

Michigan Department of Labor and Economic Opportunity
Michigan Occupational Safety and Health Administration (MIOSHA)

MIOSHA General Industry Safety & Health Division

530 West Allegan Street

P.O. Box 30644

Lansing, MI 48909

Phone: (517) 284-7750 Fax: (517) 284-7755



Citation and Notification of Penalty

To: Value City Furniture and its successors 4577 Miller Rd Flint, MI 48507	Inspection Number: Inspection Date(s): Issuance Date:	1487823 08/12/2020 - 09/02/2020 09/30/2020
Inspection Site: 4577 Miller Rd Flint, MI 48507	Reporting ID: CSHO ID: Optional Report Number:	0552652 Z8867

SUMMARY: An inspection at the site noted above has revealed conditions we believe do not comply with the provisions of the Michigan Occupational Safety and Health Act, Act 154, of the P.A. of 1974, as amended (MIOSH Act). The nature of such alleged violation(s) is described on the citation(s) with reference to the applicable standards, rules, regulations, orders and provisions of the Act. Following is a list of items the employer must consider carefully, to resolve the issues alleged in the citation(s). Following this numbered summary is a more detailed explanation of the requirements.

1. The violation(s) alleged in the citation(s) must be corrected on or before the date(s) shown in the line marked "Date By Which Violation Must Be Abated". If the line is marked "Immediately Upon Receipt," the violation must be corrected on or before the date that the citation is received by the employer. If the violation was corrected during the inspection, the line will be marked "Abated." or "Corrected during inspection." Correcting a violation does not eliminate the requirement to pay the penalty nor does payment of the penalty negate having to correct the violation.
2. A copy of the citation(s) must be posted at or near the location of the violation(s) for a minimum of 3 days or until the item(s) have been corrected, whichever is later.
3. Documentation of abatement must be provided to the issuing division. Failure to provide such documentation may result in a follow-up inspection.
4. The employer may enter into a Penalty Reduction Agreement (PRA) that can result in a 50% reduction in any assessed penalties. The employer should apply for a PRA online at www.michigan.gov/mioshapra within 5 workdays upon receiving a citation(s) if interested. An employer without access to a computer may contact the issuing division to request a PRA.
5. The employer may file a first appeal for modification or dismissal of a citation item and/or any proposed penalty or request an extension of time for abatement. **The appeal must be in writing and be postmarked within 15 workdays of receipt (workday is defined below).** The first appeal can also result in a penalty reduction of up to 50%. If an appeal is untimely, the citation(s) become a Final Order of the Board of Health and Safety Compliance and Appeals (Board) and is no longer subject to review by the issuing division. An employee or employee representative may appeal abatement dates.
6. Except under a PRA monetary penalties must be paid within 15 workdays of a citation becoming a Final Order of the Board.
7. The employer may file a request for an extension of time to abate a citation(s) that has become a Final Order of the Board. Such a request must be in writing and received or post marked no later than 1 working day following the abatement date.
8. It is unlawful to discriminate against an employee for exercising any of their rights under MIOSHA.

Note: As defined in statutes, “workday” or “working day” means any day other than a Saturday, Sunday, or state legal holiday. The state legal holidays are:

January 1, New Year’s Day
The third Monday in January, Martin Luther King, Jr. Day
February 12, Lincoln’s birthday
The third Monday of February, Washington’s birthday
The last Monday of May, Memorial or Decoration Day
July 4, Independence Day
The first Monday in September, Labor Day
The second Monday in October, Columbus Day
November 11, Veterans’ Day
The fourth Thursday of November, Thanksgiving Day
December 25, Christmas Day

Please note whenever January 1; February 12; July 4; November 11; or December 25 fall on a Sunday, the next Monday following is deemed a public holiday (non-working day) for appeal purposes. However, there is no compensating day when one of the five dated holidays falls on a Saturday. Also, when computing the 15 working days, you do not count the date on which it is received; you start with the next working day. Additionally, the count is based on when the citation was received at the employer’s location, not when it got to any particular person or office at the employer’s location.

I–CITATIONS: The nature of the alleged violation(s) is described on the enclosed citation(s). These conditions must be corrected on or before the date(s) shown in the line marked “Date By Which Violation Must Be Abated.” The issuing division may be contacted by telephone at the number indicated on the front of the citation for the purpose of discussing any issues related to the inspection or citation(s).

A copy of the citation(s) must be posted at or near the location of the violation for a minimum of 3 days or until the items have been corrected, whichever is later. The MIOSH Act provides for civil penalties of up to \$7,000 for each violation for failure to comply with posting requirements.

