

1 CITY OF FLINT
2 RECEIVERSHIP TRANSITION ADVISORY BOARD MEETING
3 Special Meeting
4 Tuesday, March 22, 2016
5 2:00 p.m.
6
7 Meeting before the RTAB Board at
8 1101 S. Saginaw, Flint, Michigan, on Tuesday, March 22,
9 2016.
10
11 BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT:
12 Frederick Headen - The Chairperson
13 Michael Townsend
14 Michael Finney
15 Joel Ferguson
16
17 FROM THE CITY:
18 Jody Lundquist, Finance Director
19
20 OTHERS PRESENT:
21 Eric Cline
22 Rodney S. Branch
23 Jim Casha
24 AC Dumas
25 Arthur Woodson
26 Tony Palladino, Jr.
27
28 REPORTED BY: Mona Storm, CSR# 4460
29
30
31
32
33
34
35

1	MOTION INDEX	
2	MOTION	PAGE
3	I. Call to order	3
4	A. Roll Call	3
5	B. Approval of Agenda	3
6	II. UNFINISHED BUSINESS	3
7	None	
8	III. NEW BUSINESS:	3
9	A. Approval of Resolutions & Ordinances for	
10	City Council Meetings	
11	1. Resolutions 014, 015, 036, 039 from 3-14-16 meeting	4
12	Resolution 018, Mayoral Appointment/ City Administrator/Sylvester Jones, Jr.	7
13		
14	B. Consideration of Chief Legal Officer Position	8
15	C. Consideration of Human Resources Director Position	9
16	IV. Public Comment	10
17	V. Adjournment	24
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

1 Flint, Michigan

2 Tuesday, March 22, 2016

3 2:07 p.m.

4 THE CHAIRPERSON: The meeting will be in
5 order, please.

6 Let the record reflect, under roll call, all
7 four members of the RTAB are present.

8 The next item is the Approval of the Agenda.
9 Does anyone have any additions to the agenda this
10 afternoon?

11 If not, is there a motion the agenda be
12 approved?

13 MR. FERGUSON: So moved.

14 THE CHAIRPERSON: Is there support?

15 MR. TOWNSEND: Support.

16 THE CHAIRPERSON: Without objection, the
17 agenda has been approved.

18 Next item, Unfinished Business. There is
19 none.

20 New Business, we have the first item, the
21 Approval of Resolutions and Ordinance for the City
22 Council meeting, regular meeting of March 14th. Under
23 Attachment 1, resolutions are listed; Resolutions 14,
24 15, 36, 37 and 39. Are there questions about any of
25 those resolutions?

1 If not, is there a motion that those
2 resolutions be approved?

3 MR. FERGUSON: So move.

4 THE CHAIRPERSON: Is there support?

5 MR. TOWNSEND: Support.

6 THE CHAIRPERSON: Any discussion regarding
7 the resolutions?

8 If not, those in favor of the motion please
9 say "aye".

10 BOARD MEMBERS: Aye.

11 THE CHAIRPERSON: Opposed?

12 Motion is adopted.

13 Next item, under -- from the same Council
14 meeting is Resolution 18. It's the Mayoral appointment
15 of the City Administrator. It's Attachment 2 in your
16 packet. I believe Mr. Branch wishes to speak on that
17 particular issue.

18 MR. BRANCH: Yes, good afternoon. On behalf
19 of the Mayor, I'm here to speak on her -- her behalf.
20 With the -- with regards to the resolutions for the
21 City Administrator, I understand that you guys had some
22 questions about that.

23 The Mayor is currently seeking some
24 consulting help and if an RFP were to go out, I would
25 get some additional help and support for the area of

1 City Administrator and she will respectfully request
2 that you approve her appointee.

3 THE CHAIRPERSON: Can you elaborate on the --
4 the additional assistance being sought?

5 MR. BRANCH: We are currently looking at
6 Accopolt would be the consulting firm that would be
7 able to assist with any matter that the appointee has
8 little experience in. Although Mr. Jones is a seasoned
9 professional, he doesn't have municipal experience.
10 However, he does have a Master's in Public
11 Administration and has worked at varying colleges
12 around Michigan once a year.

13 THE CHAIRPERSON: If you could please convey
14 to the Mayor, we appreciate the recognition. In fact,
15 there are certain issues here, and we also appreciate
16 her proactive efforts to try to address those issues
17 through the means that you've indicated.

18 I'll not speak for the other three members
19 but I'll say, for myself, that I think that her
20 proactive efforts have assisted me in addressing some
21 of the concerns that I might have had. And so, if you
22 could certainly convey that to her.

