

## **MINUTES**

### STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION

Ladislaus B. Dombrowski Board Room  
John A. Hannah Building  
608 West Allegan  
Lansing, Michigan

November 13, 2018  
9:30 a.m.

Present: Ms. Sheila A. Alles, Chairperson  
Dr. Casandra E. Ulbrich, Co-President  
Dr. Richard Zeile, Co-President  
Ms. Michelle Fecteau, Secretary  
Mr. Tom McMillin, Treasurer  
Ms. Lupe Ramos-Montigny, NASBE Delegate  
Dr. Pamela Pugh  
Ms. Nikki Snyder  
Mrs. Eileen Weiser  
Mr. Tyler Sawher, representing Governor Rick Snyder, ex officio

Also Present: Mrs. Laura Chang, 2018-2019 Michigan Teacher of the Year

### **REGULAR MEETING**

#### I. CALL TO ORDER

Ms. Alles called the meeting to order at 9:32 a.m.

#### II. APPROVAL OF AGENDA AND ORDER OF PRIORITY

**Dr. Ulbrich moved, seconded by Ms. Fecteau, that the State Board of Education approve the agenda and order of priority.**

**Ms. Snyder moved, seconded by Dr. Zeile, that the State Board of Education add Discussion on Future Agenda Items to the November 13, 2018 agenda as Item XI.0.**

The vote was taken on the motion to amend the agenda.

**The motion carried unanimously.**

The vote was taken on the motion to approve the agenda, as amended.

**The motion carried unanimously.**

III. INTRODUCTION OF STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MEMBERS AND STAFF

Mrs. Marilyn Schneider, State Board Executive, introduced members of the State Board of Education.

Ms. Alles thanked Dr. Zeile and Mrs. Weiser who will be completing their terms of office on December 31, 2018. She said their dedication to children through the field of education is admirable and much appreciated. She said they will be honored at the December Board meeting.

Ms. Alles welcomed Dr. Judy Pritchett and Ms. Tiffany Tilley who were elected to the State Board of Education during the general election on November 6, 2018. She said they will begin their eight-year terms of office on January 1, 2019.

Ms. Alles asked that new employees be introduced.

Dr. Venessa Keesler, Deputy Superintendent of Educator, Student and School Supports, introduced Mr. Steven Reed and Ms. Nichole Mosser from the Office of Education Assessment and Accountability.

Dr. Scott Koenigsnecht, Deputy Superintendent of P-20 System and Student Transitions, introduced Mr. Shawn Sinawe from the Office of Special Education, Dr. Yincheng Ye from the Office of Career and Technical Education, and Ms. Emily Radewahn from the Office of Special Education.

Ms. Alles invited the audience members to introduce themselves.

Ms. Alles asked audience members to complete public participation forms if they wish to offer comments during the public participation portion of the meeting.

IV. RECESS

The Board recessed the Regular Meeting at 9:49 a.m. and convened the Committee of the Whole.

**COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE MEETING**

V. CALL TO ORDER

Ms. Alles called the Committee of the Whole Meeting to order at 9:50 a.m.

VI. PRESENTATION ON #GO-OPEN MICHIGAN

Dr. Venessa Keesler, Deputy Superintendent of Educator, Student and School Supports; Ms. Michelle Ribant, Director of 21st Century Learning; Ann-Marie Mapes, Educational Technology manager; #GoOpen Michigan microsite funders; and staff from Marysville Public Schools and Wayland Union Schools, presented on #GoOpen Michigan.

Information was shared via a [PowerPoint presentation](#).

Board member comments included meeting individual student needs, thanks for #GoOpen social studies materials, platform limits on what's available or how resources can be used, modification of textbooks and vetting, student data privacy, local board approval process, What Works Clearinghouse at the federal level, effort by educators to teach the standards in the best way possible, parental access to student textbooks, and equity for districts that don't have resources and have high transitory rates.

#### VII. PRESENTATION ON COMPETENCY-BASED EDUCATION

Mr. Peter Greene, retired teacher and author from Pennsylvania, presented on Competency-Based Education.

