

# **Carl D. Perkins Consolidated Annual Report**

Program Year  
July 1, 2013 – June 30, 2014

Michigan Department of Education Office of Career and  
Technical Education  
(Secondary)

and

Workforce Development Agency, State of Michigan Division of Education  
and Career Success Community College Services  
(Postsecondary)

# Consolidated Annual Report, Program Year 2013 - 2014

## Michigan

### Executive Summary

This document contains the required annual report on the state-level activities conducted in Michigan through the benefit of federal funding from the Carl D. Perkins Career and Technical Education Act of 2006. In addition to the state-level activities, a report on the achievement of career and technical education students is addressed, according to the requirements within the Act.

### Use of Funds: Part A

---

#### 1. During the reporting year, did your state use Perkins funds to develop valid and reliable assessments of technical skills?

Yes

Secondary

The selection and adoption of Technical Skill Assessments (TSA) for CPI 2S1 continued to present a challenge for Michigan. Progress was slower than planned due to the lack of additional funding, which constrained the assessments that could be considered for statewide adoption and available staff devoted to the project. Additionally there is still a lack of reliable, valid, affordable assessments aligned to nationally-recognized standards that are appropriate to secondary students and for which scores can be obtained for state reporting. Michigan's process for identifying statewide third party assessments for secondary programs utilized multiple Career Cluster Referent Groups (CRG). The Assessment and Accountability Referent Group (AARG) consisted of assessment and measurement experts from intermediate school districts, the Michigan Department of Education Bureau of Assessment and Accountability (BAA), community college representatives, representatives from Community College Services in the Workforce Development Agency, secondary CTE administrators, and OCTE staff. The review and selection of assessments for each career cluster area involved a CRG which consisted of secondary and postsecondary content area experts, one or more measurement professionals, a secondary CTE administrator, and OCTE research and program staff. OCTE staff working on TSA review and adoption met biweekly, or as needed, to review and discuss progress and processes. To facilitate discussion around the selection of assessments secure collaborative applications housed within the CTEIS were utilized to share data, information, and ideas between OCTE and districts, industry partners, and vendors.

The timeline for reviewing and selecting TSAs was further refined during the 2013-14 school year. Career clusters and CTE programs with the largest numbers of students enrolled were prioritized for assessment selection processes. Michigan's process involved review and evaluation of assessments for psychometric qualities, review of assessment information by CRGs, and, where possible, content review of the assessment items compared to the program standards. Assessments that were field tested were evaluated using a both a survey from students, teachers, and proctors, and the assessment results. Assessments with acceptable field test feedback and ratings were adopted for full implementation in the 2014-15 School Year, with a final feedback survey for a final review.

During the 2013-14 school year, assessments were reviewed for the following career clusters: Hospitality & Tourism career cluster, the Architecture & Construction career cluster, and for specific pathway or program assessments within the Information Technology career cluster. Multiple field test administrations were conducted for: the Hospitality & Tourism career cluster and the Welding program area within the Manufacturing cluster with both field tests exhibiting test administrative challenges that nullified forward adoption. The review and selection process for the Manufacturing, Hospitality & Tourism, Information Technology, and Architecture & Construction Career Clusters will continue into the 2014-15 school year with a goal for some of the programs to plan field testing during Spring 2015.

Reviewing the feedback on the first year of the Information Technology career cluster in the 2012-2013 school year we found that the single test selected by the previous CRG was not functioning well for 3 of the 4 programs and that the costs far exceeded previous estimates during the selection process. Therefore, the mandate for the assessment of the Information Technology career cluster was rescinded and was targeted for more specific pathway or program selection options.

Reviewing the feedback on the first year assessment implementation surveys for the 2013-14 school year revealed mixed findings. The Transportation, Distribution & Logistics sub groups: Collision Repair Technician and Medium/Heavy Truck Technician did not reveal any large issues were moved forward for implementation. However, the first year implementation surveys for the Arts, A/V, Technology, and Graphic Communications career cluster for the Radio and TV

Broadcasting Technology and the Graphic Communication programs both indicated a probable disconnect between the content standards and the aligned TSA to the content learned by the students. Misalignment issues seem to surround changing and/or varied content and technologies where the teachers' leading may be more current and/or varied than the mandated standards. Therefore, the mandate for both of the assessments have been rescinded and further TSA selection processes are not advised or planned until another review of the standards selected has occurred.

OCTE continued to struggle to match student assessment scores to individual student records using the state Unique Identifier Code (UIC). To increase the accuracy of the UICs, student directory files linking student names to UICs were created for each adopted assessment and the files were provided to the assessment vendors under a data sharing agreement. In 2013-14, Michigan had agreements with Automotive Service Excellence (ASE), Precision Exams (health), Skills Connect, and the National Occupational Competency Testing Institute (NOCTI). This process improved the accuracy of the data. Assessment data issues were decreased during the 2013-14 school year and newly adopted assessment data that exhibited match issues went through a UIC resolution process with districts through an expansion of the CTEIS application allowing districts to interactively and accurately link assessment scores to student records.

#### Postsecondary

CCS, through the MCCDEC, has continued to identify skill certifications and technical skill assessments for occupational programs. Again this year, a list of third-party assessments and which assessments were actually being used by community colleges was shared with all colleges. Data was also reviewed to see if credentials received as a result of passing an assessment were being counted as an outcome for 2P1. MCCDEC and state staff also reviewed the validity and reliability of the data. These data were shared with the special population coordinators. In addition, CCS has an approval process whereby individual community colleges can submit proposed skill certifications and technical skill assessments for review. Faculty members that are curriculum experts in their field verify the validity and reliability of the assessments. A database of these assessments is maintained on the MCCNET website. The skill assessments for 1P1 are proposed for the duration of the Perkins State Plan for Career and Technical Education.

### **2. During the reporting year, did your state use Perkins funds to develop or enhance data systems to collect and analyze data on secondary and postsecondary academic and employment outcomes?**

Yes

#### Secondary

Data specific to participation in-, and progress through-, secondary CTE programs are collected through the Career and Technical Education Information System (CTEIS). Data from various other sources are matched into the CTEIS system to prevent duplicate data collections. Student demographic and exit status data were collected through an expansion of CTEIS to directly coordinate data matches with the Michigan Student Data System (MSDS), Student Record Maintenance, and Student History data systems through the Center for Educational Performance and Information (CEPI). Steps towards more fully automating processes both within CEPI and CTEIS are being reviewed and planned in the future.

External data coordination events for matched data for graduation data, student academic assessment data, and TSA data were ongoing activities. CTE student data was collected and extracted for matching processes with the state academic assessment system data and the graduate record system data. Student technical skill assessment data were collected from multiple assessment vendors and shared with OCTE based on data sharing agreements. TSA data that did not include accurate student identification data were processed using various data matching techniques on first and last name, middle initial, and cohort local identification to discover the students' districts. TSA directory data was then reflected back to districts for their review and correction of student identification information within CTEIS on a system level. This new process did produce markedly better student matches within CTEIS.

In all cases, external record-matching was finally carried out by linking records utilizing the student's current state Primary Unique Identification Code (UIC) utilizing a lookup and a de-duplication process. Data elements collected and incorporated into CTEIS from other systems were reflected back to districts via CTEIS to allow districts to review and correct data in their local source data systems prior to final data processing. Automated systems checked student identification and demographics against the state's master systems to ensure issues were reported to districts so they could work towards ensuring accurate and up-to-date information was submitted. Individual student records produced through the matching process were utilized to produce the ED Facts files

During 2013-14 OCTE continued support of a survey center to assist local districts to complete a follow-up survey of CTE student placement in employment, postsecondary education, or military. Additional data matching using CEPI's graduate record system was used to identify students who exited the reporting school year to allow districts to access accurate data listings for follow up surveys.

## Postsecondary

CCS, with input from MCCDEC, revised the local annual application this year to make it easier for community colleges to complete. The data collection website – MCCNET – was also updated and revised to make data submission a smoother process. CCS provides community colleges with detailed instructions and guidelines to use to measure the validity and reliability of the data submitted to the state. Edit checks are performed and year-to-year comparisons by community college are made to uncover any possible unreliable data. Colleges are contacted if data does not meet the criteria set forth in the instructions. MCCDEC reviews these data and offers recommendations to improve reliability and validity. In addition, community colleges have been very active in providing input, as well as data into the development of the K-20 Longitudinal Data System.

## Use of Funds: Part B

---

### 1. During the reporting year, how did your state assess the career and technical education programs funded under Perkins IV?

Secondary

The Career and Technical Education Information System (CTEIS), is a web application server driven database and hosts an individual student record system. The CTEIS is used to collect data on students in Career and Technical Education (CTE) programs and includes statewide, regional, and district-level performance outcomes. The CTEIS also has secure collaborative applications that allow sharing of data, information, and ideas between the Office of Career and Technical Education (OCTE) and districts, industry partners, and vendors. The collaborative tools are used for assessment and program specific tasks such as sharing student assessment data with district staff to validate, change, or update specific program or student identification information. The data collected in CTEIS allows us to systematically process state data to report measures for each special populations group and other breakout population groups; and to evaluate outcomes on each of the core performance indicators, as well as within specific CTE clusters, pathways, Classification of Instructional Program (CIP) codes, and programs.

