



RICK SNYDER
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MICHIGAN
DEPARTMENT OF TREASURY
LANSING

R. KEVIN CLINTON
STATE TREASURER

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE STATE TAX COMMISSION

***Holiday Inn Express and Okemos Conference Center,
Okemos A & B Rooms
2187 University Park Drive, Okemos, Michigan***

***Tuesday, December 16, 2014
9:00 a.m.***

***PRESENT: Douglas B. Roberts, Chair STC
Barry S. Simon, Member STC
W. Howard Morris, Member STC***

***Kelli Sobel, Executive Director
LaNiece Densteadt, Recording Secretary***

The item numbers referred to in the minutes correspond to the agenda items as numbered.

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved to adopt the minutes of October 13, 2014. (Item 1 on agenda)

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved to adopt Executive Director Sobel's recommendation regarding the STC Committees. The Commission adopted the following changes to their Advisory Committee structure and responsibilities: (Item 2 on agenda)

1. Retain the Assessor Discipline Advisory Committee with the same delegated responsibilities. Also retain the two year rotation of Committee Members.
2. Merge the Certification and Education Committee's into a single Committee dealing with certification and education issues.
3. Delegate responsibility to staff for approving continuing education programs.
4. Delegate authority to the new Certification and Education Committee to approve certification waivers, review annual certification levels, review and recommend the annual certification bulletin and review and make recommendations regarding the educational programs.
5. Rotate up to members of the Committee every year, beginning in 2017.

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved to adopt a revised STC Meeting Schedule for 2015. (Item 3 on agenda)

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved to approve special consideration requests for six local units to allow the December Board of Review to grant the Disabled Veteran's Exemption for the 2013 year in these specific cases where it was local unit error that caused the exemption not to be granted at the July Board of Review. (Item 4 on agenda)

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved Bulletin 15 of 2014 Transfer of Ownership and the Transfer of Ownership Guidelines. (Item 5 on agenda)

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved Bulletin 16 of 2014 Certified Interest Rates. (Item 6 on agenda)

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved Bulletin 17 of 2014 Property Tax Appeal Procedures. (Item 7 on agenda)

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved Bulletin 18 of 2014 Boards of Review. (Item 8 on agenda)

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved Bulletin 19 of 2014 Random Week for Qualified Business. (Item 9 on agenda)

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved Bulletin 20 of 2014 Interest Rates on Michigan Tax Tribunal Judgments. (Item 10 on agenda)

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved the 2015 System Economic Factors for Electric Distribution Cooperatives. (Item 11 on agenda)

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved to adopt the official order to certify the 2014 assessment rolls for Kimball and Columbus Township, St. Clair County. (Item 12 on agenda)

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved to adopt the official order to certify and return the 2013 assessment roll to Liberty Township, Wexford County. (Item 13 on agenda)

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved to adopt the official order to certify and return the 2013 assessment roll to Holland Township, Missaukee County. (Item 14 on agenda)

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved to adopt the official order reversing the December Board of Review Action that incorrectly identified Empire Township, Leelanau County as the local unit in which the action occurred to Elmwood Township, Leelanau County. (Item 15 on agenda)

Approval of New MCAO Level Assessing Officers: (Item 16 on agenda)

Ms. Sobel spoke regarding the MCAO Program: The July 2013 Program just finished last Friday. We have 19 students that are graduating out of the class. We normally would do a ceremony or graduation but because they just finished on Friday, we were running around trying to get the information together and we didn't want them to wait until February to be certified. We decided to forego the educational ceremony but we would like to recommend these students for certification. We also want to recognize the hard work of our instructors, Dick Steffens, Lynne Houston, Bob Brandmier and Pete Arbour. They really work hard at the program and have done a fabulous job. Then of course, Nancy Armstrong, who runs the programs for the Commission. Nancy does a fantastic job juggling our nearly 200 students that we have in our programs right now. We continue to have about doubled the number of applicants in each of our programs then we can take in each time. We have about 70 and we take 35 into the program. The programs continue to run very well. We are just starting a new class, we just had an orientation last week and the new class will start again in January. We are continuing to begin classes each January and July. The instructors and staff are recommending the Commission approve the 19 individuals listed on your sheet as new Michigan Certified Assessing Officers.

