

June 9, 2016

Mr. William R. Bloomfield Michigan Department of Attorney General Corporate Oversight Division Charitable Trust Attorney

Dear Mr. Bloomfield:

The purpose of this letter is to report Legacy DMC's status with respect to the requirements contained in Article 3 of the Monitoring and Compliance Agreement among the Department of Attorney General, Legacy DMC, VHS of Michigan, Inc. and Vanguard Health Systems, Inc. This agreement supplements the Purchase and Sales Agreement (PSA) and defines various requirements relating to the Post-Closing Covenants contained in the PSA. This letter also makes reference to the Enforcement Agreement among the same four parties. (Tenet Healthcare Corp. acquired Vanguard Health Systems, Inc. in 2013; VHS of Michigan is now a wholly-owned subsidiary of Tenet.)

#### ARTICLE 3 – "Legacy DMC Monitoring Responsibilities"

This article contains five specific monitoring responsibilities (Items A through E) as discussed below:

Item A requires Legacy DMC to monitor VHS of Michigan's compliance with seven of the 20 Post-Closing Covenants contained in the PSA. The Enforcement Agreement adds an additional covenant – bringing to eight the total number of covenants being monitored by Legacy DMC. The attachment lists the 20 PSA Covenants and provides references to the related monitoring and reporting requirements contained in the agreements. Legacy DMC believes it has diligently monitored compliance with the Covenants. VHS of Michigan's Annual Report for 2015, which will be provided to your office with our comments in a separate letter, provides its update to the status of 15 commitments at the end of 2015.

**Item B** identifies certain reports and other information that VHS of Michigan is required to provide to Legacy DMC so that it can carry out its monitoring obligations; it also provides for a Confidentiality Agreement. The status of the three specific elements is as follows:

i. Exhibit 2 of the Monitoring Agreement requires annual submission of 18 reports. For various reasons, Legacy DMC has reduced this list to 13 reports. All have been received. VHS of Michigan has classified the reports as confidential

Mr. William R. Bloomfield June 9, 2016 Page 2

ii. VHS of Michigan is required to provide additional "ordinary course of business" information if requested. There have been numerous such requests. Legacy DMC has received detailed information on actual routine capital expenditures for each hospital through December 2015. It will request similar information for 2016 and 2017.

iii. VHS of Michigan requested an agreement to keep "proprietary and commercially sensitive information" confidential as provided in this item. A Confidentiality Agreement is in place. Mr. Conrad Mallett serves as the "DMC Officer" responsible for determining confidentiality. VHS of Michigan's 2015 Report classified financial information useful in understanding indigent and uncompensated care as confidential, as well as the findings of an independent review of its capital expenditures. The information confirms a substantial reduction in costs relating to uncompensated care and that no errors in accounting for capital expenditures were identified.

**Item C** requires Legacy DMC to establish a public complaint-intake procedure, to review all complaints and to investigate complaints, if appropriate. Legacy DMC has complied with this requirement of monitoring VHS of Michigan's charitable care commitment.

Legacy DMC established a telephone hotline and email and postal addresses to obtain patient complaints. Every contact is logged and reviewed. During 2015, no actionable complaints relating to charitable care were received. Other complaints were referred to appropriate hospital departments, and other correspondence was appropriately re-directed.

The hotline contact information appears in approximately 75 locations throughout the DMC hospitals. It appears in all emergency rooms and all patient notice boards where VHS of Michigan displays its "800" telephone numbers for requesting hospital financial support and submitting patient billing complaints.

Item D requires Legacy DMC staff to report monthly to the Legacy DMC Board of Trustees regarding VHS of Michigan's compliance with the Post-Closing Covenants. During 2015, the Legacy DMC Board met three times. Compliance issues were discussed at each meeting, particularly on four critical commitments: the two relating to capital spending, charitable care, and the commitment to maintain hospitals and specific lines of service.