Board member comments included thanks for an eye-opening presentation as the Board discusses the Marshall Plan, cyberschools, competing with educators and dismantling of public schools; tension between minimal amount of education for all students and also encouraging excellence and equity; varying definitions of competency-based education; ensuring content is not lost; differences between competency-based and project-based; comparisons between Pennsylvania and Michigan; effects on curriculum and responses from families in communities; profit motives and market forces; and stewardship of tax dollars.

#### VIII. PRESENTATION ON THE MICHIGAN DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION'S RESPONSE TO THE STATE'S DETERMINATION – A PATH FORWARD

Dr. Scott Koenigsknecht, Deputy Superintendent of P-20 System and Student Transitions; and Ms. Teri Chapman, Director of Special Education; presented the Michigan Department of Education's Response to the State's Determination – a Path Forward.

Ms. Alles said the US Department of Education issued its determination regarding Section 616 of the Individuals with Disabilities Education Act (IDEA). Michigan was the only state to be determined "Needs Intervention." She said we can, we must, and we will do better for children with disabilities and their families both in the short term and long term.

Staff distributed and reviewed a document titled MDE's Response to the State's Determination – the Path Forward. Information was shared via a PowerPoint presentation.

Board member comments included clarification of results, coordination with the National Assessment of Educational Progress (NAEP), transition process to prepare students for post-secondary options, and the reasons Michigan results are decreasing compared to other Great Lakes States.

IX. RECESS

The Board recessed the Committee of the Whole at 12:15 p.m. and reconvened the Regular Meeting at 1:02 p.m.

**REGULAR MEETING**

X. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION IN STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MEETING

1. Dr. Kathryn Roberts, Ann Arbor, Michigan, provided comments regarding teacher preparation standards.
2. Ms. Erin M. Brown, Spring Lake, Michigan, provided comments on the standards for the Preparation of Teachers of Lower Elementary and Upper Elementary Education.

XI. RECESS

The Board recessed the Regular Meeting at 1:12 p.m. and reconvened the Committee of the Whole.

**COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE MEETING**

XII. PRESENTATION ON THE MICHIGAN DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION'S RESPONSE TO THE STATE'S DETERMINATION – A PATH FORWARD

This a continuation of the presentation earlier in the meeting.

There were additional comments from Board members including goals of the teaming structure and expected outcome; representation on workgroups; exposures in physical environment; trauma-induced learning; suspension and expulsion rates higher for certain populations; Multi-Tiered Systems of Support; research partners and coordination of data; and Schools Beating the Odds.

XIII. UPDATE FROM THE OFFICE OF PARTNERSHIP DISTRICTS

Dr. Venessa Keesler, Deputy Superintendent, Educator, Student, and School Supports; Dr. LaWanna Shelton, Interim Assistant Director of the Office of Partnership Districts; and Mr. Dan LaDue, Supervisor, Office of Partnership Districts; presented on the Partnership District Model.

Ms. Alles said the presentation included updates on the 21(h) grant approval process, an overview of the Review of Goal Attainment process, general office updates, as well as an update on Benton Harbor Area Schools.

Information was shared via a handout and [PowerPoint presentation](#).

XIV. ADJOURNMENT

The Board adjourned the Committee of the Whole at 2:16 p.m. and reconvened the Regular Meeting at 2:17 p.m.

**REGULAR MEETING**

XV. APPROVAL OF STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MINUTES

Approval of Minutes of Regular and Committee of the Whole Meeting of October 9, 2018

**Mrs. Weiser moved, seconded by Ms. Fecteau, that the State Board of Education approve the Minutes of the Regular and Committee of the Whole Meeting of October 9, 2018.**

The vote was taken on the motion.

**Ayes: Fecteau, McMillin, Pugh, Snyder, Ulbrich, Weiser, Zeile  
Absent During Vote: Ramos-Montigny**

**The motion carried.**

XVI. REPORT OF THE CO-PRESIDENTS

Dr. Zeile said he would forego his report.

Dr. Ulbrich said it was exciting to see the number of voters in a mid-term election. She said it shows great civic engagement, and she thanked people for voting.

Dr. Ulbrich said the work done by Dr. Zeile and Mrs. Weiser is appreciated.

Dr. Ulbrich said she saw a presentation on the PSAT by the Michigan Association of Secondary School Principals, and the assessment provides tremendous feedback.

