

STATE OF MICHIGAN DEPARTMENT OF TREASURY LANSING

NICK A. KHOURI STATE TREASURER

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE STATE TAX COMMISSION

Holiday Inn Express and Okemos Conference Center, Okemos A & B Rooms 2187 University Park Drive, Okemos, Michigan

Tuesday, November 28, 2017 9:00 a.m.

PRESENT: Douglas B. Roberts, Chair STC W. Howard Morris, Member STC Leonard D. Kutschman, Member STC

> Heather S. Frick, Executive Director LaNiece Densteadt, Recording Secretary

The item numbers referred to in the minutes correspond to the agenda items as numbered.

Chairman Roberts congratulated Commissioner Morris on his reappointment by Governor Snyder to the State Tax Commission.

It was moved by Kutschman, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved to adopt the minutes of October 30, 2017. (Item 1 on agenda)

Public Comment – Agenda Items 3-14 Only (Item 2 on agenda):

Aaron Powers appeared before the Commission on behalf of WCA Assessing regarding agenda item 4, Bulletin 21 of 2017, *Omitted or Incorrectly Reported Property*. Mr. Powers stated the following: My firm represents a number of assessment jurisdictions in Wayne, Washtenaw, Oakland and Kalamazoo Counties. I wanted to provide a recommendation as it pertains to the proposed Bulletin 21 of 2017. As I read, portions of the proposed bulletin relate to the appeals process. This bulletin, as I am sure you have already reviewed, provides assessors guidance as it relates to omitted or incorrectly reported property and 154 forms. The appeal section in the bulletin on page 5, indicates if the change which is sought is of a substantive nature, rather than a correction as referenced, an appeal of the State Tax Commission's determination. The State Tax Commission record in each case shall be available to the Michigan Tax Tribunal. Both my staff as well as my assessing peers in Southeastern Michigan have one question, and that is ultimately whether or not an assessor or an Equalization Director who files a petition with the State Tax Commission has the ability or authority to appeal to the Michigan Tax Tribunal. Clearly, as it is indicated on page 2 of the bulletin, the proceedings before the State Tax

RICK SNYDER GOVERNOR Commission are concluded by the entry of the Order. A person to whom property is assessed under Section 154 of the General Property Tax Act may appeal the State Tax Commission's Order within 35 days of the entry of the Order to the Michigan Tax Tribunal. The Court of Appeals in an unpublished decision indicated that an Assessor or Equalization Director cannot appeal the decision of the State Tax Commission to the Michigan Tax Tribunal. Additionally, it is my understanding that the Michigan Tax Tribunal recently has denied taking jurisdiction over appeals that have been brought forth by the Assessor. It is only certainly my recommendation, but I am requesting that section of the bulletin related to appeals be clarified.

No other member of the public wished to speak at public comment on agenda items 3-14.

It was moved by Morris, supported by Kutschman, and unanimously approved the City of Hamtramck, Wayne County reappraisal request to waive the requirements to complete a physical inspection and approve the reappraisal methodology for the residential property class permitting the use of remote data verification. The Commission also approved to have staff review the reappraisal work in the follow up AMAR Review conducted in 2018. (Item 3 on agenda)

It was moved by Morris, supported by Kutschman, and unanimously approved Bulletin 21 of 2017 Omitted or Incorrectly Reported Property and 154 Forms – 627 – Assessor or Equalization Director Notice of Property Incorrectly Reported or Omitted, 628 – Notice by Owner of Property Incorrectly Reported or Omitted and 629 – Notice of Property Incorrectly Reported or Omitted by a Person Other than the Owner, Assessor or Equalization Director. (Item 4 on agenda)

It was moved by Kutschman, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved Bulletin 22 of 2017 Property Tax Appeal Procedures for 2018. (Item 5 on agenda)

It was moved by Morris, supported by Kutschman, and unanimously approved Bulletin 23 of 2017 3rd Quarter Certified Interest Rates. (Item 6 on agenda)

It was moved by Morris, supported by Kutschman, and unanimously approved Bulletin 24 of 2017 Procedural Changes for the 2018 Assessment Year. (Item 7 on agenda)

It was moved by Kutschman, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved to adopt the 2018 Pipeline System Economic Factors. (Item 8 on agenda)

It was moved by Morris, supported by Kutschman, and unanimously approved to adopt the official order to grant the disabled veteran's exemption for the 2017 year in Caledonia Township, Alcona County for parcel 023-110-000-018-00 and order Caledonia Township to process the exemption for the qualifying parcel and cancel any 2017 taxes associated with the parcel. (Item 9 on agenda)

