

MINUTES

STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION

Ladislaus B. Dombrowski Board Room
John A. Hannah Building
608 West Allegan
Lansing, Michigan

November 15, 2016
9:30 a.m.

Present: Mr. Brian J. Whiston, Chairman
Mr. John C. Austin, President
Dr. Casandra E. Ulbrich, Vice President
Ms. Michelle Fecteau, Secretary
Dr. Pamela Pugh, Treasurer
Ms. Lupe Ramos-Montigny, NASBE Delegate
Mrs. Kathleen N. Straus
Mrs. Eileen Weiser
Dr. Richard Zeile
Mr. Craig Ruff, representing Governor Rick Snyder, ex officio

Also Present: Mrs. Tracy Horodyski, 2016-2017 Michigan Teacher of the Year

REGULAR MEETING

I. CALL TO ORDER

Mr. Whiston called the meeting to order at 9:30 a.m.

II. APPROVAL OF AGENDA AND ORDER OF PRIORITY

Ms. Lupe Ramos-Montigny moved, seconded by Dr. Ulbrich, that the State Board of Education approve the agenda and order of priority.

The vote was taken on the motion to approve the agenda and order of priority.

**Ayes: Austin, Ramos-Montigny, Straus, Ulbrich, Zeile
Absent During Vote: Fecteau
Absent: Pugh, Weiser**

The motion carried.

III. INTRODUCTION OF STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MEMBERS AND STAFF

Mrs. Marilyn Schneider, State Board Executive, introduced members of the State Board of Education.

Mr. Whiston asked that newly hired staff members of the Michigan Department of Education be introduced.

Mr. Martin Ackley, Director of Public and Governmental Affairs, introduced Mr. Mark Howe from the Office of Public and Governmental Affairs.

Dr. Venessa Keesler, Deputy Superintendent of Educator, Student, and School Supports, introduced Mr. Brian Lloyd, Ms. Rebekah Emmerling and Dixie Koenemann from the Office of Educator Talent and Policy Coordination.

Ms. Susan Broman, Deputy Superintendent of P-20 System and Student Transitions, introduced Ms. Dedra McGlory from the Office of Special Education.

Mr. Kyle Guerrant, Deputy Superintendent of Finance and Operations, introduced Ms. Natalee Mickelson from the Office of School Support Services.

Mr. Whiston asked audience members to introduce themselves.

Mrs. Weiser arrived at 9:35 a.m.

IV. PERSONAL PRIVILEGE – MR. BRIAN J. WHISTON

Mr. Whiston offered congratulations to Tom McMillin and Nikki Snyder, who were elected on November 8, 2016 to fill two vacancies on the State Board of Education. He said their eight-year terms begin on January 1, 2017.

Mr. Whiston said Kathleen Straus and John Austin are completing their terms. He said Kathleen has served on the State Board of Education for 24 years, and John has served for 16 years. He thanked them for their public service and dedication to education, and he said they will be honored in December.

V. RECESS

The Board recessed the Regular Meeting at 9:39 a.m. to convene the Committee of the Whole.

COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE MEETING

VI. CALL TO ORDER

Mr. Whiston called the Committee of the Whole Meeting to order at 9:40 a.m.

VII. PRESENTATION ON SPECIAL EDUCATION ADVISORY COMMITTEE (SEAC) ANNUAL REPORT FOR 2015-2016

Ms. Teri Chapman, Director, Special Education; Ms. Maggie Kolk, SEAC Chairperson, The Arc of Michigan; and Ms. Amy Schelling, SEAC Ex Officio, Educator Preparation Institutions; presented the SEAC Annual Report for 2015-2016.

Mr. Whiston said SEAC is mandated by the Individuals with Disabilities Education Act (IDEA) to advise the State Education Agency; and by Michigan law to advise the State Board of Education regarding special education issues.

Mr. Whiston said the SEAC 2015-2016 Annual Report summarizes the work the committee has done throughout the year, and SEAC leadership is presenting the report and asking the Board for feedback.

