

## **MINUTES**

### STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION

Ladislaus B. Dombrowski Board Room  
John A. Hannah Building  
608 West Allegan  
Lansing, Michigan

November 12, 2019  
9:30 a.m.

- Present: Dr. Michael F. Rice, Chairperson  
Dr. Pamela Pugh, Vice President  
Ms. Michelle Fecteau, Secretary  
Mr. Tom McMillin, Treasurer  
Ms. Tiffany Tilley, NASBE Delegate  
Dr. Judith Pritchett  
Ms. Lupe Ramos-Montigny  
Ms. Nikki Snyder  
Mr. Josh Neyhart, representing Governor Gretchen Whitmer, ex officio
- Absent: Dr. Casandra E. Ulbrich, President  
Ms. Cara Lougheed, 2019-2020 Michigan Teacher of the Year

## **REGULAR MEETING**

### I. CALL TO ORDER

Dr. Rice called the meeting to order at 9:32 a.m.

### II. APPROVAL OF AGENDA AND ORDER OF PRIORITY

**Ms. Ramos-Montigny moved, seconded by Dr. Pritchett, that the State Board of Education approve the agenda and order of priority.**

The vote was taken on the motion.

**Ayes: Fecteau, Pritchett, Pugh, Ramos-Montigny, Snyder, Tilley  
Absent: McMillin, Ulbrich**

**The motion carried.**

III. INTRODUCTION OF STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MEMBERS AND STAFF

Dr. Rice asked that the members of the State Board of Education be introduced. Mrs. Marilyn Schneider, State Board Executive, introduced the members of the State Board of Education.

Dr. Scott Koenigsknecht, Deputy Superintendent of P-20 System and Student Transitions, introduced Mr. Terry Patterson from the Office of Great Start, Child Development and Care; and Ms. Toni Mallet from the Office of Great Start, Early Childhood Development and Family Education.

Mr. Kyle Guerrant, Deputy Superintendent of Finance and Operations, introduced Ms. Brenda Sweatman from the Office of Health and Nutrition Services; and Ms. Penny Kentish McWilliams from the Superintendent's Office.

Ms. Allison Sandbrook from the Office of Educator Excellence provided a self-introduction.

Dr. Rice invited the audience to complete public participation forms if they plan to offer comments during the public participation portion of the meeting.

IV. RECESS

The Board recessed the Regular Meeting to convene the Committee of the Whole at 9:39 a.m.

**COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE MEETING**

V. CALL TO ORDER

Dr. Rice called the Committee of the Whole Meeting to order at 9:40 a.m.

VI. PRESENTATION BY STUDENTS AND STAFF OF THE EARLY COLLEGE AT LANSING COMMUNITY COLLEGE

Dr. Scott Koenigsknecht, Deputy Superintendent, P-20 System and Student Transitions; Dr. Steve Rosales, Director of the Early College; Mr. Anthony Greenburg, English Instructor and Mentor; Mr. Matthew Boeve, Social Studies Instructor and Mentor; Mr. Elijah Fink, Student, East Lansing Public Schools; Ms. Brooke Hill, Student, Eaton Rapids Public Schools; Ms. Zarreya Payton, Student, Okemos Public Schools; and Mr. Benjamin Perry, Student, Okemos Public Schools; presented on the Early College at Lansing Community College.

Dr. Rice said The Early College is a collaboration between Ingham Intermediate School District and Lansing Community College. He said the Early College is a program for students entering their junior year of high school who are looking for an opportunity to move into a college environment.

Dr. Rice said the presentation is informational and requires no Board action.

Information was shared via a [PowerPoint presentation](#).

Board member comments included extra-curricular activities and diploma from the home school district, instructors from college, scholarship opportunities, transportation, funding, and balancing college life.

VII. UPDATE ON ACCOUNTABILITY SYSTEMS

Dr. Venessa Keesler, Deputy Superintendent, Educator, Student and School Supports, presented the Update on Accountability Systems.

Dr. Rice said the presentation is a monthly update regarding activities related to the design, development, and implementation of the A-F letter grade system required by Public Act 601 of 2018.

