

MINUTES

STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION

Ladislaus B. Dombrowski Board Room
John A. Hannah Building
608 West Allegan
Lansing, Michigan

October 11, 2016
9:30 a.m.

Present: Mr. Brian J. Whiston, Chairman
Mr. John C. Austin, President
Dr. Casandra E. Ulbrich, Vice President
Ms. Michelle Fecteau, Secretary
Dr. Pamela Pugh, Treasurer
Ms. Lupe Ramos-Montigny, NASBE Delegate
Mrs. Kathleen N. Straus
Mrs. Eileen Weiser
Dr. Richard Zeile
Mr. Craig Ruff, representing Governor Rick Snyder, ex officio

Also Present: Mrs. Tracy Horodyski, 2016-2017 Michigan Teacher of the Year

REGULAR MEETING

I. CALL TO ORDER

Mr. Whiston called the meeting to order at 9:35 a.m.

II. APPROVAL OF AGENDA AND ORDER OF PRIORITY

Dr. Ulbrich moved, seconded by Mr. Austin, that the State Board of Education approve the agenda and order of priority.

The vote was taken on the motion to approve the agenda and order of priority.

**Ayes: Austin, Fecteau, Ramos-Montigny, Straus, Ulbrich,
Weiser, Zeile
Absent: Pugh**

The motion carried.

III. INTRODUCTION OF STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MEMBERS AND STAFF

Mrs. Marilyn Schneider, State Board Executive, introduced members of the State Board of Education.

Mr. Whiston asked Deputy Superintendents to introduce the newest members of the Michigan Department of Education. Ms. Susan Broman introduced Ms. Janet Timbs and Mr. Aaron Darling, Special Education; and Mr. Kreg Wager, Child Development and Care.

Mr. Kyle Guerrant introduced Ms. Caitlyn Wood and Ms. Heather Holland, Office of School Support Services.

Dr. Venessa Keesler introduced Ms. Kelli Cassaday, Professional Preparation Services; Ms. Chanel Hampton, Educator Talent and Policy Coordination; and Ms. Lisa Brown, Field Services.

Mr. Whiston asked audience members to introduce themselves.

IV. RECESS

The Board recessed the Regular Meeting at 9:42 a.m. to convene the Committee of the Whole.

Dr. Pugh arrived at 9:43 a.m.

COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE MEETING

V. CALL TO ORDER

Mr. Whiston called the Committee of the Whole Meeting to order at 9:43 a.m.

VI. PRESENTATION ON TOP 10 IN 10

Ms. Norma Jean Sass, Chief Deputy Superintendent, presented the Top 10 in 10 – Transformation Zone.

Mr. Whiston said the Michigan Department of Education is working with stakeholders to develop Michigan into a Top 10 education state in 10 years. He said Chief Deputy Superintendent Norma Jean Sass will share information on Transformation Zones, which are a key component of the plan.

Information was provided via a [PowerPoint presentation](#).

Board member comments included the addition of timelines; availability of documents for viewing, feedback and participation; similarity to work done in Massachusetts, Tennessee and Ontario; length of time to put building blocks in place; dependency on increased funding; target population; when results will be realized; limited pilot initially; multiple measures of improvement; team membership and inclusion of special education and English language learners; types of data collected; and the focus on structure and goal.

VII. PRESENTATION ON EVERY STUDENT SUCCEEDS ACT VISION INCLUDING ASSESSMENT

Mr. Brian Whiston, State Superintendent; and Dr. Venessa Keesler, Deputy Superintendent, Educator, Student, and School Supports; presented on the Every Student Succeeds Act (ESSA) Vision including Assessment.

Mr. Whiston said the presentation provides an overview of Michigan Department of Education's student testing vision for the 21st Century, which will comprise the assessment activities outlined in the ESSA state plan. He said the assessment vision supports and aligns the ESSA work and Michigan's plan to become a Top 10 Education State in 10 Years by providing an assessment that aligns with Michigan's high academic standards and aims to reduce overall testing time in Michigan schools, as well as responding to the needs of the state's educators and job providers.

Mr. Whiston said most parents want students to be curious, problem-solvers, critical thinkers, able to work independently and in teams, able to communicate well in writing and verbally, and able to set and achieve goals. He said to accomplish this, the work being done in the Top 10 in 10 plan must align classroom instruction to those outcomes. He said this requires an assessment system that meets Michigan's high standards and provides information on the level of student performance. He said the information will allow students to set performance goals. He said educators, parents and students would be able to establish a plan to achieve student goals and monitor progress.

