

MINUTES

STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION

Ladislaus B. Dombrowski Board Room
John A. Hannah Building
608 West Allegan
Lansing, Michigan

September 10, 2019
9:30 a.m.

Present: Dr. Michael F. Rice, Chairperson
Dr. Casandra E. Ulbrich, President
Ms. Michelle Fecteau, Secretary
Mr. Tom McMillin, Treasurer
Ms. Tiffany Tilley, NASBE Delegate
Dr. Judith Pritchett
Ms. Lupe Ramos-Montigny (via telephone, unable to vote)
Ms. Nikki Snyder
Mr. Josh Neyhart, representing Governor Gretchen Whitmer, ex officio

Absent: Dr. Pamela Pugh, Vice President

Also Present: Ms. Cara Lougheed, 2019-2020 Michigan Teacher of the Year

REGULAR MEETING

I. CALL TO ORDER

Dr. Rice called the meeting to order at 9:33 a.m.

II. APPROVAL OF AGENDA AND ORDER OF PRIORITY

Dr. Pritchett moved, seconded by Mr. McMillin, that the State Board of Education approve the agenda and order of priority.

The vote was taken on the motion.

**Ayes: Fecteau, McMillin, Pritchett, Snyder, Tilley, Ulbrich
Absent: Pugh**

The motion carried.

III. INTRODUCTION OF STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MEMBERS AND STAFF

Dr. Rice asked that the members of the State Board of Education be introduced. Mrs. Marilyn Schneider, State Board Executive, introduced the members of the State Board of Education.

Dr. Rice asked for the introduction of new employees.

Dr. Scott Koenigsknecht, Deputy Superintendent of P-20 System and Student Transitions, introduced Mr. Jose Velasquez-Ayala from the Office of Great Start; and Ms. Candace Vinson and Ms. Celena Mills from the Office of Career and Technical Education.

Mr. Kyle Guerrant, Deputy Superintendent of Finance and Operations, introduced Mr. Scott Addison from the Office of Financial Management.

Dr. Venessa Keesler, Deputy Superintendent of Educator, Student and School Supports, introduced Ms. Michelle Watkins and Ms. Joan Jackson from the Office of Educational Supports; and Mr. Braydin Walters from the Office of Educator Excellence.

Dr. Rice invited audience members to introduce themselves and complete public participation forms if they plan to offer comments during the public participation portion of the meeting.

IV. RECESS

The Board recessed the Regular Meeting to convene the Committee of the Whole at 9:39 a.m.

COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE MEETING

V. CALL TO ORDER

Dr. Rice called the Committee of the Whole Meeting to order at 9:40 a.m.

VI. PRESENTATION ON THE FRESH AND FURIOUS FOOD TRUCK PROGRAM

Dr. Scott Koenigsknecht, Deputy Superintendent of P-20 System and Student Transitions; Chef Corbett Day, Culinary Arts Instructor, Ingham Intermediate School District; Mr. Connor Long, Ms. Caitlin Fowler, Mr. Samuele Bradley, culinary arts students, Ingham Intermediate School District; presented on the Fresh and Furious Food Truck Program.

Dr. Rice said Chef Corbett Day, and culinary arts students from Ingham Intermediate School District are sharing food for thought by providing a presentation on the culinary arts program and serving lunch from the Fresh and Furious Food Truck.

Dr. Rice welcomed audience members Mr. Jason Mellema, Superintendent, Ingham Intermediate School District; the Ingham Intermediate School District Cabinet; and Ms. Jamiyah Kimbrough, culinary arts student, Ingham Intermediate School District.

Dr. Scott Koenigs knecht, former Superintendent of Ingham Intermediate School District, shared a video clip of the culinary arts students and the Fresh and Furious Food Truck.

Information was shared via a [PowerPoint presentation](#).

Board member comments included college credits earned, catering opportunities, funding used for student travel to competitions, opportunities to give back to the community, standardized tests and completion of class credits at the intermediate school district, attendance at home high school, inclusion of students with disabilities, and career and technical education expansion.

VII. PRESENTATION OF 2019 STATE ASSESSMENT RESULTS

Dr. Venessa Keesler, Deputy Superintendent, Educator, Student and School Supports; and Mr. Andy Middlestead, Director, Educational Assessment and Accountability; presented the 2019 State Assessment Results.

Dr. Rice said the Michigan Department of Education oversaw another successful administration of the state's assessment system this past spring. He said the scores from the 2018 to the 2019 school year are the closest apples to apples comparison between two years. He said this year, again, over 99% of students participated in the M-STEP online, and there was a successful transition to the PSAT 8/9 in grade 8. He said despite the record number of snow days in many school districts last winter, this year's results show many schools increased or maintained their scores.

