

MINUTES

STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION

Saginaw Intermediate School District
Transitions Professional Development Center
3860 Fashion Square Boulevard
Saginaw, Michigan

October 8, 2019
9:30 a.m.

Present: Dr. Michael F. Rice, Chairperson
Dr. Casandra E. Ulbrich, President
Dr. Pamela Pugh, Vice President
Ms. Michelle Fecteau, Secretary
Mr. Tom McMillin, Treasurer
Ms. Tiffany Tilley, NASBE Delegate
Dr. Judith Pritchett
Ms. Lupe Ramos-Montigny
Ms. Nikki Snyder

Absent: Mr. Josh Neyhart, representing Governor Gretchen Whitmer, ex officio

Also Present: Ms. Cara Lougheed, 2019-2020 Michigan Teacher of the Year

REGULAR MEETING

I. CALL TO ORDER

Dr. Rice called the meeting to order at 9:32 a.m. He thanked Superintendent Kathy Stewart, board members, staff and students of Saginaw Intermediate School District for hosting the State Board of Education meeting.

II. APPROVAL OF AGENDA AND ORDER OF PRIORITY

Mr. McMillin moved, seconded by Ms. Ramos-Montigny, that the State Board of Education approve the agenda and order of priority.

The vote was taken on the motion.

The motion carried unanimously.

III. INTRODUCTION OF STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MEMBERS AND STAFF

Dr. Rice asked that the members of the State Board of Education be introduced. Mrs. Marilyn Schneider, State Board Executive, introduced the members of the State Board of Education.

IV. RECESS

The Board recessed the Regular Meeting to convene the Committee of the Whole at 9:34 a.m.

COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE MEETING

V. CALL TO ORDER

Dr. Rice called the Committee of the Whole Meeting to order at 9:35 a.m.

VI. PRESENTATION BY SAGINAW INTERMEDIATE SCHOOL DISTRICT

Dr. Rice repeated his thanks to Superintendent Kathy Stewart and the staff of Saginaw Intermediate School District for hosting the State Board of Education meeting. He thanked students from Chesaning Union Schools who were videotaping and culinary students from the Saginaw Career Complex who prepared and served the food.

Dr. Rice said the State Board of Education is happy to be in Saginaw County to see the work being done in the Transformation Zone.

Dr. Kathy Stewart, Superintendent, Saginaw Intermediate School District, facilitated a presentation of programs and services offered by Saginaw Intermediate School District. The presentations included staff and students.

VII. PRESENTATION OF THE 2018-2019 ANNUAL REVIEW

Ms. Sheila Alles, Chief Deputy Superintendent; Dr. Venessa Keesler, Deputy Superintendent, Educator, Student and School Supports; Dr. Scott Koenigsknecht, Deputy Superintendent, P-20 System and Student Transitions; Mr. Ross Fort, Special Assistant, Finance and Operations; and Mr. Richard Lower, Director, Preschool & Out-of-School Time Learning; presented the 2018-2019 Annual Review.

Dr. Rice said the Michigan Department of Education Annual Review is a reflection on the work of the Department during the 2018-2019 school year, with a focus on the Michigan Department priorities of literacy, whole child, and prenatal through age 8.

Dr. Rice said the presentation is informational and requires no Board action.

Information was shared via a [PowerPoint presentation](#). Copies of the Michigan Department of Education Annual Review 2018-2019 were distributed.

Board member comments included reliability and validity of standard setting and determining cut scores, gaps of disparity between race and economics, clarification on using only reading items related to Read by Grade Three, retention notification to parents, disproportionate effects on communities, opportunities for parents to opt out, toolkits for parents and school personnel, impact of current budget on priorities, applying metrics to Top 10 in 10 strategies, continuous quality improvement, equity in education, State Board of Education was not in favor of the retention portion of the Read by Grade Three law, and types of literacy training.

VIII. UPDATE FROM THE OFFICE OF PARTNERSHIP DISTRICTS

There was Board consensus to reorder the agenda in the interest of time.

Dr. William Pearson, Director, Office of Partnership Districts; and Mrs. Gloria Chapman, Assistant Director, Office of Partnership Districts; presented the Update from the Office of Partnership Districts.

