

MINUTES

STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION

Ladislaus B. Dombrowski Board Room
John A. Hannah Building
608 West Allegan
Lansing, Michigan

December 8, 2015
9:30 a.m.

Present: Mr. John C. Austin, President
Dr. Casandra E. Ulbrich, Vice President
Ms. Michelle Fecteau, Secretary
Dr. Pamela Pugh, Treasurer
Ms. Lupe Ramos-Montigny, NASBE Delegate
Mrs. Kathleen N. Straus
Mrs. Eileen Weiser
Dr. Richard Zeile

Also Present: Mr. Rick Joseph, 2015-2016 Michigan Teacher of the Year

Absent: Mr. Brian J. Whiston, Chairman
Mrs. Karen McPhee, representing Governor Rick Snyder, ex officio

REGULAR MEETING

I. CALL TO ORDER

Mr. Austin called the meeting to order at 9:36 a.m. Mr. Austin said he is chairing the meeting, due the absence of Brian Whiston. Mr. Austin expressed condolences to Mr. Whiston and his family as they mourn the sudden passing of his mother-in-law.

II. APPROVAL OF AGENDA AND ORDER OF PRIORITY

Dr. Ulbrich moved, seconded by Ms. Ramos-Montigny, that the State Board of Education approve the agenda and order of priority.

The vote was taken on the motion.

Ayes: Austin, Fecteau, Pugh, Ramos-Montigny, Straus, Ulbrich, Zeile

Absent: Weiser

The motion carried.

III. INTRODUCTION OF STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MEMBERS

Mrs. Marilyn Schneider, State Board Executive, introduced members of the State Board of Education and the 2015-2016 Michigan Teacher of the Year. Mrs. Schneider invited guests to introduce themselves.

IV. RECESS

The Board recessed the Regular Meeting at 9:37 a.m. to convene the Committee of the Whole.

COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE MEETING

V. CALL TO ORDER

Mr. Austin called the Committee of the Whole Meeting to order at 9:38 a.m.

VI. PRESENTATION ON MICHIGAN AS A TOP 10 EDUCATION STATE IN 10 YEARS

Mr. Austin said the Board and Department have been working toward developing Michigan into a Top 10 Education State in 10 Years. He said a wide range of stakeholder input has been offered regarding major policies and strategies that can lift up the performance of Michigan's educational system.

Mr. Austin said guiding principles and strategic goals are being provided for discussion, and Board action is anticipated in the afternoon portion of the meeting. He said

Mr. Martin Ackley, Director, Public and Governmental Affairs, shared information via a [PowerPoint presentation](#).

Top 10 in 10 Years – putting Michigan on the map as a premier education state was distributed. The document contained guiding principles and strategic goals.

Mrs. Weiser joined the meeting at 9:45 a.m.

Board member comments included coherence in choices and meaningful change, child-centered call to action, preparing students to be good citizens, students taking ownership of their education, full potential in meeting academic goals; alternatives to suspension and expulsion, and opportunities for students of color.

VII. PERSONAL PRIVILEGE – MR. JOHN C. AUSTIN

Mr. Austin acknowledged Representative Phil Potvin, Chair of the Michigan Department of Education Subcommittee on Appropriations, who was attending the Board meeting.

VIII. PRESENTATION ON MICHIGAN VIRTUAL UNIVERSITY REPORT ON EFFECTIVENESS OF VIRTUAL LEARNING IN MICHIGAN

There was Board consensus to reorder the agenda.

Ms. Linda Forward, Director, Education Improvement and Innovation; Mr. Jamey Fitzpatrick, President and Chief Executive Officer, Michigan Virtual University; Mr. Joe Friedhoff, Vice President of Research, Policy and Professional Learning, Michigan Virtual University; presented the Michigan Virtual University Report on Effectiveness of Virtual Learning in Michigan.

Mr. Austin said Michigan Virtual University published an annual effectiveness report which provides a detailed look at K-12 virtual learning in Michigan. He said it highlights enrollment totals, completion rates and the overall impact of virtual courses on K-12 pupils. He said the findings of the report will be reviewed during the presentation.

Information was shared via a [PowerPoint presentation](#).

Michigan's K-12 Virtual Learning Effectiveness Report was distributed.

Board member comments included variation on numbers of students in classrooms, student characteristics suited to online learning, supervision support and funding, kindergarten unit of analysis, online learning experience requirement, virtual learning and blended instruction, teacher support for online learners, economically disadvantaged students steered toward low cost opportunities, correlation of dropout rate and pass rate, success rates for students enrolled in Michigan Virtual University courses, and seat time waivers.