Dr. Rice said the presentation is informational and requires no Board action.

Information was shared via a [PowerPoint presentation](#).

Board member comments included pending legislation to eliminate ACT WorkKeys, definition of proficiency, determination of cut scores, Read by Grade Three exemptions, helping parents fully understand Read by Grade Three, National Assessment of Educational Progress (NAEP) not analogous with proficiency, cost of reimbursement of assessments, the most impacted communities have fewer resources, alternate assessments, meeting the statute's timeline for notification of parents is challenging, environmental factors and computer skills affecting assessment results, and administration of the SAT on the Monday following spring break in some school districts.

VIII. UPDATE ON ACCOUNTABILITY SYSTEMS

Dr. Venessa Keesler, Deputy Superintendent, Educator, Student and School Supports; and Mr. Chris Janzer, Assistant Director, Educational Assessment and Accountability; presented the Update on Accountability Systems.

Dr. Rice said the presentation provides an overview of Michigan's three systems of accountability, with particular attention to the requirements and implementation of Public Act 601, the "A-F" law. He said staff will provide a brief overview of the Parent Dashboard for School Transparency and the School Index, and then discuss the requirements of Public Act 601 as well as the points of decision-making discretion allowed by the law.

Information was shared via a [PowerPoint presentation](#).

Board member comments included algorithm is complicated and difficult for most people to understand resulting in a problem understanding letter grades, technical assistance to superintendents to promote understanding of the algorithm and index, calculations for categories, index on dashboard, growth model and trajectories indicating adequate growth, growth number and proficiency number, categories mandated by the federal Every Student Succeeds Act (ESSA), weighting is negotiated in ESSA Plan, percentage of classroom children with special education needs should be considered when comparing schools, members of Peer Review Panel, Public Act 601 does not prohibit adding letters, determination of alignment of A-F system with dashboard and ESSA, comparison to similar schools decided by commission is drafting error in legislation, State Board of Education wants to be involved in setting cut scores, Panel report expected at the end of October, concern for small schools regarding percentage rate of chronically absent students, background information on ESSA cut scores and how they were determined, are M-STEP cut scores determined annually, comparing to similar schools could be a point of controversy, weighting of student teacher and economically disadvantaged, language matters – avoid using words such as career and college ready and proficiency without corresponding meaning every time, can free lunch be separated from reduced lunch since poverty is not created equal, and the State Board of Education should use the discretion given to them.

IX. RECESS

The Board recessed the Committee of the Whole at 11:58 a.m. and reconvened the Regular Meeting at 1:00 p.m.

Ms. Ramos-Montigny ended her telephone connection at 11:58 a.m. and rejoined later in the meeting.

Mr. Neyhart left the meeting at 12:30 p.m.

REGULAR MEETING

X. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION IN STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MEETING

1. Dr. Deborah Hunter-Harvill, Member, Detroit Public Schools Community District Board of Education, from Detroit, Michigan, provided comments supporting Dr. Michael Rice and the State Board of Education. She said the support from the Michigan Department is appreciated.
 2. Mr. Joel Marwil from Farmington, Michigan provided comments regarding diversity and the need for a diversity committee.
 3. Dr. Heidi Cate, Superintendent, Lighthouse Academy, from Kentwood, Michigan, provided comments on the charter school grant program.
- Ms. Ramos-Montigny rejoined the meeting via telephone at 1:15 p.m.
4. Ms. Cheryl Kruger from Okemos, Michigan provided verbal and written comments on educational rights at the Michigan School for the Deaf.

XI. RECESS

The Board recessed the Regular Meeting and reconvened the Committee of the Whole at 1:18 p.m.

COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE MEETING

XII. PRESENTATION ON MODEL 24/7 TOBACCO-FREE SCHOOLS POLICY REVISION

Mr. Kyle Guerrant, Deputy Superintendent, Finance and Operations; and Dr. Diane Golzynski, Director, Health and Nutrition Services; presented the Model 24/7 Tobacco-Free Schools Policy Revision.

Dr. Rice said the 2005 State Board of Education 24/7 Tobacco-Free Schools Policy has been updated to expand the types of tobacco products, including vapor products and electronic smoking devices.

Dr. Rice said the model policy is timely, and last week Governor Whitmer directed the Department of Health and Human Services to issue emergency rules banning the sale of flavored e-cigarettes, making Michigan the first state to take such action.

Dr. Rice said the presentation will be followed by a period of public comment and a request for approval during the State Board of Education Meeting on November 12, 2019.

Information was shared via a [PowerPoint presentation](#).

