STATE OF MICHIGAN
DEPARTMENT OF TREASURY
LANSING

RICK SNYDER
GOVERNOR

ANDY DILLON
STATE TREASURER

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE STATE TAX COMMISSION

Lansing Center, Meeting Room 201
333 East Michigan Avenue
Lansing, Michigan

Wednesday, August 31, 2011
9:00 a.m.

PRESENT: ***Douglas B. Roberts, Chair STC***
Robert H. Naftaly, Member STC
Barry N. Simon, Member STC

Kelli Sobel, Executive Director
LaNiece Densteadt, Recording Secretary

The item numbers referred to in the minutes correspond to the agenda items as numbered.

It was moved by Simon, supported by Naftaly, and unanimously approved to table Item 29, Discussion of the 2008 Midland Classification Appeal 08-221 because of the recent motion filed in Circuit Court.

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to adopt the minutes of June 9, 2011. (Item 1 on agenda)

It was moved by Roberts, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to adopt the official order to revoke the certification of Mr. Thomas Canning. (Item 2 on agenda)

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved the settlement agreement and to adopt the official order to revoke the certification of Mr. Alvin Webb. It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved the Assessor Discipline Advisory Committee's recommendation and to send a request for a formal revocation hearing regarding Debra Esper to the Department of Licensing and Regulatory Affairs, Michigan Administrative Hearing System. It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved the Assessor Discipline Advisory Committee's recommendation regarding Karl Ockerman as follows: (1) Mr. Ockerman is required to review the material of Land Values and Tax Maps, Development of ECF, and The Assessment Cyle and pass the exams within sixty days of his receipt of the materials. (2) Mr. Ockerman must submit for approval by the STC, a mentor to work under for the next year. (3) Mr. Ockerman is required to submit proof to the STC that he has completed a BS&A training course. (4) Mr. Ockerman be

recommended to participate in the next MAAO Program free of charge and must notify Kelli Sobel no later than September 21, 2011 to take advantage of the offer. (Item 3 on agenda)

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to adopt the official order to certify the 2009 assessment roll for Bruce Township - Macomb County, the 2009 assessment roll for Bark River Township - Delta County, and the 2010 assessment roll for Gilead Township - Branch County. (Items 4, 5, & 6 on agenda)

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to adopt the official order to return jurisdiction of the 2009 assessment roll to Arenac Township - Arenac County, the 2010 assessment roll to Leavitt Township - Oceana County, the 2010 assessment roll to Branch Township - Mason County, the 2010 assessment roll to Wilcox Township - Newaygo County, and the 2010 assessment roll to Custer Township - Antrim County. (Items 7, 8, 9, 10, & 11 on agenda)

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to adopt the official order to change the classification of parcel 008-031-200-02 in Elbridge Township, Oceana County to Residential Real. The Commission also ordered the Assessor, Walter Wheeler, to report to the Commission in writing when he has complied with the order and to notify us of the classification of the parcel on the 2012 assessment roll. (Item 12 on agenda)

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to accept the recommendation of Executive Director Sobel to release the results of Summerfield Township, Clare County 14 Point Review results, require the township to submit a plan to improve the accuracy of the record cards, and require the Board of Review members to attend training so they understand their requirements under the act. (Item 13 on agenda)

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to adopt the official order to assume jurisdiction of the 2011 assessment roll for Gerrish Township, Roscommon County and to hire an outside party to correct the problem with the ECF development by December 1 and to report to Executive Director Sobel on a monthly basis regarding the progress. The Commission also referred the former assessor to the Assessor Discipline Advisory Committee. (Item 14 on agenda)

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved Bulletin 7 of 2011 Certified Interest Rates. (Item 15 on agenda)

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved Bulletin 8 of 2011 Assessor Certification Requirements for the 2012 Year. (Item 16 on agenda)

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved Bulletin 9 of 2011 Withholding Property from Forfeiture. (Item 17 on agenda)

