

MINUTES

STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION

Ladislaus B. Dombrowski Board Room
John A. Hannah Building
608 West Allegan
Lansing, Michigan

January 8, 2019
9:30 a.m.

Present: Ms. Sheila A. Alles, Chairperson
Dr. Casandra E. Ulbrich, President
Dr. Pamela Pugh, Vice President
Ms. Michelle Fecteau, Secretary
Mr. Tom McMillin, Treasurer
Ms. Tiffany Tilley, NASBE Delegate
Dr. Judith Pritchett
Ms. Lupe Ramos-Montigny
Ms. Nikki Snyder
Mr. Josh Neyhart, representing Governor Gretchen Whitmer, ex officio

Also Present: Mrs. Laura Chang, 2018-2019 Michigan Teacher of the Year

REGULAR MEETING

I. CALL TO ORDER

Ms. Alles called the meeting to order at 9:30 a.m.

II. APPROVAL OF AGENDA AND ORDER OF PRIORITY

Mr. McMillin moved, seconded by Ms. Ramos-Montigny, that the State Board of Education approve the agenda and order of priority.

The vote was taken on the motion to approve the agenda.

The motion carried unanimously.

III. INFORMATIONAL FOLDER ITEM

1. Requests for Nominations to the Special Education Advisory Committee

IV. INTRODUCTION OF STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MEMBERS AND STAFF

Ms. Alles welcomed Dr. Judy Pritchett and Ms. Tiffany Tilley to their first official meeting as elected members of the State Board of Education.

Mrs. Marilyn Schneider, State Board Executive, introduced members of the State Board of Education.

Ms. Alles asked that new employees be introduced.

Dr. Keesler, Deputy Superintendent of Educator, Student and School Supports, introduced Mr. Stephen Nemeckay from the Office of Educational Supports.

Ms. Alles invited the audience members to introduce themselves.

Ms. Alles asked audience members to complete public participation forms if they wish to offer comments during the public participation portion of the meeting.

V. CEREMONIAL SWEARING IN OF JUDY PRITCHETT AND TIFFANY TILLEY

Ms. Alles said it is the Board's custom to have a ceremonial swearing in during the first official meeting of newly elected Board members. She said Dr. Judith Pritchett and Ms. Tiffany Tilley were elected by the voters during the November 6, 2018 general election. She said both have officially taken the oath of office on or before January 1, 2019, when their eight-year terms began.

Ms. Alles asked Ms. Tilley and Dr. Pritchett to join her at the head of the Board table. She congratulated them and performed the ceremonial swearing in by administering the oath of office.

Dr. Pritchett and Ms. Tilley introduced their guests.

VI. ELECTION OF STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION OFFICERS FOR 2019-2020

Ms. Alles said the By-laws of the State Board of Education state that at the January meeting of each odd numbered year, the voting members of the State Board of Education shall elect from their membership, a President, Vice President, Secretary, Treasurer, and National Association of State Boards of Education Delegate.

A. Ms. Alles declared nominations open for the President of the State Board of Education.

Dr. Pugh nominated Dr. Casandra Ulbrich for President of the State Board of Education. Ms. Fecteau supported the nomination.

Ms. Alles asked if Dr. Ulbrich would accept the nomination for President, and Dr. Ulbrich said she would accept the nomination.

Ms. Alles asked if there were additional nominations for President. Since there were no further nominations, Ms. Alles declared that the nominations be closed.

A roll-call vote was taken on the motion of President of the State Board of Education.

**Fecteau – Ulbrich
McMillin – Ulbrich
Pritchett – Ulbrich
Pugh – Ulbrich
Ramos-Montigny – Ulbrich
Snyder – Ulbrich
Tilley – Ulbrich
Ulbrich – Ulbrich**

The motion carried unanimously.

Ms. Alles declared Dr. Ulbrich President of the State Board of Education.

- B. Ms. Alles declared nominations open for the Vice President of the State Board of Education.

Dr. Ulbrich nominated Dr. Pamela Pugh for Vice President of the State Board of Education. Ms. Fecteau supported the nomination.