Commissioner Simon stated: I would like to move to approve the list of graduates. I would also like to thank all the instructors and the staff who work on this position. Everyone is doing a fantastic job.

Commissioner Morris stated: I will support and would just like to acknowledge and remember observing some of this in October and I concur with Barry's comments.

Chairman Roberts stated: Thank you. I have a motion and a second and would like to add my comments. I would like to congratulate the people who are receiving these certificates. I would also like to point out in my personal opinion this is one of the single most important features of approving the overall quality of assessing in Michigan, which frankly is the major mission of this Commission. I would also like to thank everyone.

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved to certify the following assessors as Michigan Certified Assessing Officers.

Michele Bennett	Sarah Brady	Robert Crispian
Frances DeWyse	Sara Ann Gilo	Jacqueline Godoshian
Eric Harger	Karen Hester	Heather Hoffman
Rebecca Ketchum	Robin Knoerr	Ryan MacDermaid
Tamara Mattioli	Sara Novencido	Lila Sareini
Mandy Spratto	Tami Stewart	Jennifer Woodley

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved to adopt a policy requiring that the pre-requisite courses for the Michigan Advanced Assessing Officer Program be taken in a specific order. (Item 17 on agenda)

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved to adopt the legislative report for Neighborhood Enterprise Zone Homestead Exemptions. (Item 18 on agenda)

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved to adopt the recommendation of the Telecommunications Committee and approve the following changes regarding the valuation of State Assessed telephone companies:

1. Table J – Metallic Cable (Copper): Retain the first five years of the current table, all other years are a hybrid of the TFI study and the current tables and modify the floor to be consistent with the Circuits Table.
2. Combine Tables H – Switches and I – Circuits into a single table retain the useful life currently in the Circuits Table and retaining the first three years of the current table. All remaining years are a hybrid of the TFI study and the current tables.
3. Discontinue the additional 10% per year obsolescence.
4. Retain the current allowances for fiber: Lit, Never to be Lit and Reserve for Future Use.
5. To review the tables again following the 2015 year to determine if they appropriately accounted for the loss of access lines.

The Commission also approved the revised State Assessed Property Annual Reporting Forms for 2015: 1029 Telephone Form, 1028 Railroad Form, 1027 Car Line Form and Electronic Reporting Forms. (Item 19 on agenda)

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved the Personal Property Forms 3991 – 2015 Gas Turbine and Diesel Electric Generator Report, Form 4094 – 2015 Steam Electric Report, Form 4070 – 2015 Hydroelectric Report and Nuclear Plant Composite Factors and Form 5201 – Eligible Manufacturing Personal Property. (Item 20 on agenda)

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved to adopt the staff recommendation on the Re-certifications and New Certifications of Computerized Tax Rolls for the following: (Item 21 on agenda)

These certifications will expire on **May 1, 2017**.

New Certifications:

Branch County

Kinderhook Township

Monroe County

City of Petersburg

Summerfield Township

Recertifications:

Calhoun County

Pennfield Charter Township

Genesee County
City of Linden

Otsego County
Elmira Township

Ottawa County
City of Ferrysburg

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved to adopt the staff recommendation on the Special Items Exemptions Agenda. (Item 22 on agenda) ([See attached link for file identification.](#))

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved to adopt the staff recommendation on the Exemptions Agenda. (Item 23 on agenda) ([See attached link for file identification.](#))

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved to adopt the MCL 211.154 **Concurrences**. (Item 24 on agenda) ([See attached link for file identification](#))

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved to adopt staff recommendations on the MCL 211.154 petitions on the **Special Items Agenda** except for 154-14-0084 and 154-14-0085 where the Commission approved the concurrence for the 2012 and 2013 tax years, the Commission postponed petitions 154-14-0649, 154-14-0650, 154-14-0651 and 154-14-0652 until February 10, 2015, approved petition 154-14-0561, allowed the withdrawal of petition 154-14-0620 and postponed petition 154-14-0299 until February 10, 2015. (Item 25 on agenda) ([See attached link for file identification](#))