Dr. Rice said the presentation is an update on the 24-month Review of Goal Attainment Structured Conference for Saginaw Public Schools.

Dr. Pearson provided the update on the Review of Goal Attainment Structured Conference, which occurred on October 7, 2019.

Board member comments included reasons for teacher vacancies, effects of A-F Accountability System on Partnership Districts, as gaps are filled don't lose sight of award recognition of teachers of color, permanent substitute teachers, teacher shortage is an issue across the state and is not isolated to particular subject areas, and what is being done to help fill teacher vacancies.

IX. RECESS

The Board recessed the Committee of the Whole to convene the Regular Meeting at 11:49 a.m.

REGULAR MEETING

X. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION IN STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MEETING

1. Mr. Alberto Teneyuque, representing parents against school bullying, from Saginaw, Michigan, provided comments regarding bullying in schools and the effect of students committing suicide and self-harm.
2. Mr. Keith Young, representing Ecotek Lab, from Detroit, Michigan, provided comments and written information regarding science, technology, engineering and math education and research opportunities for kindergarten through 12th grade students.

3. Mr. David Lewis, Mr. George Copeland, and Ms. Shantra Williams, representing Saginaw Valley State University Charter School Office, from Saginaw, Michigan, offered comments and written information on the work of Saginaw Valley State University as a charter school authorizer, and college completion.
4. Mr. Jon Felske, representing Covenant Academies, from Saginaw Michigan, shared comments on the work of Covenant Academies.
5. Mr. James J. Beasley, Jr., from Detroit, Michigan, and Mr. James Hare, from Bloomfield, Michigan, representing Sigma Research Group of Michigan, shared comments and written information on closing the achievement gap with growth-based strategies.
6. Ms. Ivy Golob, from Saginaw, Michigan, shared comments on lesbian, gay, bisexual, and transgender in history class.
7. Ms. Heather Golob, from Saginaw, Michigan, shared comments on Michigan School for the Deaf concerns.
8. Ms. Rosa Morales, from Saginaw, Michigan, shared comments on the Hispanic Community Parent School Partnership.

XI. RECESS

The Board recessed the Regular Meeting to convene the Committee of the Whole at 1:23 p.m.

COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE MEETING

XII. UPDATE ON ACCOUNTABILITY SYSTEMS

Dr. Venessa Keesler, Deputy Superintendent, Educator, Student and School Supports, presented the Update on Accountability Systems.

Dr. Rice said the presentation is a monthly update regarding activities related to the design, development, and implementation of the A-F letter grade system required by Public Act 601 of 2018.

Information was shared via a [PowerPoint presentation](#).

Mr. McMillin asked why a combined letter grade is being proposed as the preferred option. Dr. Keesler said it has been done in the past and is simpler. Mr. McMillin said he is inclined to support the combined letter grade rather than separate letter grades.

Ms. Ramos-Montigny said she will support the Michigan Department of Education's recommendation for a combined letter grade. She said she is supportive of the Michigan Department of Education's Parent Dashboard for School Transparency.

Dr. Ulbrich said she doesn't know what anyone is learning from the A-F letter grade system, and she said it is complicated and difficult to explain.

Dr. Rice said the Board and State Superintendent are implementing a law, with which they do not agree.

Dr. Ulbrich asked if the difference will be defined between a grade of A or B. Dr. Rice said the peer review panel will submit a report, as mandated by state law, to the Michigan Department of Education and state legislature. Dr. Rice said it will be shared with the State Board of Education for decision-making purposes. He said there will be small group meetings with Board members and Department staff between the October and November State Board of Education meetings.

Ms. Fecteau said the Parent Dashboard for School Transparency is interactive and user-friendly. She asked if people will be able to click on the grade in the A-F system and get more information. Dr. Rice said the Department is considering options for explanation and contextualization.

Dr. Pugh asked what would happen if the State Board of Education does not take a position. Dr. Rice said the Michigan Department of Education, not the State Board of Education, has a responsibility by law. He said it will be done by March 2020, and the Board has said they want to be involved.

