



RICK SNYDER
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MICHIGAN
DEPARTMENT OF LICENSING AND REGULATORY AFFAIRS
LANSING

SHELLY EDGERTON
DIRECTOR

MICHIGAN BOARD OF REAL ESTATE APPRAISERS NOVEMBER 7, 2018 MEETING

APPROVED MINUTES

In accordance with the Open Meetings Act, 1976 PA 267, as amended, the Michigan Board of Real Estate Appraisers met on November 7, 2018, at the Ottawa Building, Conference Room 4, 611 West Ottawa Street, Lansing, Michigan 48933.

CALL TO ORDER

David Worthams, Chairperson, Public Member, called the meeting to order at 9:03 a.m.

ROLL CALL

Members Present: David Worthams, Chairperson, Public Member
James Hartman, Vice Chairperson, Certified General Real Estate Appraiser
Delbert Denkins, Certified General Real Estate Appraiser
Mark Jenkins, Certified Residential Appraiser
Thomas Watson, State Licensed Real Estate Appraiser
Martin Wagar, State Certified Real Estate Appraiser
Ronald Wheeler, Certified Residential Real Estate Appraiser

Members Absent: Christian Rodriguez, Public Member
Phyllis Howard, Public Member

Staff: Laury Brown, Analyst, Compliance Section
Kimberly Catlin, Board Support, Boards and Committees Section
Jennifer Fitzgerald, Assistant Attorney General
Rick Roselle, Analyst, Boards and Committees Section

APPROVAL OF AGENDA

MOTION by Denkins, seconded by Wagar, to approve the agenda with the addition of rules discussion under new business.

A voice vote was taken.

MOTION PREVAILED

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

MOTION by Wheeler, seconded by Watson, to approve the minutes from September 19, 2018 with the correction of Thomas Watson listed as a State Licensed Appraiser and not Certified Appraiser.

A voice vote was taken.

MOTION PREVAILED

REGULATORY CONSIDERATIONS

Vicki Horne – Consent Order and Stipulation

MOTION by Hartman, seconded by Wagar, to receive the matter.

A voice vote was taken.

MOTION PREVAILED

MOTION by Worthams, seconded by Wagar, to discuss the matter.

A voice vote was taken.

MOTION PREVAILED

Discussion was held.

MOTION by Hartman, seconded by Wagar, to accept the Consent Order and Stipulation.

A roll call vote was taken: Yeas: Denkins, Jenkins, Wagar, Watson, Hartman,
 Worthams
 Nays: None
 Recuse: Wheeler

MOTION PREVAILED

Worthams recused himself. Hartman chaired for agenda item 5A(2), and 5A(3).

Mark Bollinger – Consent Order and Stipulation

MOTION by Wheeler, seconded by Denkins, to receive the matter.

A voice vote was taken.

MOTION PREVAILED

MOTION by Denkins, seconded by Wagar, to discuss the matter.

A voice vote was taken.

MOTION PREVAILED

Discussion was held.

MOTION by Wheeler, seconded by Jenkins, to accept the Consent Order and Stipulation.

A roll call vote was taken: Yeas: Denkins, Jenkins, Wagar, Wheeler, Watson,
 Hartman
 Nays: None
 Recuse: Worthams

MOTION PREVAILED

Calvin Johnson – Consent Order and Stipulation

MOTION by Wheeler, seconded by Wagar, to receive the matter.

A voice vote was taken.

MOTION PREVAILED

MOTION by Denkins, seconded by Wagar, to discuss the matter.

A voice vote was taken.

MOTION PREVAILED

Discussion was held.

MOTION by Wheeler, seconded by Jenkins, to accept the Consent Order and Stipulation.

A roll call vote was taken: Yeas: Denkins, Jenkins, Wagar, Wheeler, Watson,
 Hartman
 Nays: None
 Recuse: Worthams

MOTION PREVAILED

OLD BUSINESS

None

NEW BUSINESS

Chair Report

Worthams thanked those who have served as conferees and assisted with complex cases.

Department Update

None

Rules Discussion

Hartman expressed concern about the investigation process and documentation.

Board members also inquired about new member training.

Discussion was held.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

None

ANNOUNCEMENTS

The next regularly scheduled meeting will be held March 19, 2019 at 9:00 a.m. at the Ottawa Building, 611 West Ottawa Street, Upper Level Conference Center, Conference Room 4, Lansing, Michigan.

ADJOURNMENT

MOTION by Wagar, seconded by Hartman, to adjourn the meeting at 9:52 a.m.

A voice vote was held.

MOTION PREVAILED

Minutes approved by the Board on March 19, 2019.

Prepared By:
Kimmy Catlin, Board Support
Bureau of Professional Licensing

Prepared: November 14, 2018