



STATE ASSESSORS BOARD
SPECIAL MEETING MINUTES OF JUNE 15, 2009
State Treasurers' Board Room, Richard H. Austin Building
430 West Allegan Street, Lansing, Michigan

CALL TO ORDER: The June 15, 2009 special meeting of the State Assessors Board was called to order at 10:00 a.m. in the State Treasurers' Board Room in the Richard H. Austin Building, 430 West Allegan Street, Lansing, Michigan.

ROLL CALL: Members present: Lisa A. Hobart, Chairperson
Raman A. Patel, Vice Chairperson
Henry O. Allen, Member
Allan J. Berg, Member
Frederick W. Morgan, Member

Staff present: David C. Lee, Executive Secretary

APPROVAL OF MINUTES: It was moved by Patel, seconded by Morgan, and unanimously approved to adopt the regular meeting minutes of the May 15, 2009 meeting of the State Assessors Board as presented.

PUBLIC COMMENT: Kirk R. Harrier, City Manager for the City of Saugatuck, addressed the Board and inquired whether he could be permitted into closed session of the Board to discuss a revocation matter.

FINANCIAL REPORTS: It was moved by Allen, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to receive and file the State Assessors Board fiscal year 2009 financial reports for April 2009.

EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMS:

1. It was moved by Patel, seconded by Morgan, and unanimously approved to approve the provision of State Assessors Board educational materials and services free of charge to the State Assessors Board Technician.

2. It was moved by Patel, seconded by Morgan, and unanimously approved to approve three hours of elective educational renewal credit for an educational program titled "Fundamentals of Appraising for the Michigan Tax Tribunal", three hours of elective educational renewal credit for an educational program titled "Gold Nuggets of Information for the Assessor", six hours of elective educational renewal credit for an educational program titled "Valuing Commercial Property in a Declining Market", three hours of elective educational renewal credit for an Oakland County Association of Assessing Officers educational program titled "Fundamentals of Valuing Personal Property", three hours of elective educational renewal credit for an Oakland County Association of Assessing Officers educational program titled "How to Spot a Business Appraisal in Tax Appeals", six hours of elective educational renewal credit for an educational program titled "Appraisal for Ad Valorem Taxation of Communications, Energy and Transportation Properties", six hours of elective educational renewal credit for an educational

program titled “Public Utility Basic Appraisal Course”, and six hours of elective educational renewal credit for a McKissock educational program titled “Mortgage Fraud: Protect Yourself!”.

3. It was moved by Morgan, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to grant approval to the level 3 experience qualification requests of Carol A. Merrill and Kimberly A. Riedel.

4. It was moved by Berg, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to send a letter to Carol A. Merrill stating that her employment status will be monitored by the Board.

CERTIFICATION LEVEL MATTERS:

1. It was moved by Allen, seconded by Berg, and approved by a vote of four to one to seek the advice of legal counsel whether the Board can exclude the value of DNR-PILT parcels when determining unit certification level requirements. Morgan voted against the motion.

2. It was moved by Morgan, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to approve the certification reinstatement request of Mark Jenkins for 2009 contingent upon Mr. Jenkins paying the same penalties that are prescribed in the Board’s late renewal session completions policy/procedure and contingent upon Mr. Jenkins meeting the 2007-2008 renewal requirement.

3. It was moved by Berg, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to approve the shared equalization director request of Huron County until June of 2012, provided that the current equalization director remains in place through that time.

CERTIFICATION APPLICANTS: It was moved by Morgan, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to grant formal approval to the list of certification applicants provided to the Board. The list of certification applicants which was approved by the Board and the certification totals presented to the Board were as follows:

**Certification Applicants
June 1, 2009**

Level 1

Blust, Cynthia A.
Larsson, Barbara A.

Rushton, Robert M.
Schmidt, Jr., K. Karl

Thar, Ted

Level 2

Cage, Decarlo
Harris, Kevin S.

Schmidt, Jr., K. Karl
Thar, Ted

Verburg, Lisa

Level 3

McMurray, Dana

Ockerman, Karl E.

Smith, Matthew J.

Certification Totals
June 1, 2009

Level 1	553
Level 2	961
Level 3	903
Level 4	<u>147</u>
Total	2,564

CLOSED MEETING: A closed meeting was permissible under the Open Meetings Act, Michigan Compiled Law 15.268(a) and 15.268(h). A motion was made by Morgan and seconded by Patel to go into closed session. A roll call vote occurred: Hobart—yes, Patel—yes, Allen—yes, Berg—yes, and Morgan—yes. The motion was unanimously approved.

