

## **MINUTES**

### STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION

Ladislaus B. Dombrowski Board Room  
John A. Hannah Building  
608 West Allegan  
Lansing, Michigan

March 12, 2019  
9:30 a.m.

Present: Ms. Sheila A. Alles, Chairperson  
Dr. Casandra E. Ulbrich, President  
Dr. Pamela Pugh, Vice President  
Ms. Michelle Fecteau, Secretary  
Mr. Tom McMillin, Treasurer  
Ms. Tiffany Tilley, NASBE Delegate  
Dr. Judith Pritchett  
Ms. Lupe Ramos-Montigny  
Ms. Nikki Snyder  
Mr. Josh Neyhart, representing Governor Gretchen Whitmer, ex officio

Also Present: Mrs. Laura Chang, 2018-2019 Michigan Teacher of the Year

### **REGULAR MEETING**

#### I. CALL TO ORDER

Ms. Alles called the meeting to order at 9:33 a.m.

#### II. APPROVAL OF AGENDA AND ORDER OF PRIORITY

**Dr. Ulbrich moved, seconded by Ms. Fecteau, that the State Board of Education add to the agenda, during the State and Federal Legislative Update, an update on the A-F Legislation as well as a formal request to the legislature to extend the deadline.**

The vote was taken on the motion.

**Ayes: Fecteau, McMillin, Pritchett, Ramos-Montigny, Snyder,  
Tilley, Ulbrich  
Absent: Pugh**

**The motion carried.**

**Dr. Ulbrich moved, seconded by Ms. Ramos-Montigny, that the State Board of Education approve the agenda and order of priority, as amended.**

The vote was taken on the motion to approve the agenda, as amended.

**Ayes: Fecteau, McMillin, Pritchett, Ramos-Montigny, Snyder, Tilley, Ulbrich**  
**Absent: Pugh**

**The motion carried.**

Dr. Pugh arrived at 9:36 a.m.

III. INTRODUCTION OF STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MEMBERS AND STAFF

Ms. Alles asked that the members of the State Board of Education be introduced. Mrs. Marilyn Schneider, State Board Executive, introduced members of the State Board of Education.

Ms. Alles asked for the introduction of new employees.

Ms. Shulawn Doxie, Special Assistant, P-20 System and Student Transitions, introduced Ms. Tiffany Young and Mr. Andrew Pastoor from the Office of Preschool and Out-of-School Time Learning.

Mr. Kyle Guarrant, Deputy Superintendent of Finance and Operations, introduced Mr. Michael Leathhead and Ms. Viki Lorraine from the Office of Health and Nutrition Services; and Ms. Caitlin Hengesbach from the Office of Financial Management.

Dr. Venessa Keesler, Deputy Superintendent of Educator, Student, and School Supports, introduced Ms. Susan Palmiter from the Office of Educational Assessment and Accountability; Ms. Corinne Edwards from the Office of Educational Supports; and Ms. Darcy McMahon and Ms. Chelsey Martinez from the Office of Educator Excellence.

Dr. Bill Pearson, State School Reform Officer and Director of the Office of Partnership Districts, introduced Mr. Paul Schummer from the Office of Partnership Districts.

Ms. Alles asked audience members to complete public participation forms if they wish to offer comments during the public participation portion of the meeting.

IV. RECESS

The Board recessed the Regular Meeting at 9:44 a.m. and convened the Committee of the Whole.

## **COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE MEETING**

### V. CALL TO ORDER

Ms. Alles called the Committee of the Whole Meeting to order at 9:45 a.m.

### VI. PRESENTATION OF THE 2018-2019 MILKEN AWARD WINNER

Dr. Venessa Keesler, Deputy Superintendent of Educator, Student and School Supports; Ms. Leah Breen, Director, Office of Educator Excellence; and Ms. Jennifer Robel, Manager, Recruitment and Recognition Unit, Office of Educator Excellence; presented the 2018-2019 Milken Award Winner.

Ms. Alles said Mr. Chad Downs, an educator for Ann Arbor Open School in the Ann Arbor Public Schools, is the 2019 recipient of the Milken Educator Award on December 12, 2018. She said Mr. Downs is one of 53 educators from across the country to win this prestigious award. Ms. Alles said she had the privilege of attending the award ceremony with former State Board of Education member Mrs. Eileen Weiser.

Ms. Robel shared a video clip of the surprise announcement at Mr. Downs' school, and she introduced Mr. Downs, a 3<sup>rd</sup> and 4<sup>th</sup> grade teacher, and his guests.