Ms. Alles asked if Dr. Pugh would accept the nomination for Vice President, and Dr. Pugh said she would accept the nomination.

Ms. Alles asked if there were additional nominations for Vice President. Since there were no further nominations, Ms. Alles declared that the nominations be closed.

A roll-call vote was taken on the motion of Vice President of the State Board of Education.

**Fecteau – Pugh
McMillin – Pugh
Pritchett – Pugh
Pugh – Pugh
Ramos-Montigny – Pugh
Snyder – Pugh
Tilley – Pugh
Ulbrich – Pugh**

The motion carried unanimously.

Ms. Alles declared Dr. Pugh Vice President of the State Board of Education.

- C. Ms. Alles declared nominations open for the Secretary of the State Board of Education.

Mr. McMillin nominated Ms. Michelle Fecteau for Secretary of the State Board of Education. Dr. Ulbrich supported the nomination.

Ms. Alles asked if Ms. Fecteau would accept the nomination for Secretary, and Ms. Fecteau said she would accept the nomination.

Ms. Alles asked if there were additional nominations for Secretary. Since there were no further nominations, Ms. Alles declared that the nominations be closed.

A roll-call vote was taken on the motion of Secretary of the State Board of Education.

**Fecteau – Fecteau
McMillin – Fecteau
Pritchett – Fecteau
Pugh – Fecteau
Ramos-Montigny – Fecteau
Snyder – Fecteau
Tilley – Fecteau
Ulbrich – Fecteau**

The motion carried unanimously.

Ms. Alles declared Ms. Fecteau Secretary of the State Board of Education.

- D. Ms. Alles declared nominations open for the Treasurer of the State Board of Education.

Ms. Michelle Fecteau nominated Mr. Tom McMillin for Treasurer of the State Board of Education. Dr. Pugh supported the nomination.

Ms. Alles asked if Mr. McMillin would accept the nomination for Treasurer, and Mr. McMillin said he would accept the nomination.

Ms. Alles asked if there were additional nominations for Treasurer. Since there were no further nominations, Ms. Alles declared that the nominations be closed.

A roll-call vote was taken on the motion of Treasurer of the State Board of Education.

**Fecteau – McMillin
McMillin – McMillin
Pritchett – McMillin**

**Pugh – McMillin
Ramos-Montigny – McMillin
Snyder – McMillin
Tilley – McMillin
Ulbrich – McMillin**

The motion carried unanimously.

Ms. Alles declared Mr. McMillin Treasurer of the State Board of Education.

- E. Ms. Alles declared nominations open for the National Association of State Boards of Education (NASBE) Delegate of the State Board of Education.

Ms. Ramos-Montigny nominated Ms. Tiffany Tilley for NASBE Delegate of the State Board of Education. Dr. Ulbrich supported the nomination.

Ms. Alles asked if Ms. Tilley would accept the nomination for NASBE Delegate, and Ms. Tilley said she would accept the nomination.

Ms. Alles asked if there were additional nominations for NASBE Delegate. Since there were no further nominations, Ms. Alles declared that the nominations be closed.

A roll-call vote was taken on the motion of NASBE Delegate of the State Board of Education.

**Fecteau – Tilley
McMillin – Tilley
Pritchett – Tilley
Pugh – Tilley
Ramos-Montigny – Tilley
Snyder – Tilley
Tilley – Tilley
Ulbrich – Tilley**

The motion carried unanimously.

Ms. Alles declared Ms. Tilley NASBE Delegate of the State Board of Education.

VII. RECESS

The Board recessed the Regular Meeting at 9:47 a.m. and convened the Committee of the Whole.

COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE MEETING

VIII. CALL TO ORDER

Ms. Alles called the Committee of the Whole Meeting to order at 9:48 a.m.

IX. PRESENTATION ON K-12 COMPUTER SCIENCE STANDARDS

There was Board consensus to reorder the agenda.