Cluster, pathway, CIP code, and program specific information enables OCTE to target and focus technical assistance efforts at the regional, CEPD, and district level. In addition, local educational agencies (LEAs) maintain CTEIS data specific to the programs they operate. This enables them to specifically analyze data to the teacher, course, and student level to provide appropriate interventions for students, including those who are members of special population subgroups, who may be performing below the state performance levels. Individual student data provided to the state by each local educational agency (LEA) is reported at the aggregate level to and for each district, fiscal agency, CEPD, region, and the state (including each special population category) to aid in data analysis and evaluate performance at the local levels.

Another means of assessing funded programs is through the onsite monitoring of 20% of the 26 CTE regions each year. Based on a five year cycle, visits are made every year to recipients of Perkins funds to ensure compliance with state and federal laws in the areas of grant activity, submission of complete and accurate data, financial recordkeeping, and building level instructional program review. Additionally, Risk Analysis Factors are used to determine if it is necessary to perform an out-of-cycle targeted visit to any regions. During the Technical Review, Assistance and Compliance (TRAC) onsite monitoring process, for 2013-2014, five of the 26 Perkins regions were monitored for compliance with Perkins statutes, state laws, and policy. All non-compliance findings required corrective action as identified in a Compliance Plan submitted to, and approved by, OCTE.

Prior to each onsite visit, OCTE conducted a desk audit to determine "problem areas" for the regions to be visited, including review of such documents as core performance indicator (CPI) data, budget recaptures, single audit reports, previous end-of-year reports, and Michigan Department of Education (MDE) information regarding districts with CTE programs that did not make adequate yearly progress under the Elementary and Secondary Education Act (ESEA). The desk audit also included a review of local district CTE Program Self-Review Reports and improvement plans, whereby each region reviews a minimum of 20% of its state approved CTE programs and submits an annual report and improvement plan of corrective measures. Technical assistance is provided onsite, or in follow up communication, to assist the regions in any weak or noncompliant areas identified by the state or the region staff. CTE enrollment data, student demographic, and special populations characteristics, graduation status, state academic assessment, and technical skill assessment data were used to generate reports at multiple levels from state-level to consortia-level and at the individual program-level. Aggregate reports based on individual student data were provided to districts and the public via an interactive report generator which allowed analysis at the state, consortia, district, building, and program level, across years and for all students and special population student categories to aid in performance evaluations at the local level. Cluster, pathway, and program-specific information was used to target technical assistance efforts at the regional, CEPD, and district level. Local educational agencies (LEAs) also analyzed data at the teacher, course, and student level to evaluate programs and provide appropriate interventions for students, including those who were members of special population subgroups. Districts were also provided with trend data for each Core Performance Indicator and with interactive Tableau Dashboards to assist in drilling down through the data to analyze subgroup performance.

Michigan continued to monitor participating agencies for compliance with federal nondiscrimination legislation (Title VI of the Civil Rights Act of 1964, Title IX of the Education Amendments of 1972, Section 504 of the Rehabilitation Act of 1973, the Age Discrimination Act of 1975, and the Boy Scouts of America Equal Access Act of 2001, Title II of the Americans with Disabilities Act) to ensure equitable access for all students. During 2013-2014, ten agencies were reviewed, including one community college. Technical assistance was provided to 30 agencies as they completed Office of Civil Rights compliance plans.

The MDE has an internal monitoring coordination team. Membership includes representatives from all offices that

administer federal grant funds and conduct monitoring visits. The team shares projected onsite monitoring dates and schools to avoid duplicate visits or to streamline monitoring. Future plans are to share common monitoring findings across federal programs to inform statewide technical assistance needs and to find ways that offices can collaborate on financial/grant management training to schools to minimize future findings.

#### Postsecondary

Community College Services (CCS) within the division of Education and Career Success in Workforce Development Agency has a comprehensive internal monitoring system. Each year, the monitoring team schedules eight compliance and technical assistance on-site visits with the community colleges and select universities. CCS monitoring system consists of: onsite monitoring visits, review of the application process, data quality evaluation, and financial tracking mechanism. The outcomes from the Program Evaluations are reviewed by CCS staff for impact on the CPIs and the effectiveness and impact on student success. Each Program Evaluation includes feedback from students, faculty, administrators, and advisory groups. While eight colleges are reviewed on an annual basis, all colleges need to keep their online Program Evaluation Inventory current, indicating when programs are slated for evaluation during a four year cycle.

Data collection is done through a web-based system called the Michigan Community College (MCCNET) and is used to collect the core indicator data by individual program within each community college, four universities, and one tribal college. CCS uses these data to assess how well special population groups are doing as compared to total occupational students. This program-specific information allows CCS to focus technical assistance efforts at the program level based upon analysis of the data. Colleges are provided historical data for each of the core indicators as well as whether or not they have met the 90% threshold. Those that did not meet the 90% threshold, did not show improvement, or did not meet the standard are asked to modify their plans accordingly, to better focus on those programs that did not meet or exceed the expected levels of performance. Data is aggregated to the state level (including special population categories) and reported back to the colleges to aid data analysis and assess performance. CCS provides support of the Michigan Community College Data and Evaluation Committee (MCCDEC). The MCCDEC meets four times a year. The primary function of the MCCDEC is to advise CCS in all matters pertaining to data collection, reporting, and analysis, including local and statewide evaluation. MCCDEC began the process of reviewing current evaluation processes used by the various community colleges in order to possibly standardize evaluation methods throughout the state. The core indicators are central to this process. MCCDEC also reviewed all the core indicators last year (especially 1P1 and 2P1) in order to provide insight for the state as to why certain discrepancies occurred and why others may or may not have attained the expected level of performance. Recommendations were provided, instructions were updated, and some colleges re-ran and re-submitted their data based upon MCCDEC clarifications and recommendations. The committee also provides information regarding best practices for program and service improvement.

## **2. During the reporting year, how did your state develop, approve, or expand the use of technology in career and technical education?**

#### Secondary

Rapidly developing technologies are transforming the world and CTE programs. Highly technical, knowledge-based careers of the future are where current students will find jobs. Michigan has a process for encouraging local agencies to look to the future in delivering CTE through a new and emerging program application process. All state-approved CTE programs are required to have an active advisory committee of technical experts from local business and industry. These members provide valuable feedback on current technology and specific training needed in CTE instructional programs. This input helps all local programs to stay current and to be responsive to the needs of business and industry.

#### Postsecondary

The "TRENDS in Occupational Studies" Conference continues to provide a means for colleges to learn about the latest research, technology, and innovations in CTE. The 2014 TRENDS conference was held at the Grand Traverse Resort in Traverse City, Michigan. More than 454 faculty, administrators, and counselors participated in the conference, with over 96 separate workshops and 147 speakers. Keynote speaker, Dr. Rob Johnston, Founder and President, National Center for Inquiry & Improvement provided a unique perspective in working with community colleges to create and nurture a culture of inquiry and action on campus to improve student outcomes. Dr. Johnston discussed the evolution of collecting data to using the data to create insight and action. Additional speaker, Dr. Paul Hernandez, Director of The High School Turnaround Initiative, is a nationally recognized leader in community outreach and college access and success. This interactive presentation shared his personal story of being an 'at-risk' youth and how it influenced both his present and past work experiences as a faculty member. Dr. Hernandez shared how he learned ways to help people travelling through a similar path, and how his lessons learned and passion may help others to address the challenges faced by at-risk youth in rural and large cities.

CCS staff, as well as faculty and administrators on community college campuses, attend the annual Career Education Conference and a variety of specialized workshops on current trends and practices to enhance and improve their knowledge and technological skills in the classroom. CCS staff also actively participates in the routinely scheduled meetings of nine community college administrative organizations as regular guests and presenters to update members on current federal and state policies and procedures which govern the administration and implementation of occupational programs.

**3. During the reporting year, what professional development programs did your state offer, including providing comprehensive professional development (including initial teacher preparation) for career and technical education teachers, faculty, administrators, and career guidance and academic counselors at the secondary and postsecondary levels? On what topics?**

Secondary

During 2011, MDE organized a professional learning workgroup to review and update its professional learning policy and standards. The resulting guidance document outlines quality indicators of professional learning and the roles of various stakeholder groups in designing, implementing, and supporting high quality professional learning. CTE professional development activities are being designed and implemented consistent with the revised standards and quality indicators.

Michigan requires that all CTE programs be taught by teachers with appropriate teaching certificates to receive funding. CTE curriculum consultants work continuously with the MDE Office of Professional Preparation (OPPS) to update teacher preparation standards in CTE areas, as well as to assist revising requirements for CTE certification and work experience rules.

Two teacher education preparation grants were awarded to two public universities that prepare and recommend high quality pre-service teachers for vocational certification. These institutions also provide support to practicing teachers through inservices, conferences, and other training opportunities. Grant requirements included the recipients' presentations of outcomes and information at the Michigan Career Education Conference or a related professional development program. Evaluations generated by these activities were good. Conference attendees and grant recipients appreciated the exchange of information and ideas.

Comprehensive professional development was provided on an ongoing basis to administrators through OCTE state meetings, including the Fall OCTE Update, the Winter Perkins Grant Dissemination and Closing the Achievement Gap workshop, meetings of the Statewide Articulation committee, and the Spring OCTE Update meeting. Attendance has been consistently strong and reflected collaborative efforts between secondary and postsecondary partners.