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved to allow the **withdrawal** of the following MCL 211.154 petitions. (Item 26 on agenda)

Wayne County, City of Dearborn

154-14-0696 SEVERSTAL DEARBORN, LLC; 83-31-020-05-175-00; Personal-IFT Property

2012 AV from \$ 4,049,800 to \$ 0 TV from \$ 4,049,800 to \$ 0
2013 AV from \$ 3,433,700 to \$ 0 TV from \$ 3,433,700 to \$ 0
2014 AV from \$ 3,027,650 to \$ 0 TV from \$ 3,027,650 to \$ 0

154-14-0697 SEVERSTAL DEARBORN, LLC; 82-32-00-002-49-800-00; Personal Property

2012 AV from \$ 2,826,500 to \$ 51,279,678 TV from \$ 2,826,500 to \$ 51,279,678
2013 AV from \$ 2,397,400 to \$ 44,953,349 TV from \$ 2,397,400 to \$ 44,953,349
2014 AV from \$ 2,151,500 to \$ 40,235,255 TV from \$ 2,151,500 to \$ 40,235,255

Wayne County, City of Dearborn

154-14-0698 SEVERSTAL DEARBORN, LLC; 83-31-020-05-173-00; Personal-IFT Property

2012 AV from \$ 72,462,200 to \$ 44,407,550 TV from \$ 72,462,200 to \$ 44,407,550
2013 AV from \$ 65,316,800 to \$ 40,296,650 TV from \$ 65,316,800 to \$ 40,296,650
2014 AV from \$ 59,862,800 to \$ 37,007,000 TV from \$ 59,862,800 to \$ 37,007,000

154-14-0699 SEVERSTAL DEARBORN, LLC; 83-31-020-05-174-00; Personal-IFT Property

2012 AV from \$ 28,323,100 to \$ 11,976,400 TV from \$ 28,323,100 to \$ 11,976,400
2013 AV from \$ 24,959,800 to \$ 10,857,700 TV from \$ 24,959,800 to \$ 10,857,700
2014 AV from \$ 22,186,400 to \$ 9,986,100 TV from \$ 22,186,400 to \$ 9,986,100

154-14-0700 FORD MOTOR COMPANY; 82-32-00-001-23-000-00; Personal Property

2012 AV from \$ 16,091,050 to \$ 19,103,452 TV from \$ 16,091,050 to \$ 19,103,452
2013 AV from \$ 16,111,050 to \$ 18,836,557 TV from \$ 16,111,050 to \$ 18,836,557
2014 AV from \$ 19,951,850 to \$ 22,533,909 TV from \$ 19,951,850 to \$ 22,533,909

154-14-0701 FORD MOTOR COMPANY; 82-32-31-020-01-578-00; Personal Property

2012 AV from \$ 6,255,050 to \$ 1,127,850 TV from \$ 6,255,050 to \$ 1,127,850
2013 AV from \$ 5,404,200 to \$ 1,127,850 TV from \$ 5,404,200 to \$ 1,127,850
2014 AV from \$ 5,260,750 to \$ 986,900 TV from \$ 5,260,750 to \$ 986,900

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved to **postpone** the following MCL 211.154 petitions until **February 10, 2015**. (Item 26 on agenda)

Charlevoix Township, Charlevoix County

154-14-0710 SIEMENS FINANCIAL SERVICES; 15-004-900-102-50; Personal Property

2012 AV from \$ 190,900 to \$ 140,520 TV from \$ 190,900 to \$ 140,520

Orient Township, Osceola County

154-14-0299 THOMAS & TERESA STOVER; 67-11-004-015-00; REAL PROPERTY

2012 AV from \$ 90,700 to \$ 138,500 TV from \$ 90,700 to \$ 138,500
2013 AV from \$ 95,900 to \$ 139,000 TV from \$ 92,876 to \$ 139,000

City of Detroit, Wayne County

154-14-0712 SIEMENS FINANCIAL SERVICES; 25990907.00; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2012 AV from \$ 2,326,030 to \$ 97,888 TV from \$ 2,326,030 to \$ 97,888

