

## **MINUTES**

### STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION

Ladislaus B. Dombrowski Board Room  
John A. Hannah Building  
608 West Allegan  
Lansing, Michigan

April 9, 2019  
9:30 a.m.

Present: Ms. Sheila A. Alles, Chairperson  
Dr. Casandra E. Ulbrich, President  
Dr. Pamela Pugh, Vice President  
Ms. Michelle Fecteau, Secretary  
Mr. Tom McMillin, Treasurer  
Ms. Tiffany Tilley, NASBE Delegate  
Dr. Judith Pritchett  
Ms. Lupe Ramos-Montigny  
Ms. Nikki Snyder  
Mr. Josh Neyhart, representing Governor Gretchen Whitmer, ex officio

Also Present: Mrs. Laura Chang, 2018-2019 Michigan Teacher of the Year

### **REGULAR MEETING**

#### I. CALL TO ORDER

Ms. Alles called the meeting to order at 9:34 a.m.

#### II. APPROVAL OF AGENDA AND ORDER OF PRIORITY

**Dr. Pugh moved, seconded by Mr. McMillin, that the State Board of Education reorder the agenda moving Item E Update on Benton Harbor Area Schools for the Office of Partnership Districts prior to Item D Presentation on the Perkins V Transition Plan.**

The vote was taken on the motion.

**Ayes: Fecteau, McMillin, Pritchett, Pugh, Ramos-Montigny,  
Snyder, Ulbrich  
Absent: Tilley**

**The motion carried.**

Mr. McMillin said he would like the Social Studies Standards delayed, and he will make a motion later in the meeting.

**Dr. Ulbrich moved, seconded by Ms. Ramos-Montigny, that the State Board of Education approve the agenda and order of priority, as amended.**

The vote was taken on the motion to approve the agenda, as amended.

**Ayes: Fecteau, McMillin, Pritchett, Pugh, Ramos-Montigny,  
Snyder, Ulbrich  
Absent: Tilley**

**The motion carried.**

III. INTRODUCTION OF STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MEMBERS AND STAFF

Ms. Alles asked that the members of the State Board of Education be introduced. Mrs. Marilyn Schneider, State Board Executive, introduced members of the State Board of Education.

Ms. Alles asked for the introduction of new employees.

Dr. Scott Koenigsnecht, Deputy Superintendent, P-20 System and Student Transitions, introduced Ms. Dawn Kalkman from the Office of Preschool and Out-of-School Time Learning; Ms. Deborah Drick and Ms. Nancy Campbell from the office of Child Development and Care; and Ms. Sarah Radu from the Office of Special Education.

Mr. Ross Fort, Special Assistant, Finance and Operations, introduced Mr. Michael Kelly from the Office of Health and Nutrition Services; and Mr. Adam Oster from the Library of Michigan.

Ms. Alles asked audience members to introduce themselves and she invited them to complete public participation forms if they wish to offer comments during the public participation portion of the meeting.

IV. RECESS

The Board recessed the Regular Meeting at 9:44 a.m. and convened the Committee of the Whole.

**COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE MEETING**

V. CALL TO ORDER

Ms. Alles called the Committee of the Whole Meeting to order at 9:45 a.m.

VI. PRESENTATION ON DEARBORN'S COLLABORATIVE PROFESSIONAL LEARNING MODEL

Dr. Glenn Maleyko, Superintendent, Dearborn Public Schools; Ms. Jill Chochol, Executive Director, Student Achievement; and Ms. Shannon Peterson, Executive Director, Student Achievement; presented the Dearborn Collaborative Leadership Model.

Ms. Alles introduced Dr. Glenn Maleyko, Superintendent of Dearborn Public Schools, and Superintendent of the Year, as awarded by the Michigan Association of Superintendents and Administrators. She said Dr. Maleyko and his team have been presenting on Dearborn's collaborative leadership model at national conferences, which they will share with the Board.

Information was shared via a Google presentation and video. Handouts were distributed.

Ms. Tilley arrived at 9:48 a.m.

Board member comments included inspirational work collaborating and putting children first, source of district growth, business investment in the community, integration of English language learners with special education and general education students, proactive early childhood intervention, success rate for credit recovery, and process of accountability and teamwork building on relationships.

VII. PRESENTATION ON SCHOOL FINANCE RESEARCH COLLABORATIVE

Mr. Justin Silverstein, Co-Chief Executive Officer of Augenblick, Palaich and Associates, presented on the School Finance Research Collaborative.