Dr. Ulbrich presented the Milken award to Mr. Downs.

Mr. Downs expressed gratitude and said he is using a portion of the financial award to start a scholarship for seniors who are pursuing education from his home school district, Plainwell Community Schools.

Ms. Robel distributed a booklet, *Milken Educator Awards*.

### VII. PRESENTATION OF THE REVISED MODEL CODE OF STUDENT CONDUCT

Mr. Kyle Guerrant, Deputy Superintendent of Finance and Operations; and Ms. Diane Golzynski, Director, Office of Health and Nutrition Services; presented the Revised Model Code of Student Conduct.

Ms. Alles said the Model Code of Student Conduct has been updated to reflect recent changes to the Revised School Code. She said staff will review the document and discuss changes.

Information was shared via a [PowerPoint presentation](#).

Board member comments included gleaning suspension and expulsion data related to students of color, and the Civil Rights national data collection set.

## VIII. PRESENTATION ON SCHOOL FINANCE

Mr. David Martell, Executive Director, and Mr. Bob Dwan, Associate Executive Director, Michigan School Business Officials, presented on School Finance.

Ms. Alles introduced the presenters who shared information via a [PowerPoint presentation](#) on the basics of school finance.

Board member comments included federal funding, history of the teacher retirement system and district and state responsibilities, pensions and benefits for teachers, clarification of local funding, transparency reporting, sinking funds, voting on 18% non-homestead tax, higher education funding, legislative policy decisions, School Finance Research Collaborative Study, and higher education funding from State Aid fund.

## IX. RECESS

The Board recessed the Committee of the Whole at 11:38 a.m. and reconvened the Regular Meeting at 1:08 p.m. During the recess the board had an informal luncheon with legislative leaders.

Mr. Neyhart left the meeting at 11:38 a.m.

### **REGULAR MEETING**

## X. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION IN STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MEETING

1. Sherise M. Butler from Detroit, Michigan, representing Detroit Public Schools Community District, provided comments regarding general information on behalf of Government Relations.
2. Helen Moore from Detroit, Michigan, representing National Action Network, provided comments on Benton Harbor Area Schools.
3. Marletta Seats from Benton Harbor, provided comments on the Benton Harbor Area Schools cooperative agreement and discussion about CEO rally to have district charter school.
4. Russ Bellant from Detroit, Michigan, offered comments regarding Benton Harbor Area Schools.
5. Joseph Taylor, Vice President, Benton Harbor Area Schools Board, from Benton Harbor, Michigan, shared comments on Benton Harbor Area Schools.
6. Thomas Pedroni, from Ypsilanti, Michigan, offered comments on Benton Harbor Area Schools.
7. Derrick Lopez, JD, Superintendent, Flint Community Schools, offered comments and written information on Flint Community Schools.

## XII. RECESS

The Board recessed the Committee of the Whole at 1:47 p.m. and reconvened the Regular Meeting.

## **COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE MEETING**

### XI. UPDATE FROM THE OFFICE OF PARTNERSHIP DISTRICTS

Dr. Bill Pearson, State School Reform Officer and Director of the Office of Partnership Districts; and Mr. Dan LaDue, Supervisor, Office of Partnership Districts; presented the Update from the Office of Partnership Districts.

Ms. Alles said the presentation includes an overview of the Review of Goal Attainment structured conferences, modifications to the process, and updates on Benton Harbor Area Schools' Cooperative Agreement.

Information was shared via a handout and a [PowerPoint presentation](#).

Board member comments included the Saginaw Public Schools Cooperative Agreement; transparency in the Benton Harbor Area Schools Cooperative Agreement; parents, community, board, and union represented in meetings; presentation to the State Board of Education by Benton Harbor Area Schools; options provided by Treasury and law cited; Chief Executive Officer meeting with Benton Harbor board; and loss of students larger than expected.

### XII. DISCUSSION REGARDING CRITERIA FOR GRANT PROGRAMS

There were no comments regarding criteria for grant programs.

### XIII. ADJOURNMENT

The Board adjourned the Committee of the Whole and reconvened the Regular Meeting at 2:37 p.m.

## **REGULAR MEETING**

### XIV. APPROVAL OF STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MINUTES

Approval of Minutes of Regular and Committee of the Whole Meeting of February 12, 2019

**Ms. Ramos-Montigny moved, seconded by Dr. Ulbrich, that the State Board of Education approve the Minutes of the Regular and Committee of the Whole Meeting of February 12, 2019.**

The vote was taken on the motion.