Dr. Ulbrich said Ron and Eileen Weiser were honored at the National Philanthropy Day Dinner. She said they were nominated by UM-Dearborn.

XVII. REPORT OF THE INTERIM SUPERINTENDENT

Reports

G. Human Resources Report

H. Report on Approved Changes to the Kent Intermediate School District Plan for the Delivery of Special Education Programs and Services

I. Report on Cosponsorship

## Grants

### J. Report on Grant Awards

1. [2018-2019 Title II, Part A, Teacher and Leader Instruction Support Grant - Initial; \\$1,627,475](#) (Educator Excellence – Leah Breen)
2. [2018-2019 IDEA, Part B Formula Grants - Initial; \\$376,389,804](#) (Special Education – Teri Chapman)
3. [2018-2019 Office of Special Education \(OSE\) Adolescent Literacy Model Demonstration Projects - Initial; \\$400,000](#) (Special Education – Teri Chapman)
4. [2018-2019 Section 54b Statewide Implementation of Michigan Integrated Behavior and Learning Support Initiative Pilot - Initial; \\$1,600,000](#) (Special Education – Teri Chapman)
5. [2018-2019 State Personnel Development Grant Under the IDEA - Initial; \\$693,000](#) (Special Education – Teri Chapman)
6. [2017-2018 Mathematics and Science Centers Curriculum and Professional Development Support for the Michigan Merit Curriculum - Initial; Continuation; \\$750,000](#) (Educational Supports – Paula Daniels)
7. [2018-2019 ESSA Title IX, McKinney-Vento Homeless Students Grant - Amendment; \\$2,031,568](#) (Educational Supports – Paula Daniels)
8. [2018-2019 Section 35a\(7\) The Michigan Education Corps Grant - Initial; \\$2,500,000](#) (Educational Supports – Paula Daniels)
9. [2018-2019 Section 35a\(8\) - Kindergarten through Grade 4 Summer Reading Program - Initial; \\$500,000](#) (Educational Supports – Paula Daniels)
10. [2018-2019 Section 41 Bilingual Grant - Amendment; \\$6,000,000](#) (Educational Supports – Paula Daniels)
11. [2018-2019 Section 99v - Mathematics Pathways Alignment - Initial; \\$25,000](#) (Educational Supports – Paula Daniels)
12. [2018-2019 Title I Regional Assistance Grant - Initial; \\$19,150,000](#) (Educational Supports – Paula Daniels)
13. [2018-2019 Title I, Part C Migrant Education Programs - Amendment; \\$3,765,412](#) (Educational Supports – Paula Daniels)
14. [2018-2019 Title III, Part A English Language Acquisition - Amendment; \\$9,831,579](#) (Educational Supports – Paula Daniels)

15. [2018-2019 Mandated Activities Under Part C of the Individuals with Disabilities Education Act - Amendment; \\$1,676,729](#) (Early Childhood Development & Family Education – Renee DeMars-Johnson)
16. [2017-2018 Safe Schools/Healthy Students State Planning, Local Education Agencies, and Local Communities - Amendment; \\$1,263,449](#) (Health and Nutrition Services – Diane Golzynski)
17. [2017-2018 Section 11s - Flint Declaration of Emergency Grants - Nutritional Services - Amendment; \\$820,000](#) (Health and Nutrition Services – Diane Golzynski)
18. [2018-2019 Fresh Fruit and Vegetable Program \(FFVP\) - Amendment; \\$4,044,201](#) (Health and Nutrition Services – Diane Golzynski)
19. [2018-2019 Teen Health Centers - Initial; \\$6,057,300](#) (Health and Nutrition Services – Diane Golzynski)
20. [2018-2019 Vision Hearing Screening - Initial; \\$5,150,000](#) (Health and Nutrition Services – Diane Golzynski)
21. [2017-2018 Section 99k - Cybersecurity Competition Event Grants - Initial; Amendment; \\$466,800](#) (Systems, Evaluation, and Technology – David Judd)
22. [2018-2019 Section 32q-Early Learning Collaborative Pilot - Initial; \\$175,000](#) (Preschool & Out-Of-School Time Learning – Richard Lower)
23. [2018-2019 Section 65, Pre-College Engineering K-12 Educational Program - Initial; \\$400,000](#) (Career and Technical Education – Brian Pyles)
24. [2017-2018 Impact Aid for Displaced Students – Emergency Impact Aid for Displaced Students - Initial; \\$699,375](#) (Financial Management – Ann Richmond)

Ms. Alles shared a PowerPoint presentation highlighting events in which she had participated during the past month.