Dr. Keesler share information via a [PowerPoint presentation](#). A document, "A Student Testing Vision for the 21st Century," was distributed.

Mr. Ruff arrived at 10:30 a.m.

Board member comments included unknowns related to a change in testing; high-stakes testing resulting in consequences for schools and students; accountability monitored by Michigan Department of Education or School Reform Officer; presentations on the ESSA plan at future Board meetings; school turnaround efforts echoing Massachusetts; differential funding offering more resources for children in poverty; the value of assessments for teachers to use in real time; assessments to measure standards, growth model and proficiency; grades tested; partnership model; letters of support and opposition for assessment vision; unified vision among State Board of Education, Michigan Department of Education, Governor and Legislature; changing while on the verge of getting data; teaching of skills not individual knowledge; concern about mission creep becoming broader and less useful; subgroups; concern about value-added and growth models and controlling for variables; potential for growth is greater with more family resources; incentivizing integrated schools, successful special education programs,

successful English language learner programs, small class sizes, and schools with libraries; social studies standards; monitoring feedback of incentivizing to make sure it is achieving the intended results; and collaboration with other policymakers.

VIII. PRESENTATION ON AFRICAN AMERICAN YOUNG MEN OF PROMISE INITIATIVE; AND LISTENING PROJECT OF DETROIT LIFE COALITION AND MICHIGAN NETWORK FOR EQUITY IN EDUCATION

Mr. Stephen Best, Director, Strategic Planning and Implementation, Michigan Department of Education; and Dr. Theresa Saunders, Consultant, Office of Education Improvement and Innovation, Michigan Department of Education; presented on the African American Young Men of Promise Initiative.

Dr. Emery Petchauer, Michigan Network for Equity in Education, and Associate Professor in the College of Education at Michigan State University, presented on the Listening Project of Detroit LIFE Coalition and Michigan Network for Equity in Education.

Mr. Whiston said the presentations focus on work that is being done toward helping Michigan become a Top 10 education state in 10 years. He said the information is being presented in two parts.

He said the first presentation, from Mr. Best and Dr. Saunders, will share information on the cross-office effort the Michigan Department of Education has led on the African American Young Men of Promise Initiative.

The second presentation is a report on the Listening Project of Detroit LIFE Coalition and Michigan Network for Equity in Education, which will be presented by Dr. Petchauer.

Mr. Best and Dr. Saunders provided information via a [PowerPoint presentation](#).

Dr. Petchauer provided information via a [PowerPoint presentation](#). He also distributed the following documents: "Spring 2016 Listening Project" and "Death by a Thousand Cuts."

Board member comments encompassed inclusion of facts related to school closures, importance of listening to people's experiences, progress in building a statewide network, listening and then developing a plan of solutions leading to a positive future, schools labeled as failing and the effect on graduates, collaboration with Michigan College Access Network to multiply effort, implications for building power among areas of poverty, funding resources, availability of listening projects across the state, activating what is learned to benefit students in schools, and the importance of hearing all voices.

IX. DISCUSSION REGARDING CRITERIA FOR GRANT PROGRAMS

Mrs. Straus asked if the Criteria for Great Start Parent Coalitions Trusted Advisor Grants could be simplified. Ms. Broman said trusted advisors is a new concept that will vary greatly across communities, and the list of criteria is intended to provide guidance for a new program.

Mr. Austin asked if 21st Century Schools grant money is still available, and when the next funding cycle is due. He said he has some suggestions to share for the next funding cycle. Ms. Broman said the funding cycle is annually, and Mr. Austin was invited to share his suggestions with her.

X. ADJOURNMENT

The Board adjourned the Committee of the Whole at 12:14 p.m. and reconvened the Regular Meeting at 1:10 p.m.

REGULAR MEETING

XI. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION IN STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MEETING

1. Representative Sherry Gay-Dagnogo, representing Michigan's 9th House District, Detroit, Michigan, provided verbal comments and written information on a moratorium on school closures in Detroit.
2. Sherry A. Wells, representing the Green Party of Michigan, Ferndale, Michigan, provided comments regarding recess, testing, teachers and Detroit education.
3. Karen Schaumann, representing Michigan Coalition Against Racism in Sports and Media, Ann Arbor, Michigan, provided comments and written information regarding racial mascots in schools.
4. Laura Jones, Pinckney, Michigan, provided comments on special education.
5. Laura Jones read a statement regarding special education, which was provided by Marcie Lipsitt, Franklin, Michigan, who did not attend the meeting.
6. LaMar Lemmons, Detroit, Michigan, provided comments regarding school closings in Detroit.