Ms. Alles said the School Finance Research Collaborative is a bipartisan, diverse group of education experts and business leaders from all corners of Michigan. She said in 2018, the School Finance Research Collaborative completed a comprehensive school adequacy study for Michigan, which Mr. Silverstein will present to the Board.

Information was shared via a PowerPoint presentation.

Mr. Steve Ezikian, Steering & Technical Committee member, joined Mr. Silverstein at the Board table.

Board member comments included facilities for charter schools, unstable platform for schools operating with declining enrollment, lack of time for planning when schools close and transportation is needed, some districts alienated in high-poverty areas, tax credits for charter schools in high-poverty areas creates instability, creating political interest, and key elements for successful schools.

VIII. PRESENTATION ON SOCIAL STUDIES STANDARDS

Dr. Venessa Keesler, Deputy Superintendent of Educator, Student, and School Supports; Ms. Linda Forward, Senior Executive Policy Advisor; and Mr. Jim Cameron, Social Studies Consultant; presented on Social Studies Standards.

Ms. Alles said following the 2018 presentation of the Social Studies Standards, Michigan Department of Education staff held 18 listen and learn sessions and provided an online survey for public comment. She said there were nearly 5,000 responses to the draft standards. She said Department staff and social studies experts from across the state have worked to revise the standards based on that feedback, and staff will share the updated draft Social Studies Standards.

Information was shared via a [PowerPoint presentation](#).

Board member comments included civil rights, involvement of Public Policy Associates, arc of inquiry and seven forms of bias, diversity, function of bias review committee, diversity represented in groups and public comment, process for Board input, grades in which social studies are tested, multiple voices and perspectives included, tests based on standards, bias, Judge Michael David Warren's letter regarding Social Studies Standards, concern regarding bias in the classroom when standards are taught, balance in standards, respect and trust.

IX. RECESS

The Board recessed the Committee of the Whole to reconvene the Regular Meeting at 1:40 p.m.

**REGULAR MEETING**

X. PRESENTATION ON SOCIAL STUDIES STANDARDS (continued)

**Ms. Fecteau moved, seconded by Dr. Pritchett, to reconvene the Regular Meeting.**

The vote was taken on the motion.

**The motion carried unanimously.**

Mr. McMillin said due to the bias nature of the Social Studies Standards, he will make a motion that the standards do not go out for public comment at this time.

**Mr. McMillin moved, seconded by Ms. Snyder, that the Social Studies Standards do not go out for public comment at this time, but go back to the committee to address serious flaws and then go out for public comment.**

Discussion followed.

Dr. Pugh called for the question.

The vote was taken on the motion.

**Ayes: McMillin, Snyder**

**Nays: Fecteau, Pritchett, Pugh, Ramos-Montigny, Tilley, Ulbrich**

**The motion failed.**

Mr. Neyhart left the meeting at 1:00 p.m.

XI. RECESS

The Board recessed the Regular Meeting at 1:01 p.m. and reconvened at 1:45 p.m.

XII. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION IN STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MEETING

1. Michael Libbee from Mt. Pleasant, Michigan, representing Michigan Geographic Alliance, provided comments regarding Social Studies Standards.
2. Raman Singh from West Bloomfield, Michigan, representing Sikh Coalition, provided comments and written information on Social Studies Standards.
3. Dave Johnson from Boon, Michigan, Co-Chair of the U.S. History Task Force, provided comments on Social Studies Standards.
4. Rebecca Bush from Rockford, Michigan, Co-Chair of the U.S. History Task Force, provided comments on Social Studies Standards.
5. Sidney Kardon from Huntington Woods, Michigan, provided comments on the committee process for Social Studies Standards.
6. Rachel Clark from Mason, Michigan provided comments on bias in teaching related to the Social Studies Standards.
7. Marletta Seats from Benton Harbor, Michigan, provided comments on local control of Benton Harbor Area School District.
8. Patricia Rush from Sodus, Michigan, Secretary of the Benton Harbor Area Schools Board, provided comments and written information on the Benton Harbor Area Schools Board.
9. Ken Stockton from Ann Arbor, Michigan, provided comments on protecting student safety and child predators.
10. Thomas Pedroni from Ypsilanti, Michigan, provided verbal and written comments on Benton Harbor Area Schools stability and number of superintendents.
11. DeArtriss Richardson and James Richardson from Inkster, Michigan, representing Inkster High School Alumni Foundation and Michigan We Choose, provided comments in support of Benton Harbor Area Schools and the results of school closure.

Dr. Pugh left the meeting at 2:15 p.m. and rejoined later in the meeting.