Information was shared via a [PowerPoint presentation](#).

On Track Attendance: Cut Scores

Ms. Snyder asked for clarification of On Track Attendance. Dr. Keesler said On Track Attendance means that a student misses fewer than 10% of the school days.

There was Board consensus to reconvene the Regular Meeting. Discussion continued during the Regular Meeting.

VIII. RECESS

The Board recessed the Committee of the Whole to convene the Regular Meeting at 10:17 a.m.

**REGULAR MEETING**

IX. UPDATE ON ACCOUNTABILITY SYSTEMS (continued)

This is a continuation of discussion earlier in the meeting.

On Track Attendance: Cut Scores

**Ms. Ramos-Montigny moved, seconded by Ms. Snyder, that the State Board of Education approve On Track Attendance Cut Scores as: Significantly Above Average 94-100, Above Average 88-<94, Average 76.5-<88, Below Average 55-<76.5, and Significantly Below Average Below 55, in the A-F grading system for public schools outlined in Public Act 601 of 2018.**

Discussion followed.

Mr. McMillin arrived at 10:22 a.m.

The vote was taken on the motion.

**Ayes: Fecteau, McMillin, Pritchett, Ramos-Montigny, Snyder, Tilley**

**Abstain: Pugh**

**Absent: Ulbrich**

**The motion carried.**

Assessment Participation: Cut Scores

**Ms. Fecteau moved, seconded by Ms. Ramos-Montigny, that the State Board of Education approve Assessment Participation Cut Scores as: Significantly Above Average 96.5-100, Above Average 94-<96.5, Average 91.5-<94, Below Average 86-<91.5, and Significantly Below Average Below 86, in the A-F grading system for public schools outlined in Public Act 601 of 2018.**

Mr. McMillin said 95% of students tested is the federal standard, and there has not been a cut off of federal funding for not meeting the standard. He said some parents choose to opt out of testing for their students. He said he'd like to expand the levels to 10-point increments.

Ms. Fecteau said the A-F grading system is a function of state not federal law, and state law requires this ranking label.

Dr. Pritchett said state law requires that special education and alternative education are exempt.

Mr. McMillin said the State Board of Education has discretion, and he'll propose an amendment.

**Mr. McMillin moved, seconded by Ms. Snyder, that the State Board of Education approve Assessment Participation Cut Scores as: Significantly Above Average 90-100, Above Average 80-<90, Average 70-<80, Below Average 60-<70, Significantly Below Average 60, in the A-F grading system for public schools outlined in Public Act 601 of 2018.**

Discussion followed.

Dr. Pugh said she will support the amendment.

The vote was taken on the amendment.

**Ayes: Fecteau, McMillin, Pritchett, Pugh, Snyder, Tilley**

**Abstain: Ramos-Montigny**

**Absent: Ulbrich**

**The motion to amend carried.**

The vote was taken on the motion, as amended.

**Ayes: Fecteau, McMillin, Pritchett, Pugh, Snyder, Tilley**  
**Abstain: Ramos-Montigny**  
**Absent: Ulbrich**

**The motion, as amended, carried.**

Ms. Ramos-Montigny said she thought this was discussed previously, and cannot vote for something when she is confused.

Dr. Rice said there had been no significant conversation about this category until this time.

Subgroup Comparison: Cut Scores

**Ms. Ramos-Montigny moved, seconded by Ms. Snyder, that the State Board of Education approve Subgroup Comparison Cut Scores as: Significantly Above Average 1.00, Above Average 1.00-<1.25, Average 1.25-<1.5, Below Average 1.5-<1.9, and Significantly Below Average Above 1.9, in the A-F grading system for public schools outlined in Public Act 601 of 2018.**

Dr. Pritchett said this is a comparison by subgroup with the state average for those subgroups. She said some schools have one or two subgroups, because less than 30 students tested doesn't count as a subgroup.