XII. APPROVAL OF STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MINUTES

- E. Approval of Minutes of Regular and Committee of the Whole Meeting of September 14, 2016

Ms. Lupe Ramos-Montigny moved, seconded by Mrs. Straus, that the State Board of Education approve the Minutes of the Regular and Committee of the Whole Meeting of September 14, 2016.

The vote was taken on the motion.

The motion carried unanimously.

Mr. Ruff left the meeting at 1:40 p.m.

XXIII. PRESIDENT'S REPORT

Mr. Austin said, as mentioned during public participation, the Use of American Indian Mascots, Nicknames, and Logos continues to be a concern. He said the Resolution adopted by the Board in 2003, and reaffirmed in June 2006 and August 2010, was sent to schools in September as a reminder.

Ms. Ramos-Montigny asked if there was a list of schools using American Indian Mascots, Nicknames, and Logos. Discussion followed.

Mr. Austin said with regard to Detroit and school turnaround, there needs to be a unified school turnaround effort, first trying positive intervention and partnership, and then restructuring and quality options. He said the School Reform Office and the Michigan Department of Education need to be joined back together.

Mr. Whiston said the Every Student Succeeds Act (ESSA) plan, which included school turnaround, should be agreeable to the Department, Board, Governor and Legislature.

Mr. Austin said he will leave discussion on school closure to the Board's Legislative Committee.

Dr. Ulbrich reiterated that the Department is working on this in the ESSA plan, which may require changes in current Michigan law.

Mr. Austin said Lieutenant Governor Brian Calley convened a Special Education Reform Task Force, and Ms. Fecteau and Mrs. Weiser were members. He said the task force recommendations should continue to be animated and made real. He said Mr. Whiston is working through the special education "pause" and advocates need to feel included.

Mr. Austin said he, Mr. Whiston, and Mrs. Weiser will attend the Governor's 21st Century Education Commission retreat, and he will be advocating for many educational issues.

XIV. REPORT OF THE SUPERINTENDENT

Report

F. Human Resources Report

Grants

G. Report on Grant Awards

1. 2016-2017 Secondary Perkins State Leadership Grant - Initial; \$1,345,665
2. 2016-2017 Section 65, Pre-College Engineering K-12 Educational Program - Initial; \$340,000
3. 2015-2016 IDEA, Part B Grant Funded Initiatives - Amendment; \$20,575,000
4. 2016-2017 Mandated Activities Under the Individuals with Disabilities Education Act (IDEA 2004), Part C - Initial; \$1,665,113
5. 2016-2017 Section 32p Grants - Initial; \$10,900,000
6. 2015-2016 Flint Declaration of Emergency Grants: Section 11o- Preschool & Out-of-School Time Learning - Initial; \$900,000
7. 2016-2017 Flint Declaration of Emergency Grants: Section 11s- Preschool & Out-of-School Time Learning - Initial; \$1,500,000
8. 2016-2017 Application for School Bus Driver Safety Education Program - Initial; \$1,625,000
9. 2016-2017 Application for School Bus Inspection Program - Initial; \$1,695,600
10. 2016-2017 Title I, Part A - Improving Basic Programs - Federal; \$428,129,363
11. 2016-2017 Title II, Part A - Teacher and Principal Training and Recruiting - Federal; \$83,093,214
12. 2016-2017 Allocation of Title I School Improvement Funds to Support Regional Assistance to Priority and Focus Schools - Initial; \$14,830,000
13. 2016-2017 Mathematics and Science Partnership (MSP) Grant Program (Title II, Part B) - Initial; \$4,361,863

Mr. Whiston congratulated Pamela Pugh who has been chosen as the Chief Health Advisor of Flint.

Mr. Whiston said a few months ago, MDE staff in the offices of Financial Management and State Aid became aware of items that were needed by Camp Tuhsmeheeta and its campers. He said staff members donated small electrical appliances, towels, pillows, sleds, sweatshirts and other clothing. He thanked them for their generosity.

