EWR Low Income Workgroup

December 5th, 2019



Agenda



9:00 - 9:15	Welcome and Introductions Brad Banks, EWR Section, MPSC	11:15 - 11:55	Habitat for Humanity of Michigan Priority Home Repair and Health and Safety Issues Capturing NEB's
9:15 - 9:30	Health and Safety Statistics, CAA Study Maddy Kamalay, MDHHS, Bureau of Community Action and Economic Opportunity		Jessica Halstead, Habitat for Humanity of Michigan Breakout Discussion: How to capture NEB's What questions to ask
9:30 - 10:15	Healthy Homes Program Jennifer Shutts, MDHHS	11:55 - 12:00	Open Floor, Questions Closing and Adjourn
10:15 - 10:30	Break		
10:30 - 11:15	Michigan Climate and Health Adaptation Program Gillian Capper, MDHHS Aaron Ferguson, MDHHS		

Health and Safety Statistics, CAA Study





BCAEO Weatherization Deferrals Summary

The Weatherization Assistance Program reduces energy costs for low-income households by increasing the energy efficiency of their homes, while ensuring their health and safety.

The Bureau of Community Action and Economic Opportunity (BCAEO) administered a survey to the Community Action Agencies who perform weatherization services to identify the quantity and cause of applicant deferrals. Agencies identified the top reasons potential weatherization clients' applications were being deferred and estimated an approximate cost to address the deferral cause. If a deferral is rectified, weatherization measures can be performed for these clients.

Agencies cited the following reasons as the top causes of deferrals:

- Presence of Vermiculite / Asbestos
- Roof Repairs or Replacements needed
- Knob & Tube Wiring / Electrical issues
- Mold & Moisture / Sewage
- Structural / Foundation issues

With all funding sources, the BCAEO anticipates expending \$23,480,895 weatherizing 2,465 homes this year. Agencies reported deferring 836 applicants annually and believe that with additional funding, they would be able to correct the issues with at least 469 or 56% of the homes being deferred. BCAEO estimates that an additional \$3.5 million, an additional 13-15% of the budget, would meet the funding required.



Weatherized homes are expected to save an average of \$283 annually on utility bills. In addition to the monetary savings for the low-income client, the BCAEO anticipates the following benefits:

- · Weatherization measures are performed, addressing issues of low-quality housing stock
- Non-energy benefits including improving health outcomes for clients
- · Agencies would save on intake costs by converting a larger number of applications to completed projects
- Deferred clients tend to be the most vulnerable within the low-income segment; these individuals would now be eligible for service
- Anticipated utility savings after most deferral causes are rectified are expected to exceed the national average

Bureau of Community Action and Economic Opportunity Michigan Department of Health and Human Services 235 SOUTH GRAND AVENUE PO BDX 30037 LANSING, MICHIGAN 48909 www.michigangov/mdhtc.517-241-4871 The following charts break down the deferral categories in further detail. Please note, agencies identified the largest quantity of deferrals in each category can be addressed with the lowest estimated costs. Homes may have multiple causes for deferral. Based on estimates provided, 85% of the deferral issues could be corrected with \$5,000 or less.



BCAEO has sought partnerships with groups who provide associated services in attempt to reduce deferrals. These partners have identified similar causes of deferrals in their programs including:

Lead Safe Home Program

- Roof Integrity- Dollars needed for full roof replacement
- Missing or dysfunctional furnace/no heat
- Missing electricity/water/utilities
- Major Foundation Problems

Energy Waste Reduction - Low-Income work group

- Roof Repair and Replacement
- Knob and Tube / Electrical

Bureau of Community Action and Economic Opportunity Michigan Department of Health and Human Services 235 SOUTH GRAND AVENUE PO BOX 30037 LANSING, MICHIGAN 48909 www.michigangov/mdhhs 517-241-4871

MDHHS-Healthy Homes Section

Jennifer Shutts, Certification and Enforcement Unit Manager Courtney Wisinski, Community Development Unit Manager

Overview

- Creating Lead-Safe Environments
- Healthy Homes Section
- Future Opportunities

Creating lead-safe environments is the goal



What is lead?