Mr. McMillin said state law doesn't say 30 students is the number required for a subgroup. Dr. Rice said the Every Student Succeeds Act (ESSA) says 30 students, and a change in the number is a future discussion. Dr. Rice said it is very technically complicated and deserves a full discussion.

Ms. Snyder asked for the range in M-STEP scores represented and if it translates to an M-STEP score. Dr. Keesler said the labels are only used in this system.

Dr. Rice said this is the most challenging metric and the least intuitive.

Ms. Fecteau said less measuring on a test would be better and that's why she is not as strident about lowering the N score.

Dr. Pugh said research shows that African American students taught by African American teachers fare better. She asked if that information could be obtained, as well as other confounders such as Asian high poverty student achievement.

Dr. Rice said data mining, as proposed by Dr. Pugh, would be welcomed to increase student achievement in districts.

A roll call vote was taken on the motion.

**Fecteau – Aye**  
**McMillin – Aye**  
**Pritchett – Aye**  
**Pugh - Abstain**  
**Ramos-Montigny – Aye**  
**Snyder – Abstain**  
**Tilley – Abstain**  
**Ulbrich – Absent**

**The motion failed.**

Mr. McMillin asked if the topic will be brought up in December. Dr. Rice said time permitting yes, otherwise the Department will make the decision.

English Learner Progress: Cut Scores

**Ms. Ramos-Montigny moved, seconded by Mr. McMillin, that the State Board of Education approve English Learner Progress Cut Scores as: A 60-100, B 45-<60, C 25-<45, D 10-<25, and F Below 10, in the A-F grading system for public schools outlined in Public Act 601 of 2018.**

Ms. Ramos-Montigny said the WIDA-Access English language learner assessment is used throughout the state to assess bilingual students, and it has been effective and useful when teaching bilingual education.

Ms. Fecteau asked if it measures proficiency or adequate growth. Ms. Ramos-Montigny said the test is administered before and after to determine growth.

Dr. Rice and Dr. Keesler said the State Board of Education suggested changes including increasing B schools, lowering the number of C schools, and shifting distribution of A, B, and C schools.

Dr. Pritchett asked for clarification on the number of years a student is allowed to take the WIDA-Access test.

Mr. McMillin said he wanted to take the opportunity to clarify that the Board did not previously meet as a majority, but rather small groups for feedback, which were publicly posted. He said decisions are being made in public, and the Board did not make decisions or vote in small groups.

Mr. McMillin said if Ms. Ramos-Montigny is fine with the motion, he is fine.

Dr. Pritchett said this is the only subgroup called out, and a descriptor could offer an explanation. Dr. Rice said most schools in the state will show not applicable in this category.

The vote was taken on the motion.

**Ayes: Fecteau, McMillin, Pritchett, Ramos-Montigny, Snyder, Tilley**

**Abstain: Pugh**

**Absent: Ulbrich**

**The motion carried.**

Graduation Rate: Cut Scores

**Ms. Ramos-Montigny moved, seconded by Dr. Pritchett, that the State Board of Education approve Graduation Rate Cut Scores as: A 93-100, B 85-<93, C 75-<85, D 67-<75, and F Below 67, in the A-F grading system for public schools outlined in Public Act 601 of 2018.**

Ms. Tilley said the numbers look stringent, and Dr. Keesler provided the approximate percentages of schools which would receive each grade.

Ms. Fecteau asked for an explanation of the effects of mobility of students entering or exiting the district. Dr. Keesler that is tracked in the system.

Dr. Pritchett said the graduation rate doesn't include GED and special education certificates of completion.

Mr. McMillin said if a school gets an F grade does it mean it's a bad school? Dr. Keesler said if a lot of students are not graduating, it may not be related to what the school is doing; other circumstances could be the cause.

Ms. Tilley asked the ramifications of changing the metrics to ranges of ten points, and Dr. Keesler provided the approximate change in the percentage of schools receiving an A or F grade.

Dr. Rice said the change would not greatly affect the percentage of schools receiving an F, but it would cause confusion between the federal and state systems.

Mr. McMillin said it is a bad metric, and he doesn't like kicking it to the Michigan Department of Education, but a decision must be made by state law. He said he will vote no or abstain.

