



RICK SNYDER  
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MICHIGAN  
DEPARTMENT OF TREASURY  
LANSING

NICK A. KHOURI  
STATE TREASURER

***MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE STATE TAX COMMISSION***

***Holiday Inn Express and Okemos Conference Center,  
Okemos A & B Rooms  
2187 University Park Drive, Okemos, Michigan***

***Tuesday, August 25, 2015  
9:00 a.m.***

***PRESENT: Douglas B. Roberts, Chair STC  
Barry S. Simon, Member STC  
W. Howard Morris, Member STC***

***Heather S. Frick, Executive Director  
LaNiece Densteadt, Recording Secretary***

**The item numbers referred to in the minutes correspond to the agenda items as numbered.**

Chairman Roberts announced the Department of Treasury's reorganization of the Bureau of Local Government Services naming Heather Frick as the new Executive Director of the State Tax Commission. Chairman Roberts recognized and thanked former Executive Director, Kelli Sobel, for her significant and positive contribution to assessing including her hard work in eliminating the 154 backlog and making enormous progress on the issue of assessor education and certification.

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved to adopt the minutes of July 16, 2015. (Item 1 on agenda)

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved to adopt the Advisory Committee's recommendation granting a special waiver for those units whose certification level requirements have increased due to the SEV of wind turbines located in the local unit. A special waiver will be granted to Gratiot County Equalization allowing the MAAO (3) Director to continue his responsibilities in the County and one local unit outside Gratiot County due to the effect of the wind turbine values. A special waiver will be granted to Huron and Tuscola Counties who share their current MAAO (3) Equalization Director until 2017 due to the effect of the wind turbine values. The Commission approved the Certification Level Guidelines for 2016. The Commission also requested to have the Advisory Committee review certification levels for possible future changes. ([Counties](#)) ([Townships and Cities](#)) (Item 2 on agenda)

It was moved by Morris, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved Bulletin 10 of 2015 2<sup>nd</sup> Quarter Certified Interest Rates. (Item 3 on agenda)

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved Bulletin 11 of 2015 Assessor Certification. (Item 4 on agenda)

It was moved by Morris, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to adopt the official order to certify and return the 2014 assessment roll for Pittsfield Township, Washtenaw County. (Item 5 on agenda)

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved to adopt the list of OPRA Qualified Local Governmental Units. (Item 6 on agenda)

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved that Ms. Carly Kimmen’s receive a Michigan Certified Assessing Officer Certification with immediate effect. (Item 7 on agenda)

The Commission received a proposed 2016 meeting schedule for their review. (Item 8 on agenda)

It was moved by Morris, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to adopt the legislative reports for Commercial Redevelopment Act, Commercial Rehabilitation Act and Obsolete Property Rehabilitation Act. (Item 9 on agenda)

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved to adopt the staff recommendation on the Charitable Non Profit Housing Organization Exemptions for the following: (Item 10 on agenda)

These exemptions will expire on **December 30, 2020**, or until one of the following events occur:

1. The eligible nonprofit housing property is occupied by a low-income person under a lease agreement, or
2. The eligible nonprofit housing property is transferred by the charitable nonprofit housing organization.

<b>County</b>	<b>Local Unit</b>	<b>Parcel Number</b>
Calhoun	Bedford Township	04-370-136-00
Calhoun	City of Battle Creek	3250-00-086-0
Calhoun	City of Battle Creek	0601-42-795-0
Grand Traverse	East Bay Township	28-03-228-004-00
Grand Traverse	Paradise Township	28-42-080-017-01
Grand Traverse	East Bay Township	28-03-221-037-40
Ingham	City of Lansing	33-01-01-04-109-121
Ingham	City of Lansing	23-50-40-36-403-141
Kalkaska	Orange Township	010-700-016-01
Kalkaska	Orange Township	010-700-018-00
Kalkaska	Orange Township	010-700-027-00
Kalkaska	Orange Township	010-700-026-00