OCTE staff provides support and works closely with counselor professional development associations to assure that ongoing professional development is provided to school guidance counselors. During 2013-14, OCTE worked with the counselor professional associations to support their Fall and Spring conferences, including issues related to earning academic credit in CTE programs, the Michigan College Access Network, and the counselor certification. Staff also works in collaboration with the Michigan Occupational Special Populations Association (MOSPA) and multiple program specific teacher associations. The Michigan Comprehensive Guidance and Counseling Program has been replaced by the National School Counselor Association Standards. In addition, the counselor listserv is frequently used to disseminate national, state, and/or local information to counselors.

Throughout the year, state staff collaborates with CTE professional organizations and CTE teacher organizations to provide comprehensive professional development at statewide conferences, through website resources, summer institutes, and program specific events. Through a state leadership grant, an additional competitive grant provides for expertise and services in:

- Locating and evaluating national and industry standards relevant to and related to high-quality CTE programs and CTE program development
- Developing and managing a web portal (Navigator) that disseminates information to state CTE programs about state-approved program standards, CTE curriculum resources, and CTE program evaluation tools
- Facilitating CTE program-improvement technical assistance
- Providing state-of-the-art communication and training capacity

OCTE continued to work closely with the Michigan Career Placement Association (MCPA) to coordinate statewide work-based learning sessions for the 2013-14 school year. Support was provided through attendance at MCPA Executive Board meetings and providing technical assistance and resources to this association specifically related to work-based learning for students in state approved career and technical education programs.

The Administrative Guide for Career and Technical Education in Michigan, designed for use by CTE administrators,

includes resources and information targeted for use by those filling this role. This guide includes an explanation of the appropriate use of secondary Perkins funds, a variety of resources, and gives detailed requirements for approved career and technical education programs. The document can be reviewed on the OCTE website: [www.michigan.gov/octe](http://www.michigan.gov/octe). It is continuously updated to reflect current initiatives, policies, and procedures.

The Michigan Career Education Conference continues to provide a statewide forum for over 600 educators, administrators, counselors, and business partners. The 2014 conference theme, Career and Technical Education: Learning that Works for Michigan, emphasized the shared goals of educators and other stakeholders to help students acquire necessary academic and technical skills, while helping them to understand how and why these skills are relevant for students in their future careers and in support of the Michigan economy.

Professional development is a continuous effort involving all staff in the OCTE. On an annual basis, professional development is provided to new and current CTE administrators, new CTE teachers, teachers of specific career clusters, data staff, grant administrators, counselors, and special populations coordinators. OCTE promotes professional development through career and technical student organizations and professional associations affiliated with each career pathway.

In partnership with the U.S. Department of Labor-Office of Apprenticeship, Michigan Economic Development Corporation, and the Workforce Development Agency, OCTE supports formal, long-term education and training commitments. Apprenticeship programs are federally recognized with business occupational registered standards and signed apprenticeship agreements that outline education and training activities, timelines, and wages. The apprenticeship initiative was formed to assist in addressing specific program barriers with the goal of increasing apprenticeship opportunities throughout the state. OCTE staff meets with representatives from the statewide apprenticeship group to strengthen communication and linkages.

#### Postsecondary

In addition to the technical assistance described in the above section, CCS provides opportunities for colleges through the Curriculum Development, Assessment & Evaluation, and Professional Development (CAP) Leadership Grants. These grants subsidize the cost for occupational faculty, career guidance, academic counselors, and occupational administrators to participate in activities that allow them to stay current with the needs, expectations, latest technology, and methods of industry. Furthermore, special professional development services are provided through consortium projects for Michigan apprenticeship instructors and coordinators through the Michigan Educator's Apprenticeship and Training Association (MEATA) annual meeting. Postsecondary special population coordinators and advisors received support from CCS to attend the 2014 Michigan Occupational Special Population Association's (MOSPA) State Conference. The conference provided opportunities for secondary and postsecondary coordinators to build linkages and address the needs of special populations' students transitioning from secondary to postsecondary institutions.

#### **4. During the reporting year, how did your state provide preparation for non-traditional fields in current and emerging professions, and other activities that expose students, including special populations, to high skill, high wage occupations?**

##### Secondary

Michigan employs an equity education consultant to facilitate and support continued advocacy for increased enrollment in nontraditional CTE programs. Perkins nontraditional program areas have been identified, reflecting current state program CIP codes and labor market changes. During the OCTE Civil Rights compliance reviews, data analysis and monitoring protocol includes access to programs for nontraditional students. OCTE houses the MDE Title IX coordinator, who provides resources to LEAs. OCTE also supports the Michigan Occupational Special Populations Association professional organization addressing all SPOPS, including nontraditional.

The Michigan Breaking Traditions Award program provides an avenue to recognize and encourage student achievement in nontraditional training and provides role models for other students considering a nontraditional career. In 2013-2014, 21 outstanding Michigan secondary students pursuing nontraditional training were recognized. Parents, teachers, counselors, and students joined with the OCTE staff to recognize the unique achievements of these students.

A member of the OCTE staff attended the 2014 National Alliance for Partnerships in Equity (NAPE) conference to help stay current on these critical issues.

##### Postsecondary

CCS made concerted efforts to support continued preparation of students for nontraditional training and employment and for programs leading to high-skill, high-wage, or high-demand careers. This has become criteria for state approval of

occupational programs. The CAP grant allowed community colleges to undertake activities, beyond those under the basic grant that would increase nontraditional enrollment and completion. Special population coordinators reviewed assessment procedures and examined strategies for enrolling and retaining special population students in nontraditional career areas. CCS continued to provide direction and support for the Michigan Postsecondary Special Populations Council (MPSSPC), which provides leadership and opportunities for collaboration. Workshops are designed for the improvement of student success within the community college system. Additionally, the MPSSPC affords Special Population coordinators opportunities for professional development and the sharing of strategies in the development, administration, delivery, and advocacy regarding the Perkins/special populations grant. MPSSPC sponsored a pre-conference workshop prior to the 2014 TRENDS Conference. The workshop, for focused on supporting special population professionals' efforts to better recruit and retain every student and increase underrepresented student program participation in STEM courses and programs of study.

**5. During the reporting year, how did your state provide support for programs for special populations that lead to high skill, high wage and high demand occupations?**

Secondary

OCTE staff provided technical assistance to help regional leadership teams better understand and utilize the data that is available at the regional, CEPD and local district level. Utilizing our data more effectively allows local leaders to target their intervention strategies for more effective outcomes. The State Superintendent and the State Board of Education have examined student performance data and have resolved to place a focus on the achievement gap that exists for historically disadvantaged students – particularly African American males. To that end, MDE is creating a comprehensive, coordinated strategy to eliminate the achievement gap that supports districts and schools and establishes regular measurements to monitor progress locally and statewide. The goals include: expose the racial achievement gap and the systemic factors that perpetuate it, explore courageous conversations about race in ways that will engage, sustain, and deepen authentic understanding and meaningful action, and cultivate a statewide framework that will enable each stakeholder to depart from the status quo.

OCTE implemented regional improvement plans and supported strategies that focus on African American males, but also that promotes the same equity for all special populations groups. School professionals that work with special populations received support through state-sponsored technical assistance and professional development activities, MOSPA sponsored workshops, and seminars for student support personnel within local programs. Through Michigan's Comprehensive Guidance and Counseling Program, students received assistance in career assessment, career exploration, and preparation of an education development plan, work-based learning opportunities, cooperative education, and academic support services. The ability to disaggregate core performance indicator data by special population category enables local districts to focus student support activities and, thereby, improve services. To assist districts in serving nontraditional students, state staff supported professional development and technical assistance for counselors and special population coordinators at the Career Education Conference and the MOSPA Conference. In addition, information and materials are continuously disseminated throughout the year via a counselor and special populations list serves. OCTE is collaboratively working with the MDE Office of Special Education and school district personnel to implement strategies that will more accurately describe CTE programs for students, parents and school personnel. A more accurate description of programs, required entry level competencies and skills, specific industry factors related to the program, and program-work environment related factors will help facilitate decisions regarding the appropriate placement of special education students in CTE programs and the supports and services needed to help students to be successful.

Postsecondary

CCS has included the components of high skill, high wage, and high demand as part of state program approval for occupational programs and as a required component of all program evaluation that occurs at the college level. Special population needs must be addressed with both state program approval and as part of any program evaluation. Additionally, CCS provides in-service workshops and technical assistance to colleges on high skill, high wage, and high demand programs as they relate to special populations within individual community colleges. Additional support is provided by the postsecondary unit of MOSPA and MPSSPC. Workshop sessions at the MOSPA 2014 Annual Conference provided information and strategies to assist occupational faculty ensure that the needs of special population students are well served at the postsecondary levels and are prepared for high skill, high wage, and high demand occupations. The "Hot Topics: Postsecondary" session provided an overview of current post-secondary issues and provided an opportunity for professionals to network. One of the Hot Topic presentations focused on "Accessible Technology and Online/Software Resources for Students with Disabilities. This workshop presented alternative/accessible electronic texts instead of hard copy texts as an option for students with a print disability. Special population personnel are represented on each of the CCS task forces and advisory committees. These community college personnel join CCS to plan for expanded exemplary services and programs. Their representation ensures that the needs of special population students will be identified and that appropriate programs and services will be developed and/or enhanced. Although CCS is uniquely placed within the Workforce Development Agency, Division of Education and

Career Success, its physical location provides opportunities to partner and/or coordinate services with other programs in and out of WDA. The placement of CCS allows for state and local coordination of services with the Office of Adult Learning, Commission for the Blind, Michigan Rehabilitation Services, Adult Education, the King-Chavez Parks Initiative, and all U.S. Department of Labor sponsored workforce programs. CCS was instrumental in assisting special population coordinators create a community college specific administrative organization (MPSSPC) to help coordinate supportive services and professional development opportunities across community college campuses and the state.