- Lead is a highly toxic metal. It was commonly used in:
 - Household paint (banned in 1978)
 - Gasoline (banned in 1995)
 - Plumbing pipes and fixtures

Homes built before 1978 are more likely to have lead-based paint.

Why should I be concerned?

Too much lead can cause problems with:



Why should I be concerned?

Most people who have lead in their blood do not look or act sick. However, there is no safe level of lead in the blood.

How do we know? Find out if you have been exposed to lead by: Testing the Testing the blood for house for lead lead

えんかく かいがく ひょうかん かいしん システィック しんばく たんしょう しんえん かくがく ひょうかん たたん ひょうかん スティック しんばく たんしょうかん スティック かいろう

How does this relate to your work?

How does this relate to your work?

The work can expose others to lead

...creating LBP hazards

...creating LBP hazards ...leaving hazards behind for families

...creating LBP hazards ...leaving hazards behind for families ...exposing workers to lead

...creating LBP hazards ...leaving hazards behind for families ...exposing workers to lead

> ...who take it home to their families...

Lead Tips

Tips to protect yourself and others from lead.



Wash hands before eating, drinking or touching your face



Change clothes before entering home



Wear protective equipment on the job, including a respirator



Wash work clothes separately from other laundry. Run a rinse cycle after removing clothes from washer. For lead workers

Lead Tips

Tips to protect yourself and others from lead.



Take shoes off before entering home to avoid tracking lead containing soil indoors Keep paint in good repair; fix chipping, cracking, peeling paint right away For

everyone



Grow fruits and vegetables in raised beds



Vacuum with a High Efficiency Particulate Air (HEPA) filtered vacuum

Lead Tips

Tips to protect yourself and others from lead.



Take sho

entering

containin

Grow frui

vegetable

beds

Hire a lead professional to test your home for lead avoid tra

aint in good fix chipping, g, peeling paint way

with a High y Particulate Air iltered vacuum

For everyone

Healthy Homes Section



Healthy Homes

Compliance	Certification and Enforcement Unit			
Response	Lead Safe Home Unit			
Expansion	Community Development Unit			

Certification and Enforcement



Certification Overview



Promote lead safe work practices



Submit application, training certificate and payment



Disciplines for certification

- Supervisor
- Worker
- Firm
- Inspector/Risk Assessor



Pass the State examination

Certification card will be mailed within approximately 2 weeks

Certification Prerequisites

Workers

> no education or experience needed

Workers

Workers

no education or experience needed

Supervisors

One-year experience as a worker

Supervisors

no education or experience needed

Workers

no education or experience needed

Workers

One-year experience as

a worker

Or two years experience in related construction field

Supervisors

Certification Prerequisites Cont.



Inspectors

Need high Inspectors school diploma or equivalent

Risk Assessors
Lead Inspectors and Risk Assessors Provide the Environmental Investigations

Risk Assessors

Bachelors degree and one year experience

Lead Inspectors and Risk Assessors Provide the **Environmental Investigations**

Bachelors Associates degree and degree an two years experience one year experience

Risk

Assessors

Lead Inspectors and Risk Assessors Provide the Environmental Investigation

Risk

Assessors

H.S. diploma and three years experience

Bachelors Associates degree an degree and one year two years experience experience Lead Inspectors and Risk Assessors Provide the Environmental Investigation

H.S. diploma and three years experience

Risk Assessors BachelorsAssociatesdegree andegree andone yeartwo yearsexperienceexperience

Or certified Industrial Hygienist, Professional Engineer or other

Training and Scholarships





Increase certified EBL Investigators throughout local health departments

Scholarship Process

- ž –
- Complete application w/ work history
- Submit application and payment
- Wait for approval letter
- Register with training provider



Michigan Lead Abatement Act

Michigan Lead Abatement Rules Landlord Penalty Law

· ·····

THE THE PARTY

Regulations

Has authority to enter lead hazard control sites unannounced.