Mr. Whiston said Ms. Michelle Fecteau interacts with SEAC on a regular basis.

Information was provided via a [PowerPoint presentation](#).

Board member comments included suspension data by gender, reasons for suspension, clarification of slide outlining 56 days of lost instructional time, correlation between behavior and Michigan Education Assessment Program reading scores, integrating teachers, number of schools implementing Michigan Integrated Behavior and Learning Support Initiative with fidelity, fidelity measures, peer influence as a factor, and the effect of turnover of staff and students.

VIII. PRESENTATION ON EVERY STUDENT SUCCEEDS ACT PLAN

Dr. Venessa Keesler, Deputy Superintendent of Educator, Student, and School Supports, presented on the Every Student Succeeds Act (ESSA) Plan.

Mr. Whiston said the presentation provides an overview of how Michigan is addressing the whole child through the Every Student Succeeds Act, outlining opportunities in ESSA to leverage the funds, activities, and data to provide supports to students and schools across a broad range of identified needs. He said the approach supports and aligns the ESSA work and Michigan's plan to become a Top 10 state within 10 years by assuring a unified vision for best practices and a plan to provide assistance to schools that is responsive to the needs of the state's children, families, educators and job providers.

Information was provided via a [PowerPoint presentation](#).

Board member comments included whether the 39 per cent reduction in the reporting burden by school districts allows additional data to be collected without violation of the Headlee Amendment; timing of ESSA Plan submission

post-election; collaboration of SBE, Governor and Legislature with regard to the ESSA Plan; beginning discussion of legislative changes related to the ESSA plan; allowing for innovation while considering local level assessments and best practices; ensuring minority populations in a community are not overlooked during needs assessment; relationship to School Reform Office; decision maker for best practice and evidence-based practice; partnership districts; comprehensive testing and mission creep; tendency to go to tested subjects for instructional time, but arts and sports foster lessons in teamwork and a communal goal; use of technology and providing tools and support for educators; and need for social workers and health care workers.

IX. PRESENTATION ON TOP 10 IN 10

Ms. Norma Jean Sass, Chief Deputy Superintendent; Mr. Stephen Best, Director, Strategic Planning and Implementation; Ms. Michelle Ribant, State Director of 21st Century Learning and Assistant Director of the Office of Education Improvement and Innovation; and Mr. Mike McGroarty, Longitudinal Manager, Center for Educational Performance and Information; presented on the Top 10 in 10 – Data Mapping.

Mr. Whiston said Department of Education staff continue to work with stakeholders to develop Michigan into a Top 10 education state within 10 years, and share information at monthly State Board of Education meetings. He said staff is demonstrating the use data mapping this month.

Information was provided via a website presentation on data mapping.

Board member comments included the need for the translation of data that is easily understood by the general public.

X. PRESENTATION ON PROPOSED STANDARDS FOR THE PREPARATION OF TEACHERS OF ENGLISH AS A SECOND LANGUAGE (ESL) AND BILINGUAL EDUCATION

Ms. Leah Breen, Director, Professional Preparation Services; and Dr. Sean Kottke, Education Consultant, Professional Preparation Services; presented on Proposed Standards for the Preparation of Teachers of English as a Second Language (ESL) and Bilingual Education.

Mr. Whiston said the Standards for the Preparation of Teachers of English as a Second Language and Bilingual Education were both updated to improve alignment between educator preparation policy in Michigan and the Every Student Succeeds Act to support the Top 10 Strategic Goal 3 and Strategy 2.2c. He said these two standards will replace Michigan's current teacher endorsement standards as the guiding sets of standards for initial teacher preparation and in-service professional development in English as a second language and bilingual instruction.

Information was shared via a [PowerPoint presentation](#).

Board member comments included clarification of Chinese and Spanish standards, social justice discussion, implementation of the standards in schools; treatment of all students as first-class citizens; schools as safe places for students who should not have to fear acts of prejudice; length of time for public comment; need for more bilingual teachers in southwest Detroit; and consider making statements in the documents more concise.