When compliance is achieved, a copy of the citation must be signed and returned to the issuing division along with documentation of abatement.

Documentation of abatement for citation items originally classified as “serious,” “repeat,” “fail-to-abate,” “willful,” or “instance-by-instance,” require documentation as deemed appropriate by the issuing division. Examples of documentation for these violation classifications are:

- (a) A detailed description of how the violation was abated.
- (b) Work orders or an invoice indicating the corrective work that has been done.
- (c) Photographs of the abated conditions.
- (d) Other forms of conclusive evidence that your employees are no longer exposed to the hazard.

For citation items classified as “other,” submitting to the issuing division a signed copy of the citation item indicating the item has been abated is acceptable documentation of abatement. Submitting a document in writing, certifying abatement of the particular citation item is also acceptable for citation items classified as “other.”

If the employer does not provide adequate documentation of abatement, a re-inspection may be conducted. Failure to correct an alleged violation within the abatement period may result in new or additional proposed penalties.

Correcting a violation prior to the expiration of the abatement date does not eliminate the requirement to pay the penalty. Payment of the penalty does not eliminate the requirement of correcting the violation.

II–PENALTY REDUCTION: In addition to the appeal rights afforded by the MIOSH Act, the Michigan Occupational Safety and Health Administration has implemented a program for negotiating an expedited settlement of penalties with the employers known as a Penalty Reduction Agreement (PRA). This is a program designed to reach abatement of the hazard at the earliest possible opportunity and reduce the need for formal appeals. The penalty reduction (PRA) can result in a penalty reduction of 50% provided the issuing division and the employer agree to a number of specified conditions. These conditions include an agreement by the employer to accept all of the citations issued and to:

- (a) Not appeal further.
- (b) Abate all items within the abatement period.
- (c) Provide proof of abatement.
- (d) Pay all agreed upon penalties as required (within 15 working days of approval of the PRA.)
- (e) Abide by any other mutually agreed upon actions.

Inspections involving a fatality, the Severe Violator Enforcement Program (SVEP), or willful citations are not eligible for the program. Construction citations must be confirmed as corrected by the issuing division before a penalty reduction agreement can be approved.

If you are interested in pursuing a PRA, you should apply online at www.michigan.gov/mioshapra **within 5 workdays upon receipt of the citation(s)**, but no later than the 15th workday beyond receipt of the citation(s). If you do not have access to a computer, you should contact the issuing division within the same timeframe to request a PRA. If the employer wishes to accept the conditions stated above and the process can be completed within 15 workdays from receipt, then no appeal need be filed.

III–CITATION APPEAL: An employer may file a first appeal to the issuing division in writing for modification or dismissal of a citation item and/or any proposed penalty or an extension of time for abatement. The first appeal can also result in a penalty reduction of up to 50% providing the issuing division and the employer agree to the conditions (a) through (e) as stated in Section II, PENALTY REDUCTION (above).

An employee or employee representative may appeal in writing the reasonableness of the abatement date(s). The envelope containing an appeal must be postmarked no later than the 15th workday following receipt of the citation.

If a citation is not appealed within 15 workdays of receipt, then the citation becomes a Final Order of the Board of Health and Safety Compliance and Appeals (Board). Final Order citations are not subject to review by the issuing division unless the Bureau of Hearings establishes good cause for the late appeal.

An appeal must specify the item(s) appealed and that portion of the item (e.g., violation, abatement date, penalty) which is being appealed and include a certification that the appeal has been posted or given to affected employees or their representatives. If the issuing division meets with the employer to discuss an appeal, the issuing division will notify the employee representative and allow attendance at the meeting.

The issuing division will notify an employer of its decision within 15 workdays of the receipt of the employer's written appeal. The decision must be posted at the location of the subject citation.

If an employer, employee or employee representative is not satisfied with this decision then they may file a second appeal. The appeal must be in writing and the envelope containing the second appeal must be postmarked within 15 workdays of the receipt of the issuing division's decision on the first appeal. If the issuing division's decision is not appealed then the citation becomes a Final Order of the Board.

IV–PAYMENT OF MONETARY PENALTIES: Unless subject to a PRA, payment must be made within 15 workdays of the date a proposed penalty of a citation becomes a Final Order of the Board. This would be the 30th workday after receipt of each citation item that is not appealed. For payment of a penalty, make a check or money order payable to the "State of Michigan" and remit to the issuing division at the address shown on the citation. Please record the inspection number, citation and item number on the check, money order or transmittal letter.