Dr. Pugh said she will continue to abstain, because she doesn't want to own any of this. She said the Michigan Department of Education should be commended for being thoughtful on two separate systems. She said the numbers mean nothing, and are based on senseless measures. She said it is senseless to take measures that victimize victims, and she refuses to be part of it.

A roll call vote was taken on the motion.

**Fecteau – Abstain**  
**McMillin – Abstain**  
**Pritchett – Abstain**  
**Pugh - Abstain**  
**Ramos-Montigny – Aye**  
**Snyder – Abstain**  
**Tilley – Abstain**  
**Ulbrich – Absent**

**The motion failed.**

Dr. Rice asked Dr. Keesler to explain the remaining three items, and a vote would not occur during the November 12, 2019 meeting. Dr. Keesler briefly explained Proficiency: Cut Scores; Growth: Cut Scores; and Comparison to Similar Schools.

Discussion followed.

Dr. Rice said there will be a presentation and discussion during the December Board meeting.

X. RECESS

The Board recessed the Regular Meeting at 11:55 a.m. and reconvened at 1:04 p.m.

Mr. Neyhart left the meeting at 11:55 a.m.

XI. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION IN STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MEETING

1. Mr. Michael Flanagan, from Northville, Michigan, provided comments welcoming Dr. Rice as the State Superintendent.
2. Ms. Jessica Murphy, representing Michigan Protection and Advocacy Service, Inc., from Lansing, Michigan, provided comments and written information regarding increased reliance on long-term substitute teachers.

XII. RECESS

The Board recessed the Regular Meeting to reconvene the Committee of the Whole at 1:04 p.m.

**COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE MEETING**

XIII. PRESENTATION ON INCREASES IN CAREER AND TECHNICAL EDUCATION ENROLLMENT, PROGRAMMING, AND COMPLETION

Dr. Scott Koenigsknecht, Deputy Superintendent, P-20 System and Student Transitions; and Dr. Brian Pyles, Director, Career and Technical Education; presented on Increases in Career and Technical Education Enrollment, Programming, and Completion.

Dr. Rice said the informational presentation will provide data facts around career and technical education enrolment, programming, and completion, and no Board action is required. He said there will be additional presentations on post-secondary credit-earning opportunities in future months.

Information was shared via a [PowerPoint presentation](#).

Board member comments included flexibility in programming for students; the need for an educational foundation; what is eliminated; age of enrollment; better messaging to communicate that students are not being put into a track as was done in the past; growth is realized in nationwide awareness of unfilled jobs in career and technical education; categoricals have increased; additional resources for districts to operate programs; determining if there is an increase in industry-standard certificates among completers; modification of curriculum for students with special needs, transcribed college credit at the time it is earned; positive messaging; and early exposure to choices.

XIV. PRESENTATION ON THE DRAFT STRENGTHENING CAREER AND TECHNICAL EDUCATION FOR THE 21<sup>ST</sup> CENTURY ACT (PERKINS V) PLAN

Dr. Scott Koenigsknecht, Deputy Superintendent, P-20 System and Student Transitions; and Dr. Brian Pyles, Director, Career and Technical Education; presented the Draft Strengthening Career and Technical Education for the 21<sup>st</sup> Century Act (Perkins V) Plan.

Dr. Rice said Michigan's State Plan for Perkins V career and technical education is currently under development. He said the Board has received the draft for public comment and public hearing. He said the general public comment period will be November 14 through December 14, with an additional comment period for performance measures and levels until January 14. He said the final draft, incorporating public comment and editorial changes will be presented to the Board at its February meeting, and Board approval will be requested in March.

Dr. Koenigsknecht and Dr. Pyles provided an overview of the development of the draft plan, stakeholder diversity and input, and high-level changes.

Board member comments included clarification between completer and concentrator, use of certified teachers, annual authorization, and industry credentials.