IX. PRESENTATION ON ONE STUDENT'S STORY: ACCESS, PERSONALIZATION AND ENGAGEMENT IN LEARNING

Ms. Linda Forward, Director, Education Improvement and Innovation; Ms. Michelle Ribant, State Director, 21st Century Learning; Mr. Ryan Harp, Assistant Superintendent of Special Education, Eaton Regional Education Service Agency (RESA); Ms. Rhonda Provoast, General Education Director, Eaton RESA; and Ms. Robin Pegg, Assistive Technology Consultant, Eaton RESA; presented on One Student's Story: Access, Personalization and Engagement in Learning.

Mr. Austin said Eaton Regional Education Service Agency staff in general education, special education and instructional technology worked with Grand Ledge Public Schools to create a way in which Lilly, a student with special needs, could enhance her learning and fully communicate with her teachers, other students and her own family for the very first time. He said the solution was featured at the 2015 International Society for Technology in Education conference, and provides a model for educators working on behalf of every student.

Information was shared via a [PowerPoint presentation](#).

Lilly addressed the Board through the use of assistive technology.

X. PRESENTATION ON ENERGY CAREER CLUSTER AND CONTENT STANDARDS

Ms. Patty Cantu, Director, Career and Technical Education; Ms. Erin Ducket, Industry Clusters Specialist, Workforce Development Agency; and Ms. Tracy DiSanto, Manager, Workforce Planning and Analytics, DTE Energy; presented on Energy Career Cluster and Content Standards.

Mr. Austin said for the past six months the Michigan Department of Education Office of Career and Technical Education has been working with the Michigan Energy Workforce Development consortium and the Workforce Development Agency to develop a Career Cluster and Content Standards focusing on energy careers. He said proposed standards for secondary instructional programs in energy related fields will be presented.

Mr. Austin said there will be an opportunity for public comment, appropriate revisions will be made, and the standards will be presented to the Board for approval at its February 9, 2016, meeting.

Information was shared via a [PowerPoint presentation](#).

Board member comments included awareness that students are receiving academics as well as career readiness, the ability to transfer certifications to other states, apprenticeships, and opportunities for advancement.

XI. ADJOURNED

The Board adjourned the Committee of the Whole at 11:34 a.m. and reconvened the Regular Meeting.

REGULAR MEETING

XII. APPROVAL OF STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MINUTES

- F. Approval of Minutes of Regular and Committee of the Whole Meeting of November 10, 2015

Mrs. Weiser moved, seconded by Ms. Fecteau, that the State Board of Education approve the Minutes of the Regular and Committee of the Whole Meeting of November 10, 2015.

The vote was taken on the motion.

The motion carried unanimously.

XIII. PRESIDENT'S REPORT

Mr. Austin said he has been working with the Michigan Postsecondary Credential Attainment Workgroup, which has created an Action Plan to Increase Michigan's Postsecondary Credential Attainment. He said Michigan's economic growth is dependent upon increased numbers of people earning postsecondary credentials.

Mr. Austin shared information shared via a [PowerPoint presentation](#).

Board member comments included philanthropic support, funding, post-secondary success being dependent on success in K-12, refocus on children being the center, reward good teachers for teaching in tough conditions, teacher shortage and teacher retirements, poverty, access to quality educators, low pay, Detroit Public Schools and the Education Achievement Authority.

XIV. RECESS

The Board recessed the Regular Meeting at 12:11 p.m. and reconvened at 1:02 p.m.

XV. PERSONAL PRIVILEGE – MS. LUPE RAMOS-MONTIGNY

Ms. Ramos-Montigny introduced Ms. Esther Torres, who was attending the meeting as a guest of Ms. Ramos-Montigny.

XVI. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION IN STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MEETING

- A. Dr. Michael Musary, Superintendent, and Mr. Philip Jankowski, Assistant Superintendent of Curriculum and Instruction, Armada Area Schools, Armada, Michigan. Dr. Musary and Mr. Jankowski, representing the Network of Michigan Educators, shared verbal comments and written information regarding Armada's college readiness program.

B. Dr. Michael Libbee, Mt. Pleasant, Michigan. Dr. Libbee shared verbal comments regarding social studies standards.

XVII. PERSONAL PRIVILEGE – MR. JOHN AUSTIN

Mr. Austin asked Deputy Superintendents to introduce employees recently hired by the Michigan Department of Education.