XI. PRESENTATION ON 21ST CENTURY COMMUNITY LEARNING CENTERS PROGRAM AND OUT-OF-SCHOOL TIME FIELD

Mr. Richard Lower, Director, Preschool & Out-of-School Time Learning; and Ms. Lorraine Thoreson, Coordinator, 21st Century Community Learning Centers Programs; presented on the 21st Century Community Learning Centers Program and Out-of-School Time Field.

Mr. Whiston said the presentation is an overview of the current status of the 21st Century Community Learning Centers Program and the field of Out-of-School Time in Michigan. He said the authorization of the Every Student Succeeds Act and the goal to see Michigan become a Top 10 education state in 10 years, makes this an ideal time for increased understanding of the program and the initiatives currently underway.

Information was shared via a [PowerPoint presentation](#). Also distributed was a folder of supporting documentation, and *Expanding Minds and Opportunities – the Power of Afterschool and Summer Learning for Student Success*.

Board member comments included funding and leveraging philanthropic money to fill slots; effective implementation; and the vision of full-day, full-service schools serving as the hub of the community.

XII. RECESS

The Board adjourned the Committee of the Whole at 12:32 p.m. and reconvened the Regular Meeting at 1:35 p.m.

Dr. Pugh joined the meeting at 12:40 p.m.

Mr. Ruff left the meeting at 1:35 p.m.

REGULAR MEETING

XIII. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION IN STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MEETING

1. Kedon Wilson, representing EnACT Your Future and Pro-Up, Detroit, Michigan, provided verbal comments and written information on education and career opportunities through EnACT Your Future and Pro-Up.
2. Julie Dye, Jackson, Michigan, provided comments regarding Native American themed sports mascots, logos and nicknames in Michigan schools.
3. Zhaauanong NimKii Kwew/Linda Cypret-Kilbourne of Marshall, Michigan, representing Michigan Coalition Against Racism in Sports Media, AIM Great Lakes, and Native American Student Community Organization, provided comments regarding Native American themed sports mascots, logos and nicknames in Michigan schools.
4. Karen Schaumann, Ann Arbor, Michigan, provided comments regarding Native American themed sports mascots, logos and nicknames in Michigan schools.
5. Julie Adolphson of Mason, Michigan, representing Michigan Reading Association, provided comments and a written statement supporting school libraries and school librarians.
6. Sue Lay, West Bloomfield, Michigan, representing the Michigan Association for Media in Education, provided comments accepting the Michigan Reading Association statement supporting school libraries and school librarians.
7. Monica Washington Padula of Kalamazoo, Michigan, provided comments and written information regarding Native American themed sports mascots, logos and nicknames in Michigan schools.
8. LaMar Lemmons of Detroit, Michigan, representing the Detroit Public Schools Board of Education, provided comments regarding Detroit schools.

XIV. RECESS

The Board recessed the Regular Meeting at 2:17 p.m. to reconvene the Committee of the Whole.

COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE MEETING

XV. PRESENTATION ON SUCCESSES WITH TECHNOLOGY READINESS INFRASTRUCTURE GRANT (TRIG)

Ms. Linda Forward, Director, Education Improvement and Innovation; Ms. Michelle Ribant, State Director of 21st Century Learning and Assistant Director of the Office of Education Improvement and Innovation; and Mr. Dave Cairy, TRIG Project Director; presented on Successes with Technology Readiness Infrastructure Grant (TRIG).

Mr. Whiston said the Technology Readiness Infrastructure Grant (TRIG) has been funded by the Michigan Department of Education since 2012. He said in this final year of grant funding, staff is presenting on the successes of TRIG including supporting 96 percent of students and district testing online, as well as providing \$78.5 million in direct savings on devices.

Information was shared via a [PowerPoint presentation](#). A document, *The Michigan Data Hub – A Strategic Alignment and ROI Study*, was distributed.