It was moved by Roberts, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved to allow the reconsideration of classification appeal 17-013 and to retain the prior determination of Commercial Personal after receiving additional information from staff regarding appeal 17-013. (Item 10 on agenda)

It was moved by Kutschman, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved to adopt the staff recommendation on the Charitable Non-Profit Housing Organization Exemptions for the following: (Item 11 on agenda)

These exemptions will expire on **December 30, 2020 for a period of three (3 years)** or **December 30, 2022 for a period of five (5 years)**, or until one of the following events occur:

- 1. The eligible nonprofit housing property is occupied by a low-income person under a lease agreement, or
- 2. The eligible nonprofit housing property is transferred by the charitable nonprofit housing organization.

| County | Local Unit | Parcel Number | Years Approved |
|-----------|----------------------|------------------|----------------|
| Oakland | City of Oak Park | 25-32-105-014 | 3 Years |
| Washtenaw | City of Ann Arbor | 09-12-02-405-018 | 3 Years |
| Lenawee | City of Adrian | XA0-395-7009-00 | 3 Years |
| Washtenaw | Superior Township | J-10-35-372-008 | 3 Years |
| Washtenaw | Ypsilanti Township | K-11-03-128-008 | 3 Years |
| Washtenaw | Ypsilanti Township | K-11-02-309-020 | 3 Years |
| Washtenaw | Ypsilanti Township | K-11-11-435-017 | 3 Years |
| Washtenaw | Ypsilanti Township | K-11-10-308-032 | 3 Years |
| Washtenaw | Ypsilanti Township | K-11-070442-015 | 3 Years |
| Kent | City of Grand Rapids | 41-13-3-128-014 | 3 Years |
| Kent | City of Grand Rapids | 41-13-36-177-012 | 3 Years |
| Kent | City of Grand Rapids | 41-17-01-158-072 | 5 Years |
| Kent | City of Grand Rapids | 41-13-36-255-055 | 3 Years |
| Kent | City of Grand Rapids | 41-13-36-258-027 | 5 Years |
| Kent | City of Grand Rapids | 41-13-36-258-025 | 5 Years |
| Kent | City of Grand Rapids | 41-13-36-334-001 | 3 Years |
| Kent | City of Grand Rapids | 41-13-14-453-008 | 5 Years |
| Kent | City of Grand Rapids | 41-18-08-382-012 | 3 Years |
| Kent | City of Grand Rapids | 41-17-01-303-058 | 5 Years |
| Kent | City of Grand Rapids | 41-17-01-303-059 | 5 Years |

It was moved by Morris, supported by Kutschman, and unanimously approved to adopt the staff recommendation to deny the following Charitable Non-Profit Housing Organization Exemption Applications because these applicants do not meet the statutory definition of a "charitable nonprofit housing organization," and the subject parcels do not meet the definition of "eligible nonprofit housing property": (Item 12 on agenda)

| County | Local Unit | Parcel Number | |
|--------|-----------------|---------------|--|
| Wayne | City of Detroit | 22116892 | |
| Wayne | City of Detroit | 22116893 | |
| Wayne | City of Detroit | 22116894 | |
| Wayne | City of Detroit | 22117231 | |
| Wayne | City of Detroit | 22117231.602 | |
| Wayne | City of Detroit | 22117232 | |
| Wayne | City of Detroit | 22116900 | |

It was moved by Kutschman, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved to adopt the staff recommendation on the New Certifications of Computerized Assessment Rolls for the following: (Item 13 on agenda)

These certifications will expire on May 1, 2021.

New Certifications:

Cass County

City of Dowagiac

<u>Genesee County</u> City of Burton Flint Charter Township

Kent County

Cascade Township

Macomb County Macomb Township

Muskegon County

City of Muskegon City of Norton Shores City of Roosevelt Park City of Whitehall Dalton Township Egelston Township Fruitport Township Holton Township Montague Township Sullivan Township

It was moved by Morris, supported by Kutschman, and unanimously approved to adopt the staff recommendation on the Re-certifications and New Certifications of Computerized Tax Rolls for the following: (Item 14 on agenda)

These certifications will expire on May 1, 2021.