Board member comments included consequences of student use of tobacco products, and an offer to help from Ms. Tilley, Director of the Southfield Community Anti-Drug Coalition.

XIII. UPDATE FROM THE OFFICE OF PARTNERSHIP DISTRICTS

Dr. William Pearson, Director, Office of Partnership Districts; and Mrs. Gloria Chapman, Assistant Director, Office of Partnership Districts; presented the Update from the Office of Partnership Districts.

Dr. Rice said the presentation is an update on the 24-month Review of Goal Attainment Structured Conference for Bridgeport-Spaulling Community School District.

Information was shared via a [PowerPoint presentation](#).

Board member comments included benchmarks initially established by the district and then updated by the district to increase math and English language arts scores, defining reconstitution, mobility of students, and teacher vacancies.

XIV. ADJOURNMENT

The Board adjourned the Committee of the Whole and reconvened the Regular Meeting at 1:43 p.m.

REGULAR MEETING

XV. APPROVAL OF STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MINUTES

Approval of Minutes of Regular and Committee of the Whole Meeting of August 13, 2019

Ms. Fecteau moved, seconded by Dr. Pritchett, that the State Board of Education approve the Minutes of the Regular and Committee of the Whole Meeting of August 13, 2019.

Dr. Ulbrich said the Report of the President section of the minutes should be amended to say that she served on the NASBE Governmental Affairs Committee, since she is no longer a member of that committee.

The vote was taken on the motion, as amended by discussion.

**Ayes: Fecteau, McMillin, Pritchett, Snyder, Tilley, Ulbrich
Absent: Pugh**

The motion carried.

XVI. REPORT OF THE PRESIDENT

Dr. Ulbrich said she was in a presentation with Dean Moje, University of Michigan, School of Education, the first week of September. Dr. Ulbrich said Dean Moje spoke of the Detroit P-20 Partnership, between the University of Michigan School of Education, Marygrove College Conservancy, Starfish Family

Services, and the Kresge Foundation. She said the Marygrove College campus will host pre-school through graduate-level education, including a teacher education program designed to emulate the hospital residencies used to prepare doctors. She said this year there will be 9th grade students, with additional grades being added each year. Dr. Ulbrich distributed written information.

XVII. REPORT OF THE STATE SUPERINTENDENT

Reports

G. Human Resources Report

H. Report on Property Transfer Decision

I. Report on Teacher Certification Revocation Decision

J. Report on Cosponsorship

Grants

K. Report on Grant Awards

1. 2018-2019 Section 99s(4) and (5) - MiSTEM Network Regions - Amendment; \$3,834,290 (Educational Supports – Paula Daniels)
2. 2018-2019 Project AWARE to Advance Wellness and Resilience in Education - Amendment; \$1,473,000 (Health and Nutrition Services – Diane Golzynski)
3. 2018-2019 Project AWARE to Advance Wellness and Resilience in Education - Amendment; \$315,526 (Health and Nutrition Services – Diane Golzynski)
4. 2018-2019 School Climate Transformation Grant - Initial; \$248,000 (Health and Nutrition Services – Diane Golzynski)
5. 2019-2020 E-Rate Enhancement Special Construction Matching Fund - Amendment; \$645,953 (Systems, Evaluation, and Technology – David Judd)
6. 2019-2020 Individuals with Disabilities Education Act, Part B, Section 619 Preschool Grants - Initial; \$11,792,196 (Preschool & Out-Of-School Time Learning – Richard Lower)
7. 2018-2019 Section 21h: Partnership District Grant - Amendment; \$7,000,000 (Partnership Districts – William Pearson)
8. 2018-2019 Section 297 - Marshall Plan for Talent Competitive Grants - Amendment; \$28,135,000 (Financial Management – Ann Richmond)

Dr. Rice said he has visited Lansing School District and Flint Community Schools – three buildings in each district; and met with each State Board of Education member. He said he will attend conferences for Middle Cities Education Association, Michigan Association of Superintendents and Administrators, and Michigan Association of Intermediate School Administrators, the week of September 16, 2019.

Dr. Rice said Michigan's Top 10 in 10 Strategic Plan will be undergoing an update to streamline, clarify, and add metrics.

Ms. Fecteau said she is supportive of clear measures and discussion of what they should be at the board table.

Dr. Ulbrich said it is time to re-evaluate the Top 10 in 10 and consider what we are comparing ourselves to.

Dr. Ulbrich asked about the Marshall Plan, and the answer was that it has gone through its cycle.

Mr. McMillin said he commends Dr. Rice for discussing metrics.

Dr. Rice said the Top 10 in 10 is bigger than what can be accomplished in the room. He said we will lead with the metrics and focus on what we as a state can accomplish for children in Michigan.