Board member discussion included data breeches.

XVI. DISCUSSION REGARDING CRITERIA FOR GRANT PROGRAMS

There were no questions from Board members regarding grant criteria.

XVII. ADJOURNMENT

The Board adjourned the Committee of the Whole at 2:45 p.m. to reconvene the Regular Meeting.

REGULAR MEETING

XVIII. APPROVAL OF STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MINUTES

H. Approval of Minutes of Regular and Committee of the Whole Meeting of October 11, 2016

Mrs. Straus moved, seconded by Mrs. Weiser, that the State Board of Education approve the Minutes of the Regular and Committee of the Whole Meeting of October 11, 2016.

The vote was taken on the motion.

The motion carried unanimously.

XIX. PRESIDENT'S REPORT

Mr. Austin provided reflections on the November 8, 2016, general election. He reiterated the message that discrimination should not be tolerated, especially in schools, which should be safe places where students are free from fear of discrimination.

Mr. Austin said a letter from the State Superintendent was mailed to all school districts on September 22, 2016 reminding them of the State Board of Education policy on American Indian Mascots, Nicknames, and Logos.

XX. REPORT OF THE SUPERINTENDENT

Reports

I. Human Resources Report

J. Report on the Livingston Educational Service Agency Plan for the Delivery of Special Education Programs and Services

Grants

K. Report on Grant Awards

1. 2016-2017 Section 35a(2) and 35a(3) for Professional Development for Early Literacy Educators - Initial; \$1,900,000
2. 2016-2017 Section 35a(4) Intermediate School District Early Literacy Coaches - Initial; \$2,887,500
3. 2016-2017 Section 35a(5) Additional Instructional Time and Interventions - Initial; \$12,000,780
4. 2015-2016 Section 61b Planning Grants for Career and Technical Education Early/Middle College Programs - Initial; \$435,933
5. 2016-2017 IDEA, Part B Grant Funded Initiatives - Initial; \$21,225,000
6. 2016-2017 Office of Special Education (OSE) Adolescent Literacy Model Demonstration Projects - Initial; \$12,456
7. 2016-2017 Section 54b Statewide Implementation of Michigan Integrated Behavior and Learning Support Initiative Pilot - Initial; \$1,125,000
8. 2016-2017 Section 55 Conductive Education Evaluation Project - Initial; \$150,000

9. 2016-2017 State Personnel Development Grant Under the IDEA - Initial; \$1,386,000
10. 2015-2016 Flint Declaration of Emergency Grants: Sec. 11o(2) - State Early Intervention Services Similar to Early On - Initial; \$8,300,000
11. 2016-2017 Flint Declaration of Emergency Grants: Section 11s(4) – State Early Intervention Services Similar to Early On - Initial; \$6,155,000
12. 2014-2015 Section 1003(g) School Improvement Grants - Amendment; \$71,527,807
13. 2015-2016 Section 99h: Competitive FIRST Robotics Grants - Amendment; \$2,424,600
14. 2016-2017 ISD Collaboration Grant - Initial; \$180,000
15. 2016-2017 ISD Collaboration Grant - Initial; \$598,800

Mr. Whiston shared information on his recent school visits.

Mr. Whiston said he and Agustin Arbulu, Director, Michigan Department of Civil Rights, are sending a joint memo on November 15, 2016, to send a consistent message that bullying, harassment, violence, property destruction or any other form of intimidation have no place in schools. The memo contains suggestions and tools for ensuring that schools are safe places where every student is made to feel welcome.

XXI. REPORT OF MICHIGAN TEACHER OF THE YEAR

Mrs. Tracy Horodyski, 2016-2017 Michigan Teacher of the Year, presented the Report of the Michigan Teacher of the Year.

Mrs. Horodyski shared information on seeking techniques to empower students and encourage ownership by teaching them how to be social in purposeful ways.

