89 (Rev. 01-11)

STATE OF MICHIGAN
DEPARTMENT OF TREASURY
LANSING

RICK SNYDER
GOVERNOR

ANDY DILLON
STATE TREASURER

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE STATE TAX COMMISSION

Lansing Center, Meeting Room 201
333 East Michigan Avenue
Lansing, Michigan

Monday, October 31, 2011
9:00 a.m.

PRESENT: ***Douglas B. Roberts, Chair STC***
Robert H. Naftaly, Member STC
Barry N. Simon, Member STC

Kelli Sobel, Executive Secretary
LaNiece Densteadt, Recording Secretary

The item numbers referred to in the minutes correspond to the agenda items as numbered.

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to adopt the minutes of September 27, 2011. (Item 1 on agenda)

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved the attached list of classification appeals for the 2009 and 2010 years and held in abeyance classification appeals 10-0888, 11-0186, 11-0187, 11-0188, 11-0220, 11-0238, and 11-0354 until the December 6th Meeting. It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved the attached list of classification appeals for the 2008, 2009, and 2010 years and held in abeyance until December 6th the following: 09-0092, 09-0324, 09-0723, 10-0876, and 10-1000. (See attached link for the list of approved) (Item 2 on agenda)

It was moved by Roberts, supported by Naftaly, and unanimously approved to rescind Bulletin 22 of 2010 regarding Property Classification. (Item 3 on agenda)

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to amend the STC Manual Chapter 12, Volume 3 – Utilities. (Item 4 on agenda)

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved Bulletin 10 of 2011 Tax and Equalization Calendar for 2012. (Item 5 on agenda)

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved Bulletin 11 of 2011 Equalization Process. (Item 6 on agenda)

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved Bulletin 12 of 2011 Procedural Changes for 2012. (Item 7 on agenda)

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved Bulletin 13 of 2011 Certified Interest Rates January thru September 2011. (Item 8 on agenda)

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved Bulletin 14 of 2011 Inflation Rate Multiplier for 2012. (Item 9 on agenda)

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to adopt the official order to assume jurisdiction of the 2011 roll for Bethel Township, Branch County and to require them to hire an outside party to complete the reappraisal work by October 1, 2012 for the 2013 roll. (Item 10 on agenda)

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to adopt the official order to return jurisdiction of the 2009 assessment roll for Bruce Township - Macomb County, the 2009 assessment roll for Bark River Township - Delta County, the 2010 assessment roll for Gilead Township - Branch County, and the 2010 assessment roll for Whitney Township, Arenac County. (Items 11, 12, 13, & 14 on agenda)

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to adopt the official order to certify the 2010 assessment roll for Kenockee Township, St. Clair County. (Add on to the agenda, item 14a)

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to adopt the official order to overturn inappropriate actions of the July Board of Review for Maple Grove Township, Manistee County. (Item 15 on agenda)

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to adopt the 2012 STC Meeting Schedule. (Item 16 on agenda)

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to deny Jody Smith's request for a continuing education waiver. It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to deny Michael Jastifer's request for a continuing education waiver. The Commission is maintaining their adopted policy on continuing education. (Item 17 on agenda)

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to adopt the 2012 Wind Energy System Form 4565. (Item 18 on agenda)

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to adopt the 2012 Personal Property Forms 632 – Personal Property Statement, 2698 – Idle Equipment, 2699 – Qualified Personal Property, 3589 – Cable Television and Utility, 3595 – Daily Rental, 3612 – Itemized Listing of Daily Rental, 3966- Move-Ins Reporting, 2807 – Qualified Personal Property, Additional Reporting, and 633 – Personal Property Statement Electric Distribution Cooperative (add on). (Item 19 on agenda)

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to adopt the list of Certification Applicants. (See attached link for file identification) (Item 20 on agenda)

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to adopt the staff recommendation on the Exemptions Special Items Agenda (See attached link for file identification) and Exemptions (See attached link for file identification). (Item 21 on agenda)

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to adopt the staff recommendation on the Re-certifications and New Certifications of Computerized Tax Rolls for the following: (Item 22 on agenda)

These certifications will expire on **May 1, 2014**.

Recertification's

Genesee County
City of Montrose

Manistee County
Onekama Township

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to adopt the MCL 211.154 **Concurrences**. (See attached link for file identification.) (Item 23 on agenda)

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to adopt the MCL 211.154 **Special Items Agenda.** (See attached link for file identification) (Item 24 on agenda)

It was moved by Roberts, supported by Naftaly, and unanimously approved to move Agenda Item 26 before Agenda Item 25.