Dr. Venessa Keesler, Deputy Superintendent of Educator, Student and School Supports; Ms. Michelle Ribant, Director of 21st Century Learning; and Ann-Marie Mapes, Educational Technology Manager; presented on the K-12 Computer Science Standards.

Ms. Alles said the K-12 Computer Science Standards were developed through the input of a stakeholder committee beginning in May 2018. She said the new computer standards are critical for Michigan students to be successful in the 21st Century economy. She said a series of five in-person public comment sessions are planned for February, and it is anticipated that Board approval of the standards will be requested in April.

Information was shared via a [PowerPoint presentation](#).

Board member comments included a process question, whether standards are optional, Amazon computer science standards, example of computer science curriculum for kindergarten through second grade, computational thinking applicable to various industries, and public input sessions including a cross-section of people providing input.

X. RECESS

The Board recessed the Committee of the Whole at 10:10 a.m. and reconvened the Regular Meeting.

REGULAR MEETING

XI. REPORT OF THE PRESIDENT

Dr. Ulbrich thanked Board members for their support by electing her President of the Board. She congratulated the other officers of the Board. She welcomed Dr. Judy Pritchett and Ms. Tiffany Tilley as new Board members.

Dr. Ulbrich said the Board has two consistent committees, and the President may appointment members. She said all Board members are welcome to participate in any of the committees.

Dr. Ulbrich said the Agenda Planning Committee will be comprised of the four officers: Dr. Ulbrich, Dr. Pugh, Ms. Fecteau and Mr. McMillin.

Dr. Ulbrich said the Legislative Committee will be chaired by Ms. Ramos-Montigny and members will be Ms. Tilley, Dr. Pritchett and Ms. Snyder.

Dr. Ulbrich interrupted her report to welcome Governor Gretchen Whitmer to the meeting.

XII. RECESS

The Board recessed the Regular Meeting at 10:15 a.m. and reconvened the Committee of the Whole.

Mr. Josh Neyhart, representing Governor Whitmer, joined the meeting at 10:15 a.m.

COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE MEETING

XIII. REMARKS BY GOVERNOR GRETCHEN WHITMER

Ms. Alles welcomed Governor Gretchen Whitmer to the State Board of Education meeting.

Governor Whitmer shared her personal connection to education. She said her grandfather was the Superintendent of Pontiac Schools and her grandmother taught former State Superintendent Brian Whiston in elementary school. She said education is one of her top priorities.

Governor Whitmer ended her remarks and greeted Board members, audience members and Michigan Department of Education staff members.

XIV. RECESS

The Board recessed the Committee of the Whole at 10:18 a.m. and reconvened the Regular Meeting at 10:41 a.m.

REGULAR MEETING

XV. REPORT OF THE PRESIDENT (continued)

Dr. Ulbrich said it was a great opportunity to meet Governor Whitmer, and she resumed her report.

Dr. Ulbrich said there are three commissions, in which former Board members Dr. Richard Zeile and Mrs. Eileen Weiser represented the Board. She said they are the Career Readiness Cross Sector Team, NASBE Early Learning Workforce, and the NASBE Social and Emotional Learning Network.

Following discussion, there was Board consensus that Dr. Pritchett will serve on the Career Readiness Cross Sector Team, and the NASBE Early Learning Workforce; and Mr. McMillin and Dr. Pugh will serve on the NASBE Social and Emotional Learning Network.

XVI. PERSONAL PRIVILEGE – MS. SHEILA ALLES

Ms. Alles welcomed Mr. Josh Nayhart to the Board table as Governor Whitmer's representative.

XVII. RECESS

The Board recessed the Regular Meeting at 10:45 a.m. and reconvened the Committee of the Whole.

COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE MEETING

XVIII. PRESENTATION ON MICHIGAN INTEGRATED CONTINUOUS IMPROVEMENT PROCESS (MICIP)

Dr. Venessa Keesler, Deputy Superintendent of Educator, Student and School Supports, presented on Michigan Integrated Continuous Improvement Process (MICIP).