Dr. Rice said in March of 2019 Ms. Sheila Alles, Interim State Superintendent, and Dr. Ulbrich notified the legislature that the A-F system could not be completed by December of 2019, but it could be by completed by March of 2020. He said no response was received until the Department's budget was quartered. He said Governor Whitmer vetoed the quartering of the budget.

Dr. Ulbrich asked which system is least likely to punish schools – combined or separate grades. Dr. Rice said perhaps there will be the least damage by combining grades.

Mr. McMillin said he appreciates Dr. Rice having the State Board of Education weigh in on the decision. He said he prefers to vote on the decision to have combined or separate letter grades.

There was Board consensus to reconvene the Regular Meeting. Discussion continued during the Regular Meeting.

XIII. ADJOURNMENT

The Board adjourned the Committee of the Whole at 2:00 p.m. and reconvened the Regular Meeting.

REGULAR MEETING

XIV. UPDATE ON ACCOUNTABILITY SYSTEMS (continued)

This is a continuation of discussion earlier in the meeting.

Mr. McMillin moved, seconded by Ms. Ramos-Montigny, that the State Board of Education approve combining math and English language arts into one letter grade in the A-F grading system for public schools outlined in Public Act 601 of 2018.

Dr. Pugh said she will abstain from voting.

The vote was taken on the motion.

**Ayes: Fecteau, McMillin, Pritchett, Ramos-Montigny, Snyder,
Tilley, Ulbrich**
Abstain: Pugh

The motion carried.

Mr. McMillin said he suggested exploring the possibility of adding another letter grade to make it less harmful. He said he has discussed it with others, and has not been able to determine another grade. He asked if all schools can be an A or B.

Dr. Ulbrich said governance, transparency, financial acumen, and health of a school are not gradable. She said perhaps that could be included in the comparison of schools. She said defining students with disabilities is a fairness issue since disabilities vary in complexity. She said she is concerned that the A-F system will be used in unintended ways such as school closures in the future.

Ms. Fecteau said full time equivalent could be explored as a definition for students with disabilities.

Ms. Fecteau said school closures, and opening charter schools in underserved areas with tax incentives and lack of transparency benefits for-profit charter schools.

Dr. Pugh said at a time when differentiated funding is not available, school districts that are furthest behind and are receiving the same amount of funding are expected to compete and be compared with their peers. She asked how to grade a school district that is that far behind and receiving the same amount of funding?

Mr. McMillin said he is proposing that an additional letter grade is not added at this time, and there was Board consensus.

Dr. Rice said the Michigan Department of Education is proposing the following areas for ranking labels: chronically absent, assessment participation, and subgroup proficiency compared to statewide average.

Dr. Ulbrich asked if it is common for students to take the English language arts assessment, but not the math assessment, or vice versa. Dr. Keesler said it is not common, but it could happen.

Dr. Ulbrich asked if there is 95% participation, would all schools be labeled average, which makes them look worse than they are? Dr. Keesler said determining what is considered average is a decision point and a cut score that needs to be set.

Dr. Pritchett asked if the number for chronically absent has been determined. Dr. Keesler said ten percent of days is currently used in the parent dashboard and index, and that is the nationally recommended standard.

Dr. Pritchett said she would not have an issue with giving all schools significantly above average for assessment participation. She said she does not know the average for the other 49 states, which may have low participation rates.

Dr. Keesler explained subgroup calculations in response to a question from Dr. Pritchett.

Dr. Ulbrich said a longer algorithm is more difficult to replicate, and she is concerned about schools being able to understand it, explain it, and know what to do to improve.

Dr. Keesler reviewed the requirement of the law related to ranking labels, in response to a question from Dr. Ulbrich.

Dr. Pritchett asked what number will be used for subgroups, because some schools in Michigan do not have enough students to be counted as a subgroup. Dr. Keesler said current business rules for subgroup is 30 students.

Discussion followed regarding subgroup calculations.

Dr. Rice said small group presentations and discussions will occur during the next month, and during the November Board meeting.

XV. APPROVAL OF STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MINUTES

Approval of Minutes of Regular and Committee of the Whole Meeting of September 10, 2019

Mr. McMillin moved, seconded by Dr. Ulbrich, that the State Board of Education approve the Minutes of the Regular and Committee of the Whole Meeting of September 10, 2019.

The vote was taken on the motion.