V–EXTENSION OF TIME TO ABATE: An employer may file a petition for modification of abatement date(s) (PMA) on an item of a citation, which has become a Final Order of the Board. The PMA must be submitted to the issuing division in writing by personal delivery or postmarked no later than one day following the abatement date, and a copy posted near the place the citation was posted. An employer must have made a good faith effort to correct the violation by the abatement date, and has or will not be successful because of factors beyond the employer's reasonable control. A PMA must include:

- (a) Steps taken to achieve compliance.
- (b) The specific additional abatement time necessary.
- (c) The reasons the additional time is needed.
- (d) Available interim steps being taken to safeguard the employees against the cited hazard during the abatement period.
- (e) A certification that a copy of the PMA has been posted for employees at the location of the subject citation.

The posted copy must remain posted for a minimum of 10 workdays.

If the issuing division or affected employees file an objection to the PMA within 10 workdays of the employer's filing date, the Board will schedule a hearing and advise the employer of the date, time, and place of the hearing.

VI–EMPLOYEE DISCRIMINATION: Section 65 of the MIOSH Act, prohibits discrimination by an employer against an employee for filing a complaint or exercising any rights under the MIOSH Act, as amended. If an employee believes that he or she was discharged or otherwise discriminated against as a result of filing a complaint, they may file a complaint with the MIOSHA Employee Discrimination Section within 30 days after the violation occurs.

VII–STATE CONSULTATION EDUCATION AND TRAINING SERVICES: The MIOSHA Consultation Education and Training (CET) Division offers a wide range of services to help businesses with their health and safety practices. CET services include: helping employers create a Safety and Health Management System, seminars and workshops, onsite consultations, hazard surveys, an equipment loan program and information material. The majority of CET services are provided free of charge to Michigan employers and employees. For information on these services, contact the CET Division at (517) 284-7720 or visit their web site at www.mi.gov/miosha.

**Michigan Department of Labor
and Economic Opportunity**

530 West Allegan Street

P.O. Box 30644

Lansing, MI 48909

Phone: (517) 284-7750 Fax: (517) 284-7755

Inspection Number: 1487823

Inspection Date(s): 08/12/2020 - 09/02/2020

Issuance Date: 09/30/2020

Optional Reporting Number:

Citation and Notification of Penalty

Company Name: Value City Furniture and its successors

Inspection Site: 4577 Miller Rd, Flint, MI 48507

Citation 1 Item 1

Type of Violation: **Serious**

408.1011(a): ACT 154, MICHIGAN OCCUPATIONAL SAFETY AND HEALTH ACT

An employer shall furnish to each employee, employment and a place of employment that is free from recognized hazards that are causing, or are likely to cause, death or serious physical harm to the employee.

(The employer did not furnish employment and a place of employment which were free from recognized hazards that were causing or likely to cause death or serious physical harm to employees in that employees were not protected from the hazard of contracting the virus, SARS-CoV-2 (severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus 2), the cause of coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19):

- a. On August 12, 2020, the employer had not developed a COVID-19 preparedness and response plan.
- b. On August 12, 2020, the employer did not conduct a daily entry self-screening protocol for all employees or contractors entering the workplace, including, at a minimum, a questionnaire covering symptoms and suspected or confirmed exposure to people with possible COVID-19. There was no questionnaire developed to address daily screening requirements for employees, thus potentially exposing employees to SARS-CoV-2 virus.
- c. On August 12, 2020, the employer did not keep everyone on the worksite premises at least six feet from one another to the maximum extent possible, including through the use of ground markings, signs, and physical barriers, as appropriate to the worksite. Employees in the loading dock area were observed standing around and closer than 6 feet from coworkers while improperly wearing face coverings.
- d. On August 12, 2020, the employer did not require face coverings to be worn when employees cannot consistently maintain six feet of separation from other individuals in the workplace and consider face shields when employees cannot consistently maintain three feet of separation from other individuals in the workplace. Employees in the loading dock area and storage area were observed improperly wearing face coverings around their chin and/or dropping them below the nose on multiple occasions during the walk around inspection.
- e. On August 12, 2020, the employer did not provide training on the steps the employees must take to notify the business or operation of any symptoms of COVID-19 or a suspected or confirmed diagnosis of COVID-19.

**Michigan Department of Labor
and Economic Opportunity**

530 West Allegan Street

P.O. Box 30644

Lansing, MI 48909

Phone: (517) 284-7750 Fax: (517) 284-7755

Inspection Number: 1487823

Inspection Date(s): 08/12/2020 - 09/02/2020

Issuance Date: 09/30/2020

Optional Reporting Number:

Citation and Notification of Penalty

Company Name: Value City Furniture and its successors

Inspection Site: 4577 Miller Rd, Flint, MI 48507

- f. On August 12, 2020, the employer did not post signs at store entrances informing customers not to enter if they are or have recently been sick, thus potentially exposing employees to SARS-CoV-2 virus.
- g. On August 12, 2020, the employer had not maintained a record of required COVID-19 training and daily health screenings.
- h. On August 12, 2020, the employer allowed customers to enter its premises without a face covering and the customers were not asked to verbally indicate the reason for not wearing a face covering.