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved to **deny** the following MCL 211.154 petitions. (Item 26 on agenda)

City of Marshall, Calhoun County

154-14-0375 WALTERS-DIMMICK PETROLEUM INC.; 13-53-300-570-02; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2012 AV from \$ 107,400 to \$ 93,400 TV from \$ 107,400 to \$ 93,400
2013 AV from \$ 128,100 to \$ 111,900 TV from \$ 128,100 to \$ 111,900

City of Three Rivers, St. Joseph County

154-14-0380 WALTERS-DIMMICK PETROLEUM, INC.; 051-000-759-00; Personal Property

2012 AV from \$ 49,600 to \$ 25,255 TV from \$ 49,600 to \$ 25,255

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved the following MCL 211.154 petitions as **concurrences**, initially noticed as non-concurrences. (Item 26 on agenda)

Newberg Township, Cass County

154-14-0119 WALTERS-DIMMICK PETROLEUM INC; 14-080-925-019-00; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2012 AV from \$ 170,984 to \$ 118,037 TV from \$ 170,984 to \$ 118,037
2013 AV from \$ 155,011 to \$ 109,569 TV from \$ 155,011 to \$ 109,569

Breen Township, Dickinson County

154-14-0716 SANDOR, GARY L. & MARY E.; 001-015-008-10; REAL PROPERTY

2012 AV from \$ 6,400 to \$ 27,900 TV from \$ 6,337 to \$ 27,885

City of East Lansing, Ingham County

154-14-0758 RELATIONAL FUNDING CORP.; 33-20-90-50-690-600; Personal Property

2013 AV from \$ 35,400 to \$ 0 TV from \$ 35,400 to \$ 0
2014 AV from \$ 36,100 to \$ 0 TV from \$ 36,100 to \$ 0

City of Lansing, Ingham County

154-14-0711 SIEMENS FINANCIAL SERVICES; 90-33-01-62-631-000; Personal Property

2012 AV from \$ 1,506,700 to \$ 0 TV from \$ 1,506,700 to \$ 0

Blackman Township, Jackson County

154-14-0376 WALTERS-DIMMICK PETROLEUM INC.; 38-900-08-40-600-131-00;
PERSONAL PROPERTY

2012 AV from \$ 47,814 to \$ 19,543 TV from \$ 47,814 to \$ 19,543
2013 AV from \$ 56,689 to \$ 31,181 TV from \$ 56,689 to \$ 31,181

Comstock Township, Kalamazoo County

154-14-0377 WALTERS-DIMMICK PETROLEUM, INC.; 07-90-300-605; Personal Property

2012 AV from \$ 80,475 to \$ 66,835 TV from \$ 80,475 to \$ 66,835
2013 AV from \$ 136,137 to \$ 123,377 TV from \$ 136,137 to \$ 123,377

City of Grand Rapids, Kent County

154-14-0584 NC SOLUTIONS INC.; 41-01-51-114-228; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2014 AV from \$ 100,000 to \$ 108,600 TV from \$ 100,000 to \$ 108,600

154-14-0585 GEORGIOS IONIA LLC; 41-01-51-112-412; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2012 AV from \$ 40,300 to \$ 42,800 TV from \$ 40,300 to \$ 42,800
2013 AV from \$ 35,800 to \$ 38,000 TV from \$ 35,800 to \$ 38,000

154-14-0725 MNEMONIX TECHNOLOGY CONSULTING; 41-01-51-112-702; PERSONAL
PROPERTY

2012 AV from \$ 30,000 to \$ 39,800 TV from \$ 30,000 to \$ 39,800

Hartland Township, Livingston County

154-14-0727 DAVID M. & MARY M. BAIR; 4708-11-300-028; REAL PROPERTY

2012 AV from \$ 168,700 to \$ 211,600 TV from \$ 168,700 to \$ 211,600
2013 AV from \$ 181,300 to \$ 224,900 TV from \$ 172,748 to \$ 216,678
2014 AV from \$ 188,100 to \$ 232,400 TV from \$ 175,511 to \$ 220,144