It was moved by Roberts, supported by Naftaly, and unanimously approved to deny the following Detroit Edison MCL 211.154 petitions. (See attached link for file identification) (Item 26 on agenda)

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to **postpone** the following MCL 211.154 petitions until **December 6, 2011**. (Item 25 on agenda)

City of Muskegon, Muskegon County

154-11-1075 GREAT LAKES DIE CAST CORP.; 61-24-900-351-0155-00; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2011 AV from $ 498,300 to $ 913,900 TV from $ 498,300 to $ 913,900

154-11-1076 GREAT LAKETON LLC; 61-24-370-001-0002-00; REAL-IFT PROPERTY

2011 AV from $ 1,197,000 to $ 1,919,300 TV from $ 825,122 to $ 1,547,422

City of South Haven, Van Buren County

154-10-1655 SOUTH HAVEN COMM. HOSPITAL AUTHORITY; 80-53-900-896-00; Personal Property

2008 AV from $ 50,000 to $ 448,600 TV from $ 50,000 to $ 448,600
2009 AV from $ 50,000 to $ 416,000 TV from $ 50,000 to $ 416,000
2010 AV from $ 50,000 to $ 358,600 TV from $ 50,000 to $ 358,600

Scio Township, Washtenaw County

154-11-1084 ANN ARBOR RUG & CARPET CLEANING; H-99-45-096-060; Personal Property

2009 AV from $ 5,000 to $ 47,200 TV from $ 5,000 to $ 47,200
2010 AV from $ 500 to $ 41,000 TV from $ 500 to $ 41,000
2011 AV from $ 400 to $ 47,000 TV from $ 400 to $ 47,000

Canton Township, Wayne County

154-10-2036 MERCHANTS AUTOMATIC PRODUCTS INC./MAPCO; 71-999-99-2006-277; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2009 AV from $ 404,060 to $ 503,115 TV from $ 404,060 to $ 503,115
2010 AV from $ 456,360 to $ 545,452 TV from $ 456,360 to $ 545,452

154-10-2037 MERCHANTS AUTOMATIC PRODUCTS INC./MAPCO; 71-998-01-9892-055; PERSONAL-IFT PROPERTY

2009 AV from $ 488,760 to $ 389,707 TV from $ 488,760 to $ 389,707
2010 AV from $ 426,440 to $ 341,854 TV from $ 426,440 to $ 341,854

City of Detroit, Wayne County

154-11-0368 NEXTEL WEST CORP./SPRINT NEXTEL; 11980304.00; REAL PROPERTY

2009 AV from $ 0 to $ 49,816 TV from $ 0 to $ 49,816
2010 AV from $ 0 to $ 49,816 TV from $ 0 to $ 49,667

154-11-0897 NEW PAR DBA VERIZON WIRELESS; 16982994.01; REAL PROPERTY

2009 AV from $ 24,728 to $ 0 TV from $ 24,728 to $ 0
2010 AV from $ 24,728 to $ 0 TV from $ 24,653 to $ 0
2011 AV from $ 24,724 to $ 0 TV from $ 24,724 to $ 0

Huron Township, Wayne County

154-10-2043 CHAMPION FOODS LLC; 75-998-01-9892-007; PERSONAL-IFT PROPERTY

2008 AV from $ 5,949,500 to $ 87,112 TV from $ 5,949,500 to $ 87,112
2009 AV from $ 5,186,100 to $ 79,825 TV from $ 5,186,100 to $ 79,825

Huron Township, Wayne County

154-10-2044 CHAMPION FOODS LLC; 75-999-00-0921-009; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2008 AV from $ 0 to $ 5,961,299 TV from $ 0 to $ 5,961,299
2009 AV from $ 0 to $ 5,287,475 TV from $ 0 to $ 5,287,475

Plymouth Township, Wayne County

154-10-2064 KARMANN USA INC.; 78-998-01-9891-111; PERSONAL-IFT PROPERTY

2008 AV from $ 3,174,720 to $ 1,134,061 TV from $ 3,174,720 to $ 1,134,061
2009 AV from $ 2,791,070 to $ 1,011,427 TV from $ 2,791,070 to $ 1,011,427
2010 AV from $ 2,193,950 to $ 744,544 TV from $ 2,193,950 to $ 744,544

154-10-2065 KARMANN USA INC.; 78-999-00-0585-510; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2008 AV from $ 239,810 to $ 2,285,957 TV from $ 239,810 to $ 2,285,957
2009 AV from $ 203,090 to $ 1,982,349 TV from $ 203,090 to $ 1,982,349
2010 AV from $ 201,510 to $ 1,647,043 TV from $ 201,510 to $ 1,647,043

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to **amend** the following MCL 211.154 petitions. (Item 25 on agenda)

Redford Township, Wayne County

154-10-1725 DETROIT DIESEL CORPORATION; 79-999-00-3230-500; PERSONAL PROPERTY
****This was also a concurrence.**

