



STATE OF MICHIGAN
DEPARTMENT OF TREASURY
LANSING

JENNIFER M. GRANHOLM
GOVERNOR

ROBERT J. KLEINE
STATE TREASURER

MEETING MINUTES OF THE STATE ASSESSORS BOARD
Vista Room
Kellogg Center, East Lansing, Michigan

Monday, July 13, 2009
9:00 A.M.

Present: Lisa A. Hobart, Chairperson
Raman A. Patel, Vice Chairperson
Henry O. Allen, Member
Allan J. Berg, Member
Frederick W. Morgan, Member (Excused Absence)

Kelli Sobel, Interim Executive Secretary
LaNiece Densteadt, Recording Secretary

MINUTES:

It was moved by Patel, seconded by Berg, and unanimously approved to adopt the regular meeting minutes of the June 15, 2009 meeting of the State Assessors Board with an amendment that Mr. Berg recused himself from item number 15. (Item 1 on agenda)

PUBLIC COMMENT: (Item 2 on agenda)

Valdemar L. Washington, Deputy Treasurer handed out documents from the Civil Service Handbook regarding employee discipline. Mr. Washington stated that because of privacy concerns he could not discuss the specific allegations contained in Mr. Lee's letter. He indicated that as serious as these allegations were, the Board should ask if an investigation was initiated, if a complaint was filed, if any complaint was made to the Chief Deputy Treasurer, to the Treasurer, to Human Resources, or to Civil Services. Mr. Allen asked when a move would be made to fill the vacancy. Mr. Washington indicated that due to budgetary concerns he did not know the answer to that question but that the Board will have input.

Marty Marshall appeared before the Board to discuss his concern regarding the assessment administration. He indicated that Mr. Lee's departure highlights concerns with the approach to assessment administration and the inability to maintain a skill set within the staff. He also indicated it raised questions as to the recognition of the importance of assessment administration as it relates to correctly valuing property.

Blaine McLeod appeared before the board to reiterate what Marty Marshall had said and hoped that Treasury would seek the input of the Board and give weight to their input on their next Executive Secretary.

David Lee appeared before the Board indicating he had provided the Board with a letter. He indicated he did not want to leave but had to because he thought his job was in jeopardy. He asked that any discussion of his performance as Executive Secretary to the Board be held in open session.

Judy Nelson appeared before the Board to discuss her appreciation toward David Lee in his position.

Rick Lindstrom appeared before the board to thank the Board for administering exams twice a year in the Upper Peninsula and he hoped that would continue.

Jan Markowski appeared before the Board to indicate that the Board has had a good working relationship with MAA and he hopes that continues.

EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMS:

It was moved by Patel, seconded by Berg, and unanimously approved to approve the requests for Experience Credit from Janette M. Coon for Level 3 and David L. Engelhardt for Level 4. (Item 3a on agenda)

It was moved by Patel, seconded by Berg, and unanimously approved to approve the requests for Elective Renewal Credit: (Item 3b on agenda)

Two Hours of Elective Educational Renewal Credit

Environmental Issues for Appraisers

Three Hours of Elective Educational Renewal Credit

The Dirty Dozen (...Eleven, Now)

Six Hours of Elective Educational Renewal Credit

Current Issues in Appraising

Introduction to Expert Witness Testimony

Appraising in a Changing Market

Appraising FHA Today

New Fannie Mae Form 1004MC & More

Even Odder: More Oddball Appraisals

Mortgage Fraud – Protect Yourself

Appraising Real Estate Owned (REO) and Foreclosure Properties

Appraisal Trends

Relocation Appraisal is Different

The Cost Approach

It was moved by Patel, seconded by Berg, and unanimously approved to adopt the recommendation of Nancy Armstrong, to initiate a “Tip of the Week” rather than the Mini-Quiz and to keep the board informed of the development. (Item 3c on agenda)

CERTIFICATION LEVEL MATTERS:

Executive Secretary Sobel explained that the Local Unit Certification Level Requirements were not completed; but they would be by the next State Assessors Board Meeting. (Item 4a on agenda)

It was moved by Allen, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to seek input from the Attorney General's office whether the DNR/PILT property should be included in the certification levels for assessors.