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved the attached policy regarding Certification Level Guidelines. (Counties) (Townships and Cities) (Item 18 on agenda)

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to adopt the list of Certification Applicants. (See attached link for file identification.) (Item 19 on agenda)

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved the OPRA Qualified Local Governmental Units. (Item 20 on agenda)

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to adopt the Personal Property Examiner Certifications submitted by staff. (Item 21 on agenda)

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to adopt the staff recommendation on the Exemptions. (See attached link for file identification.) (Item 22 on agenda)

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to adopt the staff recommendation on the Re-certifications and New Certifications of Computerized Tax Rolls for the following: (Item 23 on agenda)

These certifications will expire on **May 1, 2014**.

Recertification's

Calhoun County
Eckford Township

Jackson County
Liberty Township

Ottawa County
Jamestown Township
City of Ferrysburg

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to adopt the MCL 211.154 **Concurrences**. (See attached link for file identification.) (Item 24 on agenda)

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to adopt the MCL 211.154 **Special Items Agenda.** (See attached link for file identification) It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to adopt the MCL 211.154 petitions for **Wayne County IFT Audit**. (See attached link for file identification.) (Item 25 on agenda)

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to **postpone** the following MCL 211.154 petitions until **September 27, 2011**. (Item 26 on agenda)

Wayne County, City of Allen Park

154-10-1955 FORD MOTOR COMPANY; 30-999-00-2380-000; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2008 AV from $ 31,027,900 to $ 25,252,525 TV from $ 31,027,900 to $ 25,252,525

Wayne County, Northville Township

154-10-2047 MEIDEN TECH CENTER N AMERICA; 77-998-01-9891-006; Personal-IFT Property

2008 AV from $ 0 to $ 45,798 TV from $ 0 to $ 45,798
2009 AV from $ 3,458,922 to $ 3,473,026 TV from $ 3,458,922 to $ 3,473,026
2010 AV from $ 2,632,200 to $ 2,630,969 TV from $ 2,632,200 to $ 2,630,969

Wayne County, Northville Township

154-10-2048 MEIDEN TECH CENTER N AMERICA; 77-999-00-2009-070; Personal Property

2008 AV from $ 0 to $ 1,362 TV from $ 0 to $ 1,362
2009 AV from $ 2,047,900 to $ 3,528,135 TV from $ 2,047,900 to $ 3,528,135
2010 AV from $ 2,831,700 to $ 2,916,103 TV from $ 2,831,700 to $ 2,916,103

Wayne County, Redford Township

154-10-1725 DETROIT DIESEL CORPORATION; 79-999-00-3230-500; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2008 AV from $ 20,140,300 to $ 14,627,824 TV from $ 20,140,300 to $ 14,627,824
2009 AV from $ 29,859,250 to $ 14,037,784 TV from $ 29,859,250 to $ 14,037,784
2010 AV from $ 30,127,600 to $ 16,707,242 TV from $ 30,127,600 to $ 16,707,242

154-10-1727 DETROIT DIESEL CORPORATION; 79-998-01-9894-008; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2008 AV from $ 55,797,500 to $ 60,047,294 TV from $ 55,797,500 to $ 60,047,294
2009 AV from $ 45,864,898 to $ 64,431,414 TV from $ 45,864,898 to $ 64,431,414
2010 AV from $ 40,967,900 to $ 56,248,277 TV from $ 40,967,900 to $ 56,248,277

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to **postpone** the following MCL 211.154 petitions until **October 31, 2011**. (Item 26 on agenda)

Bay County, Garfield Township

154-11-0414 BAY CONSERVATION & GUN CLUB; 09-050-030-200-005-00; REAL PROPERTY

2008 AV from $ 150 to $ 242,000 TV from $ 113 to $ 242,000
2009 AV from $ 150 to $ 242,000 TV from $ 114 to $ 242,000
2010 AV from $ 150 to $ 242,000 TV from $ 115 to $ 242,000
2011 AV from $ 150 to $ 251,550 TV from $ 116 to $ 246,215