A closed session was held for the following items:

1. Discussion of revocation petition 09-0014
2. Discussion of the closed meeting minutes from May 15, 2009
3. Informal revocation hearing for revocation petition 09-0024
4. Discussion of revocation petition 09-0011
5. Discussion of revocation petition 09-0015
6. Discussion of revocation petition 09-0016
7. Discussion of revocation petition 09-0019
8. Discussion of revocation petition 09-0020
9. Discussion of revocation petition 09-0023
10. Discussion of revocation petition 09-0025
11. Discussion of revocation petition 09-0026
12. Discussion of revocation petition 09-0027
13. Discussion of revocation petition 09-0028
14. Discussion of a prior action to commence a revocation proceeding
15. Discussion of findings from the State Tax Commission's Reviews of Local Unit Assessment Administration Practices, Procedures and Records (i.e., "mini-reviews")
16. Discussion of May 1, 2009 testing site examination results
17. Discussion of a level 4 demonstration appraisal subject property request

18. Discussion of a level 4 demonstration appraisal subject property request
19. Discussion of narrative appraisal 194
20. Discussion of narrative appraisal 207
21. Discussion of June 2009 course examination results

A motion was made by Allen and seconded by Patel to return to open session. A roll call vote occurred: Hobart—yes, Patel—yes, Allen—yes, Berg—yes, and Morgan—yes. The motion was unanimously approved.

OPEN MEETING ACTIONS ON CLOSED MEETING ITEMS:

1. It was moved by Morgan, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to approve the closed meeting minutes of May 15, 2009 as presented.
2. It was moved by Allen, seconded by Berg, and unanimously approved to hold a formal revocation hearing for revocation petition 09-0024.
3. It was moved by Allen, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to dismiss revocation petition 09-0011 with the letter of dismissal to include a reminder to the assessor involved of the importance of properly defending Michigan Tax Tribunal appeals.
4. It was moved by Patel, seconded by Morgan, and unanimously approved to dismiss revocation petition 09-0014.
5. It was moved by Allen, seconded by Morgan, and unanimously approved to request the assessing officer named in revocation petition 09-0015 to respond in writing to one of the allegations contained in the petition.
6. It was moved by Berg, seconded by Allen, and unanimously approved to request the assessing officer named in revocation petition 09-0016 to respond in writing to several of the allegations contained in the petition.
7. It was moved by Patel, seconded by Morgan, and unanimously approved to dismiss revocation petition 09-0019 with the letter of dismissal to also advise the assessing officer named in the petition that Board of Review meetings are open to the public.
8. It was moved by Berg, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to dismiss revocation petition 09-0020.
9. It was moved by Patel, seconded by Morgan, and unanimously approved to dismiss revocation petition 09-0023.
10. It was moved by Allen, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to dismiss revocation petition 09-0025.

11. It was moved by Morgan, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to dismiss revocation petition 09-0026.
12. It was moved by Patel, seconded by Morgan, and unanimously approved to dismiss revocation petition 09-0027.
13. It was moved by Berg, seconded by Morgan, and unanimously approved to dismiss revocation petition 09-0028.
14. It was moved by Morgan, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to rescind a revocation proceeding initiated by the Board at the Board's May 15, 2009 meeting (the revocation proceeding involved is identified on page P526 of the Board's June 15, 2009 closed meeting agenda packet).
15. It was moved by Morgan, seconded by Allen, and unanimously approved to send letters to the assessing officers who filed inaccurate certification statements with the State Tax Commission in Mason and Jackson Counties encouraging them to work to correct the observed assessing deficiencies and noting that the Board will be monitoring the 14-point reviews in those local units. Berg recused himself from this discussion.
16. It was moved by Morgan, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to receive and file the May 1, 2009 testing site examination results.
17. It was moved by Patel, seconded by Berg, and unanimously approved not to approve the level 4 demonstration appraisal subject property request for the property located at 4005 Roger B Chaffee Drive SE, Wyoming.
18. It was moved by Morgan, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved not to approve the level 4 demonstration appraisal subject property request for the property located at 2323 East Michigan Avenue, Lansing.
19. It was moved by Patel, seconded by Morgan, and unanimously approved to adopt the (revised) failing grading for the second submission of narrative appraisal 194.
20. It was moved by Morgan, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to adopt the failing grade for the first submission of narrative appraisal 207.
21. It was moved by Allen, seconded by Berg, and unanimously approved to receive and file the June 2009 course examination results.

OTHER BUSINESS:

1. It was moved by Patel, seconded by Allen, and unanimously approved to form a committee to advise the Board, with Board Chairperson Hobart and the Board's Executive Secretary to suggest committee members to the Board at the next meeting of the Board.
2. It was moved by Berg, seconded by Morgan, and unanimously approved to approve as amended the Revocation Proceedings Statute of Limitations Policy/Procedure.

3. The need to obtain appraiser license continuing education approval for Henry Ford Community College programs and State Assessors Board home study programs was discussed.
4. The need for the Board to develop work session items for the Board's 2009 conference meetings was discussed.
5. The composition of the Board's graders committee was discussed; the composition of that committee was to include Chairperson Hobart, Vice Chairperson Patel, the Board's Executive Secretary, and the graders.

ADJOURNMENT: It was moved by Morgan, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to adjourn the meeting. The meeting adjourned at 12:08 p.m.

Date minutes typed: June 22, 2009

Date minutes approved: _____

Lisa A. Hobart, Chairperson