The motion carried unanimously.

XVI. REPORT OF THE PRESIDENT

Dr. Ulbrich said she will forego her report, in the interest of time.

Dr. Ulbrich said Ms. Alles visited Yale Public Schools, where Dr. Ulbrich attended school. She thanked Ms. Alles for delivering a bulldog mascot from Superintendent Dale Bledsoe.

XVII. REPORT OF THE STATE SUPERINTENDENT

Report

F. Human Resources Report

Grants

K. Report on Grant Awards

1. 2019-2020 IDEA, Part B Formula Grants - Initial; \$377,936,778 (Special Education – Teri Chapman)
2. 2019-2020 Distribution of Federal Funds Awarded to Michigan Through Part C of the Individuals with Disabilities Education Act - Initial; \$10,165,007 (Early Childhood Development & Family Education – Renee DeMars-Johnson)
3. 2018-2019 Section 31j - Michigan 10 Cents A Meal Support of Local Produce in School Meals - Amendment; \$551,000 (Health and Nutrition Services – Diane Golzynski)
4. 2019-2020 LSTA Collaborative Library Services Grant Program - Initial; \$245,610 (State Librarian – Randy Riley)
5. 2019-2020 LSTA Improving Access to Information Grant Program - Initial; \$111,533 (State Librarian – Randy Riley)

Dr. Rice said he visited several schools in the Eastern Upper Peninsula. He said Dr. Dan Reattoir, Superintendent, Eastern Upper Peninsula Intermediate School District, accompanied him to Whitefish Township Community Schools, Ojibwe Charter School, Brimley Area Schools, Les Cheneaux Community Schools, Eastern Upper Peninsula Learning Center, and Superior Start School Readiness Center.

Dr. Rice said he was impressed with the resiliency and creativity of staff and students. He said 22d funding is important for geographically isolated school districts, and it was lost in the budget process. He said he urges leaders to return to the table to discuss the budget.

XVIII. REPORT OF THE MICHIGAN TEACHER OF THE YEAR

Ms. Cara Lougheed, 2019-2020 Michigan Teacher of the Year, and English language arts and history teacher at Stoney Creek High School in Rochester Community Schools, provided the Report of the Michigan Teacher of the Year. Ms. Lougheed shared highlights of her visits during the past month.

Ms. Jessyca Mathews, Region 5 Teacher of the Year, and 11th and 12th grade English teacher at Flint Carman-Ainsworth High School in the Carman-Ainsworth Community Schools, shared her educational background, teaching experience, and celebrations related to education. Ms. Mathews spoke of her passion for advocating for the children of Flint.

XIX. APPROVAL OF CAMP TUHSMEHETA SPENDING PLAN FOR FISCAL YEAR 2019-2020

Dr. Scott Koenigsknecht, Deputy Superintendent, P-20 System and Student Transitions; Ms. Roxanne Balfour, Director, Low Incidence Outreach; Ms. Jill Teegardin, Camp Tuhsmeheeta Site Director; and Ms. Michelle Woolf, Financial Manager, Low Incidence Outreach; presented Approval of Camp Tuhsmeheeta Spending Plan for Fiscal Year 2019-2020.

Dr. Rice said the Michigan School for the Blind Trust Fund Committee met on August 27, 2019. He said members Ms. Michelle Fecteau and Ms. Nikki Snyder reviewed the Camp Tuhsmeheeta spending plan for fiscal year 2019-2020. He said the Board is being asked to approve the spending plan.

Ms. Fecteau said Camp Tuhsmeheeta is a great, positive place, and she encourages people to visit.

Ms. Snyder said she is supportive of the work that has been done to move forward after the vacancy in the camp director position.

Ms. Balfour distributed the 2019 Annual Report of Camp Tuhsmeheeta, and reviewed activities and projects that occurred during the past year.

Dr. Ulbrich moved, seconded by Dr. Pritchett, that the State Board of Education approve the Fiscal Year 2019-2020 Spending Plan for Camp Tuhsmeheeta, as attached to the Superintendent's memorandum dated September 24, 2019.

The vote was taken on the motion.

The motion carried unanimously.