23 And the other members may have comments of
24 their own.

25 Mr. Finney?

1 please say "aye".

2 BOARD MEMBERS: Aye.

3 THE CHAIRPERSON: Opposed?

4 Resolution 18 is adopted.

5 Next item consideration under New Business is

6 the position description and salary range for the

7 position of Chief Legal Officer that is under

8 Attachment 3. We'll take up first the position

9 description itself. Is there a motion it be approved?

10 MR. FERGUSON: So move.

11 THE CHAIRPERSON: Support?

12 MR. FINNEY: Support.

13 THE CHAIRPERSON: A motion's been made and a

14 second. Is there any discussion?

15 Hearing none, those in favor please say

16 "aye".

17 BOARD MEMBERS: Aye.

18 THE CHAIRPERSON: Opposed?

19 Motion is adopted.

20 With respect to the Salary for the position,

21 I believe the Mayor has proposed a salary range of

22 \$90,000 to \$95,000. Is there a motion that that be

23 approved?

24 MR. FERGUSON: So move.

25 THE CHAIRPERSON: Is there support?

1 MR. FINNEY: Support.

2 THE CHAIRPERSON: Any questions or discussion
3 about that?

4 MR. FINNEY: Just one comment. My
5 understanding is that salary range is reflective of the
6 historical norm and it's also reflective of a budget
7 salary for that position.

8 Is that correct, Finance Director?

9 MS. LUNDQUIST: Good afternoon. The position
10 is currently budgeted at \$98,000.

11 MR. FINNEY: Ninety-eight?

12 MS. LUNDQUIST: Yes.

13 MR. FINNEY: Thank you.

14 THE CHAIRPERSON: The motion's been made and
15 seconded. Is there any further discussion or
16 questions?

17 If not, those in favor please say "aye".

18 BOARD MEMBERS: Aye.

19 THE CHAIRPERSON: Opposed?

20 Motion is adopted.

21 The next item is the position description for
22 the Human Resources Labor Relation Director. That's
23 under Attachment 4. Is there a motion that that
24 particular PD be approved?

25 MR. FERGUSON: So move.

1 MR. TOWNSEND: Support.

2 THE CHAIRPERSON: Any discussion?

3 If not, those in favor of the motion please

4 say "aye".

5 BOARD MEMBERS: Aye.

6 THE CHAIRPERSON: Opposed?

7 Motion is adopted.

8 With respect to that position description,

9 the Mayor has proposed a salary range of 80- to

10 \$90,000. Is there a motion that that be approved?

11 MR. FERGUSON: So move.

12 THE CHAIRPERSON: Is there support?

13 MR. TOWNSEND: Support.

14 THE CHAIRPERSON: Any discussion regarding

15 the salary range?

16 If not, those in favor of the motion please

17 say "aye".

18 BOARD MEMBERS: Aye.

19 THE CHAIRPERSON: Opposed?

20 Motion is adopted.

21 Next item is Public Comment.

22 Mr. Cline, anybody sign up for public

23 comment?

24 MR. CASHA: I did.

25 THE CHAIRPERSON: Give us a second to start

1 the clock, please.

2 MR. CASHA: Okay.

3 MR. CLINE: All right.

4 THE CHAIRPERSON: And will you please state
5 your name just for our reporter, please.

6 MR. CASHA: Yes. My name is Jim Casha.

7 Seeing how that this panel is approving
8 appointments for the Mayor and the City Council, I'd
9 like to say that the emergency managers and Governor
10 Snyder did the City of Flint a great disservice when
11 they appointed Howard Croft to be the Director of
12 Public Works and in charge of Flint's Water Treatment
13 Plant.

14 Howard Croft's background is an electrician.
15 He installed solar panels. And I guess he impressed
16 Governor Snyder that he was an entrepreneur so
17 Governor Snyder thought that would be acceptable to run
18 the Flint's Water Treatment Plant. We all see what
19 happened, right?

20 That's not a qualification. And the
21 City Council and the Mayor and this panel, Board, need
22 to be more diligent in who they hire as a replacement
23 for Howard Croft. This position should be held by a
24 professional engineer and a professional engineer only;
25 a professional engineer who swears his -- on his

1 professional license to protect the health and
2 well-being of the public, not to endanger it.

3 And, had that been the case here, I'm sure
4 the switch would have never been flipped to hook up to
5 Flint River water. So this is a very serious position
6 and needs very serious consideration by whoever's
7 making these appointments. And, you know, what you do
8 here at this -- at this Board is the one that will be
9 appointing -- or approving this appointment. You must
10 make sure the individual is qualified and has political
11 independence to do his job properly. Thank you.