154-11-0415 BAY CONSERVATION & GUN CLUB; 09-050-019-400-005-00; REAL PROPERTY

2008 AV from $ 150 to $ 158,000 TV from $ 113 to $ 158,000
2009 AV from $ 150 to $ 158,000 TV from $ 114 to $ 158,000
2010 AV from $ 150 to $ 158,000 TV from $ 115 to $ 158,000
2011 AV from $ 150 to $ 164,200 TV from $ 116 to $ 160,686

Bay County, Garfield Township

154-11-0416 BAY CONSERVATION & GUN CLUB; 09-050-029-100-010-00; REAL PROPERTY

2008 AV from $ 150 to $ 80,000 TV from $ 113 to $ 80,000
2009 AV from $ 150 to $ 80,000 TV from $ 114 to $ 80,000
2010 AV from $ 150 to $ 80,000 TV from $ 116 to $ 80,000
2011 AV from $ 150 to $ 83,150 TV from $ 115 to $ 81,360

154-11-0417 CRUMP FOX CLUB; 09-050-023-300-005-00; REAL PROPERTY

2008 AV from $ 100 to $ 19,500 TV from $ 94 to $ 19,500
2009 AV from $ 100 to $ 19,500 TV from $ 99 to $ 19,500
2010 AV from $ 100 to $ 19,500 TV from $ 100 to $ 19,500
2011 AV from $ 100 to $ 20,250 TV from $ 99 to $ 19,831

154-11-0418 CRUMP FOX CLUB; 09-050-026-100-025-00; REAL PROPERTY

2008 AV from $ 150 to $ 105,400 TV from $ 113 to $ 105,400
2009 AV from $ 150 to $ 105,400 TV from $ 114 to $ 105,400
2010 AV from $ 150 to $ 105,400 TV from $ 115 to $ 105,400
2011 AV from $ 150 to $ 109,550 TV from $ 116 to $ 107,191

Van Buren County, City of South Haven

154-10-1655 SOUTH HAVEN COMM. HOSPITAL AUTHORITY; 80-53-900-896-00; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2008 AV from $ 50,000 to $ 448,600 TV from $ 50,000 to $ 448,600
2009 AV from $ 50,000 to $ 416,000 TV from $ 50,000 to $ 416,000
2010 AV from $ 50,000 to $ 358,600 TV from $ 50,000 to $ 358,600

Wayne County, City of Detroit

154-10-1940 RAUHORN ELECTRIC INC.; 19990406.01; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2008 AV from $ 6,590 to $ 73,640 TV from $ 6,590 to $ 73,640
2009 AV from $ 42,040 to $ 71,150 TV from $ 42,040 to $ 71,150
2010 AV from $ 62,840 to $ 63,220 TV from $ 62,840 to $ 63,220

Wayne County, City of Wyandotte

154-10-2216 BASF CORPORATION; 57-999-00-0216-000; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2008 AV from $ 23,544,000 to $ 26,770,014 TV from $ 23,544,000 to $ 26,770,014
2009 AV from $ 21,691,500 to $ 25,038,635 TV from $ 21,691,500 to $ 25,038,635
2010 AV from $ 20,074,600 to $ 22,064,180 TV from $ 20,074,600 to $ 22,064,180

Wayne County, City of Wyandotte

154-10-2217 BASF CORPORATION; 57-998-01-9892-008; PERSONAL-IFT PROPERTY

2008 AV from $ 1,413,000 to $ 1,272,543 TV from $ 1,413,000 to $ 1,272,543
2009 AV from $ 1,372,000 to $ 1,169,486 TV from $ 1,372,000 to $ 1,169,486
2010 AV from $ 1,279,000 to $ 1,090,054 TV from $ 1,279,000 to $ 1,090,054

