



**STATE ASSESSORS BOARD
REGULAR MEETING MINUTES OF FEBRUARY 13, 2009
State Treasurers' Board Room, Richard H. Austin Building
430 West Allegan Street, Lansing, Michigan**

CALL TO ORDER: The February 13, 2009 meeting of the State Assessors Board was called to order at 9:30 a.m. in the State Treasurers' Board Room in the Richard H. Austin Building, 430 West Allegan Street, Lansing, Michigan.

ROLL CALL: Members present: Lisa A. Hobart, Chairperson
Henry O. Allen, Member
Allan J. Berg, Member
Frederick W. Morgan, Member

Member absent: Raman A. Patel, Vice Chairperson (excused)

Staff present: David C. Lee, Executive Secretary

APPROVAL OF MINUTES: It was moved by Morgan, seconded by Allen, and unanimously approved to adopt the regular meeting minutes of the January 7, 2009 meeting of the State Assessors Board as presented.

PUBLIC COMMENT: There was no public comment.

EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMS:

1. It was moved by Allen, seconded by Morgan, and unanimously approved to approve six hours of elective educational renewal credit for a Northern Michigan University course titled "APNC 162—Appraisal of Mixed-Use Properties".

2. It was moved by Allen, seconded by Morgan, and unanimously approved to approve six hours of elective educational renewal credit for an InfoGeographics, Inc. course titled "GIS Tools and Methods for Assessors".

3. It was moved by Allen, seconded by Morgan, and unanimously approved to grant approval to the level 3 experience qualification requests of Ms. Anne C. Leabo and Ms. Keribeth R. Rogers.

4. It was moved by Morgan, seconded by Allen, and unanimously approved to approve two hours of elective educational renewal credit for an Oakland County Association of Assessing Officers Board of Review program.

5. It was moved by Morgan, seconded by Allen, and unanimously approved to grant approval to the level 4 experience qualification requests of Mr. Matthew Woolford and Ms. Paula J. Smith.

CERTIFICATION LEVEL MATTERS: It was moved by Berg, seconded by Morgan, and unanimously approved to grant unit requirements waivers for China Township and East China Township, St. Clair County, for 2009 contingent upon a level 4 assessing officer taking responsibility for assessing the power plant property that causes the Townships to exceed the

commercial/industrial state equalized value limit stated in the level 4 unit requirements and for the contract of the level 4 assessing officer to be provided to the Executive Secretary for review.

CERTIFICATION APPLICANTS:

1. It was moved by Allen, seconded by Morgan, and unanimously approved to grant formal approval to the list of certification applicants provided to the Board. The list of certification applicants which was approved by the Board and the certification totals presented to the Board were as follows:

**Certification Applicants
February 3, 2009**

Level 1

Anthony, Tajuana D.
Ballard, LaTonya
Bernabei-Taras, Pamela M.
Finkel, Donald W.
Frost, Polly
Haight, Shannon

Kennedy, Khris
Laird, Bernie J.
Paris, Bryan
Ronewicz, Anthony
Sanford, Beth D.

Smith, William E.
Spann, Damon
Thompson, Ann
Vivyan, Mary J.
Woollard, Kimberly R.

Level 2

Alexander, Gail A.
Booth, Lorraine
Chicha, Tavia
Freeman, Stevie

German, Susan L.
Glass, Michael
Harless, David E.
Harrison, Deborah L.

Hocking, Michelle
Junior, Victor
Kallas, Christina A.

Level 3

Botke, Beth M.
Koehn, Deborah B.

Loshaw, Wendy D.
O'Connor, Cheryl M.

Rasch, Caryn
Spang, Samuil C.

Conditional
Brock, Peter

**Certification Totals
February 3, 2009**

| | |
|--------------|--------------|
| Level 1 | 547 |
| Level 2 | 947 |
| Level 3 | 899 |
| Level 4 | <u>147</u> |
| Total | 2,540 |

2. It was moved by Morgan, seconded by Allen, and unanimously approved to grant the conditional certification request of Allouez Township, Keweenaw County.

3. It was moved by Allen, seconded by Morgan, and unanimously approved to grant the conditional certification request of Austin Township, Sanilac County.