## **6. During the reporting year, how did your state offer technical assistance for eligible recipients?**

### Secondary

Technical assistance is a continuous effort involving all staff in the OCTE and occurs through phone calls and e-mail communication on a daily basis. Technical assistance is also provided through annual meetings with new and current CTE administrators, new CTE teachers, teachers of specific career cluster areas in specific regions, data staff, grant administrators, counselors, and special populations coordinators.

Technical assistance also focused on data use, specifically, subgroup analysis, including by special populations categories and race by gender. Technical assistance in support of data quality was provided through in-person trainings across the state as well as through semi-monthly conference calls with data entry staff. Monthly webinars were offered to provide technical assistance on implementing state technical skill assessments.

A project supported by OCTAE Customized Technical Assistance to States Technical Assistance to States culminated in a workshop on Strategies for Data Reporting to Support CTE Programs. The goals of the workshop were to obtain feedback from local districts and colleges on the types of data and reports that would be most useful for program improvement. The workshop included state staff from: secondary and postsecondary Perkins program offices, the Center for Educational Performance and Information, labor market information staff and workforce development staff and representatives from secondary and postsecondary local agencies/institutions. Recommendations from the workshop and research included: 1) refine the questions to be answered by analyzing data and 2) obtain more in-depth feedback on the content and format of reports needed. During 2013-14 OCTE and Community College Services staff held several internal meetings to plan follow up workshops in 2015 to investigate these issues further, with the intent to implement reports to better meet program improvement needs by the end of 2015. A challenge has been finding the time to continue this important project.

### Postsecondary

Since community colleges are independent and governed by local boards, CCS continues to provide technical assistance services as referenced earlier, but often provides such services on an individual basis, at numerous conferences and in services held throughout the year, (TRENDS, Career Education Conference, MOSPA Conference, New Dean's Orientation, and Annual Data Workshop). In addition to planned compliance and technical assistance visits on community college campuses, daily technical assistance is provided by CCS staff through telephone and electronic communications. In order to expand the base of support for all students in Michigan community college occupational education programs, technical assistance is provided through the Adult Learning Annual Conference, regional meetings, and the Michigan Workforce Development Annual Meeting. Administrative updates and technical assistance is also provided through the five regularly scheduled MODAC, MOSPA, and MPSSPC meetings.

## **7. Serving individuals in state institutions**

### **Part I: State Correctional Institutions**

#### **Amount of Perkins funds used for CTE programs in state correctional institutions:**

\$222,289

#### **Number of students participating in Perkins CTE programs in state correctional institutions:**

2,077

#### **Describe the CTE services and activities carried out in state correctional institutions.**

Michigan serves incarcerated youth through the Department of Human Services, Bureau of Juvenile Justice, by supporting an instructor at the Maxey Training School. Approximately 26 students received instruction in Graphic Arts, Building Trades, Business, and Cosmetology during the 2013-14 year. Michigan also awarded funds to the Department

of Corrections to serve incarcerated adults. The Perkins funds supported program improvement by updating textbooks used by the Building Trades program, purchasing new textbooks for the Food Technology program, providing professional development to business education technology instructors, and purchasing computers for the CTE programs. Due to the continuous movement of prisoners, only an average number of prisoners (2,051) enrolled in career and technical education programs can be provided at this time.

## **Part II: State Institutions Serving Individuals with Disabilities**

**Amount of Perkins funds used for CTE programs in state institutions serving individuals with disabilities:**

\$0

**Number of students participating of Perkins CTE programs in institutions serving individuals with disabilities:**

0

**Describe the CTE services and activities carried out in institutions serving individuals with disabilities.**

Not Applicable

**8. During the reporting year, did your state use Perkins funds to support public charter schools operating career and technical education programs?**

Yes

All eligible charter schools are invited to participate in developing the annual grant application and to participate in the Perkins regional grant activities. To increase charter school participation, OCTE has a requirement that CTE Perkins grant applicants must document their efforts to include all educational agencies that want to operate CTE programs or have students who want to enroll in CTE programs in the planning and availability of services

**9. During the reporting year, did your state use Perkins funds to support family and consumer sciences programs?**

No

**10. During the reporting year, did your state use Perkins funds to award incentive grants to eligible recipients for exemplary performance or for use for innovative initiatives under Sec. 135(c)(19) of Perkins IV?**

No

**11. During the reporting year, did your state use Perkins funds to provide career and technical education programs for adults and school dropouts to complete their secondary school education?**

No

**13P. During the reporting year, did your state use Perkins funds to provide assistance to individuals who have participated in Perkins assisted services and activities in continuing their education or training or finding appropriate jobs?**

No

## Use of Funds: Part C

---

### 1. During the reporting year, how did your state provide support for career and technical education programs that improve the academic and career and technical skills of students through the integration of academics with career and technical education?

#### Secondary

Annually, OCTE provides a variety of technical assistance activities and guidance on the National Career Cluster standards and the academic standards embedded within CTE program standards. Teachers are asked to complete a gap analysis of their curriculum against the state CTE and academic standards. This process helps local districts assess strengths and weaknesses in the local curriculum to strengthen the CTE program of study. This will ensure quality programs for students using employer endorsed national technical standards, as well as a focus on the academic content that may be earned within those programs.

Each year, OCTE awards two Excellence in Practice (EIP) Awards. The Career and Technical Education Program Excellence in Practice Award recognizes successful, exemplary state-approved CTE programs that demonstrate outstanding outcomes, produces measurable results, and leads to documented success in employment or postsecondary education/training. The Career and College Readiness Initiative Excellence in Practice Award recognizes outstanding practices, programs, or services that demonstrate exemplary support of career/college planning for students (that include their interests, abilities, and skills), promotion of high academic expectations, and linking secondary course taking (including CTE) to preparation for postsecondary education and careers. The EIP Awards are awarded annually at the Michigan Career Education Conference.

Many Michigan CTE students have expanded their learning while still in high school due to the opportunity for dual enrollment in postsecondary institutions in academic, as well as occupational, coursework. Dual enrollment legislation has recently been revised to allow students in grades 9-12 to participate and to take up to 10 college courses before leaving high school. OCTE provides guidance to secondary and postsecondary partners to refine and develop articulated programs for students to have a seamless transition from secondary to postsecondary, as well as help with utilizing resources so that programs are available to more students. OCTE is able to report that each year more of the secondary CTE programs in Michigan have articulated agreements with the community colleges.

Recent legislative changes have enable more options for students to use CTE programs to meet certain graduation requirements. Students can substitute a science credit and a year of foreign language instruction by completing a CTE program.

To remove barriers to curriculum integration, Michigan has developed guidelines for awarding academic credit through CTE, humanities, and other courses. Governor Rick Snyder, State Superintendent Mike Flanagan, and the Michigan State Board of Education support flexibility in education with rigorous expectations. School districts are encouraged to provide opportunities for students to receive rigorous instruction “any time, any place, anyway, and any pace” and to move away from traditional courses and seat time measures.

The legislature also passed a law that requires school districts to notify students that CTE instruction in an available option. A website repository of CTE best practices has also been required.

New and emerging high school programs such as mechatronics, pre-engineering, alternative energy, and other STEM areas have begun to expand. School districts continue to be interested in starting Early/ Middle Colleges. These schools are unique in that they are five year programs that require a three-way partnership between secondary, postsecondary, and business and industry. Students earn a high school diploma and an associate degree or certificate upon completion. Michigan now has 72 early/middle colleges operating across the state.

#### Postsecondary

CCS continues to support and market early college credit earning opportunities through the various programs that support articulated credit, dual enrollment, and direct credit in postsecondary institutions in academic and occupational course offerings. In support of this effort, CCS awarded funds to Northwestern Michigan College for the development of the Northwest Michigan Developer Consortium. This initiative focused on a community college entry level software developer training program. While this project did not achieve the initial goal of shared curriculum and programming, it made substantial impact to the value and quality of software development curriculum at three community colleges, Grand Rapids Community College, West Shore Community College, and Northwestern Michigan College. Northwestern Michigan College was able to mature their developer program into a significant initiative to supporting DOL Registered

Apprenticeship and is collaborating with the local Michigan Works! office. Grand Rapids Community College has plans to implement the apprenticeship program and has leveraged the NMC model to integrate certifications into their curriculum. The project also enhanced GRCC's relationship with local workforce development and employers. West Shore Community College used the project as an opportunity to revise their entire CIS program, defining a new direction and creating new content.

In 2012-13, Delta College, Grand Rapids Community College, Lansing Community College, Montcalm Community College, and Mott Community College were awarded a grant through CCS to outline a process whereby community college automotive programs would articulate occupational college courses with similar courses across the state. The goal was to give students the option to attend community colleges with similar automotive CTE programs with no or minimal loss of credit or repetition. The initiative was completed and an articulation agreement was signed by all five college Presidents. Additional funding was provided in 2013-14 for the development of a procedures manual which can be used by other occupational programs within the state which have a desire to complete a program to program articulation between colleges.