If deficiencies are identified, the following could happen:

- Advisory letter issued
- Notice of non-compliance
- Citation

If necessary, professionals can request:

- Informal compliance conference
- Formal administrative appeal



Baraga

Dickinson

Iron

Lead Hazard Control Programs

Lead Safe Home Program

Lead Safe Home Daycare Program

Ontonagon

Gogebia

Lead Safe Home Program Target Areas

Lead Hazard Control Community Development Grantees (LHCCD)

Pending LHCCD Grantee



Lead Safe Home Program



Lead Safe Home Program

Make	Make homes healthier and safer		
Identify	Identify lead-based paint and lead hazards in residential homes and child occupied facilities		
Have	Have funding available to abate lead hazards found in the home		

Intake to Abatement

✓ New focus on Medicaid enrolled residents
 ✓ All work is based on environmental investigation
 ✓ Regional Field Consultants provide:

 ✓ Work specification development
 ✓ Contractor pre-bid walkthroughs
 ✓ Contractor oversight
 ✓ Clearance

Workflow



Im Before and after in the

Healthy Homes Supplemental

HUD funded projects ONLY

Up to \$5,000 in non-lead related repairs, including:

✓ Asbestos testing and removal

✓ Roof repair

✓ Electrical Repair

✓ Furnace maintenance/replacement

✓ Water intrusion

We can address other housing needs using HHS

Healthy Homes Supplemental

Healthy Homes Section-Lead Safe Home Program's U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD) Target Areas



Only use HUD funds in target areas

Community Development Unit

Provides	Provides lead hazard control community development grant funds
Offers	Offers technical assistance and oversight of lead hazard control services to local communities
Expands	Expands lead hazard control in Michigan through community development model

Community Development Unit

How? Medicaid funding





Primary Prevention

Medicaid provides an innovative investment to address lead under a primary prevention model

LHCCD Timeline

Jan 2017					
Medicaid State Plan Amendment published	July 2017				
	FY18 Request for Proposal (RFP) published FN 96 20 20	Sept 2017			
		FY18 Grantees Selected FY18 program year is Oct. 2017 – Sept. 2018	April 2018		
			FY19 RFP published	July 2018	
				FY19 Grantees selected and renewed FY19 program year is Oct. 2018 – Sept.	
				2019	

Lead Hazard Control Community Development (LHCCD)

Lead Hazard Control Community Development (LHCCD) Grantees



Human Development Commission Before and after



Calhoun County Community Action Agency Before and after



Community Action Agency Models

External Internal Contractors Contractors

Lead Hazard Control Community Development (LHCCD) Grantees

Community Action Agency Models



External Contractors 🦘

Multiple projects at one time



k Regional





Salaries

Lead Hazard Control Community Development (LHCCD) Grantees

Future opportunities to collaborate between programs

Current gaps?





Michigan Climate and Health Adaptation Program

Energy Waste Reduction Low Income Workgroup

December 5, 2019

Aaron Ferguson – Program Manager, MICHAP

Division of Environmental Health

MDHHS

FergusonA1@Michigan.gov

Gillian Capper – Epidemiologist, MICHAP/MiTracking

Division of Environmental Health

MDHHS

CapperG@Michigan.gov



Discussion Outline

- MICHAP Overview
- Climate Change and Health Impacts
- Response Strategies
- Connection to weatherization
- Proposal: Evaluating weatherization as a climate intervention

