

## **MINUTES**

### STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION

Ladislaus B. Dombrowski Board Room  
John A. Hannah Building  
608 West Allegan  
Lansing, Michigan

May 8, 2018  
9:30 a.m.

Present: Mr. Brian J. Whiston, Chairman  
Dr. Casandra E. Ulbrich, Co-President (via telephone)  
Dr. Richard Zeile, Co-President  
Ms. Michelle Fecteau, Secretary  
Mr. Tom McMillin, Treasurer  
Ms. Lupe Ramos-Montigny, NASBE Delegate  
Dr. Pamela Pugh  
Ms. Nikki Snyder  
Mrs. Eileen Weiser (via telephone)  
Mr. Tyler Sawher, representing Governor Rick Snyder, ex officio

Also Present: Mr. Luke Wilcox, 2017-2018 Michigan Teacher of the Year

### **REGULAR MEETING**

#### I. CALL TO ORDER

Dr. Zeile called the meeting to order at 9:33 a.m. Dr. Zeile said he will be chairing the meeting.

#### II. PERSONAL PRIVILEGE – DR. RICHARD ZEILE

Dr. Zeile said all were saddened to learn of the passing of State Superintendent Brian Whiston. He said Mr. Whiston passed away on May 7, 2018, following a battle with cancer.

Dr. Zeile said Brian has been the State Superintendent for nearly three years; he set forth some dynamic and ambitious goals to make Michigan a Top 10 education state in 10 years; and the work now is to continue that collective vision. He said he is convinced that Brian's work will continue to bear fruit for us and our children in the years to come.

Dr. Zeile said condolences go out to Brian's wife, Beth; their children and grandchildren; the team at the Michigan Department of Education whom Brian loved and respected dearly; and everyone in the education community who all mourn Brian's passing.

Dr. Zeile read statements from Governor Rick Snyder and Lieutenant Governor Brian Calley. Dr. Zeile asked for a moment of silence.

III. APPROVAL OF AGENDA AND ORDER OF PRIORITY

**Mr. McMillin moved, seconded by Ms. Fecteau, that the State Board of Education approve the agenda and order of priority.**

The vote was taken on the motion.

**The motion carried unanimously.**

IV. INTRODUCTION OF STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MEMBERS AND STAFF

Mrs. Marilyn Schneider, State Board Executive, introduced members of the State Board of Education.

Dr. Zeile asked that new employees be introduced.

Ms. Shulawn Doxie, Interim Deputy Superintendent of P-20 System and Student Transitions, introduced Deborah Schultz from the Office of Special Education.

Dr. Zeile invited the audience members to introduce themselves.

Dr. Zeile said audience members should complete public participation forms if they wish to offer comments during the public participation portion of the meeting.

V. PERSONAL PRIVILEGE – DR. RICHARD ZEILE

Dr. Zeile said former Deputy Superintendent Susan Broman passed away at the end of April. He said Susan was a champion for early childhood education and care. He said her impact on ensuring quality child care and early learning will be felt for many generations. Dr. Zeile offered sympathy to Susan's loved ones and colleagues.

Dr. Zeile said this week is Teacher Appreciation Week. He read a letter to Michigan teachers from Mr. Whiston.

Dr. Zeile said there is a tradition in State of Michigan government begun by Governor Snyder of recognizing the special qualities of its employees by awarding special coins. He said there are four coins awarded: the Symbol of Customer Service, the Symbol of Teamwork, the Symbol of Excellence, and the Symbol of Leadership.

Dr. Zeile said during the past three years, Brian Whiston has awarded many of these coins to Michigan Department of Education (MDE) staff who demonstrated these qualities through their actions and work. Dr. Zeile said like many dynamic and strong leaders, Brian rarely wants the spotlight on himself but prefers to shine in on others and recognize their efforts to make MDE great.

Dr. Zeile said, during the May 7<sup>th</sup> Leadership Team meeting, Brian Whiston was awarded all four coins. He said Chief of Staff Wendy Larvick presented the coins to Brian's wife, Beth and his children Ashley, Kristen, Scott and his wife Amanda.