Leelanau	Kasson Township	45-007-550-022-00
Lenawee	City of Adrian	XAO-515-0396-00
Livingston	City of Howell	4717-36-402-012
Livingston	Conway Township	4701-01-101-022
Livingston	Conway Township	4701-01-101-038
Monroe	Bedford Township	58-02-495-035-20
Monroe	Bedford Township	58-02-365-009-00
Ottawa	Park Township	70-15-12-480-011
Ottawa	Park Township	70-15-12-480-012
Washtenaw	Ypsilanti Township	K-11-39-320-005
Washtenaw	Ypsilanti Township	K-11-11-380-021
Washtenaw	Ypsilanti Township	K-11-02-406-004
Washtenaw	Ypsilanti Township	K-11-10-386-025
Washtenaw	Ypsilanti Township	K-11-14-485-018
Washtenaw	Ypsilanti Township	K-11-39-356-031
Washtenaw	Ypsilanti Township	K-11-01-234-005
Washtenaw	Ypsilanti Township	K-11-01-455-004
Washtenaw	Ypsilanti Township	K-11-40-313-022
Washtenaw	Ypsilanti Township	K-11-02-309-019
Washtenaw	Ypsilanti Township	K-11-02-308-015
Washtenaw	Ypsilanti Township	K-11-15-107-032
Washtenaw	Ypsilanti Township	K-11-14-284-018
Washtenaw	Ypsilanti Township	K-11-15-407-014
Washtenaw	Ypsilanti Township	K-11-03-162-002
Washtenaw	Ypsilanti Township	K-11-10-482-031
Washtenaw	Ypsilanti Township	K-11-14-282-009
Wayne	City of Detroit	21069897
Wayne	City of Detroit	21069880

It was moved by Morris, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to adopt the staff recommendation on the Re-certifications and New Certifications of Computerized Tax Rolls for the following: (Item 11 on agenda)

These certifications will expire on **May 1, 2018**.

**New Certifications:**

**Alcona County**

Harrisville Township

**Missaukee County**

Bloomfield Township

Butterfield Township

Caldwell Township

Enterprise Township

Forest Township

Lake Township

Norwich Township  
Reeder Township  
Richland Township  
Riverside Township  
City of Lake City  
City of McBain

**Montcalm County**  
Pierson Township

**Recertification Denials:**

**Sanilac County**  
Elk Township

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved to adopt the staff recommendations on the Special Items Exemptions Agenda. (Item 12 on agenda) ([See attached link for file identification.](#))

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved to adopt the staff recommendations on the Exemptions Agenda. (Item 13 on agenda) ([See attached link for file identification.](#))

It was moved by Morris, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to adopt the MCL 211.154 **Concurrences**. (Item 14 on agenda) ([See attached link for file identification](#))

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved to **amend** the following MCL 211.154 petitions. (Item 15 on agenda)

**City of Detroit, Wayne County**

**154-14-0712** SIEMENS FINANCIAL SERVICES; 25990907.00; PERSONAL PROPERTY

**\*\* This was also a concurrence.**

2012 AV from \$ 2,326,030 to \$ 97,888 TV from \$ 2,326,030 to \$ 97,888

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved to **withdraw** the following MCL 211.154 petitions. (Item 15 on agenda)

**City of Ann Arbor, Washtenaw County**

**154-15-0280** COMMONWEALTH OPPORTUNITY FUND; 09-90-00-080-558; Personal Property

2014 AV from \$ 0 to \$ 31,300 TV from \$ 0 to \$ 31,300

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved to **deny** the following MCL 211.154 petitions. (Item 15 on agenda)

**City of Fraser, Macomb County**

**154-14-1105** HHI FORMTECH, LLC; 275-18450-50; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2013 AV from \$ 4,444,690 to \$ 4,639,057 TV from \$ 4,444,690 to \$ 4,105,147  
2014 AV from \$ 5,077,831 to \$ 6,394,419 TV from \$ 5,077,831 to \$ 6,240,068  
2015 AV from \$ 9,746,261 to \$ 9,856,141 TV from \$ 9,746,261 to \$ 9,856,141