**2. During the reporting year, how did your state support partnerships among local educational agencies, institutions of higher education, adult education providers, and, as appropriate, other entities, such as employers, labor organizations, intermediaries, parents, and local partnerships, to enable students to achieve state academic standards, and career and technical skills.**

Secondary

The closest partners to achievement are within MDE offices that work on school reform, school improvement, and academic assessment. OCTE also works closely with many external partners to promote positive learning opportunities for students. Some of those partners include the Michigan Occupational Deans Administrative Council (MODAC), the MEATA, the Michigan Apprenticeship Steering Committee, and many professional associations that support CTE teachers. OCTE works in coordination with these partners to assure that students are adequately supported for success in rigorous academic standards and the completion of grades 9 through 14 programs of study (POS).

OCTE continues to update the Green Initiatives and CTE website to include a variety of STEM grant funding opportunities, resources leading to renewable energy careers, and community colleges' role in preparing students for the "Green Workforce". The OCTE STEM consultant is participating in the statewide Michigan Energy Workforce Development Consortium to review programs needs. In addition, the STEM consultant is working with emerging program to develop environmental engineering programs. Both the OCTE Director and STEM consultant continue to serve on the State Green Partnership Team to locate various opportunities, industry trends, and workforce development programs in the Green and Energy Efficient Industries.

The Advisory Committee Tool Kit contains information that was put together to help facilitate communication and avoid pitfalls that can occur when working with business and industry. This publication contains guidelines and recommendations for secondary CTE Program Advisory Committees as they work to improve CTE programs. The Tool Kit contains common definitions, a general process to follow, and issues to consider to make the best use of these community, business, and industry resources. The Tool Kit is available electronically on the OCTE website.

OCTE created and updated a Parents as Partners Toolkit for many years and housed it on the OCTE website. Now that the information in the toolkit has been merged with that of the MDE parent site, there is one main place on the MDE website for parents, schools, and districts to access information and research resources. The site is called Collaborating for Success—Parent Engagement Toolkit. The site is also offered in Spanish and Arabic. [www.michigan.gov/mde](http://www.michigan.gov/mde).

Postsecondary

CCS is strategically placed within the workforce agency within Michigan's state government structure. CCS reports to the Education and Career Success division, State of Michigan Workforce Development Agency. By its location, CCS actively attends educational advisory groups addressing the needs for collaborative relationships between the colleges, community members, and local business members. CCS, through its relationships with its sister administrative agencies in other state departments, also continues to support different events that bring together education, business, and local communities such as the Governor's Education Summit and the Michigan Breaking Through Learning Network. CCS continues to showcase "Best Practices" that focus on innovative and creative ways to bring education, community, and employers together through exemplary programs especially sponsored or supported through the Perkins Act initiatives and practices. Some of these "Best Practices" can be found on the MCCNET website.

**3. During the reporting year, did your state use Perkins funds to improve career guidance and academic counseling programs?**

Yes

Secondary

Efforts are made, on an ongoing basis, to support career guidance and academic counseling programs. During the year, support is provided by working with CTE regions on specific guidance and counseling activities within their grant applications. In addition, OCTE staff works with the counselor professional associations and staff attend and present at other events, conferences, and in-services. A web page solely addressing the needs of school counselors has been created on the MDE website. Guidelines for the Use of Educational Development Plans is a document developed to assist school districts implement Educational Development Plans (EDPs), which are a requirement within school law. In addition, OCTE developed a webpage dedicated to resources to support CTE decision makers. The website contains information and resources for district and CTE educators, school counselors, parents, students and others on College and Career Information, Data Use for Program Improvement, Labor Market Information, What other State are doing and Links to related web pages.

Postsecondary

Numerous in-service and technical support workshops were held with different employees at the colleges that support career guidance and academic counseling programs, including the TRENDS in Occupational Studies Conference and the MOSPA Conference. In-service workshops sponsored by the MPSSPC and CAP Leadership grant eligibility includes and allows counselors and academic advisers to participate in professional development activities. These professional development opportunities are necessary to assist special population coordinators to become and remain current in research, services, and laws that apply to special population students. In order to ensure that special population students are receiving appropriate services as designated by law, each student must have an EDP to help them achieve their goals.

**4. During the reporting year, did your state use Perkins funds to establish agreements, including articulation agreements, between secondary school and postsecondary career and technical education programs to provide postsecondary education and training opportunities for students?**

Yes

Secondary

OCTE has continued its efforts to support linkages between secondary and postsecondary agencies to ensure that students transition without gaps or overlap in instruction, from the secondary to the postsecondary program of study through an articulation agreements and content alignment. OCTE has required POS for several years through locally-developed "articulated" program agreements where postsecondary credit earned in high school is held in "escrow" until the student arrives at the postsecondary institution. These agreements are reviewed annually.

In 2014, OCTE launched a web page with information to assist secondary and postsecondary partners to develop statewide articulation agreements, based on a series of statewide meetings in 2012 and 2013. The website also provides links to the statewide articulation agreements that have been developed at five postsecondary institutions. Additionally OCTE served as a cosponsor for the first annual Michigan Concurrent Enrollment Conference: Creating Successful College Credit Opportunities for Michigan High School Students and sent a representative to the National Alliance for Concurrent Enrollment Partnerships national conference to gather information on increasing concurrent enrollment for CTE students. During 2014 a planning group met several times to plan a statewide credit agreement workshop to be held in 2015. Strategies for tracking articulated credit for individual students was investigated during the workshop facilitated as part of the technical assistance provided by OCTAE.

Michigan continues to support schools interested in designing and developing Early/Middle College (E/MC) schools. The goal is to support E/MC high schools and programs that will increase student achievement by collaborating with postsecondary institutions. These specialized schools provide students the opportunity to graduate from the E/MC with training in a marketable occupation, a high school diploma, and/or a certificate or degree from a community college or state public university. Michigan has 19 E/MC schools, 52 E/MC programs, and several more districts interested in planning for the future.

In addition to E/MC schools, Michigan has 12 enhanced dual enrollment systems. Michigan has two dual enrollment laws—one for academic courses and one for CTE courses. These two laws have recently been revised to allow students

in grades 9-12 to take up to 10 college courses while in high school. In addition, non-credit industry certification training at the community college is also allowed in the revised laws.

Postsecondary

As part of Perkins requirements, community colleges throughout the state continue to establish articulation agreements with their local partners (secondary schools) to implement Programs of Study. These agreements afford secondary students the opportunity to enter into occupational programs, take classes while in high school, receive dual enrollment credits, and upon graduation from high school, enter college and work towards certification, an Associate's Degree, or transfer to a four-year institution.

**5. During the reporting year, did your state use Perkins funds to support initiatives to facilitate the transition of sub baccalaureate career and technical education students into baccalaureate programs?**

Yes

Postsecondary

Each of Michigan's 28 public community colleges has one or more campus-based university extension programs. Some even have separate facilities that house four year university programs so that students can dual enroll in two-year and four-year POS. Four public universities, Ferris State University, Northern Michigan University, Lake Superior State University, and Michigan Technological University receive Perkins funds and offer associate degrees in occupational programs in their respective communities and afford students the opportunity to transition and continue their program of study at the community college to receive a baccalaureate degree. Community colleges are also expanding the number of articulation agreements with universities. Ferris State has articulation agreements with almost all of the community colleges within the state.

**6. During the reporting year, did your state use Perkins funds to support career and technical student organizations?**

Yes

Secondary

OCTE supports six Career and Technical Student Organizations (CTSOs) through modest grant funding and technical assistance. Semi-annual meetings with all directors and ongoing communication with the respective CTE program consultants, as well as assistance to field instructors and administrators, helps ensure that all students in state-approved CTE programs have the opportunity to develop strong leadership skills. The organizations vigorously recruit new members, strongly support academic excellence, and give special attention to students with unique needs. These priorities are hallmarks of the CTSSO. Various types of support are explored and provided.

Competitive events promote win/win opportunities as students work at their own pace toward set goals. Events designed for student teams showcase the diverse talents of all participants. Many activities aim at improving problem solving and job seeking skills. Student leadership is a critical and necessary part of the career and technical education curricula in all clusters. Although not mandated, many instructors utilize the CTSSO to meet the leadership component of state approved CTE programs. Students take a written test prior to skill competition so that competitive activities may be configured to include special populations, promote academic rigor, and help all students grow into their personal best.

**7. During the reporting year, did your state use Perkins funds to support career and technical education programs that offer experience in, and understanding of, all aspects of an industry for which students are preparing to enter?**

Yes

Secondary

Michigan CTE programs must provide students with a strong experience in all aspects of the industry. Students need to have technical skills, but also need a comprehensive understanding of the industry that they are preparing to enter. Approved CTE programs must include the array of occupations and careers that comprises an industry, from the most basic to the most advanced. Curriculum must include principles of technology, labor and community issues, health and safety issues, and environmental issues related to such industry. Students should be able to demonstrate knowledge of

the planning, management, finances, technical, and production skills for the industry relating to the program. All programs incorporate state and/or national level industry-related skill standards.

All instruction must include emphasis on the new skills that employees of the future will need. Academic studies focus on the mathematics, communications skills (reading and writing), and sciences, in the context of the students' career cluster, using an applied or contextual approach. Curriculum content incorporates community issues related to the industry, environmental issues raised, economic issues, finance, health issues, labor issues, leadership/management, safety, technological skills, marketing, and underlying principles of technology. All aspects of the industry are available to all students in approved CTE programs, regardless of future education and employment plans.

