



RICK SNYDER  
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MICHIGAN  
DEPARTMENT OF LICENSING AND REGULATORY AFFAIRS  
LANSING

SHELLY EDGERTON  
DIRECTOR

## MICHIGAN BOARD OF REAL ESTATE APPRAISERS SEPTEMBER 18, 2018 MEETING

### APPROVED MINUTES

In accordance with the Open Meetings Act, 1976 PA 267, as amended, the Michigan Board of Real Estate Appraisers met on September 18, 2018, at the Ottawa Building, Conference Room 4, 611 West Ottawa Street, Lansing, Michigan 48933.

#### CALL TO ORDER

David Worthams, Chairperson, Public Member, called the meeting to order at 9:05 a.m.

#### ROLL CALL

**Members Present:** David Worthams, Chairperson, Public Member  
Delbert Denkins, Certified General Real Estate Appraiser  
Christian Rodriguez, Public Member  
Thomas Watson, State Licensed Real Estate Appraiser  
Martin Wagar, State Certified Real Estate Appraiser  
Ronald Wheeler, Certified Residential Real Estate Appraiser

**Members Absent:** James Hartman, Vice Chairperson, Certified General Real Estate Appraiser  
Phyllis Howard, Public Member  
Mark Jenkins, Certified Residential Appraiser

**Staff:** Stacie Bayes, Manager, Occupational Code Investigations Section  
Laury Brown, Analyst, Compliance Section  
Jon Campbell, Division Director, Investigation and Inspections Division  
Kimberly Catlin, Board Support, Boards and Committees Section  
Andria Ditschman, Analyst, Boards and Committees Section  
Jennifer Fitzgerald, Assistant Attorney General  
Stephanie Rosenthal, Manager, Complaint Intake Section  
Robin Sirls, Manager, Licensing Division

#### APPROVAL OF AGENDA

MOTION by Wheeler, seconded by Wagar, to approve the agenda as presented.

A voice vote was taken.



MOTION by Wheeler, seconded by Denkins, to discuss the matter.

A voice vote was taken.

MOTION PREVAILED

Discussion was held.

MOTION by Denkins, seconded by Rodriguez, to accept the Consent Order and Stipulation.

A roll call vote was taken:           Yeas: Denkins, Rodriguez, Wagar, Wheeler, Watson  
  Nays: None  
  Recuse: Worthams

MOTION PREVAILED

**Gerald Francis– Consent Order and Stipulation**

MOTION by Wagar, seconded by Rodriguez, to receive the matter.

A voice vote was taken.

MOTION PREVAILED

MOTION by Wheeler, seconded by Wagar, to discuss the matter.

A voice vote was taken.

MOTION PREVAILED

Discussion was held.

MOTION by Wheeler, seconded by Wagar, to accept the Consent Order and Stipulation.

A roll call vote was taken:           Yeas: Denkins, Rodriguez, Wagar, Wheeler, Watson,  
  Worthams  
  Nays: None

MOTION PREVAILED

**OLD BUSINESS**

None

**NEW BUSINESS**

**Complaint Intake Discussion**

Jon Campbell introduced himself, Stephanie Rosenthal, and Stacie Bayes to the Board. Jon Campbell gave an overview of the administrative process that occurs once an allegation is filed with the Department.

Discussion was held.

### **2019 Public Notice**

Discussion was held regarding the 2019 meeting dates.

### **Rules Update**

None

### **Chair Report**

Worthams informed the Board of current legislation.

Discussion was held.

Discussion was held regarding training for the new members.

### **Department Update**

None

### **PUBLIC COMMENTS**

Robin Sirls introduced Appraisal Subcommittee members Kristi Klamet, Denise Graves, and Neal Fenochietti to the Board. Kristi Klamet informed the Board of the Appraisal Subcommittee's view on House Bill 5591, Public Act 157 of 2018.

Discussion was held.

### **ANNOUNCEMENTS**

The next regularly scheduled meeting will be held November 7, 2018 at 9:00 a.m. at the Ottawa Building, 611 West Ottawa Street, Upper Level Conference Center, Conference Room 4, Lansing, Michigan.

### **ADJOURNMENT**

MOTION by Wheeler, seconded by Wagar, to adjourn the meeting at 10:12 a.m.

A voice vote was held.

MOTION PREVAILED

Minutes approved by the Board on November 7, 2018.

Prepared By:  
Kimmy Catlin, Board Support  
Bureau of Professional Licensing

Prepared: September 21, 2018