XX. APPROVAL OF NOMINATIONS TO THE SPECIAL EDUCATION ADVISORY COMMITTEE - ORGANIZATIONAL SEAT REPLACEMENTS

Dr. Scott Koenigsknecht, Deputy Superintendent, P-20 System and Student Transitions, presented Approval of Nominations to the Special Education Advisory Committee – Organizational Seat Replacements.

Dr. Rice said each year the State Board of Education is asked to approve nominations to the Special Education Advisory Committee. He said the Board approved nominations on May 14, 2019, and since that time organizations have recommended 11 additional member changes, which are being presented to the Board for approval.

Ms. Ramos-Montigny moved, seconded by Ms. Fecteau, that the State Board of Education approve the nominees listed in Attachment B of the Superintendent’s memorandum dated September 24, 2019, and appoint those individuals to serve as members of the Special Education Advisory Committee for the respective terms specified.

The vote was taken on the motion.

The motion carried unanimously.

XXI. APPROVAL OF STANDARDS FOR THE PREPARATION AND PRACTICE OF SCHOOL SOCIAL WORKERS

Dr. Venessa Keesler, Deputy Superintendent of Educator, Student, and School Supports.; Dr. Sean Kottke, Education Consultant Manager; and Mr. Sungti Hsu, Education Consultant; presented Approval of Standards for the Preparation and Practice of School Social Workers.

Dr. Rice said the Standards for the Preparation and Practice of School Social Workers were written to support the Top 10 in 10 Strategic Goal 3 to develop, support, and sustain a high-quality, prepared, and collaborative education workforce as well as the Michigan Department of Education’s Whole Child priority.

Dr. Rice said the Standards were presented to the Board on June 11, 2019, and public comment was solicited through September 15, 2019. He said the Board is being asked to approve the Standards.

Information was shared via a [PowerPoint presentation](#).

Mr. McMillin asked what would happen if the standards are not approved. Dr. Keesler said there are current competencies that would remain in place, but the system would not be updated or aligned.

Mr. McMillin asked for clarification regarding the school social worker certificate. Mr. Hsu said currently a letter is issued, but the future intent is to replace the letter with a certificate that could be tracked through the certification system.

Mr. McMillin said Standard 5 uses the term economic justice, and Element 2 uses the term educational jargon.

Dr. Rice proposed that the phrase educational jargon be replaced with educational language, and there was Board consensus.

Ms. Ramos-Montigny moved, seconded by Dr. Pritchett, that the State Board of Education approve the Michigan Standards for the Preparation and Practice of School Social Workers, as attached to the Superintendent’s memorandum dated September 24, 2019, and as amended by discussion.

The vote was taken on the motion, as amended by discussion.

Ayes: Fecteau, Pritchett, Pugh, Ramos-Montigny, Snyder, Tilley, Ulbrich
Abstain: McMillin

The motion carried.

XXII. STATE AND FEDERAL LEGISLATIVE UPDATE

Dr. Rice asked Ms. Lupe Ramos-Montigny, Chairperson of the Board’s Legislative Committee, to lead the discussion on State and Federal Legislation.

The Legislative Committee report, and Board legislative priorities were distributed. Ms. Ramos-Montigny reviewed the report of the Legislative Committee, which met on September 24, 2019.

Mr. Ackley, Director, Public and Governmental Affairs, said Governor Whitmer signed the budget, which included line item vetoes. He said the State Senate has introduced 23 separate bills containing some of the vetoed items.

Mr. Ackley said Dr. Ulbrich asked the Board’s Legislative Committee to consider a statement regarding pending legislation requiring a two-thirds vote for passage during the lame duck session. He said the statement is included in the Legislative Committee report.

Dr. Ulbrich moved, seconded by Dr. Pritchett, to adopt the Statement on Legislative Actions During Lame Duck Session, as presented during the State Board of Education meeting on October 8, 2019.

Mr. McMillin said he supports the spirit of the statement, but doesn’t know if two-thirds is too high, and he will abstain on the vote.

The vote was taken on the motion.

Ayes: Fecteau, Pritchett, Pugh, Ramos-Montigny, Snyder, Tilley, Ulbrich
Abstain: McMillin

The motion carried.

Ms. Ramos-Montigny said due to the lack of meeting space available during the Board's November and December meetings, the Board will try to convene the legislative reception in January 2020.