Shelby Township, Macomb County

154-14-0591 DEMANSKI, DEAN A. AND CHERYL; 23-07-18-203-039; REAL PROPERTY

2014 AV from \$ 0 to \$ 87,800 TV from \$ 0 to \$ 83,690

City of Madison Heights, Oakland County

154-14-0731 MADISON FOURTEEN; 44-25-02-227-016; REAL PROPERTY

2014 AV from \$ 250,300 to \$ 418,790 TV from \$ 167,850 to \$ 360,790

Springfield Township, Oakland County

154-14-0666 TODD STANISZEWSKI; U-07-07-100-027; REAL PROPERTY

2014 AV from \$ 0 to \$ 151,400 TV from \$ 0 to \$ 144,080

Grand Haven Township, Ottawa County

154-14-0735 MAUREEN A. & MICHAEL W. SCOTT; 70-07-02-129-007; Real Property

2014 AV from \$ 0 to \$ 125,000 TV from \$ 0 to \$ 88,579

City of Three Rivers, St. Joseph County

154-14-0379 WALTERS-DIMMICK PETROLEUM, INC.; 051-000-222-25; Personal Property

2012 AV from \$ 45,600 to \$ 34,500 TV from \$ 45,600 to \$ 34,500

Nottawa Township, St. Joseph County

154-14-0378 WALTERS-DIMMICK PETROLEUM, INC.; 75-042-000-250-00; Personal Property

2012 AV from \$ 78,300 to \$ 69,896 TV from \$ 78,300 to \$ 69,896

City of Detroit, Wayne County

154-13-0869 GENERAL ELECTRIC CAPITAL CORP.; 25990431.00; Personal Property

2011 AV from \$ 2,837,500 to \$ 2,424,660 TV from \$ 2,837,500 to \$ 2,424,660

154-14-0705 MATTY, SHAHER; 16016092-99; REAL PROPERTY

2012 AV from \$ 727,208 to \$ 226,766 TV from \$ 727,208 to \$ 226,766

City of Lincoln Park, Wayne County

154-14-0751 PAUL M. POLYVIU, DDS PC; 82-45-999-00-3905-006; Personal Property

2013 AV from \$ 92,700 to \$ 115,700 TV from \$ 92,700 to \$ 115,700

2014 AV from \$ 214,500 to \$ 196,800 TV from \$ 214,500 to \$ 196,800

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved to adopt all other MCL 211.154 petitions. ([See attached link for file identification.](#)) (Item 26 on agenda)

Public Comment (Item 27 on agenda):

John Lauve appeared before the Commission to discuss the Ilitch Hockey Arena in the City of Detroit and the failure of the DDA to meet the requirements of the Downtown Development Act.

Mr. Lauve asked the Commission to send the DDA a letter to review the files and make sure that all the rules are complied with before the bonds are released.

It was moved by Roberts, supported by Morris, to go into closed session to discuss items of pending litigation. Roll Call Vote: Chairperson Roberts – Yes, Commissioner Simon – Yes, Commissioner Morris – Yes. The motion was unanimously approved.

It was moved by Roberts, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to return to open session. Roll Call Vote: Chairperson Roberts – Yes, Commissioner Simon – Yes, Commissioner Morris – Yes. The motion was unanimously approved.

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved to authorize a settlement in the Soo Line Railroad Case from 2013 and issue a refund for \$357,873.49.

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved to allow staff to explore a June 2015 UP MCAO Class with the following requirements: (1) there must be a minimum of 25 students to fill the class and (2) staff must secure qualified instructors and a location to offer the class.

The next Commission meeting will be held February 10, 2015 at the Okemos Conference Center in the Okemos A & B Rooms, 2187 University Park Drive, Okemos.

It was moved by Roberts, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to adjourn the meeting of the State Tax Commission at 11:30 a.m.

DATE TYPED: December 17, 2014

DATE APPROVED: February 10, 2015

Douglas B. Roberts, Chair
State Tax Commission

Barry N. Simon, Member
State Tax Commission

W. Howard Morris, Member
State Tax Commission