.m. in the State Treasurers' Board Room of the Richard H. Austin Building, 430 West Allegan Street, in Lansing.

ADJOURNMENT: It was moved by Patel, seconded by Allen, and unanimously approved to adjourn the meeting. The meeting adjourned at 12:46 p.m.

Date minutes typed: May 3, 2009

Date minutes approved: 5-15-09



Lisa A. Hobart, Chairperson