#### Postsecondary

CCS actively provides support to the MEATA and the Office of Apprenticeship and Training. Both organizations help educate and support students in the skilled trades and during their internships. MEATA helps coordinate the development and provision of apprenticeship and training through research, leadership, and innovative practice by workforce organizations, collaborating community colleges, and economic development partners. Annual meetings bring these partners together to share innovations and practices to improve employee training. Within the WDA, CCS is also an active partner in many work-based initiatives whereby student internship and work related opportunities are sponsored and promoted.

#### **8. During the reporting year, did your state use Perkins funds to support partnerships between education and business, or business intermediaries, including cooperative education and adjunct faculty arrangements at the secondary and postsecondary levels?**

Yes

#### Secondary

The MDE supports work-based learning experiences, including career and technical capstone education, by working closely with the Michigan Career Placement Association (MCPA). This organization works collaboratively with OCTE to conduct one to two statewide work-based learning conferences during the school year. Additionally, pupil accounting rules have been promulgated to assure that requirements are met to align business and industry standards and provide quality educational opportunities for students. These rules indicate that all state and federal regulations will be followed.

Michigan has enacted The Postsecondary Enrollment Options Act [1996 PA 160] and the Career and Technical Preparation Act [2000 PA 258], that require school districts to support dual enrollment for pupils in grades 9-12, if certain requirements are met. Additionally, MDE encourages seamless transitions between secondary and postsecondary education by promoting dual enrollment and supporting early/middle college initiatives, as well as encouraging articulated credit and virtual learning for Michigan's students.

#### Postsecondary

Institutions that receive Perkins funds develop partnerships with business and industry in order to establish cooperative career education, work study, internships, externships, on-the-job training, and apprentice-ships with an emphasis on work-based learning. Additionally, individuals from business and industry participate on advisory boards to assist institutions in identifying skills and adopting strategies that enable students to overcome barriers faced for employment in high-skilled, high-wage and high-demand occupations that lead to self-sufficiency. Institutions also recruit individuals from business and industry as adjunct faculty for occupational programs. The partnership between business, industry, and educational institutions is essential to promote access to and success in occupational programs.

#### **9. During the reporting year, did your state use Perkins funds to support the improvement or development of new career and technical education courses and initiatives, including career clusters, career academies, and distance education?**

No

**10. During the reporting year, did your state use Perkins funds to provide activities to support entrepreneurship education and training?**

Yes

Secondary

The OCTE believes that expanding the availability of youth entrepreneurship education resources is a critical part of CTE. Since entrepreneurship programs have a proven track record of keeping students in school, each CTE program is encouraged to promote educational opportunities by using statewide standards for youth entrepreneurship education. Entrepreneurship programs are being monitored for quality by CTE staff. One of the curriculum segments in all Marketing programs is entrepreneurship. Each of the CTE programs in Michigan have curriculum standards dedicated to entrepreneurship education. These standards are part of the statewide testing initiative in these programs. CTE students also participate in entrepreneurial competitive events in CTSOs. Business partnerships continue to be stressed through a requirement that each program advisory committee must have a majority of their membership from the appropriate business and industry area.

MDE is working with the MEDC on joint activities to encourage entrepreneurship and entrepreneurial thinking in K-12 education. Michigan continues to be a member of the National Consortium for Entrepreneurship Education.

Postsecondary

Most of the institutions that receive Perkins funds have strengthened efforts to increase entrepreneurship on their campuses. The Entrepreneurial Center for Innovation and Development was developed as a strategy to accomplish this workforce development goal. Through the School of Continuing Education and Workforce Development, partnerships with business and industry in support of developing entrepreneurial opportunities have increased. Other institutions have developed entrepreneurial programs to encourage students to establish small business initiatives.

The WDA also promotes partnerships between education, business, and business intermediaries through funding alliances with WIA statewide dollars that promote entrepreneurship. Two examples are the Business Training Alliance (BTA) and the Agriculture and Food System Sector Alliance (AFSSA). The BTA coordinates with business and educators to offer community classes for entrepreneurs in Wexford and Missaukee Counties. The classes cover foundational business skills entrepreneurs need to succeed. The AFSSA convenes local and regional farmers, educators, businesses, government officials, and others to engage in a collaborative process to support and create jobs and enterprises throughout the regional farm and food system and to shape training and educational programs that support farm and food entrepreneurs and workers. More information on the BTA and AFSSA can be found at: <http://www.nwm.org/main-site/homepage.html>.

**11. During the reporting year, did your state use Perkins funds to improve the recruitment and retention of career and technical education teachers, faculty, administrators, or career guidance and academic counselors, and the transition to teaching from business and industry, including small business?**

Yes

Secondary

Two teacher education improvement grants were awarded to public universities that prepare and recommend high quality pre-service teachers for vocational certification. Michigan requires that all CTE programs be taught by teachers with specific and appropriate teaching certificates to receive federal and state funding. CTE teacher education institutions that received a Perkins grant were required to conduct activities that focused on the recruitment and retention of CTE teachers. These institutions also provided support to practicing teachers through inservices, conferences, and other training opportunities. OCTE is currently collaborating with the MDE, OPPS in the development of new processes for an alternate route to teacher certification and advanced level credentials. This year, grant requirements included that recipients conduct a presentation of outcomes and information at the Michigan Career Education Conference or a related program. Evaluations generated by these activities were good.

OCTE staff actively participated on the internal task force initiated by OPPS and on the Professional Standards Commission for Teachers (PSCT), whose primary focus was the development of framework for Michigan educator evaluations.

Postsecondary

Annually, postsecondary institutions that receive Perkins funds must include a plan that addresses the methods the college will use to improve, recruit, and retain CTE teachers, faculty and career guidance and academic counselors, including groups underrepresented in the teaching profession in their annual application. The college's methods must also include a plan that addresses how individuals from business and industry will be supported through the transition to teaching. A few of the methods used by community colleges to advertise and recruit qualified applicants are through: newspapers (local, regional, state, and national), mailing lists (hard copy and electronic), professional journals, national publications, and at recruitment conferences. In order to retain qualified faculty from business and industry in making the transition to teaching, colleges have held new faculty orientations, developed faculty development curriculum, provided mentoring by pairing new faculty with experienced faculty, and provided professional development opportunities at conferences, meetings, and other relevant workshops.

**12. During the reporting year, did your state use Perkins funds to support occupational and employment information resources?**

# Program Improvement Plans

---

## Extension Requested?

No

## Required Program Improvement Plans

Your state has met at least 90% of the state adjusted level of performance for all core indicators of performance. You do not need to provide state program improvement plans.

## Local Program Improvement Plans

Michigan has 26 regional eligible recipients for CTE funds. Local Improvement Plans will be required for regions as indicated below:

Indicator/Number of eligible recipients that did not meet 90% of target:

1S1/12; 1S2/17; 2S1/23; 3S1/0; 4S1/0; 5S1/0; 6S1/6; 6S2/8

Only one of the 26 regions met 90% of the target for all eight indicators. The number of regions not meeting the 90% threshold improved for indicator 1S2 (from 23 to 17) compared to the previous year. The number of regions meeting the 90% threshold worsened for indicators 1S1 (9 to 12), 2S1 (0 to 20), and for 6S2 (3 to 6) compared to last year while the number of regions meeting the 90% target remained the same for indicators 3S1 (remained at 0), 4S1 (remained at 0), 5S1 (remained at 0), and 6S1 (remained at 6) compared to last year.

A determination of disaggregated categories of students for whom there were disparities or gaps in performance compared to all CTE students will be made to assist regions in the development of Improvement Plans. Particular attention will be paid to the performance gaps across gender, race, and special population categories. The state of Michigan and 26 regions within it will be required to develop improvement plans with action steps, timelines, and staff responsible no later than March 1, 2015. Applications for funding for 2015-2016 are due April 1, 2015 and improvement plans must be consistent with the activities selected as part of these applications. On January 21st, 2015 a technical assistance training will be held for all regions statewide where data dashboards displaying CPIs will be shared. Apart from overall CPI performance the dashboards will allow the regions to examine their performance on the CPIs by gender, race, gender/race, and special population categories. Regions can develop actionable steps to improve CPI performance prior to the start of the of the next school year.

## Secondary Program Improvement Plans

1S1 – Academic Attainment Reading: The performance level for 2013-14 for this indicator was 51.8%, a decrease of 3.4 percentage points compared to 2012-13. 1S1 performance was less than the adjusted level of performance (ALP) of 55.8% but met the 90% threshold. This compares to a percent proficient rate of 59.0% for all students who took the reading Michigan Merit Exam (MME) in 2013-14. The MME is administered in the Spring of a student's junior year of high school. Therefore, the assessment scores reflect a student's academic attainment prior to completing, and sometimes prior to entering, the CTE program, where many of them thrive in learning CTE skills, as well as integrated reading and mathematics skills.

In 2013-14 there was a slight difference in 1S1 performance by gender with girls reading proficiency at 52.8% (within 90% of the ALP) versus boys reading proficiency at 50.9% (within 90% of the ALP). Differences in reading proficiency were also observed across race, with two race categories below 90% of ALP and the remaining five race categories meeting the 90% threshold of ALP. The two race categories that were below 90% of the ALP in reading proficiency were African-American students at 34.2% and Hispanic students at 41.7. The five race categories that were above 90% of the ALP in reading proficiency were Pacific Islander students at 61.1%, Asian students at 59.4%, Two or More Races students at 54.2%, white students at 54.1%, and Native American students at 50.5%. It should be noted that neither gender category had reading proficiency rates that exceeded the ALP of 55.8%. Of the race categories, only Pacific Islander students and Asian students exceeded the ALP. During the next professional development session to be held in January 2014, OCTE will share strategies for ameliorating gaps in performance by gender and race on 1S1.