#### XVIII. REPORT OF MICHIGAN TEACHER OF THE YEAR

Ms. Laura Chang, 2018-2019 Michigan Teacher of the Year, provided the Report of the Michigan Teacher of the Year.

Ms. Chang presented on the High Impact Leadership Project.

Ms. Wendy Tenney, Region 3 Teacher of the Year, a music teacher in Lowell Area Schools, presented on music education.

XIX. DISCUSSION ON STATE SUPERINTENDENT SEARCH

Dr. Casandra Ulbrich and Dr. Richard Zeile, Co-Presidents, led the Discussion on the State Superintendent Search.

Dr. Ulbrich said the Board met to review proposals submitted for the purpose of assisting with the search for the State Superintendent. She said Ray & Associates is the search firm that the Board selected. She asked if the contract with Ray & Associates had been finalized, and Mrs. Schneider affirmed that the contract was finalized.

Dr. Ulbrich introduced Mr. Ryan Ray, President, Ray & Associates; and Mr. Ricardo Medina, Regional Search Associate.

Mr. Ray and Mr. Medina distributed and reviewed the following draft documents: National Salary Comparison, Suggested State Superintendent of Public Instruction Search Advertising, Application for State Superintendent of Public Instruction, Experience in Identifying and Placing a Diverse and Qualified Pool of Candidates, Suggested State Superintendent Search Process and Timeline.

Discussion followed.

A representative of Ray & Associates will attend every State Board of Education meeting during the search and selection process.

XX. APPROVAL OF THE STANDARDS FOR THE PREPARATION OF TEACHERS OF LOWER ELEMENTARY (PK-3) AND UPPER ELEMENTARY (3-6) EDUCATION

Dr. Venessa Keesler, Deputy Superintendent of Educator, Student and School Supports; Ms. Leah Breen, Director, Office of Educator Excellence; Dr. Sean Kottke, Interim Education Consultant Manager; and Ms. Kelli Cassaday, Education Consultant; presented on Approval of the Standards for the Preparation of Teachers of Lower Elementary (PK-3) and Upper Elementary (3-6) Education.

Ms. Alles said the Standards for the Preparation of Teachers of Lower Elementary (PK-3) and Upper Elementary (3-6) Education were presented to the Board of August 14, 2018. She said there was a period of public comment, and revisions were made based on public comment.

Information was shared via a handout and [PowerPoint presentation](#).

**Ms. Ramos-Montigny moved, seconded by Mrs. Weiser, that the State Board of Education approve the Standards for the Preparation of Teachers of Lower Elementary (PK-3) and Upper Elementary (3-6) Education, as described in the Superintendent's memorandum dated October 30, 2018.**



Discussion followed.

The vote was taken on the motion.

**Ayes: Fecteau, Pugh, Ramos-Montigny, Ulbrich, Weiser, Zeile**  
**Nays: McMillin, Snyder**

**The motion carried.**

XXI. APPROVAL OF NOMINATIONS TO THE SPECIAL EDUCATION ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Ms. Alles said each year the State Board of Education is asked to approve nominations to the Special Education Advisory Committee (SEAC) membership. She said six organizational vacancies need to be filled, and recommendations are being proposed.

**Mr. McMillin moved, seconded by Dr. Ulbrich, that the State Board of Education approve nominees listed in Attachment B of the Superintendent's memorandum dated October 30, 2018, and approve those individuals to serve as members of the Special Education Advisory Committee for the respective terms specified.**

Discussion followed.

The vote was taken on the motion.

**The motion carried unanimously.**

XXII. STATE AND FEDERAL LEGISLATIVE UPDATE

Ms. Alles asked Mr. Ackley, Director of Public and Governmental Affairs, to provide an update on State and Federal Legislative issues.