2008 AV from $ 20,140,300 to $ 20,700,084 TV from $ 20,140,300 to $ 20,700,084
2009 AV from $ 29,859,250 to $ 20,186,524 TV from $ 29,859,250 to $ 20,186,524
2010 AV from $ 30,127,600 to $ 22,053,787 TV from $ 30,127,600 to $ 22,053,787

154-10-1727 DETROIT DIESEL CORPORATION;79-998-01-9894-008; Personal-IFT Property
****This was also a concurrence.**

2008 AV from $ 55,797,500 to $ 55,042,487 TV from $ 55,797,500 to $ 55,042,487
2009 AV from $ 45,864,898 to $ 59,314,619 TV from $ 45,864,898 to $ 59,314,619
2010 AV from $ 40,967,900 to $ 52,787,206 TV from $ 40,967,900 to $ 52,787,206

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to **deny** the following MCL 211.154 petitions. (Item 25 on agenda)

Acme Township, Grand Traverse County

154-11-1115 CHARLES STARK BUILDER; 28-01-900-433-00; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2009 AV from $ 0 to $ 4,130 TV from $ 0 to $ 4,130
2010 AV from $ 0 to $ 4,130 TV from $ 0 to $ 4,130
2011 AV from $ 0 to $ 4,130 TV from $ 0 to $ 4,130

Northfield Township, Washtenaw County

154-11-1078 FRANK & JOSEPHINE JAKUBUS TRUST; B-02-02-400-010; REAL PROPERTY

2009 AV from $ 118,800 to $ 138,900 TV from $ 112,264 to $ 132,360
2010 AV from $ 112,600 to $ 132,700 TV from $ 111,927 to $ 131,960

City of Detroit, Wayne County

154-10-1940 RAUHORN ELECTRIC INC.; 19990406.01; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2008 AV from $ 6,590 to $ 73,640 TV from $ 6,590 to $ 73,640
2009 AV from $ 42,040 to $ 71,150 TV from $ 42,040 to $ 71,150
2010 AV from $ 62,840 to $ 63,220 TV from $ 62,840 to $ 63,220

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to **deny 2008 only** and **approve 2009**, **2010**, and **2011** on the following MCL 211.154 petitions. (Item 25 on agenda)

Garfield Township, Bay County

154-11-0414 BAY CONSERVATION & GUN CLUB; 09-050-030-200-005-00; REAL PROPERTY

Deny 2008 AV from $ 150 to $ 242,000 TV from $ 113 to $ 242,000
2009 AV from $ 150 to $ 242,000 TV from $ 114 to $ 242,000
2010 AV from $ 150 to $ 242,000 TV from $ 115 to $ 242,000
2011 AV from $ 150 to $ 251,550 TV from $ 116 to $ 246,215

154-11-0415 BAY CONSERVATION & GUN CLUB; 09-050-019-400-005-00; REAL PROPERTY

Deny 2008 AV from $ 150 to $ 158,000 TV from $ 113 to $ 158,000
2009 AV from $ 150 to $ 158,000 TV from $ 114 to $ 158,000
2010 AV from $ 150 to $ 158,000 TV from $ 115 to $ 158,000
2011 AV from $ 150 to $ 164,200 TV from $ 116 to $ 160,686

154-11-0416 BAY CONSERVATION & GUN CLUB; 09-050-029-100-010-00; REAL PROPERTY

Deny 2008 AV from $ 150 to $ 80,000 TV from $ 113 to $ 80,000
2009 AV from $ 150 to $ 80,000 TV from $ 114 to $ 80,000
2010 AV from $ 150 to $ 80,000 TV from $ 116 to $ 80,000
2011 AV from $ 150 to $ 83,150 TV from $ 115 to $ 81,360

154-11-0417 CRUMP FOX CLUB; 09-050-023-300-005-00; REAL PROPERTY

Deny 2008 AV from $ 100 to $ 19,500 TV from $ 94 to $ 19,500
2009 AV from $ 100 to $ 19,500 TV from $ 99 to $ 19,500
2010 AV from $ 100 to $ 19,500 TV from $ 100 to $ 19,500
2011 AV from $ 100 to $ 20,250 TV from $ 99 to $ 19,831

Garfield Township, Bay County

154-11-0418 CRUMP FOX CLUB; 09-050-026-100-025-00; REAL PROPERTY

Deny 2008 AV from $ 150 to $ 105,400 TV from $ 113 to $ 105,400
2009 AV from $ 150 to $ 105,400 TV from $ 114 to $ 105,400
2010 AV from $ 150 to $ 105,400 TV from $ 115 to $ 105,400
2011 AV from $ 150 to $ 109,550 TV from $ 116 to $ 107,191

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to allow the **withdrawal** of the following MCL 211.154 petitions. (Item 25 on agenda)