CDC Climate-Ready States and Cities Initiative



Framework for Climate and Health Adaptation



Step 1

Anticipate Climate Impacts and Assess Vulnerabilities

Observed Temperature Change



Michigan

Observed Precipitation Change

4.5%

Michigan



Projected Temperature Changes: 1971-2000 to 2041-2070



Projected Precipitation Changes: 1971-2000 to 2041-2070




Step 2

Project the Disease Burden

Impacts from Climate Change



networks

and water bodies

» Financial strains

Priority Climate-Related Health Impacts

- 1. Respiratory conditions
- 2. Heat Illness
- 3. Storm-related Injury, CO poisoning
- 4. Waterborne diseases
- 5. Vector-borne diseases





Costs of Climate Change



patient and \$92.4 M cumulative impact.

century that could be 240 additional deaths at cost of \$280 M

- 2018 Houghton, \$100 M
- 2019 \$15 M to farms

estimated to have resulted in \$8M in health costs.

Step 3

Assess Public Health Interventions

Public Health Intervention Strategies: Secondary and Tertiary Prevention

Adaptation: Actions that Moderate Harm

- Surveillance & Tracking
- Education & Engagement
- Inform Planning & Policy
- Emergency Preparedness



Public Health Intervention Strategies: Primary Prevention

Mitigation: Reduce, Prevent GHG Emissions

- Improving energy efficiency
- Reducing energy consumption
- Using alternatives to fossil fuels



Steps 4 & 5

Develop and Implement Climate and Health Adaptation Plan

Evaluate Impact and Improve Quality of Activities

Implement Projects: Urban Detroit Climate Action Collaborative

GOAL

GOAL

2



PUBLIC HEALTH

Inform decision makers and residents of Detroit about climate change health risks and evidence-based responses. (mitigation and adaptation)

Ensure that citywide and agency emergency response plans address public health risks of climate change. (adaptation)



Assess health impacts of land use decisions affecting urban heat islands, air quality, and stormwater management. (adaptation)



Increase monitoring of climate-related health outcomes, such as heat-related hospitalizations, injury or death from extreme weather events, and asthma-related outcomes. (mitigation and adaptation)

Implement Projects: Rural Marquette Climate and Health Adaptation Guidebook



Physical Interventions:

- 1. Trail
- 2. Vegetated swale
- 3. Pervious pavement
- 4. New trees

Road Access <

Sample Policies:

- Limit tall grasses near trails to create a "buffer zone" between recreational areas and tick habitats.
- Implement natural infiltration systems in municipal development to filter runoff before reaching the lake.
- Identify coastal areas at risk for flooding and protect them as greenspace that can withstand temporary flooding.
- Create a county wide Shoreline Protection Zone to require enhanced building standards and further setbacks in coastal areas, including for roads to ensure accessibility of roadways.

Sample Health Measures:

- Miles of established tick buffer zones in county
- % of low-impact-development stormwater management
- 🤨 techniques used in municipal upgrades and development
- % of publicly owned coastal land cover dedicated to green spaces
- % of waterfront covered by a Shoreline Protection or Beach Overlay Zone

Water Quantity 🔫





Weatherization as Climate and Health Intervention

How does climate change affect your home and your health?

Climate drivers such as temperature and extreme weather



Extreme heat and **humidity** can lead to...

- Worsening droughts
- Wildfires
- Air pollution risks
- Increase indoor moisture
- Heat illness

Extreme cold can lead to...

- CO poisonings
- Respiratory conditions

Extreme precipitation can lead to...

- Increases in severe flooding
 - Immediate health hazards include injuries or exposure to waterborne diseases
 - Long term health conditions
 include depression and
 anxiety
- Mold contamination
- Poor indoor air quality

Seasonal changes can lead to...

- Pollen producing plants and longer growing seasons
- Animal allergies

Climate drivers and asthma triggers pathway



Can weatherization (home improvements) also improve health?