New Certifications:

Calhoun County Eckford Township

<u>Genesee County</u> Atlas Township Ingham County Ingham County

Recertification:

Monroe County Monroe Township

Oakland County

Bloomfield Township Village of Leonard City of Novi Village of Ortonville

It was moved by Kutschman, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved to adopt the staff recommendations on the Special Items Exemptions Agenda. (Item 15 on agenda) (See attached link for file identification.)

It was moved by Morris, supported by Kutschman, and unanimously approved to adopt the staff recommendations on the Exemptions Agenda. (Item 16 on agenda) (See attached link for file identification.)

It was moved by Morris, supported by Kutschman, and unanimously approved to adopt the MCL 211.154 **Concurrences**. (Item 17 on agenda) (See attached link for file identification)

It was moved by Morris, supported by Kutschman, and unanimously approved to adopt staff recommendations on MCL 211.154 petitions on the **Special Items Agenda**. (Item 18 on agenda) (<u>See attached link for file identification</u>)

It was moved by Morris, supported by Kutschman, and unanimously approved the following MCL 211.154 petitions as a **concurrence**, initially noticed as a non-concurrence. (Item 19 on agenda)

| Meridian Township, Ingham County | | | | |
|--|--|---------------------|--|--|
| 154-17-0496 | US BANK NATIONAL ASSOC. | 33-02-02-92-275-617 | | |
| | PERSONAL PROPERTY | | | |
| 2016 AV | from \$ 0 to \$ 8,700 TV from \$ 0 to \$ 8,700 | | | |
| 2017 AV from \$ 6,900 to \$ 15,200 TV from \$ 6,900 to \$ 15,200 | | | | |
| | | | | |
| City of East La | nsing, Ingham County | | | |
| 154-17-0460 | SCENE METROSPACE | 33-20-90-55-017-035 | | |
| | PERSONAL PROPERTY | | | |
| 2017 AV | | | | |

| <u>City of Iron River, Iron County</u> | | | | |
|--|---|-----------------------|--|--|
| 154-17-0507 | GLOBAL RESPONSE CORPORATION | 055-925-047-00 | | |
| | PERSONAL PROPERTY | | | |
| 2017 AV | ⁷ from \$ 0 to \$ 61,698 TV from \$ 0 to \$ 61,698 | | | |
| Muskegon Tow | nship, Muskegon County | | | |
| 154-17-0475 | ASHLEY GEISLER | 61-10-658-000-0096-00 | | |
| | REAL PROPERTY | | | |
| 2016 AV from \$ 0 to \$ 69,500 TV from \$ 0 to \$ 57,564 | | | | |
| Hartwick Town | nship, Osceola County | | | |
| 154-16-0914 | HENRY PROSZEK | 67-04-004-004-00 | | |
| | REAL PROPERTY | | | |
| 2014 AV | 7 from \$ 32,000 to \$ 43,400 TV from \$ 14,703 to \$ 43,40 | 00 | | |
| 2015 AV | 7 from \$ 32,700 to \$ 46,600 TV from \$ 13,004 to \$ 44,09 | 94 | | |
| 2016 AV | 7 from \$ 67,300 to \$ 83,600 TV from \$ 42,382 to \$ 44,22 | 26 | | |
| 154-16-0916 | RONALD BERGUM ESTATE OF | 67-04-013-009-00 | | |

2014 AV from \$ 32,000 to \$ 38,500 TV from \$ 29,768 to \$ 38,500 2015 AV from \$ 32,000 to \$ 39,500 TV from \$ 30,244 to \$ 39,116 2016 AV from \$ 53,000 to \$ 61,000 TV from \$ 51,734 to \$ 39,233

REAL PROPERTY

It was moved by Kutschman, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved to adopt all other MCL 211.154 petitions. (See attached link for file identification.) (Item 19 on agenda)

Public Comment (Item 20 on agenda): No member of the public wished to comment.

It was moved by Kutschman, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved Bulletin 25 of 2017, Assessment of Property Owned by a Federally Recognized Indian Tribe or by an enrolled Member. (Add on to agenda)

The next Commission meeting will be held December 12, 2017, at the Okemos Conference Center in the Okemos A & B Rooms, 2187 University Park Drive, Okemos.

It was moved by Roberts, supported by Morris, and approved to adjourn the meeting of the State Tax Commission at 9:45 a.m.

DATE TYPED:November 29, 2017DATE APPROVED:December 12, 2017

Douglas B. Roberts, Chair State Tax Commission

W. Howard Morris, Member State Tax Commission

Leonard D. Kutschman, Member State Tax Commission