12. Brenda Terrell from Benton Harbor, Michigan provided comments on Benton Harbor Area Schools.
13. Carrie Rowan from Hudson, Michigan provided comments on Social Studies Standards.
14. Marsha A. Lewis and Melissa Kiesewetter, Co-Chairs of the Bias Review Committee, provided comments on Social Studies Standards.

XIII. MOTION TO REORDER MEETING

**Mr. McMillin moved, seconded by Dr. Ulbrich, that Item E Update on Benton Harbor Area Schools from the Office of Partnership Districts be moved to immediately precede Item J Discussion on State Superintendent Search.**

The vote was taken on the motion.

**Ayes: Fecteau, McMillin, Pritchett, Ramos-Montigny, Snyder, Ulbrich**  
**Absent During Vote: Tilley**  
**Absent: Pugh**

**The motion carried.**

XIV. RECESS

The Board recessed the Regular Meeting at 2:30 p.m. and reconvened the Committee of the Whole.

**COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE MEETING**

XV. PRESENTATION ON THE PERKINS V TRANSITION PLAN

Dr. Scott Koenigsknecht, Deputy Superintendent, P-20 System and Student Transitions; and Ms. Christine Black, Fiscal Specialist, Office of Career and Technical Education; presented on the Perkins V Transition Plan.

Ms. Alles said the Carl D. Perkins Career and Technical Education Act of 2006, as amended, requires states to submit a Perkins V Transition Plan for 2019-2020. She said during its meeting on February 12<sup>th</sup>, the Board heard a presentation on the development of the Perkins V Transition Plan, and staff will explain the plan during the presentation. She said the Board will be asked to approve the Perkins V Transition Plan at its May 14, 2019 meeting.

Ms. Black distributed copies of the plan and reviewed it.

Board member comments included funding clarity during transition, the most change in the accountability in data section, business included, and modifications for students with special needs.

XVI. DISCUSSION REGARDING CRITERIA FOR GRANT PROGRAMS

There were no comments regarding criteria for grant programs.

XVII. RECESS

The Board recessed the Committee of the Whole and reconvened the Regular Meeting at 2:48 p.m.

**REGULAR MEETING**

XVIII. APPROVAL OF STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MINUTES

Approval of Minutes of Regular and Committee of the Whole Meeting of March 12, 2019

**Ms. Ramos-Montigny moved, seconded by Dr. Pritchett, that the State Board of Education approve the Minutes of the Regular and Committee of the Whole Meeting of March 12, 2019.**

The vote was taken on the motion.

**The motion carried unanimously.**

XIX. REPORT OF THE PRESIDENT

Dr. Ulbrich said Ms. Tilley, Ms. Fecteau, Dr. Pugh and she visited Benton Harbor Area Schools and met with the community on April 3, 2019. She said it was a good turnout.

Dr. Ulbrich said the Attorney General's Office will meet with the Board in Closed Session during a future meeting.

Dr. Ulbrich said she has sent a letter to the Legislature requesting that they extend the deadline for a minimum of one year to keep student growth and assessment data as a 25% component of the annual year-end evaluation for all teachers.

Dr. Ulbrich expressed thanks to everyone who worked on the Social Studies Standards.

XX. REPORT OF THE INTERIM STATE SUPERINTENDENT

Report

H. Human Resources Report

## Grants

### I. Report on Grant Awards

1. 2018-2019 Section 99x - Teach for America Grant - Initial; \$300,000 (Educator Excellence – Leah Breen)
2. 2018-2019 Section 35a(9) - Literacy Essentials Professional Learning Grant - Initial; \$1,000,000 (Educational Supports – Paula Daniels)
3. 2018-2019 Section 35b - Multisensory Structured Language Program Pilot - Initial; \$250,000 (Educational Supports – Paula Daniels)
4. 2018-2019 Section 99s(2) and (3) - MiSTEM Advisory Council Grants - Amendment; \$3,041,738 (Educational Supports – Paula Daniels)
5. 2018-2019 Section 99y - STEM and Entrepreneurship Pilot Project - Initial; \$60,000 (Educational Supports – Paula Daniels)
6. 2018-2019 Project AWARE to Advance Wellness and Resilience in Education - Amendment; \$304,526 (Health and Nutrition Services – Diane Golzynski)
7. 2018-2019 Section 99w - Michigan Fitness Foundation Grant - Initial; \$500,000 (Health and Nutrition Services – Diane Golzynski)
8. 2018-2019 Section 99h: Competitive FIRST Robotics Grants - Amendment; \$3,197,600 (Systems, Evaluation, and Technology – David Judd)
9. 2018-2019 Section 104f-Assessment Digital Literacy Preparation Pilot Project - Initial; \$500,000 (Systems, Evaluation, and Technology – David Judd)
10. 2018-2019 Section 61f - Pipeline 2 Promise Grant - Initial; \$200,000 (Career and Technical Education – Brian Pyles)
11. 2018-2019 Section 61g - Programs for High-Demand Future Jobs - Initial; 50,000 (Career and Technical Education – Brian Pyles)
12. 2018-2019 Section 61h - Statewide Virtual Reality Training Initiative - Initial; \$1,200,000 (Career and Technical Education – Brian Pyles)
13. 2018-2019 Section 74a - Statewide School Bus Driver Safety Program - Initial; \$810,000 (Financial Management – Ann Richmond)

