

GRETCHEN WHITMER
GOVERNOR

# STATE OF MICHIGAN DEPARTMENT OF LICENSING AND REGULATORY AFFAIRS LANSING

ORLENE HAWKS

# MICHIGAN BOARD OF REAL ESTATE APPRAISERS JUNE 16, 2020 MEETING

## **APPROVED MINUTES**

In accordance with the Open Meetings Act, 1976 PA 267, as amended, the Michigan Board of Real Estate Appraisers met on June 16, 2020. The meeting was held via Zoom, pursuant to Executive Order 2020-75.

#### CALL TO ORDER

David Worthams, Chairperson, Public Member, called the meeting to order at 9:01 a.m.

#### **ROLL CALL**

**Members Present:** David Worthams, Chairperson, Public Member

James Hartman, Vice Chairperson, Certified General Real Estate Appraiser

Delbert Denkins, Certified General Real Estate Appraiser

Phyllis Howard, Public Member

Mark Jenkins, Certified Residential Appraiser

Martin Wagar, State Certified Real Estate Appraiser Thomas Watson, State Licensed Real Estate Appraiser Ronald Wheeler, Certified Residential Real Estate Appraiser

**Members Absent:** Christian Rodriguez, Public Member

Staff: Laury Brown, Analyst, Compliance Section

Kimberly Catlin, Board Support, Boards and Committees Section Andria Ditschman, Analyst, Boards and Committees Section

Jennifer Fitzgerald, Assistant Attorney General

#### APPROVAL OF AGENDA

MOTION by Wheeler, seconded by Hartman, to approve the agenda with the correction of the previous meeting date being November 19, 2019.

A roll call vote was taken: Yeas: Denkins, Jenkins, Howard, Wheeler, Wagar, Watson,

Hartman, Worthams

Nays: None

Michigan Board of Real Estate Appraisers Meeting Minutes June 16, 2020 Page 2 of 7

#### MOTION PREVAILED

## APPROVAL OF MINUTES

MOTION by Wheeler, seconded by Wagar, to approve the minutes from November 19, 2019, as presented.

A roll call vote was taken: Yeas: Denkins, Jenkins, Howard, Wheeler, Wagar, Watson,

Hartman, Worthams

Nays: None

MOTION PREVAILED

## REGULATORY CONSIDERATIONS

# **David Glauber- Consent Order and Stipulation**

MOTION by Wagar, seconded by Denkins, to discuss the matter.

A roll call vote was taken: Yeas: Denkins, Jenkins, Howard, Wheeler, Wagar, Watson,

Worthams

Navs: None

Recuse: Hartman

MOTION PREVAILED

Discussion was held.

MOTION by Denkins, seconded by Wheeler, to accept the Consent Order and Stipulation.

A roll call vote was taken: Yeas: Denkins, Jenkins, Howard, Wheeler, Wagar, Watson,

Worthams

Nays: None

Recuse: Hartman

MOTION PREVAILED

# Robert Holsinger- Consent Order and Stipulation

MOTION by Wagar, seconded by Watson, to discuss the matter.

A roll call vote was taken: Yeas: Denkins, Jenkins, Howard, Wheeler, Wagar, Watson,

Michigan Board of Real Estate Appraisers Meeting Minutes June 16, 2020 Page 3 of 7

Worthams

Nays: None

Recuse: Hartman

## MOTION PREVAILED

Discussion was held.

MOTION by Wagar, seconded by Jenkins, to accept the Consent Order and Stipulation.

A roll call vote was taken: Yeas: Denkins, Jenkins, Howard, Wheeler, Wagar, Watson,

Worthams

Nays: None

Recuse: Hartman

## MOTION PREVAILED

## Vicki Horne- Consent Order and Stipulation

MOTION by Wheeler, seconded by Denkins, to discuss the matter.

A roll call vote was taken: Yeas: Denkins, Jenkins, Howard, Wheeler, Wagar, Watson,

Worthams

Nays: None

Recuse: Hartman

## **MOTION PREVAILED**

Discussion was held.

MOTION by Denkins, seconded by Wagar, to accept the Consent Order and Stipulation.

A roll call vote was taken: Yeas: Denkins, Jenkins, Howard, Wheeler, Wagar, Watson,

Worthams

Nays: None

Recuse: Hartman

## **MOTION PREVAILED**

## **Dale Killins- Consent Order and Stipulation**

MOTION by Denkins, seconded by Wagar, to discuss the matter.