Ms. Alles said the Michigan Department of Education (MDE) is committed to a system of continuous improvement that supports the whole child. She said this is in alignment with Michigan's Top 10 in 10 Strategic Plan and the state plan for the Every Student Succeeds Act. She said MICIP is how MDE will support school districts to assess needs, develop plans for continuous improvement and allocate funding to implement those plans through one integrated process.

Information was shared via a [PowerPoint presentation](#).

Board member comments included spirit of continuous improvement with specific targeted goals, ability to shift to meet needs, district participation and flexibility of assessment tools to meet local needs, representative group of districts to do a pilot project, data readily available, how to determine progress and goal attainment, funding process, integrated grant application for ease of districts, and needs assessment with qualitative data.

XIX. DISCUSSION REGARDING CRITERIA FOR GRANT PROGRAMS

Mr. McMillin asked for clarification on the Criteria for Great Start to Quality Grant and Criteria for Early Childhood Support Networks Grant. Dr. Scott Koenigsknecht, Deputy Superintendent, P-20 Systems and Student Transitions; and Ms. Lisa Brewer Walraven, Director, Child Development and Care provided additional information.

XX. UPDATE FROM THE OFFICE OF PARTNERSHIP DISTRICTS

There was Board consensus to reorder the agenda.

Dr. Venessa Keesler, Deputy Superintendent of Educator, Student and School Supports; Dr. Bill Pearson, State School Reform Officer and Director of the Office of Partnership Districts; Dr. LaWanna Shelton, Interim Assistant Director, Office of Partnership Districts; and Mr. Dan LaDue, Supervisor, Office of Partnership Districts; presented the Update from the Office of Partnership Districts.

Ms. Alles said the presentation includes updates on the Review of Goal Attainment process, 21h applications, and Benton Harbor Area Schools' Cooperative Agreement.

Mr. McMillin asked if the lame duck legislative session had an effect on the Office of Partnership Districts.

Ms. Alles said further information will be provided during the State and Federal Legislative Update later in the meeting.

Information was shared via a handout and [PowerPoint presentation](#).

Board member comments included elimination of Section 1280c in the Revised School Code, Review of Goal Attainment sessions including elected union representatives, goals of partnership districts, and partners at the table during Review of Goal Attainment sessions.

XXI. ADJOURNMENT

The Board adjourned the Committee of the Whole at 11:58 a.m. and reconvened the Regular Meeting at 1:00 p.m.

REGULAR MEETING

XXII. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION IN STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MEETING

1. John Lauve, Holly, Michigan, provided comments and written information regarding agendas and the Constitution.
2. Ellen Zwarenstejn from Caledonia, Michigan; and Michael Obuchi from Kentwood, Michigan; representing the Michigan Center for Civic Education; shared opportunities for civic education at the Michigan Center for Civic Education.

XXIII. APPROVAL OF STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MINUTES

Approval of Minutes of Regular and Committee of the Whole Meeting of December 11, 2018

Dr. Pritchett moved, seconded by Mr. McMillin, that the State Board of Education approve the Minutes of the Regular and Committee of the Whole Meeting of December 11, 2018.

The vote was taken on the motion.

The motion carried unanimously.

XXIV. REPORT OF THE INTERIM STATE SUPERINTENDENT

Reports

- I. Human Resources Report
- J. Report on Approved Changes to the West Shore Educational Service District Plan for the Delivery of Special Education Programs and Services