City of Warren, Macomb County

154-11-1073 ARROW UNIFORM RENTAL; 99-02-272-819; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2011 AV from $ 5,500 to $ 8,844 TV from $ 5,500 to $ 8,844

Canton Township, Wayne County

154-10-2039 YAZAKI NORTH AMERICA; 71-998-01-9892-014; PERSONAL-IFT PROPERTY

2008 AV from $ 1,953,900 to $ 1,380,420 TV from $ 1,953,900 to $ 1,380,420
2009 AV from $ 1,695,100 to $ 1,248,935 TV from $ 1,695,100 to $ 1,248,935
2010 AV from $ 1,555,430 to $ 1,117,611 TV from $ 1,555,430 to $ 1,117,611

City of Livonia, Wayne County

154-10-2178 ROUSH INDUSTRIES; 46-998-01-9891-161; PERSONAL-IFT PROPERTY

2009 AV from $ 0 to $ 1,482,042 TV from $ 0 to $ 1,482,042

City of Wyandotte, Wayne County

154-10-2216 BASF CORPORATION; 57-999-00-0216-000; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2008 AV from $ 23,544,000 to $ 26,770,014 TV from $ 23,544,000 to $ 26,770,014
2009 AV from $ 21,691,500 to $ 25,038,635 TV from $ 21,691,500 to $ 25,038,635
2010 AV from $ 20,074,600 to $ 22,064,180 TV from $ 20,074,600 to $ 22,064,180

154-10-2217 BASF CORPORATION; 57-998-01-9892-008; PERSONAL-IFT PROPERTY

2008 AV from $ 1,413,000 to $ 1,272,543 TV from $ 1,413,000 to $ 1,272,543
2009 AV from $ 1,372,000 to $ 1,169,486 TV from $ 1,372,000 to $ 1,169,486
2010 AV from $ 1,279,000 to $ 1,090,054 TV from $ 1,279,000 to $ 1,090,054

154-10-2376 BASF; 57-998-01-9892-007; PERSONAL-IFT PROPERTY

2008 AV from $ 3,759,300 to $ 2,199,443 TV from $ 3,759,300 to $ 2,199,443
2009 AV from $ 3,536,581 to $ 1,770,029 TV from $ 3,536,581 to $ 1,770,029
2010 AV from $ 3,196,900 to $ 1,605,486 TV from $ 3,196,900 to $ 1,605,486

Redford Township, Wayne County

154-11-0513 AXLE ALLIANCE; 79-999-00-2868-824; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2009 AV from $ 1,029,600 to $ 1,661,870 TV from $ 1,029,600 to $ 1,661,870
2010 AV from $ 2,065,900 to $ 2,269,455 TV from $ 2,065,900 to $ 2,269,455

154-11-0514 AXLE ALLIANCE; 79-998-01-9892-006; PERSONAL-IFT PROPERTY

2009 AV from $ 4,645,100 to $ 4,412,122 TV from $ 4,645,100 to $ 4,412,122
2010 AV from $ 4,167,300 to $ 3,963,690 TV from $ 4,167,300 to $ 3,963,690

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved several MCL 211.154 petitions as **concurrences,** initially noticed as non-concurrences. (See attached link for file identification.) (Item 25 on agenda)

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to adopt all other MCL 211.154 petitions. (See attached link for file identification.) (Item 26 on agenda)

Public Comment (Item 27 on agenda): No member of the public wished to comment.

It was moved by Roberts, supported by Simon, to go into closed session to discuss pending litigation. Roll Call Vote: Chairperson Roberts – Yes, Commissioner Naftaly – Yes, Commissioner Simon – Yes. The motion was unanimously approved.

It was moved by Roberts, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to return to open session. Roll Call Vote: Chairperson Roberts – Yes, Commissioners Naftaly – Yes, Commissioner Simon – Yes. The motion was unanimously approved.

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to request the Attorney General to file an amicus brief with the Supreme Court on behalf of the State Tax Commission in the Michigan Properties Case.

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to amend the requirement for Assessor Continuing Education for the 2012 year and remove the requirement for the Mandatory Class. (Add on to agenda)

It was moved by Simon, supported by Naftaly, and unanimously approved to deny Kendra McDonald's request to retake the Master Level oral exam. The Commission granted Ms. McDonald automatic entry into the Master Level class that will begin in 2012. (Add on to agenda)

The next Commission meeting will be held December 6, 2011 at the Lansing Center in Meeting Room 201, 333 East Michigan Avenue, Lansing.

It was moved by Roberts, supported by Naftaly, and unanimously approved to adjourn the meeting of the State Tax Commission at 12:00 p.m.

DATED TYPED: **November 1, 2011**

DATE APPROVED: **December 6, 2011**

Douglas B. Roberts, Chair
State Tax Commission

Robert H. Naftaly, Member
State Tax Commission

Barry N. Simon, Member
State Tax Commission