Ms. Alles shared a PowerPoint presentation of her visits to Parma School District, Western School District and Chelsea School District; Michigan PTA Advocacy Day; and transition planning for the next State Superintendent. She said currently there are two accountability systems for schools, which are the federal index system and the state A-F letter grade system. She congratulated Dr. Ulbrich who will become Vice Chancellor for Institutional Advancement at



University of Michigan – Dearborn on May 15, 2019. She congratulated Ms. Ramos-Montigny who will receive an honorary doctorate and deliver a commencement speech at Grand Valley State University on April 27. She thanked Ms. Wendy Larvick, Chief of Staff, for her service to the Michigan Department of Education. She said Ms. Larvick will become the Director of Public Policy and Communication with the National Charter Schools Institute.

XXI. REPORT OF MICHIGAN TEACHER OF THE YEAR

Ms. Laura Chang, 2018-2019 Michigan Teacher of the Year, provided the Report of the Michigan Teacher of the Year.

Ms. Chang presented a report from Dubai, where she is doing work as the Michigan Teacher of the Year.

Mr. Tom Torrento, Region 9 Teacher of the Year, a band director at Grosse Pointe North High School and Parcels Middle School in the Grosse Pointe Public Schools, presented on adverse childhood experiences and increasing focus on the performing arts.

XXII. DISCUSSION ON STATE SUPERINTENDENT SEARCH

There was Board consensus to reorder the agenda.

Dr. Casandra Ulbrich, President of the Board, led the Discussion on the State Superintendent Search.

Dr. Ulbrich invited Mr. Michael Collins, a representative of Ray and Associates, Inc., to update the Board on the State Superintendent Search. Mr. Collins joined the meeting via telephone.

Mr. Collins said he is pleased with the depth of knowledge of the candidates for State Superintendent. He said he is impressed with the thoughtfulness of the Board and how well they work together.

Mr. Collins said the state's retirement system requires educators to leave one retirement system and join another, and that was a deterrent for some candidates. Dr. Ulbrich said perhaps that is a topic for the Board's legislative committee.

Dr. Pugh rejoined the meeting at 3:22 p.m.

XXIII. RECESS

The Board recessed the Regular Meeting at 3:25 p.m. and reconvened the Committee of the Whole.

## **COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE MEETING**

### XXIV. PRESENTATION ON BENTON HARBOR AREA SCHOOLS FROM THE OFFICE OF PARTNERSHIP DISTRICTS

Ms. Alles said the Office of Partnership Districts and Benton Harbor Area Schools will provide an update on Benton Harbor Area Schools.

Dr. Alles welcomed the following presenters to the Board table: Dr. Bill Pearson, State School Reform Officer and Director of the Office of Partnership Districts, Michigan Department of Education; Dr. Robert Herrera, Chief Executive Officer/Superintendent, Benton Harbor Area Schools; Ms. Patricia Robinson, Assistant Superintendent, Benton Harbor Area Schools' Mr. Joseph Taylor, Vice President, Benton Harbor School Board, Mr. Matt Nicholls, President, Benton Harbor Teacher Union; Chief Financial Officer; and Dr. Patricia Rush, Secretary, Benton Harbor School Board.

Information was shared via a [PowerPoint presentation](#) and Benton Harbor Area Schools informational notebooks were distributed.

Board member comments included superintendent turnover, roles and responsibilities, laws dissolving districts in financial crisis, limitations on teacher pool, high stakes testing, building trust in the district and community, consideration of selling parcels of land and buildings, GED preparation program, connecting Benton Harbor with other school districts for support and sharing of ideas, school collaboration and engagement with business and community, focus on student achievement and strengths, local control and a plan for building trust and moving forward.