Dr. Zeile said State Superintendent Brian Whiston surely deserves this small token of gratitude for his dedicated service to the Michigan Department of Education.

VI. RECESS

The Board recessed the Regular Meeting at 9:45 a.m. and convened the Committee of the Whole.

**COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE MEETING**

VII. CALL TO ORDER

Dr. Zeile called the Committee of the Whole Meeting to order at 9:46 a.m.

VIII. PRESENTATION OF THE MICHIGAN INVENTION CONVENTION

Dr. Zeile said The Henry Ford is hosting the Michigan Invention Convention, which provides a live, interactive opportunity for youth inventors and entrepreneurs in grades 3-12 to display their critical thinking and entrepreneurial skills by inventing and pitching a product to community judges and peer inventors.

Dr. Zeile introduced Ms. Lucie Howell, Director of Learning and Engagement; and Ms. Patricia Mooradian, President and CEO of The Henry Ford.

Ms. Howell and Ms. Mooradian shared information via a [PowerPoint presentation](#).

Board member comments included education support and outreach materials, enhancing and developing the interests and strengths of youth, and the opportunity for a global competition in Michigan.

IX. PRESENTATION ON THE REVISED TEACHER CERTIFICATION STRUCTURE

Dr. Venessa Keesler, Deputy Superintendent, Educator, Student, and School Supports; Ms. Leah Breen, Director, Educator Excellence; and Ms. Kelli Cassaday, Early Literacy Consultant, Educator Excellence; presented on the Revised Teacher Certification Structure.

Dr. Zeile said for more than three years, the Michigan Department of Education in collaboration with Michigan's stakeholders have been working to revise Michigan's teacher certification structure and improve the preparation of the educator workforce in Michigan. He said this is in direct alignment with the Strategic Plan for becoming a Top 10 education state within 10 years.

Dr. Zeile said the collaboration has led to the design of a structure that places students at the heart of the system and will prepare teachers for supporting the diversity of Michigan's students. He said stakeholder feedback has been essential to the process to ensure students are at the heart of the system and to consider potential barriers for implementation.

Information was shared via a [PowerPoint presentation](#).

Board member comments included authority of the State Board of Education, increase in depth of knowledge, student achievement increases, Partnership Districts included in focus groups, ensuring that schools struggling the most are included, special education endorsement requirements, and training general education teachers in special education.

X. PRESENTATION ON SOCIAL STUDIES STANDARDS

Dr. Venessa Keesler, Deputy Superintendent, Educator, Student, and School Supports; Ms. Linda Forward, Senior Executive Policy Advisor; and Mr. Jim Cameron, Social Studies Consultant; presented on Social Studies Standards.

Dr. Zeile said in April of 2014 social studies practitioners and experts began the process to update the Michigan Social Studies Standards. He said following the initial public review, Department staff convened a focus group designed to bring a diverse set of voices together to assure that the standards reflected the multiplicity of thoughts across the state. He said the focus group has completed its work and the revised standards are ready for State Board of Education review and a new period of public comment.

Information was shared via a [PowerPoint presentation](#).

Dr. Zeile said the Honorable Judge Michael David Warren, Jr., had requested an opportunity to address the Board during the presentation. Judge Warren shared comments on the Social Studies Standards.

Board member comments included tracking differences between the current standards and revised standards, inclusion of labor movement and other progressive movements, public comment period schedule and sessions throughout the state, addressing concerns regarding civil rights and the Equal Rights Amendment, sex trafficking and exploitation of human labor, Common Core, receiving unfiltered comments, democracy and republic, and four pillars of citizenship.

XI. RECESS

The Board recessed the Committee of the Whole at 11:39 a.m. and reconvened the Regular Meeting at 1:10 p.m.