XV. UPDATE FROM THE OFFICE OF PARTNERSHIP DISTRICTS

Dr. William Pearson, Director, Office of Partnership Districts; Mrs. Gloria Chapman, Assistant Director, Office of Partnership Districts; and Ms. Cynthia White-McPhaul, Unit Manager, Focused Assistance Support Team (FAST); presented the Update from the Office of Partnership Districts.

Dr. Rice said the presentation is an update on the newly established zone for partnership Districts located within Wayne County.

Information was shared via a [PowerPoint presentation](#).

Board member comments included anticipation of districts off-track and supports, Read by Grade Three resources for districts, reporting to parents, report to Board the dollar amount of Read by Grade Three funds distributed district by district and the number of students, and designing the zone for Partnership Districts in Wayne County.

XVI. ADJOURNMENT

The Board adjourned the Committee of the Whole at 2:29 p.m. and reconvened the Regular Meeting.

**REGULAR MEETING**

XVII. APPROVAL OF STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MINUTES

Approval of Minutes of Regular and Committee of the Whole Meeting of October 8, 2019

**Dr. Pritchett moved, seconded by Ms. Fecteau, that the State Board of Education approve the Minutes of the Regular and Committee of the Whole Meeting of October 8, 2019.**

The vote was taken on the motion.

**Ayes: Fecteau, McMillin, Pritchett, Pugh, Ramos-Montigny, Snyder, Tilley  
Absent: Ulbrich**

**The motion carried.**

XVIII. REPORT OF THE PRESIDENT

There was no Report of the President, due to the absence of Dr. Ulbrich.

XIX. REPORT OF THE STATE SUPERINTENDENT

Report

G. Human Resources Report

## Grants

### H. Report on Grant Awards

1. [2018-2019 IDEA, Part B Grant Funded Initiatives - Amendment; \\$22,415,000](#) (Special Education – Teri Chapman)
2. [2019-2020 IDEA, Part B Grant Funded Initiatives - Initial; \\$22,450,000](#) (Special Education – Teri Chapman)
3. [2015-2016 Section 1003\(g\) School Improvement Grants - Amendment; Continuation; \\$5,351,647](#) (Educational Supports – Paula Daniels)
4. [2017-2018 Section 1003\(g\) School Improvement Grants - Amendment; Continuation; \\$38,100,252](#) (Educational Supports – Paula Daniels)
5. [2019-2020 Statewide System of Support, Technical Assistance Grant - Initial; Continuation; \\$8,870,400](#) (Educational Supports – Paula Daniels)
6. [2019-2020 Title I Regional Assistance Grant - Initial; \\$17,385,000](#) (Educational Supports – Paula Daniels)
7. [2019-2020 Title I, Part C Migrant Education Programs - Initial; \\$2,074,059](#) (Educational Supports – Paula Daniels)
8. [2019-2020 Title III, English Language Acquisition - Amendment; \\$9,924,279](#) (Educational Supports – Paula Daniels)
9. [2019-2020 Title III, Immigrant Student Grant - Initial; \\$1,751,344](#) (Educational Supports – Paula Daniels)
10. [2019-2020 Great Start Parent Coalitions Trusted Advisors Grant - Initial; \\$959,398](#) (Early Childhood Development & Family Education – Renee DeMars-Johnson)
11. [2018-2019 Fresh Fruit and Vegetable Program \(FFVP\) - Amendment; \\$4,143,881](#) (Health and Nutrition Services – Diane Golzynski)
12. [2019-2020 Fresh Fruit and Vegetable Program \(FFVP\) - Initial; \\$4,162,610](#) (Health and Nutrition Services – Diane Golzynski)

Dr. Rice provided an update on Benton Harbor Area Schools, in response to a request from Ms. Tilley. He said the Community Advisory Committee has met for the second time and will meet again next month. He said the Committee will present a report in the spring. Dr. Rice said he again has visited Benton Harbor Area Schools and spoken with students, and he plans to visit in the future.

Ms. Tilley asked what will be contained in the report. Dr. Rice said the plan is wide open, and the Michigan Department of Education is there to advise on academics.