SAB ADVISORY COMMITTEE MEMBERS:

It was moved by Patel, seconded by Hobart, and unanimously approved to table the issue of the committee members to discuss at a future State Assessors Board Meeting.

APPROVAL OF THE 2009 SAB ANNUAL REPORT:

It was moved by Berg, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to adopt the 2009 Annual Report with the deletion of the recommendation of the SAB Advisory Committee Members and word changes regarding Executive Secretary Sobel.

REPORT FROM THE JUNE 11, 2009 STATE TAX COMMISSION MEETING:

It was moved by Allen, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to delay a recommendation on Buena Vista Township in Saginaw County until the 14-point review has been completed by field staff and bring back to the Board at a later date.

6 HOUR RENEWAL EVALUATION:

It was moved by Berg, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to receive the evaluation comments from the Six Hour Renewal Class Segment 1 – Application of New, Loss, Additions, Losses & Adjustment on June 2, 2009 instructed by Steven Mellen in Clinton Township.

It was moved by Patel, seconded by Allen, and unanimously approved to go into closed session to present an Oral Examination. Roll Call Vote: Hobart-Yes, Patel-Yes, Allan -Yes, and Berg-Yes.

It was moved by Patel, seconded by Berg, and unanimously approved to return to open session. Roll Call Vote: Hobart-Yes, Patel-Yes, Allen-Yes, and Berg-Yes.

It was moved by Patel, seconded by Berg, and unanimously approved to notify Matt Wolford he had passed his oral examination and congratulate him on his Level 4 Certification. (Item 9f on agenda)

The Board recessed at 10:45 a.m. for Lisa Hobart, Chairperson to present the 2009 State Assessors Board Annual Report to the MAED Conference Meeting.

The Board reconvened at 11:15 a.m. It was moved by Patel, seconded by Berg, and unanimously approved to go into closed session. Roll Call Vote: Hobart-Yes, Patel-Yes, Allan -Yes, and Berg-Yes.

It was moved by Patel, seconded by Allen, and unanimously approved to return to open session. Roll Call Vote: Hobart – Yes, Patel – Yes, Allen – Yes, and Berg – Yes.

It was moved by Patel, seconded by Berg, and unanimously approved to adopt the closed meeting minutes from the June 15, 2009 meeting of the State Assessors Board. (Item 9a on agenda)

It was moved by Patel, seconded by Allen, and unanimously approved to dismiss revocation petition 09-0030 because no violation of rule 211.447 occurred. (Item 9b on agenda)

It was moved by Allen, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to ask the assessor named in revocation petition 09-0029 respond in writing to specific questions on the allegations contained in the petition. (Item 9c on agenda)

It was moved by Patel, seconded by Allen, and unanimously approved to ask the assessor named in revocation petition 09-0022 to appear at the September 9, 2009 meeting for an informal revocation hearing. (Item 9d on agenda)

The Board received a report on File 08-0029 from field staff and asked that this item be placed back on the agenda following the November 2009 review by field staff. (Item 9e on agenda)

OTHER BUSINESS

Member Allan Berg indicated that he wanted to have discussion regarding Mr. Lee's resignation and what happened in that specific situation. He indicated he did not know what had transpired and that there were a lot of unknowns. Discussion amongst the Board occurred.

Chairperson, Lisa Hobart mentioned she would like to have a graders meeting on the afternoon on Monday, August 3rd at the MAA Conference in Boyne Falls.

ADJOURNMENT:

It was moved by Berg, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to adjourn the State Assessors Board Meeting at 12:00 noon.

Date Minutes Typed: July 13, 2009

Date Minutes Approved: _____

Lisa A. Hobart, Chairperson