Reduced pest intrusion

Wx benefits health in many ways			
Health benefits	are associated with these improvements to home condition	Strength of ns. evidence*	
General Health	\$ 🌡 🏤 🕀 💕 🎘 🗞	High	
Productivity	l 🎓 📀 🔹 🌞 🐁	High	
Social Health	l 🎓 🔹 🕸 🐁	High	
Upper Respiratory	l 🎓 🔹 🏶 🐁	High	
Asthma	l 🎓 🔹 🏶 🐁	Medium	
Cardiovascular	l 🏠	Medium	
Financial Stress	\$ 🌡 🏤 🕀 🖸 🎘 🐁	Medium	
Mental Health	\$ 🌡 🎓 🕀 🖋 🎕 🐁	Medium	
Health Care Utilization & Costs	l 🎓 🕀 🌢 🔅 🐁	Medium	
Accidental Injury	۲	Low	
Infectious Disease	J. 👻	Low	
Neurological	۵ ک	Low	

Source: Vermont Department of Health. 2018. Weatherization and Health, Health and Climate Change Co-Benefits of Home Weatherization in Vermont. Retrieved from https://www.healthvermont.gov/sites/default/files/documents/pdf/ENV_CH_WxHealthReport.pdf

Studies have found that...

- Weatherizing 2,000 homes in Vermont would prevent an estimated 223 emergency department visits, 13 hospitalizations, and 0.5 deaths over a 10-year period, associated with reduced health impacts caused by asthma, cold, and heat.
- Also helps reducing fine particulate emissions from heating systems with an estimated 10-year value of energy and health benefits of at least \$24,757 per household or 3X the initial cost

Oak Ridge National Laboratory Reports (1)

- Looked at describing and monetizing numerous health and household related benefits attributable to the weatherization of low-income homes by the US DOE Weatherization Assistance Program using the national occupant survey.
- Descriptive statistics suggest the following post-weatherization benefits:
 - Homes are more livable;
 - The physical condition of homes is improved;
 - These and other improvements lead to improved general health;
 - Respondents experience fewer 'bad' physical and mental health days;
 - Respondents and other household members suffer fewer persistent colds and headaches;
 - There are fewer instances of doctor and emergency room visits, and hospitalizations;
 - Households are better able to pay energy and medical bills;
 - Households are better able to pay for food; and
 - Households use of two kinds of short-term, high interest loans (tax refunds and pawn shops) decreases.

Oak Ridge National Laboratory Reports (2)

Monetizing heath-related non-energy benefits:

- Reduced Carbon Monoxide Poisonings
- \circ Reduced Home Fires
- Reduced Thermal Stress on Occupants
- \odot Reduced Asthma-Related Medical Care and Costs
- \odot Increased Productivity at Work Due to Improvements in Sleep
- \odot Increased Productivity at Home Due to Improvements in Sleep
- \odot Fewer Missed Days at Work
- Reduced Use of High Interest, Short-Term Loans Increased Ability to Afford Prescriptions
- Reduced Heat or Eat Choice Dilemma Faced by Pregnant Women
- Reduced Need for Food Assistance

Average weatherization cost per unit in 2008 for a single-built single-family home was ~\$4000

The PV per unit of **health-related benefits** is estimated to be **\$14,148**

Oak Ridge National Laboratory Reports (3)

- 2015: Looked at asthma-related health impacts of weatherization and healthy homes interventions using data from 49 households in NW Washington State from 2006-2013.
- **Results**: found that all interventions including Wx Plus Health, Healthy Homes, and WAP all reduced asthma-related health effects.
 - Found a statistically **significant decrease of \$421** in annualized asthma related Medicaid costs for all study groups combined.
- But additional research is required to better attribute these observed reductions in Medicaid claims and costs to these programs.
- Sample sizes were too small to detect differences

What does **MDHHS MICHAP** and **WAP** plan to do?

Michigan study that will evaluate if weatherization services can reduce asthma hospitalizations and emergency department visits among the Michigan Medicaid population with asthma.

• Step 1: Which weatherization services might prevent indoor/outdoor asthma triggers related to climate change?

Which weatherization services might prevent indoor/outdoor asthma triggers related to climate change?