VHS of Michigan's Chief Executive Officer, Mr. Joseph Mullany, attended one Board meeting to report on the progress of the capital investment program and other hospital developments and issues.

During 2016, Legacy DMC's Board of Trustees plans to meet quarterly to review updated information on the remaining key commitments. Legacy DMC staff will alert the Trustees of material changes or serious compliance issues that arise during interim months.

Mr. William R. Bloomfield June 9, 2016 Page 3

Item E requires Legacy DMC to produce a written report annually and make it available to the public on a website. The 2015 report has been completed and will be available to the public on the websites of the Detroit Wayne County Health Authority and the Department of the Attorney General.

## Conclusion

Legacy DMC believes the requirements of Article 3 (as modified) have been met for 2015, the fifth year of the agreement period.

Sincerely,

loe Walsh President RRALdgren
Richard Widgren

Chair

Cc:

Mr. Trevor Fetter

Mr. Joseph Mullany

## POST CLOSING COVENANTS

# (15 Vanguard Reporting Requirements Underlined)

Section	PSA Commitments	Monitoring References		
12.1	Buyer Advisory Board, Hospital Advisory Board			
12.2	Indigent and Low Income Care	E	M	Q
12.3	Commitment to Maintain Hospitals and Core Services	E	М	Q
12.4	Capital Expenditures	E	M	Q
12.5	The Warrant	E		
12.6	Retention of Medical Staff			
12.7	No Sale of Hospitals	E	М	Q
12.8	Commitment to Education			
12.9	Commitment to Research			
12.10	Karmanos Center			
12.11	Health and Wellness Initiatives			
12.12	Supplier Diversity Program			
12.13	Project Genesis			
12.14	Detroit-based Systems	E	M	
12.15	National Support Centers	E	М	
12.16	Naming Conventions			
12.17	Annual Reporting Requirements	E	M	
12.18	Post-Closing Assistance to Seller			
12.19	Renaissance Sub-zone			
12.20	Donor-restricted Funds			

#### Purchase and Sale Agreement - Article 12 identifies 20 Post Closing Covenants

<u>E - Enforcement Agreement</u> – supplemental agreement among Vanguard, DMC and Attorney General (AG) where parties recognize enforcement right by AG to certain remedies beyond those specified in the PSA (identified by "E" above). PSA remedies for any disagreement are primarily mediation/arbitration.

<u>M – Monitoring Agreement</u> – supplemental agreement among Vanguard, DMC and AG specifying responsibilities for Monitoring certain covenants (identified by "M" above) and information necessary to support Monitoring, as well as requiring identification of any potential conflict of interest and defining aspects of Legacy Board structure and operation.

Q – Interim Quarterly Status Report – Legacy DMC and VHS-M have agreed to certain Interim Quarterly Status Reports (identified by "Q" above), in part to carry out Monitoring Agreement responsibilities.



June 9, 2016

Mr. William R. Bloomfield Michigan Department of Attorney General Corporate Oversight Division Charitable Trust Attorney

Dear Mr. Bloomfield:

The purpose of this letter is to confirm compliance with Article 4 of the Monitoring and Compliance Agreement among the Department of Attorney General, Legacy DMC, VHS of Michigan, Inc. and Vanguard Health Systems, Inc. This agreement supplements the Purchase and Sales Agreement (PSA) and defines various requirements relating to the Post-Closing Covenants contained in the PSA. (Tenet Healthcare Corp. acquired Vanguard Health Systems, Inc. in 2013; VHS of Michigan is now a wholly-owned subsidiary of Tenet.)

#### ARTICLE 4 - "Legacy DMC Corporate Structure"

This article contains eight specific governance requirements as discussed below:

Items A and C require Legacy DMC to submit its Articles of Incorporation and Bylaws to the Attorney General promptly before closing after making appropriate changes to reflect its obligations under the Monitoring Agreement. Legacy DMC made the necessary modifications, submitted its documents, and received the approval of the Attorney General before closing. A procedural issue associated with the Articles was subsequently identified and the necessary revision submitted for consideration.