Discussion followed.

Ms. Tilley, NASBE Delegate, provided the NASBE report. Ms. Tilley said she, Ms. Snyder, and Ms. Ramos-Montigny are attending the annual conference October 16-19, 2019. Ms. Tilley said she is running for Central Area Director of NASBE, and she read her statement.

Ms. Ramos-Montigny said NASBE by-laws changes are being proposed to streamline the organization and improve efficiency. She said there will be one Central Area Director, rather than two.

Ms. Ramos-Montigny moved, seconded by Dr. Ulbrich, that the State Board of Education approve the changes to the NASBE by-laws as proposed.

The vote was taken on the motion.

The motion carried unanimously.

The Statement on Legislative Actions During Lame Duck Session is attached as Exhibit A.

XXIII. COMMENTS BY STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MEMBERS

Dr. Pugh said she is glad to be in her hometown for a Board meeting. She said she is thankful for the words of support for the city of Flint that were expressed during the meeting. She introduced her father, John Pugh, who was in the audience.

Ms. Tilley thanked the staff of Saginaw Intermediate School District for hosting the meeting. She suggested a future meeting at Camp Tuhsmeheeta.

Ms. Lougheed thanked Ms. Jessyca Mathews for presenting during the Board meeting.

Dr. Pritchett thanked Saginaw for hosting, and she said she appreciates the substantive conversation on the A-F accountability system.

Ms. Ramos-Montigny said she is appreciative of the work done by Saginaw Intermediate School District to host the meeting. She said she had a meet and greet with the Hispanic community, and she said topics discussed were bullying, teacher shortages, and the Read By Grade Three law.

Mr. McMillin said he appreciates the comments by charter schools sharing their good work. Mr. McMillin said the legislature gave the Board latitude to develop the A-F accountability system, and the Board should exercise that latitude.

XXIV. FUTURE MEETING DATES

- A. Tuesday, December 10, 2019 (9:30 a.m.) Regular Meeting
- B. Tuesday, January 14, 2020 (9:30 a.m.) Regular Meeting
- C. Tuesday, February 11, 2020 (9:30 a.m.) Regular Meeting
- D. Tuesday, March 10, 2020 (9:30 a.m.) Regular Meeting

XXV. TENTATIVE AGENDA FOR NEXT MEETING

Dr. Rice asked Board members if there are additional agenda topics they would like to be considered for future meeting agendas.

Ms. Fecteau said she would like the Special Education Advisory Committee to present at a future Board meeting.

Dr. Pugh asked if follow up occurs with public speakers after Board meetings, and Dr. Rice affirmed that is often the case.

Dr. Rice thanked Saginaw Intermediate School District for hosting the State Board of Education meeting.

XXVI. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 3:56 p.m.

The video archive of the meeting is available on Michigan's State Board of Education website (www.michigan.gov/sbe).

Respectfully submitted,

Michelle Fecteau
Secretary

**Statement On
Legislative Actions During Lamé Duck Session**

There have been joint resolutions introduced in the Michigan House of Representatives and Michigan Senate to amend the Michigan Constitution to require a two-thirds vote by both chambers to pass any bill after the November election in an even-numbered year – a time commonly referred to as “Lame Duck.”

Specifically, those resolutions are House Joint Resolution L and Senate Joint Resolution H. If either is adopted by both the House of Representatives and Senate, the proposal to amend the Michigan Constitution would be placed on a statewide ballot for consideration by the people of the state of Michigan.

As has occurred for decades, Lamé Duck sessions following a November election have seen the passage of bills that have been re-written and pushed through the legislature in the early morning hours of the last days of those sessions without public input – in many cases by elected officials who no longer are accountable to their constituents, either through term limits, retirement, or being voted out of office.

Requiring a two-thirds vote to pass legislation during a Lamé Duck session would necessitate bipartisan involvement and agreement on all bills, and ensure more transparency, input, and public confidence in Michigan’s legislative process.

As such, the State Board of Education supports both House Joint Resolution L and Senate Joint Resolution H; and encourages the state legislature to adopt either resolution to put this question of amending the Michigan Constitution before the people of Michigan.

Adopted October 8, 2019