**City of Trenton, Wayne County**

**154-15-0252** FCA US LLC (CHRYSLER GROUP LLC);82-54-998-01-9892-005; PERSONAL-IFT PROPERTY

2013 AV from \$ 0 to \$ 62,822,100 TV from \$ 0 to \$ 62,822,100  
2014 AV from \$ 0 to \$ 55,472,600 TV from \$ 0 to \$ 55,472,600  
2015 AV from \$ 0 to \$ 48,618,300 TV from \$ 0 to \$ 48,618,300

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved to **postpone** the following MCL 211.154 petitions until **September 22, 2015**. (Item 15 on agenda)

**City of Sturgis, Saint Joseph County**

**154-14-1122** MORGAN OLSON LLC; 75-052-000-237-00; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2013 AV from \$ 1,923,100 to \$ 1,628,900 TV from \$ 1,923,100 to \$ 1,628,900

**City of River Rouge, Wayne County**

**154-14-1100** PCI ENTERPRISES; 50-998-01-9892-004; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2014 AV from \$ 10,376,700 to \$ 9,651,400 TV from \$ 10,376,700 to \$ 9,651,400

**154-14-1101** PCI ENTERPRISES; 50-999-00-0630-000; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2012 AV from \$ 8,506,200 to \$ 9,432,000 TV from \$ 8,506,200 to \$ 9,432,000  
2013 AV from \$ 7,780,700 to \$ 8,486,100 TV from \$ 7,780,700 to \$ 8,486,100  
2014 AV from \$ 6,941,200 to \$ 8,272,700 TV from \$ 6,941,200 to \$ 8,272,700

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved to **postpone** the following MCL 211.154 petitions until **October 12, 2015**. (Item 15 on agenda)

**City of Eaton Rapids, Eaton County**

**154-14-0508** MAGNESIUM PRODUCTS of AMERICA; 300-090-010-162-00; Personal Property

2012 AV from \$ 5,611,150 to \$ 4,789,788 TV from \$ 5,611,150 to \$ 4,789,788  
2013 AV from \$ 5,601,600 to \$ 4,888,318 TV from \$ 5,601,600 to \$ 4,888,318

**154-14-0509** MAGNESIUM PRODUCTS of AMERICA; 300-091-027-040-15; Personal Property

2012 AV from \$ 2,551,050 to \$ 2,204,968 TV from \$ 2,551,050 to \$ 2,204,968  
2013 AV from \$ 2,019,300 to \$ 1,519,804 TV from \$ 2,019,300 to \$ 1,519,804