Mrs. Weiser and Dr. Ulbrich interrupted their telephone connections at 11:39 a.m. Mrs. Weiser resumed her connection at 1:10 p.m. Dr. Ulbrich resumed her connection later in the meeting.

Mr. Sawher left the meeting at 11:45 a.m.

### **REGULAR MEETING**

#### **XII. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION IN STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MEETING**

1. Senator Patrick Colbeck, representing Michigan's 7<sup>th</sup> State Senate District, provided comments on the Social Studies Standards.
2. Ms. Sherry Wells, Ferndale, Michigan, representing the Green Party of Michigan, provided comments on a community education town hall meeting in Benton Harbor.
3. Dr. Michael Libbee, Mt. Pleasant, Michigan, representing Michigan Geographic Alliance, provided comments on the Social Studies Standards.
4. Ms. Rebecca Bush, Coloma, Michigan, representing Ottawa Area Intermediate School District and Michigan Social Studies Supervisors Association, provided comments on the Social Studies Standards.
5. Mr. Roy Sovis, Grand Blanc, Michigan, provided comments on the Social Studies Standards.
6. LTC Charles J. Cogger, Lansing, Michigan, representing the United States Army Recruiting Command Great Lakes, provided comments on Army education and career opportunities.

#### **XIII. RECESS**

The Board recessed the Regular Meeting at 1:36 p.m. and reconvened the Committee of the Whole.

### **COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE MEETING**

#### **XIV. PRESENTATION ON KINDERGARTEN ENTRY OBSERVATION PILOT PROJECT**

Mr. Scott Menzel, Superintendent, Washtenaw Intermediate School District; and Ms. Melissa Brooks-Yip, Director of Regional Educational Media Center (REMC) 16; presented on the Kindergarten Entry Observation Pilot Project.

Dr. Zeile said during a previous State Board of Education meeting, Board members expressed interest in learning more about the Kindergarten Entry Observation Pilot Project.

Information was shared via a [PowerPoint presentation](#).

Board member comments included amount of observation time, compare and contrast with Gazelle, example of observation that will inform instruction, including parent's perspective on what child can do, ways to support teacher in classroom, class size, concept of kindergarten readiness and future consequences, opportunity for all children, data on effective use of preschool years, individual growth schedule of children, and community-based cooperative model encouraging parental and family involvement.

XV. PRESENTATION ON PARTNERSHIP DISTRICT MODEL UPDATE

Dr. Venessa Keesler, Deputy Superintendent, Educator, Student, and School Supports; Dr. Dedrick Martin, School Reform Officer and Director of the Partnership District Office; Mrs. Rane Garcia, Superintendent, Muskegon Heights Public School Academy; and Dr. Traci Teasley, Liaison, Michigan Department of Education; presented on the Partnership District Model.

Dr. Zeile said this is an opportunity for one of the Partnership Districts, Muskegon Heights Public School Academy, to provide an overview of their partnership agreement goals and the partnerships they have developed to help them accomplish those goals.

Information was shared via a [PowerPoint presentation](#).

Board member comments included parental opinion before and after the Partnership District model, timeline for school district exiting the Partnership District model, implementation science, exciting news and a feeling of hope reaffirming the position taken to rethink closing schools.

XVI. ADJOURNMENT

The Board adjourned the Committee of the Whole at 3:08 p.m. and reconvened the Regular Meeting at 3:15 p.m.

Dr. Ulbrich resumed her telephone connection at 3:08 p.m.

**REGULAR MEETING**

XVII. APPROVAL OF STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MINUTES

F. Approval of Minutes of Regular and Committee of the Whole Meeting of April 10, 2018

**Ms. Ramos-Montigny moved, seconded by Mr. McMillin, that the State Board of Education approve the Minutes of the Regular and Committee of the Whole Meeting of April 10, 2018.**

The vote was taken on the motion.

**Ayes: Fecteau, McMillin, Ramos-Montigny, Snyder, Ulbrich,  
Weiser, Zeile  
Absent During Vote: Pugh**

**The motion carried.**

XVIII. REPORT OF THE CO-PRESIDENTS

Dr. Zeile said the passing of State Superintendent Brian Whiston is a great loss. He said proper respect will be shown to the family of this great public servant.