Item D stipulates that the Attorney General must approve all changes in Legacy DMC's Articles of Incorporation or Bylaws for 10 years after closing. During 2015, Legacy DMC proposed certain changes consistent with distribution of the charitable assets, which were accepted by the Attorney General's Office.

Item E establishes certain governance criteria, including the number of trustees (at least 11 and not more than 20), provision for appointment of three trustees (one each by the Mayor of the City of Detroit, the Wayne County Executive, and the Attorney General of the State of Michigan), and staggered three-year trustee terms starting in 2017. Legacy DMC presently has 18 trustees (see Attachment) including the appointees representing Detroit (Ms. Patti Kukula), Wayne County (Mr. Marcus Ivery) and the State (Ms. Candyce Abbatt). Legacy DMC's Nominating Committee will identify candidates who meet the criteria contained in this item to fill open positions, if necessary.

Mr. William R. Bloomfield June 9, 2016 Page 2

Item F states that the President and Chair of Legacy DMC will oversee Vanguard's capital expenditure and hospital commitments. Legacy DMC's Chair, Mr. Richard Widgren, and President, Mr. Joe Walsh, provided this oversight.

Item H establishes certain requirements relating to Legacy DMC representation on the VHS of Michigan Advisory Board, the individual DMC hospital advisory boards, and the Vanguard Health System, Inc. Board. It also stipulated procedures relating to potential conflict of interest situations and compensation. The status of these matters is as follows:

i. At its December 2010 meeting, the DMC Board appointed six representatives to the VHS of Michigan Advisory Board and the hospital Advisory Boards; these representatives receive no compensation. At the same time, the DMC Board nominated a representative to the Board of Vanguard Health Systems, Inc. This representative served as a director until September 2013, when Tenet Healthcare Corp. completed its acquisition of Vanguard. Requirements relating to the compensation related to this position were met.

ii. No matters considered by the Legacy DMC Board have required a recusal of these members relating to a potential conflict between the interests of Legacy DMC and other entities.

### Conclusion

Legacy DMC believes the requirements of Article 4 have been met for 2015, the fifth year of the Agreement. Previous reports have provided a final status on Items B, G and H iii. Subsequent annual reports will provide updates on the remaining open requirements.

Sincerely,

riesident

RR Midgren
Richard Widgren

Chair

Cc: Mr. Trevor Fetter Mr. Joseph Mullany



#### **BOARD ROSTER**

Richard Widgren (Chair)

President Life Beyond Barriers (Subsidiary of Urban Science)

Candyce Abbatt

Fried Saperstein Abbatt P.C.

John M. Barnwell MD

Chief of Surgery and Surgical Services Sinai – Grace Hospital

Honorable Terrence Berg

U.S. District Court Judge

Cynthia Ford

Vice Chair

Children's Hospital of Michigan Foundation

Anthony Frabotta (Treasurer)

Co-CEO

**UHY Advisors** 

Matt Friedman

Tanner Friedman Strategic Communications

**Eugene Gargaro** 

Manoogian Foundation

Marcus Ivery

Wayne County

Patti Kukula

City of Detroit

Yale Levin

Executive Vice President Soave Enterprises

**David Nicholson** 

**PVS Chemicals** 

Gloria Robinson

Retired CEO

Heritage Vision Plans Inc.

Alan Schwartz (Vice Chair)

Vice Chair

Honigman Miller Schwartz and Cohn LLP

Herbert C. Smitherman Jr. MD, MPH, FACP

Assistant Dean and Associate Professor Wayne State University School of Medicine

-----

President and CEO

Health Centers Detroit Foundation

Mary Stephens – Ferris (Secretary)

Retired President

Detroit Community Health Center

Lorna Thomas MD

Chair

**DMC** Foundation

Rhonda Welburn

Dickinson Wright PLLC