### XXV. ADJOURNMENT

The Board adjourned the Committee of the Whole Meeting to reconvene the Regular Meeting at 5:45 p.m.

## **REGULAR MEETING**

### XXVI. APPROVAL OF EXTENSION OF THE MORATORIUM ON GRANTING PRELIMINARY APPROVAL TO EDUCATOR PREPARATION INSTITUTIONS IN MICHIGAN

**Dr. Pritchett moved, seconded by Ms. Ramos-Montigny that the State Board of Education move the Approval of the Extension of the Moratorium on Granting Preliminary Approval to Educator Preparation Institutions in Michigan to its meeting on May 14, 2019, due to time constraints.**

The vote was taken on the motion.

**The motion carried unanimously.**

Ms. Fecteau left the meeting at 5:45 p.m.

XXVII. STATE AND FEDERAL LEGISLATIVE UPDATE

Ms. Alles asked Ms. Lupe Ramos-Montigny, Chairperson of the Board's Legislative Committee, to lead the discussion on State and Federal Legislation.

The Legislative Committee report and board legislative priorities were distributed.

Ms. Ramos-Montigny reviewed the report of the Legislative Committee, which met on March 26, 2019.

Mr. Ackley, Director, Public and Governmental Affairs, provided an update on educator evaluation bills, school start before/after Labor Day legislation, school safety/school culture bills, House Bill 4342 exemption for college credit requirements for substitute teachers if they are a family member of a pupil, Section 22(p) of the State Aid Act, and funding for water testing and maintenance in schools.

Ms. Ramos-Montigny said a draft Board statement supporting Governor Whitmer's Funding Proposal to Improve Michigan's Drinking Water, needs more research and may be presented to the Board at a future meeting.

Ms. Tilley, National Association of State Boards of Education (NASBE) Delegate, said she attended the NASBE Legislative Conference on April 6-8, 2019, and she found it to be very beneficial. She provided a report on elected versus appointed members of state boards, NASBE priorities, computer science and students at the Board table.

XXVIII. CONSENT AGENDA

M. Approval of Criteria for Library Services and Technology Act Library Capacity Building Grant, \$1,000,000

N. Approval of Criteria for Section 106(3) E-Rate Enhancement Special Construction Matching Fund, \$5,000,000

**Dr. Ulbrich moved, seconded by Dr. Pritchett, that the State Board of Education approve the Consent Agenda as follows:**

**M. approve the Criteria for Library Services and Technology Act Library Capacity Building Grant Program, as attached to the Superintendent's memorandum dated March 26, 2019; and**

**N. approve the Criteria for Section 106(3) – E-Rate Enhancement Special Construction Matching Fund, as attached to the Superintendent's memorandum dated March 26, 2019.**

The vote was taken on the motion.

**Ayes: McMillin, Pritchett, Pugh, Ramos-Montigny, Snyder,  
Tilley, Ulbrich**  
**Absent: Fecteau**

**The motion carried.**

XXIX. COMMENTS BY STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MEMBERS

Mr. McMillin said he hopes the Board will have the opportunity to debate and approve the A-F system.

Ms. Snyder said she remains concerned about teacher shortages and ensuring safe schools.

Dr. Pugh said Elon Musk has funded education and safe water in Flint, and he recently visited Flint.

Ms. Tilley said it is imperative to increase the number of social workers and counselors in schools.

XXX. FUTURE MEETING DATES

- A. Monday, April 22, 2019 (11:30 a.m.) Special Meeting
- B. Wednesday, April 24, 2019 (9:30 a.m.) Special Meeting
- C. Tuesday, May 7, 2019 (9:30 a.m.) Special Meeting
- D. Tuesday, May 14, 2019 (9:30 a.m.) Regular Meeting
- E. Wednesday, May 22, 2019 (9:30 a.m.) Board Retreat at James B. Henry Center for Executive Development, Michigan State University, Lansing
- F. Tuesday, June 11, 2019 (9:30 a.m.) Regular Meeting

XXXI. TENTATIVE AGENDA FOR NEXT MEETING

Ms. Alles asked Board members if there are additional agenda topics they would like to be considered for future meeting agendas.

Ms. Alles thanked Board members and staff for a productive meeting.

XXXII. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 6:10 p.m.

The video archive of the meeting is available on the [Michigan State Board of Education website](http://www.michigan.gov/sbe) ([www.michigan.gov/sbe](http://www.michigan.gov/sbe)).

Respectfully submitted,

Michelle Fecteau  
Secretary