Grants

K. Report on Grant Awards

1. [2018-2019 Child Care and Development Block Grant - Initial; \\$11,736,824](#) (Child Development and Care – Lisa Brewer-Walraven)
2. [2018-2019 Section 401 - Flint Early Childhood Education Partnership - Initial; \\$4,519,568](#) (Child Development and Care – Lisa Brewer-Walraven)
3. [2018-2019 Section 55 - Conductive Learning Center - Initial; \\$250,000](#) (Special Education – Teri Chapman)
4. [2018-2019 ISD Collaboration Grant - Initial; \\$180,145](#) (Educational Supports – Paula Daniels)
5. [2018-2019 ISD Collaboration Grant - Initial; \\$319,200](#) (Educational Supports – Paula Daniels)
6. [2018-2019 Section 99u\(3\) - Spanish Language Literacy Software - Initial; \\$500,000](#) (Educational Supports – Paula Daniels)
7. [2018-2019 Section 104d – Acceptable Assessment Tools for Early Literacy Educators - Initial; \\$9,200,000](#) (Educational Supports – Paula Daniels)
8. [2017-2018 Section 11s - Flint Declaration of Emergency Grants - Nutritional Services - Amendment; \\$1,220,000](#) (Health and Nutrition Services – Diane Golzynski)
9. [2018-2019 Flint Declaration of Emergency Grants - Initial; \\$2,185,000](#) (Health and Nutrition Services – Diane Golzynski)
10. [2018-2019 Project AWARE to Advance Wellness and Resilience in Education - Initial; \\$1,353,000](#) (Health and Nutrition Services – Diane Golzynski)
11. [2018-2019 Project AWARE to Advance Wellness and Resilience in Education - Initial; \\$279,526](#) (Health and Nutrition Services – Diane Golzynski)
12. [2018-2019 Project Unify - Initial; \\$500,000](#) (Health and Nutrition Services – Diane Golzynski)

13. [2018-2019 Section 31j - Michigan 10 Cents A Meal Support of Local Produce in School Meals - Initial; \\$551,000](#) (Health and Nutrition Services – Diane Golzynski)
14. [2018-2019 Section 99h: Competitive FIRST Robotics Grants - Initial; \\$3,191,600](#) (Systems, Evaluation, and Technology – David Judd)
15. [2018-2019 Section 104\(4\) - Kindergarten Entry Observation Tool - Initial; Continuation; \\$1,500,000](#) (Educational Assessment and Accountability – Andrew Middlestead)
16. [2018-2019 Section 21h: Partnership District Grant - Amendment; \\$3,330,328](#) (Partnership Districts – William Pearson)
17. [2018-2019 Section 61a\(5\) - CTE Counselor Designated Grant - Initial; \\$1,000,000](#) (Career and Technical Education – Brian Pyles)
18. [2018-2019 Section 61c\(1\) - Designated Secondary CTE Equipment Grant - Initial; \\$2,499,986](#) (Career and Technical Education – Brian Pyles)
19. [2017-2018 Impact Aid for Displaced Students - Assistance for Homeless Children and Youth - Initial; \\$9,795](#) (Financial Management – Ann Richmond)
20. [2018-2019 Section 31b - Balanced Calendar Instructional Program Grant - Initial; \\$750,000](#) (Financial Management – Ann Richmond)

Ms. Alles shared a verbal report on the Governor’s Transition Team Meetings, the State Superintendent search process, Governor Whitmer’s education platform, and the \$5,058,813 Preschool Development Grant from the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services and the U.S. Education Department.

XXV. REPORT OF MICHIGAN TEACHER OF THE YEAR

Ms. Laura Chang, 2018-2019 Michigan Teacher of the Year, provided the Report of the Michigan Teacher of the Year.

Ms. Chang presented on the Kalamazoo Area Mathematics and Science Center (KAMSC). Ms. Chang distributed two documents on KAMSC.

Ms. Karen Nicol, Region 5 Teacher of the Year, a first grade teacher at Marlette Elementary School in Marlette, Michigan, presented on literacy.

XXVI. DISCUSSION ON STATE SUPERINTENDENT SEARCH

Dr. Casandra Ulbrich, President of the Board, led the Discussion on the State Superintendent Search.

Dr. Ulbrich welcomed Mr. Ricardo Medina and Mr. Michael Collins, Regional Search Associates, Ray & Associates, Inc. Mr. Collins joined the meeting via telephone.

Mr. Medina distributed five documents: (1) promotional flyer, (2) timeline, (3) purpose of constituent meetings, (4) representative questions, and (5) suggested stakeholders to be included in constituent meetings.

Discussion followed with Board members proposing edits to the documents.