Mr. Whiston shared information on his recent school visits.

Mr. Whiston provided an update on the special education "pause."

XV. REPORT OF MICHIGAN TEACHER OF THE YEAR

Mrs. Tracy Horodyski, 2016-2017 Michigan Teacher of the Year, presented the Report of the Michigan Teacher of the Year.

Mrs. Horodyski discussed the Proud Michigan Educator campaign and showed a video clip of the program celebrating the great work being done by Michigan educators.

XVI. APPROVAL OF FISCAL YEAR 2016-2017 CAMP TUHSMEHETA (CAMP T) SPENDING PLANNING

Ms. Ann Dennis, Director, Financial Management; Ms. Collette Bauman, Director, Low Incidence Outreach; and Mr. Jereme Vanden Heuvel; presented Approval of Fiscal Year 2016-2017 Camp Tuhsmeheeta Spending Plan.

Mr. Whiston said during the September 26, 2016 Michigan School for the Blind Trust Fund Committee meeting, members Michelle Fecteau and Kathleen Straus reviewed the fiscal year 2016-2017 spending plan for Camp Tuhsmeheeta, which is referred to as Camp T. He said the spending plan is being presented to the full Board for approval at today's meeting.

The Camp Tuhsmeheeta 2016 Annual Report was distributed. Ms. Bauman and Mr. Vanden Heuvel shared information on Camp T operations and activities.

Board member comments included the success of Family Day at Camp T, using social media to promote Camp T, location of the camp in northeastern Kent County, and a future Board retreat at the camp.

Mrs. Straus moved, seconded by Ms. Fecteau, that the State Board of Education approve the FY 2016-17 spending plan for Camp Tuhsmeheeta, as attached to the Superintendent's memorandum dated September 27, 2016.

The vote was taken on the motion.

The motion carried unanimously.

XVII. STATE AND FEDERAL LEGISLATIVE UPDATE

Mr. Martin Ackley, Director, Public and Governmental Affairs; Dr. Casandra Ulbrich, Chair, State Board of Education Legislative Committee; Ms. Lupe Ramos-Montigny, National Association of State Boards of Education Delegate; and Mrs. Eileen Weiser, Education Commission of the States; presented the State and Federal Legislative Update.

Mr. Ackley said the State Board of Education Legislative Committee met on October 5, 2016. He said the Governor signed Public Act 306, which requires the retention of students if they are not at reading level by the end of third grade, beginning in the 2019-2020 school year.

Dr. Ulbrich said the Legislative Committee also discussed Senate legislation regarding tax breaks for the redevelopment of brownfield sites, and the possible impact of the bills to the State School Aid Fund.

Ms. Ramos-Montigny said the National Association of State Boards of Education is holding its annual meeting on October 19-22, 2016. She said Mrs. Straus will receive the David A. Kysilko Distinguished Service Award, and Dr. Zeile will be Michigan's voting delegate at the business meetings. She said Ms. Fecteau and Dr. Pugh will also attend the annual meeting.

Ms. Fecteau asked Mrs. Straus if there is information to share on the Higher Education Reauthorization Act regarding what is required in teacher preparation programs. Mrs. Straus said she will check on the language.

Mrs. Weiser said she will defer her comments until later in the meeting.

Dr. Pugh said she would like to make a motion regarding a moratorium on school closures in Detroit.

Dr. Pugh moved, seconded by Ms. Ramos-Montigny, that the State Board of Education support a moratorium on school closures in Detroit.

Following discussion, the motion was amended.

Dr. Pugh moved, seconded by Mr. Austin, that the State Board of Education amend the previous motion to support a moratorium on state-imposed Detroit Public Schools Community District school closures.

Discussion followed.

The vote was taken on the motion to amend.

The motion to amend carried unanimously.

Discussion followed.

The vote was taken on the motion to support a moratorium on state-imposed Detroit Public Schools Community District school closures.

**Ayes: Austin, Fecteau, Pugh, Ramos-Montigny, Straus, Ulbrich,
Nay: Zeile
Abstain: Weiser**

The motion carried.

Following discussion, it was determined that background information on the number of potential school closures, length of the three-year moratorium, and the Board's Policy on State School Turnaround would be included with the Board's statement.

State Board of Education Statement on Moratorium on Detroit Public Schools Community District School Closures is attached as Exhibit A.