Dr. Ulbrich said Mr. Whiston was a wonderful leader and will be greatly missed.

XIX. REPORT OF THE SUPERINTENDENT

Reports

G. Human Resources Report

H. Report on Teacher Certification Revocation Decision

I. Report on Approved Changes to the Ionia Intermediate School District Plan for the Delivery of Special Education Programs and Services

Grants

J. Report on Grant Awards

1. 2017-2018 IDEA, Part B Grant Funded Initiatives - Amendment; \$21,260,000 (Special Education – Teri Chapman)
2. 2016-2017 Title I, Part A, Improving Basic Programs - Amendment; \$458,907,854 (Student, School, and District Supports – Paula Daniels)
3. 2017-2018 ISD Collaboration Grant - Amendment; \$699,879 (Student, School, and District Supports – Paula Daniels)
4. 2017-2018 Section 21j - Competency-Based Education District Grant - Initial; \$500,000 (Student, School, and District Supports – Paula Daniels)
5. 2017-2018 Section 35a(4) Intermediate School District Early Literacy Coaches - Amendment; \$5,850,000 (Student, School, and District Supports – Paula Daniels)
6. 2017-2018 Section 99s(6) and (7) - MiSTEM Network Regions - Amendment; \$1,400,000 (Student, School, and District Supports – Paula Daniels)

7. 2017-2018 Title I, Part A, Improving Basic Programs - Amendment; \$458,584,487 (Student, School, and District Supports – Paula Daniels)
8. 2017-2018 Title I, Part C Summer Migrant Program - Initial; \$4,629,792 (Student, School, and District Supports – Paula Daniels)
9. 2017-2018 Title I, Part D, Subpart 2, Local Programs for Neglected or Delinquent Youth - Amendment; \$6,497,165 (Student, School, and District Supports – Paula Daniels)
10. 2017-2018 Title II, Part A, Supporting Effective Instruction - Amendment; \$74,408,683 (Student, School, and District Supports – Paula Daniels)
11. 2017-2018 Title III, English Language Acquisition - Amendment; \$9,359,465 (Student, School, and District Supports – Paula Daniels)
12. 2017-2018 Title IV, Part A, Student Support and Academic Enrichment Grant - Amendment; \$11,711,838 (Student, School, and District Supports – Paula Daniels)
13. 2018-2019 Statewide System of Support, Technical Assistance Grant – Initial; \$10,000,000 (Student, School, and District Supports – Paula Daniels)
14. 2017-2018 Flint Declaration of Emergency Grants: Section 11s(3) – Early Childhood Services - Initial; \$1,720,000 (Early Childhood Development & Family Education – Renee DeMars-Johnson)
15. 2018-2019 Mandated Activities Under Part C of the Individuals with Disabilities Education Act - Initial; \$1,336,076 (Early Childhood Development & Family Education – Renee DeMars-Johnson)
16. 2017-2018 School Climate Transformation - Amendment; \$323,000 (Health and Nutrition Services – Diane Golzynski)
17. 2017-2018 Section 21h: Partnership District Grant - Amendment; \$2,335,451 (Partnership Districts – Dedrick Martin)
18. 2017-2018 Section 21h: Partnership District Grant - Amendment; \$2,359,056 (Partnership Districts – Dedrick Martin)
19. 2017-2018 Kindergarten Entry Observation Pilot Project - Initial; \$1,000,000 (Educational Assessment and Accountability - Andrew Middlestead)
20. 2017-2018 LSTA Collaborative Library Services Grant Program - Initial; \$71,330 (Library of Michigan – Randy Riley)



Ms. Sheila Alles, Chief Deputy Superintendent, said she echoes the kind words of Dr. Zeile and Dr. Ulbrich in the loss of an amazing leader who served for the past three years. She said Brian Whiston's passing has created a loss in our hearts. She said we are a strong and resilient team and we will go forth with his vision and love. She said there is a great Michigan Department of Education team to make it happen.