A roll call vote was taken: Yeas: Denkins, Jenkins, Howard, Wheeler, Wagar, Watson,

Michigan Board of Real Estate Appraisers Meeting Minutes June 16, 2020 Page 4 of 7

Worthams

Nays: None

Recuse: Hartman

## MOTION PREVAILED

Discussion was held.

MOTION by Wheeler, seconded by Watson, to accept the Consent Order and Stipulation.

A roll call vote was taken: Yeas: Denkins, Jenkins, Howard, Wheeler, Wagar, Watson,

Worthams

Nays: None

Recuse: Hartman

## MOTION PREVAILED

# **Harold Morgan– Consent Order and Stipulation**

MOTION by Wagar, seconded by Denkins, to discuss the matter.

A roll call vote was taken: Yeas: Denkins, Jenkins, Howard, Wheeler, Wagar, Watson,

Worthams

Nays: None

Recuse: Hartman

## **MOTION PREVAILED**

Discussion was held.

MOTION by Wheeler, seconded by Jenkins, to reject the Consent Order and Stipulation.

A roll call vote was taken: Yeas: Denkins, Jenkins, Howard, Wheeler, Wagar, Watson,

Worthams

Nays: None

Recuse: Hartman

## MOTION PREVAILED

## **Larry Odom– Consent Order and Stipulation**

MOTION by Wagar, seconded by Hartman, to discuss the matter.

A roll call vote was taken: Yeas: Denkins, Jenkins, Howard, Wagar, Watson, Hartman

Michigan Board of Real Estate Appraisers Meeting Minutes June 16, 2020 Page 5 of 7

Worthams

Nays: None

Recuse: Wheeler

## MOTION PREVAILED

Discussion was held.

MOTION by Wagar, seconded by Denkins, to accept the Consent Order and Stipulation.

A roll call vote was taken: Yeas: Denkins, Jenkins, Howard, Wagar, Watson, Hartman

Worthams

Nays: None

Recuse: Wheeler

MOTION PREVAILED

#### **OLD BUSINESS**

None

## **NEW BUSINESS**

## **Elections**

Ditschman ran the election for the Chairperson.

MOTION by Wagar, seconded by Denkins, to elect Worthams as Chairperson.

Worthams declined the nomination.

MOTION by Wheeler, seconded by Hartman, to elect Denkins as the Chairperson.

A roll call vote was taken: Yeas: Denkins, Jenkins, Howard, Wheeler, Wagar, Watson,

Hartman, Worthams

Nays: None

## **MOTION PREVAILED**

MOTION by Worthams, seconded by Wagar, to elect Hartman as the Vice Chairperson.

A roll call vote was taken: Yeas: Denkins, Jenkins, Howard, Wheeler, Wagar, Watson,

Hartman, Worthams

Michigan Board of Real Estate Appraisers Meeting Minutes June 16, 2020 Page 6 of 7

Nays: None

#### MOTION PREVAILED

## **Rules Discussion**

Ditschman explained the promulgation process and timeline.

## **Board Member Resolutions**

Catlin stated that members not seeking reappointment or members that do not get reappointed, will be presented with a resolution at the next regularly scheduled meeting.

# **Chair Report**

Worthams informed the Board of his new job.

Denkins agreed to handle allegations and delegate, as necessary.

## **Department Update**

Ditschman announced that the Department is holding a board member training on July 29, 2020, and all members are welcome to attend.

## **PUBLIC COMMENTS**

Wheeler inquired if Board members can receive continuing education credit for attending Board meetings.

Ditschman stated she will investigate it.

The Board requested that conferees be present for all compliance conferences.

## **ANNOUNCEMENTS**

The next regularly scheduled meeting will be held September 15, 2020 at 9:00 a.m. at the Ottawa Building, 611 West Ottawa Street, Upper Level Conference Room 4, Lansing, Michigan.

#### **ADJOURNMENT**

MOTION by Wheeler, seconded by Wagar, to adjourn the meeting at 10:54 a.m.

A roll call vote was taken: Yeas: Denkins, Jenkins, Howard, Wheeler, Wagar, Watson,

Hartman, Worthams

Michigan Board of Real Estate Appraisers Meeting Minutes June 16, 2020 Page 7 of 7

Nays: None

Prepared: June 16, 2020

# **MOTION PREVAILED**

Minutes approved by the Board on September 15, 2020

Prepared By: Kimmy Catlin, Board Support Bureau of Professional Licensing