Asthma triggers related	Weatherization measure	
to climate change	installed for impact	
Cold weather	Insulation	
	Air sealing	
Wood-burning stoves or	Heating system replacement –	
fireplaces	fuel switch	
Unvented gas stoves or		
heaters		
Air pollution	Filtration	
High humidity	ASHRAE fan	
	Ground moisture barrier	
Dust mites	ASHRAE fan	
	Reduced Humidity	
Cockroaches	Air sealing	
Molds	ASHRAE fan	
	Ground moisture barrier	
	Insulation	
Indoor air quality	ASHRAE fan	
Pollen	Air sealing	
	Insulation	

MDHHS MICHAP and WAP- Wx and Asthma Study

• Step 2: What is our study design?

 \odot Treatment and control group



• Step 3: How do we match weatherization data to Medicaid data? • By address

 \odot Ever lived at weatherized address 12 months before and after start date

Resources and Contact Information

Climate and Health Adaptation Planning References:

- <u>Michigan Climate and Health</u> <u>Adaptation Program</u>
- <u>CDC Climate and Health Program</u>
- Fourth National Climate
 Assessment
- <u>Marquette Climate and Health</u>
 <u>Adaptation Guidebook</u>
- <u>Managing Water For Health In a</u> <u>Changing Climate</u>
- Resilience Hub Website

Aaron Ferguson MICHAP Program Manager FergusonA1@Michigan.gov

Gillian Capper MICHAP/MiTracking Epidemiologist CapperG@Michigan.gov

Health Data Sources

- CDC <u>National</u>
 <u>Environmental Public</u>
 <u>Health Tracking Network</u>
- EPA <u>Environmental</u> Justice (EJ) Screen
- CDC <u>500 Cities: Local</u>
 Data for Better Health
- Robert Wood Johnson
 Foundation <u>County</u>
 <u>Health Rankings</u>

PRIORITY HOME REPAIR PROGRAM

HABITAT FOR HUMANITY – FOCUSING ON HEALTH AND SAFETY REPAIRS



About the Program



Prioritized Repairs – data capture



How to capture Non-Energy Benefits

About the Program

Program history Prioritizing health and safety Knowing the homeowner



Grant Requirements

Yearly grant term – projects are completed during the grant cycle. Serves families at 60% AMI &

lower

All projects must be performed to code by licensed and insured contractors



Funding per project

\$7000 per project

- + additional \$500 for roof repairs
- + additional \$\$ for energy waste reduction measures



 \Box

Community Action Agency
DTE Energy (rebates)
Consumers Energy (rebates)

Prioritized repairs – data capturing

HIGHEST PRIORITY REPAIRS



Repair statistics



Families served = **197** | Adults **161**, children **34**

Average AMI = **42%**

31 households with a veteran member

52 households with member with disabilities

2018-19 statistic only – average age **57.9**

person	report water in home	symptom types	behavior characteristics
			no pets, no one smoke in home, no pests,
		allergies, sinus, eye irritation, ear	cleans weekly, no ventilation, changes
A	dampness and mold	infection, nausea	filter yearly
в	dampness and mold	asthma and allergies	pests - bugs, cleans daily, no ventilation, changes filter bi yearly, 3 pets, no one smokes in the home
С	visible mold	frequent headaches	2 pets, smokes in home
D	dampness during heavy rain, musty odor	no symptoms	1 pet, no one smokes in home, no pests, cleans weekly
E	mold, dampness	<mark>asthma</mark> , <mark>allergies</mark> , <mark>frequent headaches</mark> / daughter has frequent headaches	4 pets, no one smokes in home, furnace filter yearly, mice, no ventilation, uses air fresheners and candles, cleans weekly

Health reporting sample *before repairs*

NON-ENERGY BENEFITS



Collecting information

BREAK OUTS – Capturing NEB / Group Discussion What information needs to be collected at beginning of project?

How do we make that data show NEB results?

Other thoughts on how to capture NEB


Closing and Adjourn