**City of Eaton Rapids, Eaton County**

**154-14-0510** MAGNESIUM PRODUCTS of AMERICA; 300-091-027-100-45; Personal Property

2012 AV from \$ 483,150 to \$ 217,601 TV from \$ 483,150 to \$ 217,601

2013 AV from \$ 189,950 to \$ 201,472 TV from \$ 189,950 to \$ 201,472

**154-14-0511** MAGNESIUM PRODUCTS of AMERICA; 300-091-027-100-55; Personal Property

2012 AV from \$ 1,836,350 to \$ 1,807,146 TV from \$ 1,836,350 to \$ 1,807,146

2013 AV from \$ 1,686,900 to \$ 1,576,092 TV from \$ 1,686,900 to \$ 1,576,092

**154-14-0512** MAGNESIUM PRODUCTS of AMERICA; 300-091-027-100-65; Personal Property

2012 AV from \$ 2,620,600 to \$ 2,347,830 TV from \$ 2,620,600 to \$ 2,347,830

2013 AV from \$ 2,350,200 to \$ 2,009,179 TV from \$ 2,350,200 to \$ 2,009,179

**154-14-0513** MAGNESIUM PRODUCTS of AMERICA; 300-091-027-100-75; Personal Property

2012 AV from \$ 3,827,250 to \$ 3,380,013 TV from \$ 3,827,250 to \$ 3,380,013

2013 AV from \$ 3,734,650 to \$ 3,486,294 TV from \$ 3,734,650 to \$ 3,486,294

**154-14-0514** MAGNESIUM PRODUCTS of AMERICA; 300-091-027-100-85; Personal Property

2013 AV from \$ 749,250 to \$ 607,596 TV from \$ 749,250 to \$ 607,596

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved the following MCL 211.154 petitions as **concurrences**, initially noticed as non-concurrences. (Item 15 on agenda)

**City of Wyoming, Kent County**

**154-15-0292** SANDRA MAE CAPESTANY; 41-17-24-402-006; REAL PROPERTY

2013 AV from \$ 9,500 to \$ 119,200 TV from \$ 9,500 to \$ 119,200

2014 AV from \$ 9,500 to \$ 111,700 TV from \$ 9,500 to \$ 111,700

2015 AV from \$ 9,500 to \$ 122,300 TV from \$ 9,500 to \$ 113,469

**Cleveland Township, Leelanau County**

**154-15-0218** CONSUMERS ENERGY CO; 003-900-002-00; PERSONAL-UTILITY PROPERTY

2013 AV from \$ 439,600 to \$ 439,600 TV from \$ 428,349 to \$ 439,600

2014 AV from \$ 459,100 to \$ 459,100 TV from \$ 433,058 to \$ 459,100

2015 AV from \$ 493,800 to \$ 493,800 TV from \$ 456,728 to \$ 493,800

**City of Sterling Heights, Macomb County**

**154-15-0258** AM RETAIL GROUP (WILSON'S LEATHER); 10-01-104-014-354; Personal Property

2014 AV from \$ 10,000 to \$ 39,300 TV from \$ 10,000 to \$ 39,300

**City of Sterling Heights, Macomb County**

**154-15-0259** NEW ELECTRIC; 10-04-176-018-001; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2015 AV from \$ 14,000 to \$ 20,250 TV from \$ 14,000 to \$ 20,250

**154-15-0260** ELWOOD STAFFING SERVICES INC.; 10-20-426-020-015; Personal Property

2015 AV from \$ 14,000 to \$ 21,050 TV from \$ 14,000 to \$ 21,050

**Bloomfield Township, Oakland County**

**154-15-0212** HIKMAT MAHMOOD; C-63-19-08-476-013; REAL PROPERTY

2013 AV from \$ 1,195,440 to \$ 1,307,350 TV from \$ 946,480 to \$ 887,750

2014 AV from \$ 1,120,030 to \$ 1,108,200 TV from \$ 961,620 to \$ 873,770

2015 AV from \$ 1,341,670 to \$ 1,307,350 TV from \$ 977,000 to \$ 887,750

**City of Ann Arbor, Washtenaw County**

**154-15-0280** COMMONWEALTH OPPORTUNITY FUND; 09-90-00-080-558; Personal Property

2015 AV from \$ 0 to \$ 23,900 TV from \$ 0 to \$ 23,900

**154-15-0313** WINDSOR; 09-90-00-079-366; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2015 AV from \$ 33,100 to \$ 127,200 TV from \$ 33,100 to \$ 127,200

**City of Highland Park, Wayne County**

**154-15-0095** INTEGRATED MANUFACTURING; 43-999-00-2664-014; Personal Property

2014 AV from \$ 3,280,000 to \$ 1,067,900 TV from \$ 3,280,000 to \$ 1,067,900

2015 AV from \$ 862,000 to \$ 683,500 TV from \$ 862,000 to \$ 683,500

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved to adopt all other MCL 211.154 petitions. ([See attached link for file identification.](#)) (Item 15 on agenda)