XVIII. CONSENT AGENDA

- J. Approval of Criteria for Great Start Parent Coalitions Trusted Advisor Grants, \$3,610,000
- K. Approval of Criteria for Section 401 – Flint Early Childhood Education Partnership, \$2,329,703
- L. Approval of Criteria for Section 61c – Secondary Career and Technical Education Equipment Grant, \$3,000,000
- M. Approval of Criteria for 22g – District/Intermediate School District Consolidation Grant, \$500,000
- N. Approval of Criteria for Section 22g(3) – District/Intermediate School District Consolidation Grant, \$2,500,000

Mrs. Straus moved, seconded by Mrs. Weiser, that the State Board of Education approve the consent agenda as follows:

- J. approve the Criteria for Great Start Parent Coalitions Trusted Advisor Grants as attached to the Superintendent's memorandum dated September 27, 2016;**
- K. approve the Criteria for Section 401 – Flint Early Childhood Education Partnership, as attached to the Superintendent's memorandum dated September 27, 2016;**

- L. approve the Criteria for Section 61c - Secondary Career and Technical Education Equipment Grant, as attached to the Superintendent's memorandum dated September 27, 2016;**
- M. approve the Criteria for the 2016-17 Section 22g - District/ Intermediate School District Consolidation Grant as attached to the Superintendent's memo dated September 27, 2016; and**
- N. approve the Criteria for the Section 22g(3) - District/ Intermediate School District Consolidation Grant as attached to the Superintendent's memo dated September 27, 2016.**

The vote was taken on the motion.

The motion carried unanimously.

XIX. COMMENTS BY STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MEMBERS

Mrs. Weiser said Senator Howard Stephenson of Utah appeared before the House Education Committee to present UPSTART, which is a program that places laptops with four-year-olds who are rural, Native American or English language learners. She said it is a play-based program for 15 minutes per day, and Utah students are entering kindergarten with post-kindergarten achievement levels in reading, math and science.

Mrs. Weiser said over the past several months, the lack of available parking has become an issue. Mr. Whiston said staff will seek solutions.

Ms. Fecteau said Michigan school library media people have asked her to consider ways to prioritize school libraries. She said Innovative Approaches to Literacy is federal funding for Title I schools, which can be used for school libraries. She said consideration should be given to including school libraries in Michigan's plan for the Every Student Succeeds Act.

In response to Ms. Fecteau, Mr. Whiston provided an update on the special education "pause."

Dr. Zeile said the State Board of Education should have a presentation on the role and function of intermediate school districts.

Mrs. Straus suggested a future presentation from the Director of the Michigan Department of Civil Rights.

Mrs. Straus asked about accountability of Public School Academies. Mr. Whiston provided an update.

Mrs. Straus asked when the Social Studies Standards will be presented to the Board. Mr. Whiston said the presentation will likely occur at the December State Board of Education meeting, an opportunity for public comment will follow, and Board action will be requested at a subsequent meeting.

XX. TENTATIVE AGENDA FOR NEXT MEETING

Board members are asked to contact a member of the Agenda Planning Committee with suggestions for agenda topics.

XXI. FUTURE MEETING DATES

- A. Tuesday, November 15, 2016 (9:30 a.m.) Regular Meeting
- B. Tuesday, December 13, 2016 (9:30 a.m.) Regular Meeting
- C. Tuesday, January 10, 2017 (9:30 a.m.) Regular Meeting

XXII. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 2:50 p.m.

The video archive of the meeting is available at www.michigan.gov/sbe.

Respectfully submitted,

Michelle Fecteau
Secretary

**State Board of Education
Statement on Moratorium on Detroit Public Schools Community District
School Closures**

With the consideration that 58 schools (47 in the former Detroit Public Schools and 11 in the Education Achievement Authority) on the lowest-performing schools list potentially could be closed by the State School Reform Office; and that recently-enacted law created a new school district including those 58 schools would re-start the accountability process that gives the new district three years to turnaround those lowest-performing schools; and that the State Board of Education adopted a Policy on State School Turnaround on May 12, 2015 http://www.michigan.gov/documents/mde/SBE_Policy_on_School_Turnaround_FINAL_489448_7.pdf

The State Board of Education moved and adopted the following statement:

The State Board of Education calls for a moratorium on state-imposed Detroit Public Schools Community District school closures.

Adopted October 11, 2016