The State’s Duty under Public Trust Law to Protect the Great Lakes from the Operation of the Line 5 Oil Pipelines in the Straits

Presentation to the Michigan Petroleum Pipeline Task Force by:

➢ Jim Lively, Michigan Land Use Institute
➢ Liz Kirkwood, FLOW (For Love of Water)
➢ James Clift, Michigan Environmental Council

www.OilandWaterDontMix.org
Enbridge 2010 Kalamazoo Spill

www.OilandWaterDontMix.org
How We Got Here
Civic, Public & Business Support

Public & Business Endorsements
Upper Peninsula Environmental Coalition
Student Environmental Alliance
Ryde Marine
Shepler’s Mackinac Island Ferry
Breezeswept Docks
Mackinac Island Community Fdn.
Cheboygan Brewing Company
Sturgeon for Tomorrow
...and more

Civic Endorsements
City of Mackinac Island
City of Grand Rapids
City of Traverse City
County of Cheboygan

2,560+ Public Sign-On Letter Signatures to Date
Our Partner Organizations

- Michigan Land Use Institute
- Sierra Club
- FLOW
- Les Cheneaux Watershed Council
- WMEAC
- TC 350
- Environmental Law & Policy Center
- MN 350
- Micats
- Food & Water Watch
- 32
- SURF.org
- CLEAN WATER ACTION
- Michigan Resource Stewards
- Concerned Citizens of Cheboygan & Emmet County
- Les Cheneaux Watershed Council

Oil & Water Don't Mix Campaign [www.OilandWaterDontMix.org](http://www.OilandWaterDontMix.org)
Line 5 Oil Pipelines: The State of Michigan’s Duty

Line 5 in the Straits:

* Rests on **state-owned bottomlands**
* Required legislative authorization (Act 10)
* 1953 easement is held in **public trust** for the benefit of Michigan’s current & future generations
Michigan’s Public Trust Responsibility

Public Trust means:

* State’s **perpetual duty**

* Ongoing determination Line 5’s continued operation will **not substantially harm or impair**

* Public trust protection of resources and uses:
  * navigation, fishing, commerce, hunting, drinking water, recreation, etc

-- R 322.1001; R 322.1006(d)
Public Trust Precedent in Great Lakes

Illinois Central Railroad Co. v. Illinois - 1892

Oil & Water Don't Mix Campaign  www.OilandWaterDontMix.org
Public Trust Incorporated in Enbridge’s 1953 Easement

The state’s easement with Enbridge says:

“Grantee...at all times shall exercise the due care of a reasonably prudent person for the safety and welfare of all persons and of all public and private property...”

- Enbridge easement pgs. 3-4
Urgency for State to Act Now to Protect the Public Trust
Urgency for State to Act Now to Protect the Public Trust
Urgency for State to Act Now to Protect the Public Trust

12 hour release (north)
- Near-surface
- Mid-depth
- Near-bottom
08/12/1990 02:00
11.1 days after release

www.OilandWaterDontMix.org
Urgency for State to Act Now to Protect the Public Trust
Urgency for State to Act Now to Protect the Public Trust
Urgency for State to Act Now to Protect the Public Trust
About the GLSLA:

* Legislature incorporated state’s **public trust** responsibilities into the **GLSLA** in 1955.

* Executive branch issued rules under GLSLA to dictate details of a **public trust determination**.

* Judicial branch reaffirms its role as the **third trustee** of the public trust. (Obrecht v. National Gypsum, 1960)
Great Lakes Submerged Lands Act & the Public Trust

Rules under GLSLA: “A determination by the department that the private or public use of such lands and waters will neither substantially affect the public use thereof nor impair the public trust or interest of the state.”

(R 322.1006(d))
Procedure for Public Trust Review: GLSLA

* Attorney General Frank Kelly’s Opinion #5214 - Existing deed owners subject to GLSLA permitting.
Procedure for Public Trust Review: GLSLA

* Enbridge and state recognize GLSLA as guiding statute as it applies to maintenance activities under the easement.

Enbridge Installs New Anchors – 8/22/2014
Protections included in GLSLA

- **Open public process** with full disclosure with **notice** to impacted local units of government and riparian owners.
- Allows **participation by the tribes** to protect their public use rights.
Protections included in GLSLA

- Opportunity to explore the cost and feasibility of a full range of alternatives, including decommissioning, re-routing, secondary containment, replacement etc.
- Burden of proof on Enbridge to demonstrate they are protecting public trust uses.
- Duly recorded findings necessary (Obrecht v. National Gypsum Co., 1960)
Applaud the administration for the work of the Task Force for bringing attention to the pipeline and the potential risk to the Great Lakes.

Has served an important fact-finding function.

However, we don’t think it has the legal authority to make a final public trust determination the Enbridge’s Line 5 will neither substantially harm nor impair the public waters and uses of the Straits.
1. Enbridge be required to file a proceeding under GLSLA to show:
   That its pipelines will neither substantially affect the public use nor impair the state’s public trust interests and that they are taking all reasonable steps to protect public uses.

2. That the review should be ongoing and formally reviewed under the GLSLA on a time table determined by the state.
Thank you

Presented by

➢ Jim Lively, Michigan Land Use Institute
  jim@mlui.org • 231-941-6584 ext. 13

➢ Liz Kirkwood, FLOW (For Love of Water)
  liz@flowforwater.org • 231-944-1568

➢ James Clift, Michigan Environmental Council
  james@environmentalcouncil.org • 517-487-9539

Oil & Water Don’t Mix Campaign
148 E Front Street, Suite 201
Traverse City, MI 49684

www.OilandWaterDontMix.org