Among other methods, one feasible and acceptable abatement method to correct this hazard is to:

- a. Develop a COVID-19 preparedness and response plan, consistent with recommendations in Guidance on Preparing Workplaces for COVID-19, developed by the Occupational Health and Safety Administration (“OSHA”). Within two weeks of resuming in-person activities, make readily available the business’s or operation’s plan to employees, labor unions, and customers, whether via website, internal network, or by hard copy.
- b. Conduct a daily entry self-screening protocol for all employees or contractors entering the workplace, including, at a minimum, a questionnaire covering symptoms and suspected or confirmed exposure to people with possible COVID-19.
- c. Keep everyone on the worksite premises at least six feet from one another to the maximum extent possible, including through the use of ground markings, signs, and physical barriers, as appropriate to the worksite.
- d. Require face coverings to be worn when employees cannot consistently maintain six feet of separation from other individuals in the workplace and consider face shields when employees cannot consistently maintain three feet of separation from other individuals in the workplace.
- e. Provide COVID-19 training to employees that covers, at a minimum workplace infection-control practices, the proper use of personal protective equipment, steps the employee must take to notify the business or operation of any symptoms of COVID-19 or a suspected or confirmed diagnosis of COVID-19 and how to report unsafe working conditions.

**Michigan Department of Labor
and Economic Opportunity**

530 West Allegan Street

P.O. Box 30644

Lansing, MI 48909

Phone: (517) 284-7750 Fax: (517) 284-7755

Inspection Number: 1487823

Inspection Date(s): 08/12/2020 - 09/02/2020

Issuance Date: 09/30/2020

Optional Reporting Number:

Citation and Notification of Penalty

Company Name: Value City Furniture and its successors

Inspection Site: 4577 Miller Rd, Flint, MI 48507

- f. Post signs at store entrances informing customers not to enter if they are or have recently been sick.
- g. Maintain a record of the COVID-19 training and daily health screenings.
- h. Provide service to a customer or allow a customer to enter its premises, only when the customer is wearing a face covering to protect workers, shoppers, and the community. Do not assume that someone who enters the business without a face covering meets one of the exceptions allowed, including the exception for individuals who cannot medically tolerate a face covering. Obtain a verbal representation from them that they are not wearing a face covering because they fall within a specified exception.

Date By Which Violation Must be Abated:

November 18, 2020

Proposed Penalty:

\$1,500.00

Sundari Murthy

Authorized Signature

**Michigan Department of Labor
and Economic Opportunity**

530 West Allegan Street

P.O. Box 30644

Lansing, MI 48909

Phone: (517) 284-7750 Fax: (517) 284-7755

Inspection Number: 1487823

Inspection Date: 08/12/2020 - 09/02/2020

Issuance Date(s): 09/30/2020

Optional Reporting Number:

CSHO ID: Z8867

PROPOSED PENALTY INVOICE

Company Name: Value City Furniture and its successors

Inspection Site: 4577 Miller Rd

Flint, MI 48507

Summary of Penalties for Inspection Number: 1487823

Citation 1 Item 1, Serious

\$1,500.00

TOTAL PROPOSED PENALTIES:

\$1,500.00

Correcting a violation prior to the expiration of the abatement date does not eliminate the requirement to pay the penalty.
Payment of the penalty does not eliminate the requirement of correcting the violation.

The state does not agree to any restrictions or conditions or endorsements put on any check or money order for less than full amount due, and will cash the check or money order as if these restrictions, conditions, or endorsements do not exist.

Payment must be made within 15 working days of the date a proposed penalty of a citation item becomes a final order of the board. This would be the thirtieth (30th) working day after receipt of each citation item which is not appealed. For the payment of any penalty, make a check or money order payable to the "State of Michigan" and remit to the Department of Labor and Economic Opportunity at the address shown on the citation. **PLEASE RECORD THE APPLICABLE INSPECTION NUMBER, CITATION NUMBER(S) AND ITEM NUMBER(S) ON THE CHECK, MONEY ORDER OR YOUR TRANSMITTAL LETTER.**

Enclose this invoice page (or a copy thereof) with your payment.

Sundari Murthy

Authorized Signature