Ms. Tilley said she believes we are going in the right direction.

XVIII. REPORT OF THE MICHIGAN TEACHER OF THE YEAR

Ms. Cara Loughheed, 2019-2020 Michigan Teacher of the Year, and English language arts and history teacher at Stoney Creek High School in Rochester Community Schools, provided the Report of the Michigan Teacher of the Year.

Ms. Loughheed introduced herself and shared her interests and passions: mentoring and teacher education, equitable practices for all students and staff, and teacher retention and diversifying the workforce.

Ms. Michelle Pizzo, Region 10 Teacher of the Year, and English language arts teacher at Davison Elementary-Middle School in Detroit Public Schools Community District, shared her beliefs and passions including the parent teacher home visit program.

Dr. Rice said he looks forward to working on the teacher shortage with the Michigan and Regional Teachers of the Year.

Ms. Loughheed said Region 1 Teacher of the Year Rachal Gustafson, a special education and resource room teacher at Rapid River Public Schools, attended the August board meeting. Ms. Loughheed shared Ms. Gustafson's interests and passions.

XIX. APPROVAL OF STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MEETING SCHEDULE FOR 2020

Dr. Rice said the State Board Executive has proposed a meeting schedule for 2020. He said the regular meetings are scheduled for the second Tuesday of each month, and the Board's retreat is scheduled for the third Wednesday in May. He said the dates avoid conflicts with holidays and meetings convened by the National Association of State Boards of Education and the Council of Chief State School Officers. He said the Board is being asked to approve the 2020 State Board of Education meeting schedule.

Mr. McMillin moved, seconded by Dr. Ulbrich, that the State Board of Education approve the State Board of Education Meeting Schedule for Calendar Year 2020, as attached to the State Board Executive's memorandum dated August 27, 2019.

The vote was taken on the motion.

**Ayes: Fecteau, McMillin, Pritchett, Snyder, Tilley, Ulbrich
Absent: Pugh**

The motion carried.

XX. STATE AND FEDERAL LEGISLATIVE UPDATE

Dr. Rice asked Ms. Lupe Ramos-Montigny, Chairperson of the Board's Legislative Committee, to lead the discussion on State and Federal Legislation.

The Legislative Committee report, and board legislative priorities were distributed. Ms. Ramos-Montigny reviewed the report of the Legislative Committee, which met on September 3, 2019.

Mr. Ackley, Director, Public and Governmental Affairs, provided an update on the state budget and pending ACT WorkKeys legislation.

There was discussion regarding WorkKeys, Michigan Merit Curriculum and reauthorization of the Individuals with Disabilities Education Act, and fiscal agency analysis of the budget.

Dr. Ulbrich asked the Board's Legislative Committee to consider a statement regarding pending legislation requiring a two-thirds vote for passage during the lame duck session.

Ms. Tilley, NASBE Delegate, provided the NASBE report. Ms. Tilley said she is running for Central Area Director of NASBE, she and Ms. Ramos-Montigny are attending the annual conference, and Ms. Snyder may be attending.

Following discussion there was consensus to finalize conference attendance, and then determine Michigan's NASBE voting delegate and alternate, which Ms. Schneider will report to NASBE.

XXI. COMMENTS BY STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MEMBERS

Ms. Fecteau said she visited the Michigan School for the Deaf. She said they had a strategic plan to make American Sign Language the official language of the school, but it could not be implemented when the principal resigned. She said Ms. Teri Chapman, Director of the Office of Special Education, has handled the situation with empathy, and staff have been receptive. She said Deputy Superintendent Scott Koenigsknecht has been at the school, and Michigan Department of Education staff is working hard. She said there is a need for deaf teachers with content expertise, and she suggested a grow your own teachers program at the Michigan School for the Deaf.

Ms. Ramos-Montigny said warrior mascots were mentioned during the meeting, and it struck a chord with her regarding the elimination of Native American mascots and logos.

XXII. FUTURE MEETING DATES

- A. Tuesday, October 8, 2019 (9:30 a.m.) Regular Meeting **at Saginaw Intermediate School District**
- B. Tuesday, November 12, 2019 (9:30 a.m.) Regular Meeting
- C. Tuesday, December 10, 2019 (9:30 a.m.) Regular Meeting

XXIII. TENTATIVE AGENDA FOR NEXT MEETING

Dr. Rice asked Board members if there are additional agenda topics they would like to be considered for future meeting agendas.

XXIV. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 2:26 p.m.

The video archive of the meeting is available on Michigan's State Board of Education website (www.michigan.gov/sbe).

Respectfully submitted,

Michelle Fecteau
Secretary