XXII. STATE AND FEDERAL LEGISLATIVE UPDATE

Mr. Martin Ackley, Director, Public and Governmental Affairs; Dr. Casandra Ulbrich, Chair, State Board of Education Legislative Committee; Ms. Lupe Ramos-Montigny, National Association of State Boards of Education Delegate; and Mrs. Eileen Weiser, Education Commission of the States; presented the State and Federal Legislative Update.

Mr. Ackley said some of the legislative leadership has been appointed. He said the State Board of Education Legislative Committee met on November 4, 2016, and discussed statements to present to the full Board for consideration.

Dr. Ulbrich asked that three draft statements be distributed.

Statement Limiting the Use of Seclusion and Restraint in Schools

Ms. Fecteau moved, seconded by Mrs. Straus, that the State Board of Education approve the Statement on House Bills 5409-5416.

The vote was taken on the motion.

The motion carried unanimously.

State Board of Education Statement on House Bills 5409-5416 is attached as Exhibit A.

Statement Providing Alternatives to Suspending or Expelling Students

Mr. Austin moved, seconded by Mrs. Weiser, that the State Board of Education approve the Statement on House Bills 5618-21; 5693-95.

The vote was taken on the motion.

The motion carried unanimously.

State Board of Education Statement on House Bills 5418-21; 5693-95 is attached as Exhibit B.

Statement on New Public School Employees in Defined Contribution System

Mrs. Weiser moved, seconded by Ms. Ramos-Montigny, that the State Board of Education approve the Statement on Senate Bill 102.

The vote was taken on the motion.

**Ayes: Austin, Fecteau, Pugh, Ramos-Montigny, Straus, Ulbrich,
Weiser**

Abstain: Zeile

The motion carried.

Dr. Zeile said he abstained, because he needs to fully understand the legislation.

State Board of Education Statement on Senate Bill 102 is attached as Exhibit C.

Dr. Ulbrich said safety concerns have been expressed in schools that serve as polling locations. Mr. Whiston said, when requested, he has forgiven the day of instruction in such instances.

National Association of State Boards of Education (NASBE)

Dr. Pugh said she, Ms. Fecteau, Dr. Pugh and Dr. Zeile attended the NASBE annual meeting on October 19-22, 2016. She said Mrs. Straus received the David A. Kysilko Distinguished Service Award.

Mrs. Straus thanked her colleagues for attending the awards ceremony. She further stated that Dr. Pugh moderated a session on the environment, which is an area of her expertise.

Ms. Fecteau said she attended a session on Every Student Succeeds Act guidance, and there was an interesting debate on what states should do given the flexibility that is allowed.

Education Commission of the States

Mrs. Weiser said there will be a meeting of the Education Commission of the States in two weeks. She said she will be sharing the thinking that is going into Top 10 in 10. She said there is a small group that is making recommendations to states as they vision for ESSA plans. She said they are also focusing on the learner and the new children coming up and seeing the change in the way they learn.

XXIII. CONSENT AGENDA

- M. Approval of Criteria for Section 61a(4) Culinary Arts Program, \$79,000
- N. Approval of Criteria for Section 63, Joint Capital Project Between an Intermediate School District and a Local Health Department, \$250,000
- O. Approval of Criteria for Section 99s(2) and (3) – Michigan Science Technology Engineering Mathematics (MiSTEM) Advisory Council Grants, \$1,000,000
- P. Approval of Amended Criteria for Michigan 10 Cents a Meal Support of Local Produce in School Meals, \$250,000

Ms. Fecteau moved, seconded by Mrs. Straus, that the State Board of Education approve the consent agenda as follows:

- M. approve the Criteria for Section 61a(4), Culinary Arts Program, as attached to the Superintendent's memorandum dated November 1, 2016;**

- N. approve the Criteria for Section 63 – Joint Capital Project Between an Intermediate School District and a Local Health Department, as attached to the Superintendent’s memorandum dated November 1, 2016;**
- O. approve the Criteria for Section 99s(2) and (3) – Michigan Science Technology Engineering Mathematics (MiSTEM) Advisory Council Grants, as attached to the Superintendent’s memo dated November 1, 2016; and**
- P. approve the amended Criteria for Michigan 10 Cents a Meal Support of Local Produce in School Meals, as attached to the Superintendent’s memo dated November 1, 2016.**

The vote was taken on the motion.