4. It was moved by Allen, seconded by Morgan, and unanimously approved to grant the conditional certification request of Ironwood Township, Gogebic County.

5. It was moved by Morgan, seconded by Allen, and unanimously approved to grant the conditional certification request of Adams Township, Arenac County.

FIRST CLOSED MEETING: A closed meeting was permissible under the Open Meetings Act, Michigan Compiled Law (MCL) 15.268(h). A motion was made by Morgan and seconded by Allen to go into closed session. A roll call vote occurred: Hobart—yes, Allen—yes, Berg—yes, and Morgan—yes. The motion was unanimously approved.

A closed session was held for the following items:

1. Discussion of the closed meeting minutes from January 7, 2009
2. Discussion of an official suspension order relating to revocation petition 08-0028
3. Formal revocation hearing for revocation petition 08-0029

A motion was made by Morgan and seconded by Berg to return to open session. A roll call vote occurred: Hobart—yes, Allen—yes, Berg—yes, and Morgan—yes. The motion was unanimously approved.

FORMAL REVOCATION HEARING: A formal revocation hearing was held for Mr. Robert P. Konle, the assessing officer named in revocation petition 08-0040. Mr. Konle was not present for the hearing and, based on legal advice, the formal revocation hearing was therefore held in open session. The allegations against Mr. Konle were read for the record and were discussed. A motion was made by Morgan and seconded by Hobart to revoke the certification of Mr. Konle for a period of at least five years and for Mr. Konle not to be permitted to work in the field of assessment administration during that time. A roll call vote occurred: Hobart—yes, Allen—yes, Berg—yes, and Morgan—yes. The motion was unanimously approved.

SECOND CLOSED MEETING: A closed meeting was permissible under the Open Meetings Act, MCL 15.268(h). A motion was made by Morgan and seconded by Allen to go into closed session. A roll call vote occurred: Hobart—yes, Allen—yes, Berg—yes, and Morgan—yes. The motion was unanimously approved.

A closed session was held for the following item: informal revocation hearing for revocation petition 08-0036

A motion was made by Morgan and seconded by Berg to return to open session. A roll call vote occurred: Hobart—yes, Allen—yes, Berg—yes, and Morgan—yes. The motion was unanimously approved.

INFORMAL REVOCATION HEARING: An informal revocation hearing was held for Mr. James A. Weburg, the assessing officer named in revocation petition 09-0008. Mr. Weburg was not present for the hearing and, based on legal advice, the informal revocation hearing was therefore held in open session. It was moved by Allen, seconded by Morgan, and unanimously approved to hold a formal revocation hearing for Mr. Weburg.

THIRD CLOSED MEETING: A closed meeting was permissible under the Open Meetings Act, MCL 15.268(h). A motion was made by Morgan and seconded by Allen to go into closed session. A roll call vote occurred: Hobart—yes, Allen—yes, Berg—yes, and Morgan—yes. The motion was unanimously approved.

A closed session was held for the following items:

1. Informal revocation hearing for revocation petition 09-0009
2. Discussion of revocation petition 08-0032
3. Discussion of revocation petition 08-0039
4. Discussion of revocation petition 09-0001
5. Discussion of revocation petition 09-0002
6. Discussion of revocation petition 09-0003
7. Discussion of revocation petition 09-0004
8. Discussion of revocation petition 09-0005
9. Discussion of revocation petition 09-0006
10. Discussion of revocation petition 09-0011
11. Oral examination
12. Discussion of an assessing practices matter
13. Discussion of narrative appraisals grading status

A motion was made by Berg and seconded by Allen to return to open session. A roll call vote occurred: Hobart—yes, Allen—yes, Berg—yes, and Morgan—yes. The motion was unanimously approved.

OPEN MEETING ACTIONS ON CLOSED MEETING ITEMS:

1. It was moved by Allen, seconded by Morgan, and unanimously approved to approve the closed meeting minutes of January 7, 2009 as presented.
2. It was moved by Allen, seconded by Berg, and unanimously approved (Morgan recused himself) to approve the official suspension order as presented for revocation petition 08-0028.
3. It was moved by Morgan, seconded by Allen, and unanimously approved to place the assessing officer named in revocation petition 08-0029 on probation until December 30, 2009 and request the staff of the Assessment and Certification Division to report on the assessing officer's work as of April 2009 and November 2009.