154-10-2376 BASF; 57-998-01-9892-007; PERSONAL-IFT PROPERTY

2008 AV from $ 3,759,300 to $ 2,199,443 TV from $ 3,759,300 to $ 2,199,443
2009 AV from $ 3,536,581 to $ 1,770,029 TV from $ 3,536,581 to $ 1,770,029
2010 AV from $ 3,196,900 to $ 1,605,486 TV from $ 3,196,900 to $ 1,605,486

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to **postpone** the following MCL 211.154 petitions until **December 6, 2011**. (Item 26 on agenda)

Wayne County, City of River Rouge

154-11-0526 EES COKE BATTERY LLC; 50-415-99-0002-000; REAL PROPERTY

2009 AV from $ 0 to $ 2,006,521 TV from $ 0 to $ 2,006,521
2010 AV from $ 0 to $ 1,961,533 TV from $ 0 to $ 1,955,649
2011 AV from $ 1,032,800 to $ 1,916,545 TV from $ 1,032,800 to $ 1,916,545

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to **amend** the following MCL 211.154 petitions. (Item 26 on agenda)

Branch County, California Township

154-11-0420 JERRY L. & LINDA S. GROVE; 12-160-016-300-015-00; REAL PROPERTY

2009 AV from $ 158,327 to $ 166,922 TV from $ 107,656 to $ 116,796
2010 AV from $ 135,531 to $ 172,738 TV from $ 107,333 to $ 115,933
2011 AV from $ 146,614 to $ 141,614 TV from $ 117,487 to $ 117,480

Wayne County, City of Allen Park

154-10-1951 FORD MOTOR COMPANY; 30-999-00-2380-025; PERSONAL PROPERTY
**This was also a concurrence.

2008 AV from $ 3,944,500 to $ 6,698,950 TV from $ 3,944,500 to $ 6,698,950
2009 AV from $ 4,893,200 to $ 7,779,750 TV from $ 4,893,200 to $ 7,779,750

Wayne County, City of River Rouge

154-10-1521 DTE RIVER ROUGE LLC; 50-998-01-9892-003; PERSONAL-IFT PROPERTY
****Commissioner Simon voted no.**

2008 AV from $ 4,474,351 to $ 5,592,400 TV from $ 4,474,351 to $ 5,592,400
2009 AV from $ 4,372,313 to $ 5,364,100 TV from $ 4,372,313 to $ 5,364,100

Wayne County, Redford Township

154-10-1726 DETROIT DIESEL CORPORATION; 79-998-01-9892-005; PERSONAL-IFT PROPERTY
****This was also a concurrence.**

2008 AV from $ 19,882,350 to $ 20,870,425 TV from $ 19,882,350 to $ 20,870,425
2009 AV from $ 18,065,500 to $ 18,959,000 TV from $ 18,065,500 to $ 18,959,000
2010 AV from $ 16,359,000 to $ 17,448,850 TV from $ 16,359,000 to $ 17,448,850

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to **deny** the following MCL 211.154 petitions. (Item 26 on agenda)

Wayne County, City of River Rouge

154-10-1522 DTE RIVER ROUGE LLC; 50-999-00-1018-001; PERSONAL PROPERTY
****Commissioner Simon voted no.**

2008 AV from $ 1,110,831 to $ 1,689,900 TV from $ 1,110,831 to $ 1,689,900
2009 AV from $ 1,110,739 to $ 1,689,750 TV from $ 1,110,739 to $ 1,689,750

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to **withdraw** the following MCL 211.154 petitions. (Item 26 on agenda)

Oakland County, City of Auburn Hills

154-11-0501 ELITE IMAGING SYSTEMS; 02-99-00-011-175; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2011 AV from $ 0 to $ 21,200 TV from $ 0 to $ 21,200

Wayne County, Canton Township

154-10-2038 YAZAKI MANAGEMENT CO. INC.; 71-999-99-1738-111; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2008 AV from $ 3,415,750 to $ 3,588,998 TV from $ 3,415,750 to $ 3,588,998
2009 AV from $ 2,922,030 to $ 3,124,214 TV from $ 2,922,030 to $ 3,124,214