1S2 – Academic Attainment Mathematics: The performance level for 2013-2014 for this indicator was 24.4%, a decrease of 0.7 percentage points compared to 2012-13. This compares to a percent proficient rate of 29.0% for all students who took the math Michigan Merit Exam (MME) in 2013-14. Performance on 1S2 did not meet Michigan's ALP of 27% but did meet the required 90% threshold. The cut score on the math portion of the MME was also increased by 20% in 2011 to reflect career and college ready expectations for Michigan students and the CPI target for this indicator was changed to match the AMO in the state ESEA waiver. The assessment scores reflect a student's academic attainment prior to

completing, and sometimes prior to entering, the CTE program, where many of them thrive in learning CTE skills, as well as integrated reading and mathematics skills.

In 2013-14 there was a difference in 1S2 performance by gender with girls' mathematics proficiency at 20.8% (below 90% of the ALP) and boys' mathematics proficiency at 27.8% (above the ALP). The gender differences in mathematics proficiency where boys perform at a higher level are in contrast to reading proficiency where girls perform at a higher level. The gaps in mathematics proficiency by race grew wider as compared to the gender gap. Four race categories were below 90% of ALP and two race category exceeded the ALP with regards to mathematics proficiency. The four race categories that were below 90% of the ALP in mathematics proficiency were African American students at 5.7%, Hispanic students at 14.9%, Native American students at 15.5%, and Two or More Races students at 18.2%. Asian Students and Pacific Islander students had a mathematics proficiency rate of 44.3% and 27.8% which exceeded the ALP. White students had a proficiency rate of 26.7% which was within 90% of the ALP.

**2S1 – Technical Skill Attainment:** For 2013-14, the performance level for this indicator was 42.5%, a decrease of 22.7% over the previous year. This performance level was well below Michigan's ALP of 55.5%. There were multiple reasons as to why the 2S1 rate for the state dropped. Firstly, the cut scores for two statewide assessments were increased in 2013-2014 compared to the cut scores from 2012-2013. In Accounting Advanced the cut scores were changed from 46.6% (2012-2013) to 70% (2013-2014) and Health Science was changed from 60% (2012-2013) to 70% (2013-2014). Changing the cut-scores for Accounting Advanced that is taken by students within the Finance cluster resulted in dropping the pass rate from 51.2% (2012-2013) to 3.6% (2013-2014). The cut score for the NOCTI Accounting Advanced assessment was changed to align with the cut score required by the National College Credit Recommendation Service (NCCRS) to recommend college credit. In Health Science the pass rate dropped from 78.5% (2012-2013) to 45.1% (2013-2014). Secondly, six new assessments were added in the areas of Automotive Electrical/Electronic Systems (pass rate 52.4%), Collision Repair (pass rate 53.2%), Medium/Heavy Truck (pass rate 50.0%), Marketing, Sales and Service (pass rate 23.6%), Radio and TV Broadcasting Technology (pass rate 28.5%), and Arts, A/V Technology and Communication (pass rate 12.0%). For all the six newly added assessments the statewide 2S1 rate did not exceed 90% of the ALP rate. The number of students who took technical skill assessments in the state increased from 12,536 students in 2012-13 to 16,118 students in 2013-14. 2S1 broken down by gender showed a difference between girls (40.1%) and boys (45.4%). 2S1 observed across race categories showed differences with African American students performing the lowest at 25.2% to White students performing the highest at 45.2%.

**3S1 – School Completion:** The performance level for 2013-14 for this indicator was 95.5%, compared to 95.3% in 2012-13. The 2013-2014 performance exceeds Michigan's adjusted level of performance of 95%. This indicator was computed using data for the cohort of students that entered ninth grade in 2008-09. The denominator includes all concentrators in the cohort year (expected four year graduation date) of 2011-2012. Boys completed school at a rate of 94.2% compared to girls who completed school at 96.9%. Students of all races also completed school higher than the 90% of ALP. Among the race categories students from two or more races had the highest school completion at 95.9% while Pacific Islander students had the lowest completion rate at 87.0%.

**4S1 – Student Graduation Rates:** The performance level for this indicator for was 95.9% which exceeds the ALP (95.0%). This measure was computed using data for the cohort of students that entered ninth grade in 2009-10. This compares to the 4-year graduation rate for all students of 76.96% in 2012-13. Both boys and girls graduated school at a rate greater than the ALP with girls completing school at a rate of 97.5% and boys completing school at a rate of 94.5%. Students of all races also graduated school higher than the ALP except for African-American students who were within 90% of the ALP at 94.8%. Among the race categories Pacific Islander students had the highest graduation rate at 100%.

**5S1 – Placement:** The performance level for this indicator for was 95.4%, a slight increase compared to the previous year, but just below the ALP (95.5%). The placement rate in Michigan has remained relatively constant around the 95.0% level for the last four years. The data indicated that 19 out of 20 CTE students in Michigan continued their postsecondary education or advanced training, or were in the military, or were employed which is significant given that Michigan's unemployment rate is still around 7.0%. Placement rate for both girls and boys was within 90% of the ALP with girls being placed at a rate of 95.4% and boys being placed at a rate of 94.3%. Gaps in the placement rate could be observed across the different race categories, with one race category below 90% of ALP, four within 90% of the ALP, and two exceeding the ALP. Placement rate for Pacific Islander students was lowest at 81.8%. The four race categories that were within 90% of the ALP in placement rate were Hispanic students at 91.6%, Native American students at 92.6%, African-American students at 92.8%, and students of two or more races at 95.1%. The two race categories that exceeded the ALP in placement rate were White students at 95.8% and Asian students at 98.5%.

**6S1 – Nontraditional Participation:** The performance level for this indicator was 26.8% an increase of 1.2 percentage points compared to 2012-2013. Michigan's performance on this indicator exceeded the ALP and has increased each year in the last five years. Michigan continues to work on increasing this indicator through the Breaking Traditions Award Program and a yearly workshop addressing strategies for improving nontraditional participation. All seven race categories participated in non-traditional programs at a rate higher than the ALP with a range of 25.4% for White students to 36.7% in

the case of African-American students.

6S2 – Nontraditional Completion: The performance level for this indicator was 29.2%, a decrease of .8 percentage points compared to the previous year. The nontraditional completion rate exceeded 90% of the ALP (30%). This is the first time in five years that Michigan's completion rate has decreased compared to the previous year. There was a large difference in 6S1 rates between boys and girls. Boys completed non-traditional CTE programs at a rate of 48.9% compared to girls who completed at a rate 29.0%. Even though the percentage difference between genders is apparent the number of boys in non-traditional programs statewide was only 47 compared to 4,498 girls in non-traditional programs statewide. Students from three of the race categories completed non-traditional programs at a rate higher than ALP (White students at 31.6%, Hispanic students at 33.3%, and students from two or more races at 34.9%), while the remaining students from the other four race categories were below 90% of the ALP (Pacific Islander students at 0.0%, Black students at 17.0%, Native American students at 21.6%, and Asian students at 25.0%).

Summary of the 90% Threshold: Michigan exceeded the targeted levels for four CPIs (3S1, 4S1, 6S1, and 6S2), met 90% of the adjusted level of performance for two CPIs (1S1, and 1S2), and was below the 90% adjusted level for one CPI (2S1). Statewide performance on four of the eight indicators (3S1, 4S1, 5S1, and 6S1) was better this year compared to 2012-2013. Statewide performance on four of the eight secondary indicators (1S1, 1S2, 2S1, and 6S2) declined this year compared to 2012-2013.

#### Improvement Plan Action Steps:

1. Review technical skill assessments for appropriate alignment to state program standards and will convene a referent group to recommend a more appropriate assessment for those found not to be aligned. (Spring 2015). Staff: Program and assessment staff.
2. Provide technical assistance to local programs as they develop their local improvement plans (Spring 2015). Staff: Perkins teams.
3. Prioritize use of Perkins funds in regional grant application activities targeted to improve technical skill attainment. (Fall 2014, Spring 2015). Staff: Perkins teams.

#### State's Performance Results for Special Populations

1S1 – Academic Attainment Reading: For this indicator, students in the special population categories of Students with Disabilities (22.3%), Economically Disadvantaged (41.8%), (Single Parents (28.6%), Migrant (33.3%), Nontraditional Enrollees (48.4%), and Limited English Proficient (11.2%), all achieved at a lower proficiency level than the entire CTE population (51.8%). Compared to last year the performance on reading proficiency increased for the special population category of Students with Disabilities (by 0.6%), but decreased across all other categories. Economically Disadvantaged decreased by 3.0%, Migrant by 16.7%, Single Parents by 5.5%, Nontraditional Enrollees by 2.8%, and Limited English Proficient by 2.6%. CTE special population students performed worse than similar students in the general population. For example, the rate of reading proficiency for all economically disadvantaged students was 43.0%, 19.0% for LEP students, and 24.0% for students with disabilities. In 2012-2013 the reading proficiency for CTE students within these same three special population groups was higher than similar students in the general population, however, this trend has switched in 2013-2014.