XX. REPORT OF MICHIGAN TEACHER OF THE YEAR

Mr. Luke Wilcox, 2017-2018 Michigan Teacher of the Year, provided his report.

Mr. Wilcox presented highlights from the 2018 State Teachers of the Year gathering in Washington, DC.

XXI. APPOINTMENT OF INTERIM SUPERINTENDENT OF PUBLIC INSTRUCTION

Dr. Zeile said as stated at the beginning of the meeting, we are deeply saddened that Superintendent of Public Instruction Brian Whiston has passed away. He said this leads to a vacancy and someone needs to be identified to take the lead of the Department.

**Dr. Zeile moved, seconded by Ms. Fecteau, that the State Board of Education appoint Chief Deputy Superintendent Sheila Alles as Interim Superintendent of Public Instruction effective May 8, 2018.**

Discussion followed.

**Ms. Ramos-Montigny moved, seconded by Ms. Snyder, that the State Board of Education consider a substitute motion to vote on the appointment of the Interim Superintendent of Public Instruction on May 22, 2018 at the State Board of Education Retreat.**

Discussion followed.

A roll call vote was taken on the motion to consider the substitute motion.

**Fecteau: Aye  
McMillin: Aye  
Pugh: Aye  
Ramos-Montigny: Aye  
Snyder: Aye  
Ulbrich: Nay  
Weiser: Nay  
Zeile: Nay**

**The motion to consider the substitute motion carried.**

Discussion followed.

**Ms. Ramos-Montigny moved, seconded by Ms. Snyder, that the State Board of Education vote on the appointment of the Interim Superintendent of Public Instruction on May 22, 2018 at the State Board of Education Retreat.**

Discussion followed.

A roll call vote was taken on the substitute motion.

**Fecteau: Nay  
McMillin: Aye  
Pugh: Nay  
Ramos-Montigny: Aye  
Snyder: Aye  
Ulbrich: Nay  
Weiser: Nay  
Zeile: Nay**

**The substitute motion failed.**

The motion as originally proposed was reread as follows: **Dr. Zeile moved, seconded by Ms. Fecteau, that the State Board of Education appoint Chief Deputy Superintendent Sheila Alles as Interim Superintendent of Public Instruction effective May 8, 2018.**

A roll call vote was taken on the motion.

**Fecteau: Aye  
McMillin: Nay  
Pugh: Aye  
Ramos-Montigny: Aye  
Snyder: Nay  
Ulbrich: Aye  
Weiser: Aye  
Zeile: Aye**

**The motion carried.**

Dr. Zeile asked that the Whiston family be held in thought and prayer.

Ms. Alles thanked the Board for their faith in her as the Interim Superintendent of Public Instruction. She said she is humbled and dedicated to moving forward Brian Whiston's vision. She said the Michigan Department of Education family has reached out to her, and she appreciates the team. She thanked the Board for appointing her Interim Superintendent of Public Instruction.

XXII. APPROVAL OF NOMINATIONS TO THE SPECIAL EDUCATION ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Ms. Shulawn Doxie, Interim Deputy Superintendent, P-20 System & Student Transitions; and Ms. Teri Chapman, Director, Office of Special Education; presented Approval of Nominations to the Special Education Advisory Committee.

Dr. Zeile said each year the State Board of Education is asked to approve nominations to the Special Education Advisory Committee (SEAC) membership. He said terms of five members at-large and organizational delegate and alternate vacancies need to be filled. He said the State Board of Education was asked to make nominations for the member at-large vacancies at its April 10, 2018 meeting. He said the list of nominees and supporting biographical information is included in the Board item.

**Mr. McMillin moved, seconded by Ms. Ramos-Montigny, that the State Board of Education approve the nominees listed in Attachment B of the Superintendent's memorandum dated April 24, 2018, and appoint those individuals to serve as members of the Special Education Advisory Committee for the respective terms specified.**

The vote was taken on the motion.