4. It was moved by Morgan, seconded by Berg, and approved by a vote of three to one to hold a formal revocation hearing for revocation petition 08-0036. Allen voted against the motion.
5. It was moved by Morgan, seconded by Berg, and unanimously approved to hold a formal revocation hearing for revocation petition 09-0009.
6. It was moved by Morgan, seconded by Berg, and unanimously approved to dismiss revocation petition 08-0032.
7. It was moved by Allen, seconded by Morgan, and unanimously approved to hold a formal revocation hearing for revocation petition 08-0039.
8. It was moved by Morgan, seconded by Allen, and unanimously approved to dismiss revocation petition 09-0001 and to include in the letter of dismissal a suggestion to seek education related to assessing practices deficiencies which had been observed.
9. It was moved by Morgan, seconded by Berg, and unanimously approved to dismiss revocation petition 09-0002 and to include in the letter of dismissal a suggestion to seek education related to assessing practices deficiencies that had been observed and a reminder regarding the importance of removing overrides from assessment software.
10. It was moved by Morgan, seconded by Allen, and unanimously approved to dismiss revocation petition 09-0003 and to include in the letter of dismissal a suggestion to seek education related to assessing practices deficiencies that had been observed.
11. It was moved by Morgan, seconded by Allen, and unanimously approved to dismiss revocation petition 09-0004 and to include in the letter of dismissal a suggestion to seek education related to assessing practices deficiencies that had been observed.
12. It was moved by Morgan, seconded by Allen, and unanimously approved to dismiss revocation petition 09-0005 and to include in the letter of dismissal a suggestion to seek education related to assessing practices deficiencies that had been observed.
13. It was moved by Morgan, seconded by Allen, and unanimously approved to dismiss revocation petition 09-0006.
14. It was moved by Berg, seconded by Morgan, and unanimously approved to ask the assessing officer named in revocation petition 09-0011 to respond in writing to the petition.

OTHER BUSINESS:

1. Possible changes to the 2009 State Assessors Board meeting schedule were discussed.
2. It was moved by Hobart, seconded by Allen, and unanimously approved to approve a certificate of appreciation for Ms. Beth M. Shafer for her many contributions to the assessing profession.
3. It was moved by Morgan, seconded by Allen, and unanimously approved for all members of the State Assessors Board and the Board's Executive Secretary to uphold publicly the policies and positions of the State Tax Commission and the State Assessors Board.

4. The 2009 priorities of the State Assessors Board were discussed.
5. The possibility of implementing a mentoring program was discussed.
6. It was moved by Allen, seconded by Berg, and unanimously approved to allow several organizations to use renewal programs developed by the State Assessors Board and to allow the organizations to charge attendees of the programs. The organizations covered by the motion were the Michigan Assessors Association, Henry Ford Community College, and the Michigan Townships Association (at the Michigan Townships Association annual conference). In accordance with the motion, the State Assessors Board will not provide copies of handouts to the organizations, the State Assessors Board will not pay the instructors of the programs, and mandatory programs must be instructed by a State Assessors Board approved instructor.

CORRESPONDENCE:

1. A letter of appreciation to Ms. Maxine J. McClelland was discussed.
2. A letter of resignation from State Assessors Board committees from Ms. Beth M. Shafer was discussed.
3. It was moved by Berg, seconded by Hobart, and unanimously approved to deny the request of Ms. Sheila D. Maguire for a waiver of late fees related to renewal of her certification.

ADDITIONAL OTHER BUSINESS: It was moved by Allen, seconded by Morgan, and unanimously approved to authorize the Executive Secretary to revise the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice renewal program as needed and to create an on-line version of the renewal program.

ANNOUNCEMENTS: The next meeting of the State Assessors Board is scheduled for March 20, 2009 at 9:30 a.m. in the State Treasurers' Board Room of the Richard H. Austin Building, 430 West Allegan Street, in Lansing.

ADJOURNMENT: It was moved by Berg, seconded by Morgan, and unanimously approved to adjourn the meeting. The meeting adjourned at 3:12 p.m.

Date minutes typed: February 17, 2009

Date minutes approved: 3-20-09



Lisa A. Hobart, Chairperson