Wayne County, City of Livonia

154-10-2163 HI-VOL PRODUCTS; 46-998-01-9891-155; PERSONAL-IFT PROPERTY

2008 AV from $ 0 to $ 145,324 TV from $ 0 to $ 145,324

Wayne County, City of Trenton

154-11-0162 CARAVAN/KNIGHT FACILITIES MGT.; 82-54-999-99-2528-011; Personal Property

2010 AV from $ 0 to $ 58,600 TV from $ 0 to $ 58,600

Wayne County, City of Woodhaven

154-10-2022 FORD MOTOR COMPANY; 59-999-00-0472-000; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2008 AV from $ 62,250,600 to $ 69,681,500 TV from $ 62,250,600 to $ 69,681,500

Wayne County, Plymouth Township

154-10-2057 DADCO INC.; 78-999-00-0274-500; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2008 AV from $ 1,750,550 to $ 1,851,831 TV from $ 1,750,550 to $ 1,851,831
2009 AV from $ 1,591,540 to $ 1,695,087 TV from $ 1,591,540 to $ 1,695,087
2010 AV from $ 1,972,010 to $ 2,067,752 TV from $ 1,972,010 to $ 2,067,752

154-10-2059 DADCO INC.; 78-998-01-9891-072; PERSONAL-IFT PROPERTY

2008 AV from $ 816,820 to $ 707,872 TV from $ 816,820 to $ 707,872
2009 AV from $ 766,730 to $ 664,377 TV from $ 766,730 to $ 664,377
2010 AV from $ 708,420 to $ 612,675 TV from $ 708,420 to $ 612,675

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved the following MCL 211.154 petitions as **concurrences.** These petitions were initially noticed as non-concurrences. (See attached link for file identification.) (Item 26 on agenda)

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to adopt all other MCL 211.154 petitions. (See attached link for file identification.) (Item 26 on agenda)

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to **postpone** the following Detroit Edison MCL 211.154 petitions. (See attached link for file identification.) (Item 27 on agenda)

PUBLIC COMMENT (Item 28 on agenda)

Richard Sharland appeared before the Commission to ask a question regarding taxation of mobile home improvements. Mr. Sharland asked the Commission to remind assessors to put decks and carports on the tax roll.

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, to go into closed session to discuss pending litigation. Roll Call Vote: Chairperson Roberts – Yes, Commissioner Naftaly – Yes, Commissioner Simon – Yes. The motion was unanimously approved.

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to return to open session. Roll Call Vote: Chairperson Roberts – Yes, Commissioners Naftaly – Yes, Commissioner Simon – Yes. The motion was unanimously approved.

It was moved by Roberts, supported by Naftaly, and unanimously approved to authorize the Attorney General to dismiss five MTT cases involving the State Tax Commission v City of Grosse Pointe and Grosse Pointe Park.

It was moved by Roberts, supported by Naftaly, and unanimously approved to authorize staff to take whatever action is necessary to settle the Johnson Mathey classification case.

Chairman Roberts would like for the Commission to consider beginning to look at Personal Property Tax Tables starting with Wind Turbine tables.

The Commission received a proposed 2012 meeting schedule for their review.

The Commission modified their meeting schedule and rescheduled their October 24, 2011 meeting to October 31, 2011.

It was moved by Naftaly, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to change the Air and Water Pollution Control form to include an affidavit from an Engineer certifying that the facility that they are applying for meets the requirements of the act. The Commission also approved a list of commonly approved equipment and if anything falls outside this list that DEQ will review.

The next Commission meeting will be held September 27, 2011 at the Lansing Center in Meeting Room 201, 333 East Michigan Avenue, Lansing.

It was moved by Roberts, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to adjourn the meeting of the State Tax Commission at 1:00 p.m.

DATED TYPED: **September 6, 2011**

DATE APPROVED: **September 27, 2011**

Douglas B. Roberts, Chair
State Tax Commission

Robert H. Naftaly, Member
State Tax Commission

Barry N. Simon, Member
State Tax Commission