Mr. Kyle Guarrant, Deputy Superintendent, Administration and School Support Services, introduced Aris Bailey and Kaitlyn Silvestri from the Library of Michigan.

Ms. Norma Jean Sass, Deputy Superintendent, Education Services, introduced Laurie McCann from the Office of Special Education.

Ms. Susan Broman, Deputy Superintendent, Great Start, introduced Alison Bliss from the Child Development and Care Unit.

XVIII. RECOGNITION OF NATIONAL PTA FAMILY READING CHALLENGE WINNER JULIE SPENCE, LIVONIA

Ms. Norma Jean Sass, Deputy Superintendent, Education Services; Ms. Sandra York, Executive Director, Michigan PTA; and Ms. Julie Spence, PTA President, Garfield Elementary, Livonia; presented on the National PTA Family Reading Challenge.

Ms. Sandra York introduced Ms. Julie Spence who received the National PTA Family Reading Challenge Award.

Ms. York and Ms. Spence shared information via a [PowerPoint presentation](#).

XIX. REPORT OF THE SUPERINTENDENT

Reports

G. Human Resources Report

H. Report on Modifications to the Previously Approved Wexford-Missaukee Intermediate School District Plan for the Delivery of Special Education Programs and Services

I. Report on Modifications to the Previously Approved Eaton Regional Education Service Agency Plan for the Delivery of Special Education Programs and Services

Grants

J. Report on Grant Awards

1. 2015-2016 Mandated Activities Under the Individuals with Disabilities Education Act (IDEA 2004), Part C - Initial; Continuation; \$1,644,485
2. 2015-2016 Improving Teacher and Principal Quality Grant - Initial; \$400,000
3. 2014-2015 Application for School Bus Driver Safety Education Program - Amendment; \$1,625,000
4. 2015-2016 Project AWARE to Advance Wellness and Resilience in Education - Initial; \$260,123
5. 2015-2016 Project AWARE to Advance Wellness and Resilience in Education - Initial; \$1,275,000
6. 2015-2016 Safe Schools/Healthy Students State Planning, Local Educational Agencies and Local Communities - Initial; \$102,828
7. 2015-2016 School Climate Transformation - Initial; \$248,000
8. 2014-2015 IDEA, Part B Mandated Activities Projects - Amendment; \$15,171,830
9. 2015-2016 ISD Collaboration Grant - Amendment; \$590,200
10. 2015-2016 Michigan Education Corps - Initial; \$1,000,000
11. 2014-2015 Elementary and Secondary Education Act (ESEA) Regional Intermediate School District (ISD) Partnership Grant - Amendment; \$448,410
12. 2015-2016 Elementary and Secondary Education Act (ESEA) Regional Intermediate School District (ISD) Partnership Grant - Initial, Continuation; \$357,131
13. 2015-2016 McKinney-Vento Homeless Students Grant - Amendment; \$1,568,737
14. 2015-2016 Section 41 Bilingual Grant - Initial; \$1,200,000
15. 2015-2016 Title I, Part A Schoolwide Planning Grant - Initial; \$108,000

16. 2015-2016 Title III, English Language Acquisition - Amendment; \$9,200,355

17. 2015-2016 Title III, Immigrant Student Grant - Initial; \$39,856

18. 2015-2016 Title III, Immigrant Student Grant - Initial; \$1,624,010

XX. PERSONAL PRIVILEGE – MR. JOHN C. AUSTIN

Mr. Austin congratulated Ms. Fecteau on receiving the Outstanding Governmental Official Award from the Michigan Association of Media in Education.

XXI. REPORT OF MICHIGAN TEACHER OF THE YEAR

Mr. Rick Joseph, the 2015-2016 Michigan Teacher of the Year, provided his report. Mr. Joseph shared a video presentation highlighting his activities during the past month as the Michigan Teacher of the Year.

XXII. APPROVAL OF GOALS FOR DEVELOPING MICHIGAN INTO A TOP 10 EDUCATION STATE IN 10 YEARS

Mr. Austin said the Guiding Principles and Strategic Goals for Developing Michigan into a Top 10 Education State in 10 Years were presented and discussed earlier in the day during the Committee of the Whole. He said Board approval is being requested.

Mr. Austin moved, seconded by Ms. Ramos-Montigny, that the State Board of Education approve the Guiding Principles and Strategic Goals for Developing Michigan into a Top 10 Education State in 10 Years, as presented at the December 8, 2015, State Board of Education Meeting.

The vote was taken on the motion.