Ms. Fecteau moved, seconded by Mr. McMillin that the State Board of Education designate the President of the Board to approve documents related to the State Superintendent search, after draft documents have been shared with Board members giving them an opportunity for input and edits.

The vote was taken on the motion.

The motion carried unanimously.

XXVII. STATE AND FEDERAL LEGISLATIVE UPDATE

Ms. Alles asked Mr. Ackley, Director of Public and Governmental Affairs, to provide an update on State and Federal Legislative issues.

Mr. Ackley provided a verbal and written report on 2018 Lame Duck Legislation.

Discussion followed.

Dr. Ulbrich asked Board members to propose legislative priorities, and Board members shared their priorities.

Dr. Ulbrich said her priorities are exploring possible amendments for Section 22p (Partnership Schools) in the School Aid Act; replacing the A-F accountability system and have the Michigan Department of Education create the system; and making sure that "consent" is part of the requirements to be taught in sex education.

Dr. Pugh said her priority is water testing and maintenance in schools including monitoring testing of water in schools and child care centers.

Ms. Fecteau said her priorities include the validity of the teacher evaluation system; tax credits and their effect on school funding; and a better funding model for education.

Mr. McMillin said his priorities include repealing the educator evaluation law; data privacy including requiring parental approval; and repealing the A-F accountability system.

Ms. Snyder said her priority is the Student Safety Act regarding sexual assault and the consequences of sexual assault in schools. She said she would like to know how the new laws will improve school culture.

XXVIII. CONSENT AGENDA

- N. Approval of Criteria for Library Services and Technology Act (LSTA) Improving Access to Information Grant Program, \$100,000
- O. Approval of Criteria for Great Start to Quality Grant, based on appropriation by Legislature
- P. Approval of Criteria for Early Childhood Support Networks Grant, based on appropriation by Legislature

Dr. Ulbrich moved, seconded by Dr. Pugh, that the State Board of Education approve the Consent Agenda as follows:

- N. approve the Criteria for Library Services and Technology Act Improving Access to Information Grant Program, as attached to the Superintendent’s memorandum dated January 2, 2019;**
- O. approve the Criteria for Great Start to Quality Grant, as attached to the Superintendent’s memorandum dated January 2, 2019; and**
- P. approve the Criteria for the Early Childhood Support Networks Grant, as attached to the Superintendent’s memorandum dated January 2, 2019.**

Discussion followed.

The vote was taken on the motion.

**Ayes: Fecteau, Pritchett, Pugh, Ramos-Montigny, Tilley, Ulbrich
Nays: McMillin, Snyder**

The motion carried.

XXIX. COMMENTS BY STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MEMBERS

Mr. McMillin and Dr. Pugh welcomed Ms. Tilley and Dr. Pritchett.

Dr. Pritchett and Ms. Tilley said they are thankful for the warm welcome and helpful staff providing a smooth transition.

Dr. Pugh said the educator shortage needs to be addressed. She said she is planning to participate an upcoming event at the Michigan Center for Civic Education.

Dr. Tilley said she is hopeful that one of the five public comment sessions for computer science standards can be scheduled in Wayne County.

XXX. TENTATIVE AGENDA FOR NEXT MEETING

Ms. Alles asked Board members if there are future agenda topics they would like to be considered for future meeting agendas. Ms. Fecteau suggested a presentation by the ACLU regarding the implementation of the suspension and expulsion law, and United Way's Bibs to Backpacks program. Ms. Snyder suggested a presentation on student data privacy and health information.

XXXI. FUTURE MEETING DATES

- A. Tuesday, February 12, 2019 (9:30 a.m.) Regular Meeting
- B. Tuesday, March 12, 2019 (9:30 a.m.) Regular Meeting
- C. Tuesday, April 9, 2019 (9:30 a.m.) Regular Meeting

XXXII. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 3:07 p.m.

The video archive of the meeting is available on the [Michigan State Board of Education website \(www.michigan.gov/sbe\)](http://www.michigan.gov/sbe).

Respectfully submitted,

Michelle Fecteau
Secretary