**The motion carried unanimously.**

Approval of Minutes of Regular and Committee of the Whole Meeting of February 12, 2019

**Ms. Ramos-Montigny moved, seconded by Dr. Pritchett, that the State Board of Education approve the Minutes of Closed Session of February 12, 2019.**

The vote was taken on the motion.

**The motion carried unanimously.**

XV. REPORT OF THE PRESIDENT

Dr. Ulbrich said she will skip the President's report, because she will be speaking later in the meeting.

XVI. REPORT OF THE INTERIM STATE SUPERINTENDENT

Reports

H. Human Resources Report

I. Report on Cosponsorship

Grants

J. Report on Grant Awards

1. 2018-2019 Title II, Part A, Teacher and Leader Instruction Support Grant – Amendment; \$4,468,130 (Educator Excellence – Leah Breen)
2. 2017-2018 Title III, English Language Acquisition – Amendment; \$9,359,465 (Educational Supports – Paula Daniels)
3. 2018-2019 Section 35a(7) The Michigan Education Corps Grant – Amendment; \$3,000,000 (Educational Supports – Paula Daniels)
4. 2018-2019 Section 99s(2) and (3) – MiSTEM Advisory Council Grants – Initial; \$2,797,615 (Educational Supports – Paula Daniels)
5. 2018-2019 Section 99s(4) and (5) – MiSTEM Network Regions – Amendment; \$3,834,290 (Educational Supports – Paula Daniels)
6. 2018-2019 Section 99s(4) and (5) – MiSTEM Network Regions – Initial; \$3,621,083 (Educational Supports – Paula Daniels)
7. 2018-2019 Title I, Part A, Improving Basic Programs – Amendment; \$442,147,768 (Educational Supports – Paula Daniels)

8. 2018-2019 Section 21h: Partnership District Grant – Amendment; \$5,672,080 (Partnership Districts – William Pearson)
9. 2018-2019 Section 297 – Marshall Plan for Talent Competitive Grants – Initial; \$14,476,700 (Financial Management – Ann Richmond)

Ms. Alles shared a verbal report on the American Association of School Superintendents and Administrators Conference; and her meet and greet sessions with legislators.

#### XVII. REPORT OF MICHIGAN TEACHER OF THE YEAR

Ms. Laura Chang, 2018-2019 Michigan Teacher of the Year, provided the Report of the Michigan Teacher of the Year.

Ms. Chang presented a report on the mentoring and coaching of teachers.

Ms. Kimberli Wregglesworth, Region 2 Teacher of the Year, a history teacher at Onaway High School in Onaway, Michigan, presented on student mental health resources.

#### XVIII. DISCUSSION ON STATE SUPERINTENDENT SEARCH

Dr. Casandra Ulbrich, President of the Board, led the Discussion on the State Superintendent Search.

Dr. Ulbrich invited Mr. Michael Collins, a representative of Ray and Associates, Inc., to update the Board on the State Superintendent Search. Mr. Collins joined the meeting via telephone.

Mr. Collins provided an update on the stakeholder meetings, prospective candidate applications, and the retirement system. He said the application deadline was March 11, 2019.

Dr. Ulbrich said the Special Meeting to review the all of the applications will be on Friday, April 5, 2019 at 10:00 a.m. She said it was originally scheduled for March 12<sup>th</sup>, following the Board's Regular Meeting, but the search firm needs more time to review the applications.

Dr. Ulbrich asked the Board to hold all day on April 17<sup>th</sup> and 24<sup>th</sup> for Special Meetings to interview candidates.

#### XIX. STATE AND FEDERAL LEGISLATIVE UPDATE

Ms. Alles asked Ms. Lupe Ramos-Montigny, Chairperson of the Board's Legislative Committee, to lead the discussion on State and Federal Legislation.

The Legislative Committee report and draft Resolution on Dignity in Schools was distributed.

Ms. Ramos-Montigny said members of the Board's Legislative Committee are Dr. Pritchett, Ms. Snyder and Ms. Tilley. Ms. Ramos-Montigny reviewed the report of the Legislative Committee, which met on February 26, 2019.

Dr. Ulbrich said as the Board directed during the February 12, 2019 meeting, she met with the Attorney General's office to discuss Subsection 1280g of 2018 Public Act 601, pertaining to the statewide system of public school accountability measurement, also known as A-F. She said no conclusion was reached, and the Attorney General's office is doing some research. She said she is proposing that she, as the Board President, requests an extension for the August 1 and September 1 deadlines mentioned in MCL 390, subsection 1280g of 2018 Public Act 601.