The motion carried unanimously.

The Guiding Principles and Strategic Goals for Developing Michigan into a Top 10 Education State in 10 Years are attached as Exhibit A.

XXIII. APPROVAL OF CHANGES TO ORGANIZATIONAL REPRESENTATIVES ON THE SPECIAL EDUCATION ADVISORY COMMITTEE (SEAC)

Ms. Norma Jean Sass, Deputy Superintendent, Education Services; and Ms. Teri Chapman, Director, Office of Special Education; presented the Approval of Changes to the Organizational Representatives on the Special Education Advisory Committee (SEAC).

Mr. Austin said the Office of Special Education has received nominations to fill vacancies on the Special Education Advisory Committee and Board approval is being requested.

Ms. Sass reviewed the nominations requested by SEAC.

Ms. Ramos-Montigny moved, seconded by Dr. Ulbrich, that the State Board of Education approve changes to organizational representatives on the Special Education Advisory Committee, as described in the Superintendent's memorandum dated November 24, 2015.

Ms. Fecteau asked if the requirement is met for fifty-one per cent of committee members with a disability or the parent/guardian of a child with a disability. Ms. Chapman said the membership requirement is met.

The vote was taken on the motion.

The motion carried unanimously.

XXIV. STATE AND FEDERAL LEGISLATIVE UPDATE

Mr. Martin Ackley, Director, Public and Governmental Affairs; Dr. Casandra Ulbrich, Chair, State Board of Education Legislative Committee; and Mrs. Kathleen Straus, NASBE Governmental Affairs Committee; presented the State and Federal Legislative Update.

Mr. Ackley provided an update on Senate Bill 279 regarding public school employee retirement, which modifies the computing retirement allowance based on employees organization professional services leave or released time. He also provided an update on Senate Bill 280 regarding collective bargaining, which prohibits public employer contracts that pay union officials for time conducting union business.

Mr. Ackley said the Board's Legislative Committee met on November 30, 2015.

Mrs. Straus provided an update on the federal Every Student Succeeds Act (ESSA). Discussion followed regarding the effects of ESSA on No Child Left Behind waivers, teacher evaluations and students opting out of testing.

Mr. Austin said House Bill 4552 regarding middle school and high school counselor requirements is pending. He said he would like the Board to support the legislation.

Dr. Ulbrich asked to see the legislation. Mr. Austin said discussion would occur later in the meeting, after staff has had the opportunity to provide the requested information.

Supplement to Statement on Detroit Education Proposal

Dr. Pugh said she has been asked to share a report regarding the review of the interlocal agreement between Eastern Michigan University and Detroit Public Schools related to the Education Achievement Authority. She said the report is from the Eastern Michigan University College of Education Council to the Faculty Senate Executive Board. She said staff is calling for an immediate break in the agreement.

Discussion followed.

Mrs. Straus moved, seconded by Dr. Pugh, that the State Board of Education adopt a Supplement to its Statement on Detroit Education Proposal adopted November 10, 2015, The State Board of Education encourages the dissolution of the Education Achievement Authority and discourages "charterization" of schools in the Education Achievement Authority.

The vote was taken on the motion.

Ayes: Austin, Fecteau, Pugh, Straus, Ulbrich

Nays: Ramos-Montigny, Weiser, Zeile

The motion carried.

Discussion continued on House Bill 4552 regarding middle school and high school counselor requirements. Mr. Ackley distributed a summary. Mr. Austin said the legislation calls for additional professional development and training for counselors. Mr. Austin said it is consistent with developing Michigan into a Top 10 Education State in 10 Years and the Postsecondary Credential Attainment Workgroup recommendations, both of which were discussed earlier in the meeting.

Mr. Ackley said the legislation is on the floor of the Michigan House of Representatives.

Following discussion regarding the feasibility of developing standards within the timeline and the need to address counselor staffing ratios, there was Board consensus take no action at this time.

Statement on Senate Bills 279-280

Ms. Fecteau said she would like the Board to adopt a statement discouraging action on Senate Bill 279 (regarding public school employee retirement, which modifies the computing retirement allowance based on employees organization professional services leave or released time); and Senate Bill 280 (regarding collective bargaining, which prohibits public employer contracts that pay union officials for time conducting union business).

Mr. Austin moved, seconded by Ms. Fecteau, that the State Board of Education adopt a statement encouraging the Legislature not to move forward on Senate Bills 279-280.

The vote was taken on the motion.