Dr. Pugh asked if there is a way to measure the impact of negative messaging on the enrollment decline in Benton Harbor Area Schools, perhaps through a parent survey.

Ms. Tilley asked about debt relief for Benton Harbor Area Schools.

There was discussion regarding where authority lies in regards to debt relief and building closures.

## XX. REPORT OF THE MICHIGAN TEACHER OF THE YEAR

There was no Report of the Michigan Teacher of the Year, due to the absence of Ms. Cara Lougheed.

## XXI. STATE AND FEDERAL LEGISLATIVE UPDATE

Dr. Rice asked Ms. Lupe Ramos-Montigny, Chairperson of the Board's Legislative Committee, to lead the discussion on State and Federal Legislation.

The Legislative Committee report, and Board legislative priorities were distributed. Ms. Ramos-Montigny reviewed the report of the Legislative Committee, which met on October 29, 2019.

Mr. Ackley, Director, Public and Governmental Affairs, provided an update on the budget. Mr. Ackley said Dr. Rice testified on the Michigan Merit Curriculum at 12:00 p.m.

Ms. Fecteau said transitional services for 18 to 26-year-olds cease if a student with special needs receives a diploma, and she hopes that is taken into consideration as the Michigan Merit Curriculum is discussed.

Ms. Ramos-Montigny said it is important that the requirement for foreign languages is maintained in the Michigan Merit Curriculum.

Dr. Pugh asked if there is continued discussion regarding removal of the retention requirement in the Read By Grade Three law, and Mr. Ackley said it is his understanding that the discussion is no longer on the table.

Ms. Tilley, NASBE Delegate, provided the NASBE report. Ms. Tilley said she, Ms. Snyder, and Ms. Ramos-Montigny attended the annual conference on October 16-19, 2019. Ms. Tilley said among the conference highlights was her visit to the school at the zoo, which is a project-based school for several grade levels focusing on science, technology, engineering and mathematics (STEM) education.

Ms. Snyder said she met the 2019 National Teacher of the Year, Mr. Rodney Robinson, and he spoke about the importance of trauma-informed training. Ms. Snyder said she has information, which she will share at a later date.

XXII. COMMENTS BY STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MEMBERS

Ms. Ramos-Montigny said Dr. Randy Liepa, Superintendent, Wayne Regional Educational Service Agency, received the Policy Leader of the Year Award from the National Association of State Boards of Education. Ms. Ramos-Montigny thanked Ms. Sheila Alles, Chief Deputy Superintendent, for attending the award ceremony.

Ms. Fecteau suggested a future presentation on schools successfully working with trauma-exposed students, as well as schools successfully working with students with special needs and transition services.

Dr. Pugh said she is interested in minimizing the exacerbation of the effects of trauma.

Ms. Tilley said she appreciates having American Sign Language interpreters during the Board meeting.

Dr. Pritchett said although she didn't support Public Act 601 of 2018, the A-F accountability system, she appreciated the feedback and discussions.

Mr. McMillin said he also appreciates the discussions regarding implementation of Public Act 601 of 2018.

XXIII. FUTURE MEETING DATES

- A. Tuesday, December 10, 2019 (9:30 a.m.) Regular Meeting
- B. Tuesday, January 14, 2020 (9:30 a.m.) Regular Meeting
- C. Tuesday, February 11, 2020 (9:30 a.m.) Regular Meeting
- D. Tuesday, March 10, 2020 (9:30 a.m.) Regular Meeting

XXIV. TENTATIVE AGENDA FOR NEXT MEETING

Dr. Rice asked Board members if there are additional agenda topics they would like to be considered for future meeting agendas.

Dr. Pugh suggested a future presentation on the teacher shortage including how reliance on long-term substitute teachers adversely affects students with learning disabilities.

Ms. Ramos-Montigny said she will provide topics at a later date.

XXV. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 3:26 p.m.

The video archive of the meeting is available on Michigan's State Board of Education website ([www.michigan.gov/sbe](http://www.michigan.gov/sbe)).

Respectfully submitted,

Michelle Fecteau  
Secretary