**The motion carried unanimously.**

XXIII. STATE AND FEDERAL LEGISLATIVE UPDATE

Dr. Zeile asked Mr. Ackley, Director of Public and Governmental Affairs, to provide an update on State and Federal Legislative issues.

Mr. Ackley said the State Board of Education Legislative Committee did not meet on April 26, 2018, due to lack of a quorum.

Mr. Ackley reported on school safety bills, "Nassar" bills regarding sexual predation of students, Partnership District language in the State Budget, Marshall Plan bills, and English as the official language legislation.

Ms. Ramos-Montigny said she does not support legislation designating English as the official language. She said everyone understands English is the primary language spoken, and she is offended by the legislation. Ms. Fecteau said she agrees.

Dr. Zeile said Nikki Snyder has requested that she step down as the Board's Delegate to the National Association of State Boards of Education (NASBE). He said Lupe Ramos-Montigny, State Board of Education member and NASBE Central Area Director, is willing to serve as the Board's NASBE Delegate.

**Mrs. Weiser moved, seconded by Mr. McMillin, that the State Board of Education honor Ms. Snyder's request to resign as the Board's National Association of State Boards of Education (NASBE) Delegate, and appoint Ms. Ramos-Montigny to serve as the Board's NASBE Delegate.**

Ms. Ramos-Montigny said she is happy to act in that capacity.

The vote was taken on the motion.

**The motion carried unanimously.**

XXIV. COMMENTS BY STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MEMBERS

Ms. Ramos-Montigny said it has been a difficult day with the passing of Brian Whiston. She said his legacy and friendship will live forever. She said Brian had many different sides, and he attended many events in Grand Rapids. She said she will miss him a lot, and he leaves a legacy only he could do. She said she feels lucky he was part of her life.

Mr. McMillin said he is saddened by Brian Whiston's passing. He said he has known Mr. Whiston since the early 1990's when Mr. Whiston was employed by Oakland Schools and presented Schools of Choice sessions for the Auburn Hills City Council, of which Mr. McMillin was a member. He said he is also saddened by the passing of Susan Broman, and he is looking forward to working with Sheila Alles.

Dr. Pugh said she called Mr. Whiston late into the evening, and his level of commitment rubs off. She said his legacy is his life, the way he lived, his calmness, and response to everyone including Michigan's children. She said we will make sure his life was not in vain.

Mr. Wilcox said this is Teacher Appreciation Week, and he invited people to thank a teacher.

Dr. Pugh said Alisande Shrewsbury, Special Assistant, helped her organize a meeting with community members and she plans to schedule additional meetings with community members.

Dr. Zeile said Brian Whiston displayed great courage and faith, especially during the past six months while battling cancer. He said it is a privilege to work with Brian and Michigan Department of Education staff who are at the top of the game. He said Brian's service is humbling.

XXV. TENTATIVE AGENDA FOR NEXT MEETING

Dr. Zeile said Board members may contact the Co-Presidents and Interim State Superintendent with suggestions for future agenda topics.

XXVI. FUTURE MEETING DATES

- A. Tuesday, May 22, 2018 (9:30 a.m.) State Board of Education Retreat  
James B. Henry Center for Executive Development, Michigan State University
- C. Tuesday, June 12, 2018 (9:30 a.m.) Regular Meeting
- D. Tuesday, August 14, 2018 (9:30 a.m.) Regular Meeting

XXVII. ADJOURNMENT

**Mr. McMillin moved, seconded by Ms. Ramos-Montigny, that the meeting be adjourned.**

The vote was taken on the motion.

**The motion carried unanimously.**

The meeting adjourned at 4:32 p.m.

The video archive of the meeting is available on the [Michigan State Board of Education website](http://www.michigan.gov/sbe) (www.michigan.gov/sbe).

Respectfully submitted,

Michelle Fecteau  
Secretary