**Ayes: Austin, Fecteau, Pugh, Ramos-Montigny, Straus, Ulbrich
Nays: Weiser, Zeile**

The motion carried.

XXV. COMMENTS BY STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MEMBERS

Mrs. Weiser said the Special Education Task Force convened by Lieutenant Governor Calley is focusing on four or five points. She said there is good work and discussion occurring which requires significant work for Michigan Department of Education staff.

Ms. Fecteau commended Ms. Teri Chapman, Director of Special Education, for her exemplary work as a member of the task force.

Ms. Ramos-Montigny said she attended the National Association of Latino Elected and Appointed Officials Summit in San Antonio, Texas on November 20-22, 2015. She said a topic of discussion was science, technology, engineering and mathematics and addressing America's shortage of skilled workers. She said it was noted that Michigan has recently passed science standards.

Dr. Pugh asked if the Lieutenant Governor's Special Education Task Force is considering environmental exposures. Ms. Fecteau said it was discussed on a limited basis, and the Board should have a presentation on the topic. Mrs. Weiser said the Special Education Task Force is examining how to construct policy with the widest possible reach.

Mrs. Weiser said she is a member of the Education Commission of the States and she attended its meeting in Austin, Texas. She said there was discussion regarding disconnects in how children are learning and being challenged by teachers. She said she will provide a website link to the study. She said she will provide regular updates on the Education Commission of the States.

XXVI. TENTATIVE AGENDA FOR NEXT MEETING

Board members were asked to notify a member of the agenda planning committee if there are agenda topics they would like included on a future agenda.

XXVII. FUTURE MEETING DATES

- A. Tuesday, January 12, 2016, Regular Meeting (9:30 a.m.)
- B. Tuesday, February 9, 2016, Regular Meeting (9:30 a.m.)
- C. Tuesday, March 8, 2016, Regular Meeting (9:30 a.m.)


XXVIII. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 3:02 p.m.

The video archive of the meeting is available at www.michigan.gov/sbe.

Respectfully submitted,

Michelle Fecteau
Secretary




putting Michigan on the map as a premier education state

In response to a request for suggestions on how to make Michigan a Top 10 state for education within the next 10 years, the Michigan Department of Education (MDE) and State Board of Education (SBE) received input from numerous stakeholders groups, education partners and individual citizens. This valuable information was provided via formal presentations to the SBE, written submissions, one-on-one and group meetings with the State Superintendent, and through more than 750 responses collected through a dedicated website.


GUIDING PRINCIPLES

- To be successful at becoming a Top 10 performing state in 10 years, Michigan must develop a *coherent* and *cohesive* strategy for the children, and implement that plan with continuity for multiple years. Education reform takes time; we must implement, use evidence and data to correct course, and continue with progress on key goals.
 - A “Can-Do Culture” that focuses on student-directed learning and student outcomes, and the work on instruction must take priority.
 - Data and accountability will be used to help drive resources and focus improvement activities for students and educators. Attention will be on transparency in support of key goals for the entire system to make Michigan a Top 10 state for education.
 - Poverty matters, not to be used as an excuse, but as a purpose to design a Michigan system of education that motivates and excites all children about learning, keeps them in school, and provides them with hope and knowledge for a successful future.



To realize Michigan becoming a Top 10 education state within the next 10 years, the existing structure and system of education must be challenged and reshaped. Michigan must establish an educational system that grants indelible rights for all stakeholders to succeed – a system focused more on what is best for children and their learning.

This is a framework of the strategic goals necessary to move Michigan forward.



putting Michigan on the map as a premier education state

STRATEGIC GOALS

- 1 Provide every child access to an aligned, high-quality P-20 system from early childhood to post-secondary attainment – through a multi-stakeholder collaboration with business and industry, labor, and higher education – to maximize lifetime learning and success.
- 2 Implement, with strong district and building leadership, high-quality instruction in every classroom through a highly coherent, child-centered instructional model where students meet their self-determined academic and personal goals to their highest potential.
- 3 Develop, support, and sustain a high-quality, prepared, and collaborative education workforce.
- 4 Reduce the impact of high-risk factors, including poverty, and provide equitable resources to meet the needs of all students to ensure that they have access to quality educational opportunities.
- 5 Ensure that parents/guardians are engaged and supported partners in their child’s education.
- 6 Create a strong alignment and partnership with job providers, community colleges, and higher education to assure a prepared and quality future workforce; and informed and responsible citizens.
- 7 Further develop an innovative and cohesive state education agency that supports an aligned, coherent education system at all levels (state, ISD, district and school).