1S2 – Academic Attainment Mathematics: For this indicator, students in the special population categories of Students With Disabilities (4.7%), Economically Disadvantaged (13.7%), Single Parents (4.1%), Migrant (0.0%), Nontraditional Enrollees (16.6%), and Limited English Proficient (3.9%) all performed at a much lower proficiency level than the entire CTE population (24.4%). All special population categories were lower in their performance on mathematics proficiency compared to last year, Students With Disabilities by 0.2%, Economically Disadvantaged students by 0.8%, Single Parents by 3.2%, Migrant by 6.3%, Nontraditional students by 0.2%, and Limited English Proficient students by 3.6%. Compared to similar students in the general population, rates of math proficiency were slightly better for economically disadvantaged CTE students compared to all economically disadvantaged students (13.7% versus 13.0%, respectively). No comparison was made for Students with Disabilities and Limited English Proficient because percent proficient was lower than 10% among all students in these groups and therefore an actual percentage was not available for comparison.

2S1 – Technical Skill Attainment: Students in all special population categories performed below the state average (42.5%). The technical skill attainment for Students with Disabilities was 22.7%, Economically Disadvantaged students was 35.7%, Single Parents was 31.8%, Migrant was 25.0%, and Limited English Proficiency was 25.0%. The performance across all special population categories decreased on 2S1 this year (2013-2014) when compared to last year (2012-2013).

3S1 – School Completion: Students in special population categories completed school at a slightly lower rate than the

state average of 95.5%. However all special population categories performed within 90% of the ALP.

4S1 – Student Graduation: For this indicator, students in the special population categories of Students with Disabilities (87.6%), Economically Disadvantaged (94.1%), Single Parent (91.7%), and Limited English Proficient (92.6%) performed at a lower rate than the general CTE population (95.9%). Migrant students (100.0%) and Non-traditional Enrollee students (96.0%) graduated at a rate higher than the entire CTE student population. The rates for CTE special population students compare favorably to the four year graduation rate for similar students in the general population. CTE Students with Disabilities graduated at a rate 34.0% higher than the rate for all students. CTE Economically Disadvantaged students at a rate 30.2% higher, Limited English Proficient students at a rate 27.2% higher and Migrant students at a rate 29.5% higher than the rate for all students.

5S1 – Placement: For this indicator, students in the all special population categories performed at a lower rate than the general CTE population (95.4%) in Michigan. The placement rates for all sub-population categories except Single Parents (77.8%) was greater than 86.0% and were within the 90% adjusted level of performance.

6S1 – Nontraditional Participation: For this indicator, students in the special population categories of Students with Disabilities (19.3%) and Limited English Proficient students (20.8%) were less likely to participate in a program nontraditional for their gender than the general CTE population (26.8%), while students in the special population categories of Economically Disadvantaged (29.6%), Migrant (27.3%), and Single Parent (57.9%) were more likely to participate in a program nontraditional for their gender than the general CTE population. Nontraditional participation rate for all special population categories increased compared to the previous year.

6S2 – Nontraditional Completion: Students with Disabilities (1.1%) were more likely to complete a program nontraditional for their gender than were students in the general CTE population (29.2%), while students in the special population categories Economically Disadvantaged (27.9%), Limited English Proficient (22.2%), and Single Parent (26.1%) were less likely to complete a program nontraditional for their gender than students in the general CTE population. Given the small sample sizes of the special population categories in the nontraditional completion indicator it was not deemed appropriate to make comparisons across years.

Summary of Disparities: In general students within special population categories performed at a lower rate than the general CTE population, Special population groups performed especially poorly with regards to mathematics proficiency (1S2). Nontraditional students performed consistently with the general CTE population, typically within 75% to 90% of the general student performance for each indicator.

#### Improvement Plan (Special Populations)

OCTE reviews local recipient grant applications and final reports and provides technical assistance on the basis of a team structure. Four Perkins teams, comprised of OCTE staff, service six to seven regions of the state for CTE grants. In addition, a Perkins Leadership Team, comprised of representatives from each team, meets regularly to determine and recommend policy and procedures relating to CTE.

#### Action Steps

Review and analyze data reflecting the disparities in performance by disaggregated categories as compared to all CTE students and any other information which may identify areas of the state, student populations, etc., indicating gaps in performance as compared to that of the whole state. Special attention will be given to gaps for African American males. (Fall 2014/Winter 2015). Staff: Perkins Teams

Determine, provide and require funding-application research based activities proven to positively affect student performance especially for those students at high risk. (Winter 2015). Staff: Perkins Teams.

Develop statewide and regional technical assistance events/activities addressing those gaps in performance, specific regional needs, new mandates (assessments) based upon assessed needs and recommendations from grantees. (Winter/Spring 2015). Staff: Perkins Teams, Perkins Leadership.

Provide technical assistance events/activities as developed and amend, as needed. (Fall 2013, Winter/Spring 2015). Staff: All OCTE.

Continuously monitor for changes in assistance needs by monitoring subgrantees via desk audit and/or onsite visit, utilizing relevant advisory groups, conducting frequent communication to all clientele and data analysis. (Fall 2014, Winter/Spring 2015). Staff: All OCTE.

No later than July 1, 2015, a complete schedule of technical assistance activities will be finalized for implementation in the 2015-2016 grant year. Events and activities will focus on directly impacting the number of CTE students who have failed

to score a level 1 or 2 on either (or both) of the ESEA academic tests.

#### Local Program Improvement Plans

Michigan has 26 regional eligible recipients for CTE funds. Local Improvement Plans will be required for regions as indicated below:

Indicator/Number of eligible recipients that did not meet 90% of target:

1S1/12; 1S2/17; 2S1/20; 3S1/0; 4S1/0; 5S1/0; 6S1/6; 6S2/6

None of the 26 regions met all eight indicator targets. The number of regions not meeting the 90% threshold improved for indicator 1S2 (from 23 to 17) compared to the previous year. The number of regions meeting the 90% threshold worsened for indicators 1S1 (9 to 12), 2S1 (0 to 23), and for 6S2 (3 to 6) compared to last year while the number of regions meeting the 90% target remained the same for indicators 3S1 (remained at 0), 4S1 (remained at 0), 5S1 (remained at 0), and 6S1 (remained at 6) compared to last year.

A determination of disaggregated categories of students for whom there were disparities or gaps in performance compared to all CTE students will be made to assist regions in the development of Improvement Plans. Particular attention will be paid to the performance gaps across gender, race, and special population categories. The state of Michigan and 26 regions within it will be required to develop improvement plans with action steps, timelines, and staff responsible no later than March 1, 2015. Applications for funding for 2015-2016 are due April 1, 2015 and improvement plans must be consistent with the activities selected as part of these applications. On January 21st-22nd a technical assistance training will be held for all regions statewide where data dashboards displaying CPIs is to be shared. Apart from overall CPI performance the dashboards will allow the regions to examine their performance on the CPIs by gender, race, gender/race, and special population categories. Regions presented with CPI data will be able to develop actionable steps to improve CPI performance prior to the start of the next school year. The January training will include technical assistance on strategies for fixing gaps in performance and further assistance on the development of regional improvement plans.

#### Postsecondary

1P1 – Technical Skill Attainment: Michigan community colleges came within approximately 0.9% of meeting the expected level of performance. This showed improvement over last year when they came within 2%. Economically While Single Parent (99.03%) exceeded the expected level of performance, Economically Disadvantaged (89.64%), Displaced Homemaker (89.36%), LEP (85.19%), and Non-Traditional (87.01%) came within 90% of the expected level of performance. Individuals with Disabilities (73.75%) did not come within 90%. This was an improvement over last year when only 3 of the Special Populations came within 90%.

2P1 – Credential, Certificate, or Degree: Michigan community colleges exceeded the expected level for 2013-14 by 2%. All special populations groups either met, exceeded or came within 90% of the expected level of performance.

3P1 – Student Retention or Transfer: Michigan's community colleges came within approximately 3% of the expected level of performance by achieving a 68.42% performance level. All special population students either exceeded or came within 90% of achieving the expected levels of performance. The following exceeded the expected performance level: Individuals with Disabilities (74.58%) and LEP (81.92%). Economically Disadvantaged (70.43%) came very close to meeting the expected level of 71%. Nontraditional (67.08%) and Single Parent (68.67%) came within less than 2% of the expected performance level.

4P1 – Student Placement: Michigan community colleges exceeded the expected state performance level of 84.00% by achieving an actual performance level of 88.10%. Economically Disadvantaged (88.24%), Nontraditional (89.70%), and Single Parent (88.24%) all exceeded the expected level. However, Displaced Homemakers (62.50%), and LEP (67.65%), while they did show improvement, did not come within 90%. Individuals with disabilities showed a decrease over last year and did not meet the expected level.

5P1 – Nontraditional Participation: Michigan community colleges exceeded the expected state performance level of 24.00% by achieving an actual performance of 26.04%. This was approximately 2% over last year. All special populations groups with the exception of LEP, exceeded the expected level: Individuals with Disabilities (26.59%), Economically Disadvantaged (26.44%), Single Parents (34.18%), and Displaced Homemakers (34.27%).

5P2 – Nontraditional Completion: Michigan community colleges exceeded the expected state performance level of 21.00% by achieving an actual performance of 21.42%. Individuals with Disabilities (50.93%), LEP (24.49%), Economically Disadvantaged (43.92%), and Single Parents (25.13%) exceeded the expected performance level. Displaced Homemaker (18.64%), did show improvement and came within approximately 0.2% of reaching 90% of the

expected level of performance.

Summary of the 90% Threshold:

Michigan community colleges either met or exceeded the expected levels of performance for all Core Indicators.