Public Comment (Item 16 on agenda):

James Schlichting appeared before the Commission regarding a complaint he had submitted to the State Tax Commission and stated the following: As part of Public Act 206 the legislature, in the early 1980's, provided for youth organizations that have membership of at least 50% Michigan residents to enjoy limited property tax relief for real property owned by that organization. I have provided each of you a photocopy of that portion of the Property Tax Act. I believe the quid pro quo established by the Michigan legislature is that for the services youth organizations provide to Michigan residents, the people of the State of Michigan intend for a property tax break to be given for the services provided by that organization. The Michigan legislature further provided that youth organizations who do not meet the residency requirement of the law have an opportunity to request real property exemption through the local County Board of Commissioners. Since enactment of this law in the early 1980's the Board of Blue Lake Township, Muskegon County, has purposefully circumvented the cited property tax law. For more than three decades the Blue Lake Township

administration, including the current supervisor and board, has taken it upon themselves to grant property tax exemptions to at least one, if not more than one, unqualified organization owning property in Blue Lake Township. The organization is not qualified because they do not have membership that includes at least 50% Michigan residents. Since enactment of the cited property tax provision, the Chicago based chartered organization, known variously as the Chicago Council, Chicago Area Council and now as the Gateway to Adventure Council has been granted by the Blue Lake Township Board a property tax exemption. Such an exemption from the Board is not authorized under the cited provision because 50% of the members of the Boy Scouts franchise for the Chicago Area are not Michigan residents. On August 4, 2015 I provided to your Commission documentation that explains what I have just described to you. The law does not mention a provision for a township to waive the residency requirement specified in the law. I believe you as a Commission are inaccurate by taking the positions you have that: (i) the membership make-up of the Chicago Council of the Boy Scouts of America meets the membership requirement of having 50% Michigan residents as members; (ii) that the actions of the Blue Lake Township Board to grant property tax exemptions for an unqualified property owner for more than 30 years have been proper; and (iii) that the process you cite in subsection (3) is available to a township board when it is explicitly stated the process is reserved for the “county board of commissioners”.

It was moved by Roberts, supported by Simon, to go into closed session to discuss a settlement. Roll Call Vote: Chairperson Roberts – Yes, Commissioner Simon – Yes, Commissioner Morris – Yes. The motion was unanimously approved.

It was moved by Roberts, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to return to open session. Roll Call Vote: Chairperson Roberts – Yes, Commissioner Simon – Yes, Commissioner Morris – Yes. The motion was unanimously approved.

It was moved by Roberts, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to request the Attorney General and Executive Director Frick to execute settlement agreements in the following cases pending in the Ingham County Circuit Court: *James E. Fedie v Michigan State Tax Commission*, Ingham County Circuit Court 15-534-AA; *City of Houghton v Michigan State Commission*, Ingham County Circuit Court 15-478-AA; *Laird Twp. v Michigan State Tax Commission*, Ingham County Circuit Court 15-479-AA; *L’Anse Twp. v Michigan State Tax Commission*, Ingham County Circuit Court 15-480-AA; and *Baraga Twp. v Michigan State Tax Commission*, Ingham County Circuit Court 15-481-AA.

Chairman Roberts directed staff to review the Complaint Process Regarding Assessment Administration Practices policy to address potential due process concerns. Chairman Roberts requested the policy also be reviewed by the Attorney General.

The next Commission meeting will be held September 22, 2015 at the Okemos Conference Center in the Okemos A & B Rooms, 2187 University Park Drive, Okemos.



It was moved by Roberts, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to adjourn the meeting of the State Tax Commission at 11:15 a.m.

**DATE TYPED:** August 26, 2015

**DATE APPROVED:** September 22, 2015

---

**Douglas B. Roberts, Chair**  
**State Tax Commission**

---

**Barry N. Simon, Member**  
**State Tax Commission**

---

**W. Howard Morris, Member**  
**State Tax Commission**