Request to Legislature to Extend Deadline on A-F Legislation

**Mr. McMillin moved, seconded by Dr. Pritchett, that the State Board of Education hereby resolves to delegate authority to its Board President, consistent with the prior authority granted to seek clarity from the Attorney General regarding MCL 390, Subsection 1280g, to request from all appropriate authorities an extension for the August 1 and September 1 deadlines imposed through the aforementioned legislation.**

Discussion followed.

The vote was taken on the motion.

**The motion carried unanimously.**

Mr. Ackley, Director of Public and Governmental Affairs, provided an update on pending legislation regarding snow days (House Bill 4206), educator evaluations (House Bills 4208, 4221, 4222 and Senate Bill 122), and school safety/school culture (House Bills 4216, 4200, 4201).

Resolution on Dignity in Schools

Ms. Ramos-Montigny reviewed the draft Resolution on Dignity in Schools.

**Ms. Ramos-Montigny moved, seconded by Dr. Ulbrich, that the State Board of Education adopt the Resolution on Dignity in Schools, as distributed during the State Board of Education meeting on March 12, 2019.**

Mr. McMillin said he believes in due process and opposes discrimination, but he is concerned about a disparate impact. He said he will probably pass on the vote for that reason.

Discussion followed.

Ms. Snyder, supported by Dr. Pritchett, proposed a friendly amendment to add a paragraph related to sexual assault and harassment. Ms. Ramos-Montigny and Dr. Ulbrich accepted the friendly amendment.



**Dr. Ulbrich moved, seconded by Ms. Fecteau, that the resolution be amended by adding "may" immediately preceding disproportionately in the first paragraph of the resolution.**

Discussion followed.

The vote was taken on the amendment.

**Ayes: Fecteau, McMillin, Pritchett, Pugh, Snyder, Tilley, Ulbrich  
Nays: Ramos-Montigny**

**The motion to amend carried.**

**Dr. Ulbrich moved, seconded by Ms. Snyder, that the resolution be amended by adding "safety" immediately following school climate in the last paragraph of the resolution.**

The vote was taken on the amendment.

**The motion to amend carried unanimously.**

The vote was taken on the resolution, as amended.

**Ayes: Fecteau, Pritchett, Pugh, Ramos-Montigny, Snyder,  
Tilley, Ulbrich  
Abstain: McMillin**

**The motion carried.**

The Resolution on Dignity in Schools is attached as Exhibit A.

Mr. Ackley provided an update on the Governor's Executive budget.

Ms. Tilley, National Association of State Boards of Education (NASBE) Delegate, said she will attend the NASBE Legislative Conference on April 6-8, 2019, and she will provide a report in April.

XX. CONSENT AGENDA

M. Approval of Criteria for Grant Programs to Build the Capacity of Michigan Schools to Impact the Health, Wellbeing and Educational Outcomes of Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender and Questioning (LGBTQ) Students, \$400,000

**Ms. Ramos-Montigny moved, seconded by Dr. Pritchett, that the State Board of Education approve the Consent Agenda as follows:**

**M. approve the Criteria for Grant Programs to Build the Capacity of Michigan Schools to Impact the Health, Wellbeing and Educational Outcomes of Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender and Questioning (LGBTQ) Students, as attached to the Superintendent's memorandum dated February 26, 2019.**

Mr. McMillin said he has concerns, and will be voting no.

The vote was taken on the motion.

**Ayes: Fecteau, Pritchett, Pugh, Ramos-Montigny, Tilley, Ulbrich**  
**Nays: McMillin, Snyder**

**The motion carried.**

XXI. COMMENTS BY STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MEMBERS

Ms. Ramos-Montigny said Cesar Chavez's birthday is March 31, and the Committee to Honor Cesar E. Chavez is preparing for the annual social justice march, community gathering, unity luncheon, Cinco de Mayo celebration and Scholarship and Awards Gala.

Dr. Pritchett said she attended the Career Readiness Cross Sector Team meeting on March 1<sup>st</sup>, and she was impressed. She said it was a great opportunity for business people and educators to learn from each other.

Dr. Pritchett said she has previously worked with schools that are facing potential chief executive officers, and she is willing to help if asked.

Mr. McMillin said Mr. Peter Greene addressed the Board in November, and he recently had a blog post regarding test scores as proxy for student achievement and teacher effectiveness. Mr. McMillin said Mr. Greene has excellent blog posts.

Ms. Tilley said she would like to hear presentations on areas of concern as well as innovative ideas for classrooms.

