



GRETCHEN WHITMER
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MICHIGAN
DEPARTMENT OF LICENSING AND REGULATORY AFFAIRS
LANSING

ORLENE HAWKS
DIRECTOR

MICHIGAN BOARD OF REAL ESTATE APPRAISERS MARCH 19, 2019 MEETING

APPROVED MINUTES

In accordance with the Open Meetings Act, 1976 PA 267, as amended, the Michigan Board of Real Estate Appraisers met on March 19, 2019, at the Ottawa Building, Conference Room 4, 611 West Ottawa Street, Lansing, Michigan 48933.

CALL TO ORDER

David Worthams, Chairperson, Public Member, called the meeting to order at 9:00 a.m.

ROLL CALL

Members Present: David Worthams, Chairperson, Public Member
James Hartman, Vice Chairperson, Certified General Real Estate Appraiser
Delbert Denkins, Certified General Real Estate Appraiser
Mark Jenkins, Certified Residential Appraiser
Thomas Watson, State Licensed Real Estate Appraiser
Ronald Wheeler, Certified Residential Real Estate Appraiser

Members Absent: Christian Rodriguez, Public Member
Phyllis Howard, Public Member
Martin Wagar, State Certified Real Estate Appraiser

Staff: Laury Brown, Analyst, Compliance Section
Kimberly Catlin, Board Support, Boards and Committees Section
Andria Ditschman, Analyst, Boards and Committees Section
Jennifer Fitzgerald, Assistant Attorney General (Attended to answer questions regarding the compliance conference process)
Kerry Przybylo, Manager, Boards and Committees Section
Bridget Smith, Assistant Attorney General

APPROVAL OF AGENDA

MOTION by Wheeler, seconded by Jenkins, to approve the agenda as presented.

A voice vote was taken.

MOTION PREVAILED

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

MOTION by Denkins, seconded by Hartman, to approve the minutes from November 7, 2018 as presented.

A voice vote was taken.

MOTION PREVAILED

Information on Egress Discussion

Kerry Przybylo introduced herself to the Board. Przybylo informed the Board of the new portal that the Department will be using to securely deliver meeting materials to the Board members. She provided a demonstration of how to access and use the portal.

REGULATORY CONSIDERATIONS

Robert Stewart, Jr., – Consent Order and Stipulation

MOTION by Hartman, seconded by Wheeler, to receive the matter.

A voice vote was taken.

MOTION PREVAILED

MOTION by Wheeler, seconded by Jenkins, to discuss the matter.

A voice vote was taken.

MOTION PREVAILED

Discussion was held.

MOTION by Wheeler, seconded by Jenkins, to accept the Consent Order and Stipulation.

A roll call vote was taken: Yeas: Jenkins, Wheeler, Watson, Hartman, Worthams
 Nays: None
 Recuse: Denkins

MOTION PREVAILED

Sandra Subotich – Consent Order and Stipulation

Amy Rector – Consent Order and Stipulation

MOTION by Wheeler, seconded by Jenkins, to receive the matter.

A voice vote was taken.

MOTION PREVAILED

MOTION by Hartman, seconded by Jenkins, to discuss the matter.

A voice vote was taken.

MOTION PREVAILED

Discussion was held.

MOTION by Wheeler, seconded by Jenkins, to accept the Consent Order and Stipulation.

A roll call vote was taken: Yeas: Denkins, Jenkins, Wheeler, Hartman, Worthams
 Nays: None
 Recuse: Watson

MOTION PREVAILED

Worthams recused himself. Hartman chaired for agenda item 6B.

Craig Butterfield – Hearing Report

MOTION by Hartman, seconded by Wheeler, to receive the matter.

A voice vote was taken.

MOTION PREVAILED

MOTION by Wheeler, seconded by Denkins, to discuss the matter.

A voice vote was taken.

MOTION PREVAILED

Discussion was held.

MOTION by Wheeler, seconded by Watson, to revoke the Respondent's license. The Respondent is fined \$5,000 to be paid within 120 days.

A roll call vote was taken: Yeas: Denkins, Jenkins, Wheeler, Watson, Hartman
 Nays: None
 Recuse: Worthams

MOTION PREVAILED

OLD BUSINESS

None

NEW BUSINESS

Compliance Conference Discussion

Fitzgerald informed the Board of the compliance conference process and the role of the conferee.

Discussion was held.

Elections

Ditschman ran the election for the Chairperson.

MOTION by Hartman, seconded by Jenkins, to elect Worthams as the Chairperson.

A roll call vote was taken: Yeas: Denkins, Jenkins, Wheeler, Watson, Hartman
 Nays: None
 Abstain: Worthams

MOTION PREVAILED

MOTION by Denkins, seconded by Worthams, to elect Hartman as the Vice Chairperson.

A roll call vote was taken: Yeas: Denkins, Jenkins, Wheeler, Watson, Hartman,
 Worthams
 Nays: None

MOTION PREVAILED

Rules Discussion

Ditschman informed the Board that LARA leadership has mandated that all rules committee meetings will be open to the public and will be referred to as Rules Work Group

Meetings. The public will be invited to attend and will be able to discuss proposed rules with the Rules Committee.

Chair Report

Worthams informed the Board that he will continue to use the same method of selecting conferees as he has in the past.

Department Update

Ditschman announced that Orlene Hawks has been named Director of the Department of Licensing and Regulatory Affairs and Kim Gaedeke has been named Chief Deputy Director of the Department of Licensing and Regulatory Affairs.

Ditschman announced that the department will be providing another board training in July and all members are welcome to attend.

Ditschman informed the Board that they have the option of subscribing to email alerts that will inform them of Rules Work Group meetings and any other email blast sent by the Department pertaining to their profession. Attached is a link to Gov Delivery to sign up for the email notifications.

https://www.michigan.gov/lara/0,4601,7-154-89334_72600-483744--,00.html

PUBLIC COMMENTS

None

ANNOUNCEMENTS

The next regularly scheduled meeting will be held June 18, 2019 at 9:00 a.m. at the Ottawa Building, 611 West Ottawa Street, Upper Level Conference Room 4, Lansing, Michigan.

ADJOURNMENT

MOTION by Hartman, seconded by Denkins, to adjourn the meeting at 10:37 a.m.

A voice vote was held.

MOTION PREVAILED

Minutes approved by the Board on June 18, 2019.

Prepared By:
Kimmy Catlin, Board Support

Prepared: March 21, 2019

Bureau of Professional Licensing