Mr. Ackley said per the discussion during the November 1, 2018 State Board of Education Legislative Committee, several pieces of legislation were discussed and supported to bring to the full State Board of Education for consideration.

Mrs. Weiser, Chair of the State Board of Education Legislative Committee led the discussion on the statements discussed during the State Board of Education Legislative Committee meeting on November 1, 2018.

Discussion followed.

**Mrs. Weiser moved, seconded by Dr. Ulbrich, that the State Board of Education supports House Bills 5707 and 6401, which would keep student growth and assessment data as a 25 percent component of the annual year-end evaluation for teachers and school administrators.**

The vote was taken on the motion.

**The motion carried unanimously.**

**Mr. McMillin moved, seconded by Ms. Fecteau that the State Board of Education adopt a Statement in Opposition to Education Legislation Moving During Lamé Duck Session.**

The vote was taken on the motion.

**Ayes: Fecteau, McMillin, Pugh, Snyder, Ulbrich, Zeile**

**Nays: Weiser**

**Abstain: Ramos-Montigny**

**The motion carried.**

The State Board of Education Statement in Opposition to Education Legislation Moving During Lamé Duck Session is attached as Exhibit A.

**XXIII. FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS**

This item was added to the agenda.

Ms. Alles asked if Board members have future agenda items to propose. The following items were proposed: Presentation by Derek Lopez, Superintendent of Flint Community Schools; legislative priorities for new legislature; legislator lunch; update on A Path Forward including short- and long-term data barriers; Great Start Readiness Program; High Impact Leadership Project; school facilities – disparities between urban and rural; how schools are reporting and utilizing personal health information and data; and an invitation to Governor-elect Whitmer to attend State Board of Education meeting.

**XXIV. COMMENTS BY STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MEMBERS**

Mrs. Weiser said in the by-laws future agenda topics are referenced, and it would be good to include them on future agendas for reference purposes.

Mrs. Weiser said she plans to attend the December State Board of Education meeting, but if for some reason she is unable to attend, it has been a pleasure to serve and make things better for the children of today and adults of tomorrow.

Dr. Zeile said he appreciates those who supported him in his re-election attempt. He said he has appreciated the mentorship of Mrs. Weiser. He said it has been a privilege to serve with committed and caring people. He congratulated Dr. Judy Pritchett and Ms. Tiffany Tilley on being elected to serve on the State Board of Education.

**XXV. TENTATIVE AGENDA FOR NEXT MEETING**

This agenda item was addressed during Future Agenda Items, earlier in the meeting.

XXVI. FUTURE MEETING DATES

- A. Tuesday, December 11, 2018 (9:30 a.m.) Regular Meeting
- B. Tuesday, January 8, 2019 (9:30 a.m.) Regular Meeting
- C. Tuesday, February 12, 2019 (9:30 a.m.) Regular Meeting

XXVII. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 4:45 p.m.

The video archive of the meeting is available on the [Michigan State Board of Education website](http://www.michigan.gov/sbe) (www.michigan.gov/sbe).

Respectfully submitted,

Michelle Fecteau  
Secretary

**STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION  
STATEMENT IN OPPOSITION TO  
EDUCATION LEGISLATION MOVING DURING LAME DUCK SESSION**

The State Board of Education is in support of the position presented by the Tri-County Alliance for Public Education to the Michigan Legislature regarding its Lame Duck session, that “now is not the time to rush through legislation that will have questionable long-term impacts on public schools. Instead, the Tri-County Alliance for Public Education is calling for legislators to leave any action on education policies to the new legislature and Governor in order to properly debate and review them.”

In referencing a letter by House Education Reform Committee Chairman, Rep. Tim Kelly, on his intention to reengage the House of Representatives to take action in the last weeks of this legislative session on several pieces of legislation, the State Board of Education agrees with Tri-County Alliance for Public Education leaders who said: There is too much at stake for schools throughout Michigan to rush legislation through with little or no time to properly review or debate its impact on our students, parents and teachers. Lame duck is simply not the time to be making fundamental changes to Michigan’s public education system; and suggesting that the last few weeks of the legislative session is the time to ‘reengage’ on these important issues ignores the complexity of these policies and the importance of getting them right; and could have serious unintended consequences for schools going forward.

Adopted November 13, 2018