The motion carried unanimously.

XXIV. COMMENTS BY STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MEMBERS

Mrs. Weiser said the newly elected Board members may have conflicts with the Board meeting schedule, and she has urged them to contact Mr. Whiston.

Dr. Pugh said there has been discussion and action on concerns expressed regarding the use of Native American mascots, logos and nicknames in schools. She asked if anything else can be done. Discussion followed.

Dr. Pugh asked to see the Detroit Public Schools comprehensive financial report, if it is available.

Ms. Fecteau said she met with Michelle Corey of Michigan’s Children, and they are working with children who have experienced trauma. Ms. Fecteau said she would like services for children who have experienced trauma, as well as school libraries and librarians, considered for inclusion in Michigan’s Every Students Succeed Act Plan.

Ms. Fecteau said she would like the Special Education Caucus, comprised of Senators and Representatives, to meet with the Board, as other legislators have met with the Board in the past.

Ms. Fecteau said there have been discussion regarding the special education complaint process and providing defenders for those who cannot afford representation.

Ms. Ramos-Montigny thanked Mr. Whiston for sending the statement to school personnel encouraging safe school environments for all children.

Mrs. Straus asked if there will be an orientation for newly elected State Board of Education members and legislators. Mr. Whiston said orientations are being planned.

Mrs. Weiser said Michigan has high rates of cyber and high school bullying, which must be dealt with. She said Connecticut has done a fantastic job of addressing bullying. Discussion followed.

XXV. TENTATIVE AGENDA FOR NEXT MEETING

Board members are asked to contact a member of the Agenda Planning Committee with suggestions for agenda topics.

XXVI. FUTURE MEETING DATES

- A. Tuesday, December 13, 2016 (9:30 a.m.) Regular Meeting
- B. Tuesday, January 10, 2017 (9:30 a.m.) Regular Meeting
- C. Tuesday, February 14, 2017 (9:30 a.m.) Regular Meeting

XXVII. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 3:26 p.m.

The video archive of the meeting is available at www.michigan.gov/sbe.

Respectfully submitted,

Michelle Fecteau
Secretary

**State Board of Education Statement on
House Bills 5409-5416**

The State Board of Education (SBE) reiterates its support for House Bills 5409-5416, which codify the Board's 2006 policy limiting the use of restraint and seclusion in schools as a last resort only in emergency situations, and directs the Legislature to the [SBE statement of May 10, 2016](#).

Adopted November 15, 2016

**State Board of Education Statement on
House Bills 5618-21; 5693-95**

The State Board of Education (SBE) supports House Bills 5618-21 and 5693-95, which provide alternatives to suspending or expelling students. These alternatives include utilizing restorative practices in addition to suspension or expulsion. The SBE encourages the Legislature to also consider the additional costs of providing these services, such as training.

Adopted November 15, 2016

**State Board of Education Statement on
Senate Bill 102**

Senate Bill 102 would require all new public school employees to enter into a defined contribution system. The State Board of Education appreciates the significant unfunded liabilities in the current Michigan Public School Employees Retirement System (MPSERS) program, however we fear that this move will lead to higher liabilities in the current pension system and cost the state taxpayers billions of additional dollars. A 2012 study determined that the transition costs to place public school employees into the same defined contribution plan as other state employees would cost an additional \$13.6 billion over 30 years, plus an additional \$4.5 billion in short-term costs. In addition, according to the Office of Retirement Services, transitioning new employees will not address the existing defined benefit legacy liability, but will most likely enhance it. Therefore, the State Board of Education urges caution in making these changes, and supports maintaining the current hybrid plan, which is fully funded.

Adopted November 15, 2016