Ms. Fecteau said she and Dr. Keesler are speaking at the Michigan Civil Rights Commission Hearing and Testimony on Education and Civil Rights on March 25<sup>th</sup>. Ms. Fecteau said she is part of a panel on special needs and special education.

Dr. Pugh said many school districts are overcoming huge barriers in clever ways, and she would like to see more presentations on innovative ways to overcome challenges.

Mr. McMillin said he would like future discussions on summative scores and defining growth.

Dr. Pugh said she it is important that the Benton Harbor Area Schools Board, as elected officials, and community members are involved in decisions that will affect the district in the future.

Ms. Snyder said Mr. Chad Downs, the Milken Award recipient, acknowledged his parents for teaching him resilience, commitment, a work ethic, and how to have fun. She said she appreciated his comments.

XXII. APPROVAL OF SPECIAL MEETING

**Dr. Ulbrich moved, seconded by Ms. Tilley, that the State Board of Education approve the Special Meeting of the Board on Friday, April 5, at 10:00 a.m. to review applications for the position of State Superintendent.**

The vote was taken on the motion.

**The motion carried unanimously.**

XXIII. FUTURE MEETING DATES

- A. Friday, April 5, 2019 (10:00 a.m.) Special Meeting
- B. Tuesday, April 9, 2019 (9:30 a.m.) Regular Meeting
- C. Wednesday, April 17, 2019 (9:30 a.m.) Special Meeting *PENDING*
- D. Wednesday, April 24, 2019 (9:30 a.m.) Special Meeting *PENDING*
- E. Tuesday, May 14, 2019 (9:30 a.m.) Regular Meeting
- F. Wednesday, May 22, 2019 (9:30 a.m.) Board Retreat

XXIV. TENTATIVE AGENDA FOR NEXT MEETING

Ms. Alles asked Board members if there are additional agenda topics they would like to be considered for future meeting agendas.

Ms. Fecteau said she would like a presentation on the federal Community Renewal Tax Relief Act, which provides a tax credit that affects education.

Ms. Tilley said she would like to know more about federal grants for schools, their purpose, and allocations.

Ms. Alles thanked Board members and staff for a productive meeting.

XXV. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 4:38 p.m.

The video archive of the meeting is available on the [Michigan State Board of Education website](http://www.michigan.gov/sbe) ([www.michigan.gov/sbe](http://www.michigan.gov/sbe)).

Respectfully submitted,

Michelle Fecteau  
Secretary

State of Michigan  
State Board of Education

**RESOLUTION ON DIGNITY IN SCHOOLS**

WHEREAS, Suspensions, expulsions, and school-based arrests are used too often in our schools and may disproportionately impact students based on their race, color, or national origin; sex; LGBTQ status; and disability status.

WHEREAS, Data from the U.S. Department of Education (USED), during the 2013-2014 school year, indicate that Black K-12 students were 3.8 times more likely to receive an out-of-school suspension than white students, even though research shows there is no evidence that students of color misbehave more than their white peers.

WHEREAS, Research has shown that exclusionary discipline is a counterproductive response to student behavior, worsening educational outcomes both for the students suspended and for their classmates.

WHEREAS, In 2014, the U.S. Department of Justice and USED jointly released a school discipline guidance package that assisted states, districts, and schools in developing policies and practices to meet existing federal civil rights laws and to promote positive school climates.

WHEREAS, In December 2018, those federal departments rescinded the guidance package after a report from the federal School Safety Commission recommended doing so and indicated that the federal government no longer supported investigating district policies and practices that have a disparate impact on students of color.

WHEREAS, Federal law and regulations continue to prohibit district policies and practices that have a disparate impact on students based on their race, color, or national origin; sex; disability status; or age.

WHEREAS, Focusing on evidence-based policies and practices that create a positive school climate for all students and addressing school climate in the Michigan ESSA Plan increases student achievement and increases equitable access to educational opportunities.

WHEREAS, Trauma research and evidence-based practice shows response is necessary in sexual assault and harassment behavior to effectively address the impact on school climate and safety; and change the culture of assault with the acknowledgement that sexual assault and harassment disproportionately affects students of color. Transformative Justice is a general philosophical strategy for responding to conflicts that incorporates restorative justice and will provide a foundation for discussion and recommendations on practice and policy in this area.

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED THAT The State Board of Education reaffirms its commitment to upholding all federal and state civil rights laws; helping school districts enact policies that improve school climate, safety, and do not have a disparate impact on students based on their race, sex, LGBTQ status, disability status, or age; and eliminating the use of ineffective exclusionary discipline and increasing equity for all students.