12 THE CHAIRPERSON: Two points. I'm not aware
13 that -- with respect to the appointment of Mr. Croft,
14 that the Governor had any involvement or input in that
15 appointment. Secondly, we will not be approving any
16 particular appointment, we will be approving, as we did
17 just now, as it's presented to us, the position
18 descriptions, which I assume were made public. So
19 those would indicate what the necessary qualifications
20 are. Then we'll conduct a search to appoint someone.

21 I believe that individual would probably be a
22 department head so that would require, under the City
23 Charter, approval by City Council. And so, if Council
24 acts on that particular appointment, the Council
25 resolution will come before this body and we'll

1 consider at that point.

2 So our involvement is somewhat indirect but,
3 certainly, it will be an opportunity for us, as well as
4 I hope the general public, to view the position
5 description and have input with regards to what the
6 qualifications should be.

7 MR. CASHA: May I say something?

8 THE CHAIRPERSON: Certainly.

9 MR. CASHA: So, for a position description,
10 if it doesn't say "professional engineers", would this
11 Board have an opportunity to not approve it?

12 THE CHAIRPERSON: That would certainly be a
13 possible consideration, if the position description
14 comes to us. We don't produce those until whatever PD
15 is provided by the Mayor's office. We will certainly
16 take a look at it.

17 I would refer to any other member of the
18 public, if you think that the PD does not contain the
19 necessary requirements, to express your views either to
20 the administration or at -- or at a Council meeting to
21 the City Council.

22 MR. CASHA: I will. Thank you.

23 MR. CLINE: AC Dumas.

24 MR. DUMAS: Good afternoon. My name is
25 AC Dumas and I'm a life-long resident of the City of

1 Flint. And I -- I guess, out of all the citizens of
2 this City, I probably have come to this chambers more
3 longer than any Councilperson, serving for close to 45
4 years. I've seen them come and I've seen them go and I
5 keep hearing -- you know, I'm somewhat conflicted.

6 I say "conflicted" because I hear the RTAB
7 talk about the City Charter and then other times I
8 don't hear you talk about the City Charter. And I know
9 a lot of the appointments the City Charter gives, as
10 far as the chief legal officers, the requirements and
11 so on and so forth.

12 I do have a -- you know, I think that you did
13 the right thing by allowing the Mayor to appoint her
14 appointees, her staff persons, just like I heard a few
15 weeks ago you all had to go and check with your staff
16 persons. So staff is very important. And I think that
17 Mayor Weaver will vet to people that represent the City
18 of Flint.

19 You know, I do have somewhat of a question
20 because I know what the Mayor's salary is and I know
21 what an appointee's salary is. And it seems as though
22 some of the appointees are making more than the Mayor.
23 And, you know, I'm somewhat conflicted with that. I do
24 know that the compensation board, they set salaries for
25 the Council and the Mayor.

1 And so I hope that -- again, I don't know
2 if -- if you follow ordinances or whatever but I -- I
3 just think it's -- it's kind of nonsense for -- that
4 the employee makes more than the employer, you know.
5 And so that's -- that's my -- my thought on that. And
6 to say that, you know, we -- we've got a lot of -- are
7 my two minutes gone already?

8 MR. FERGUSON: You can go ahead.

9 MR. DUMAS: Okay. Okay. I didn't want to --
10 you know, I know you're very strict about that.

11 So consider that, you know, I think we've got
12 to move forward. I've got some issues that's not
13 concerning the RTAB. But, if it comes up, I certainly
14 will voice myself. And I think that, when you -- you
15 talk about salaries and so on and so forth, the public
16 should know.

17 Now, you say the public do know. But I feel
18 that should be attached to the agenda or, you know, not
19 only attached to the agenda but the deemed
20 qualification of who you're -- who you want to appoint,
21 who the Mayor wants to appoint coming before this RTAB.

22 I thank you for your consideration.

23 THE CHAIRPERSON: Thank you.

24 MR. CLINE: Arthur Woodson.

25 MR. WOODSON: How are you doing?

1 Mr. Ferguson, I know you from Lansing, on
2 Tisdale. I used to have a TV station over on Tisdale,
3 down by the apartments. I know a lot of you all. But,
4 with you personally, I know you're a good person, I
5 know that you're going to learn the job. But I have an
6 issue here.

7 And this is why I feel that Snyder should not
8 be in the office because he has to do everything that
9 the Mayor says because he's afraid. He's afraid to do
10 anything because he's afraid we'll speak out. He's
11 afraid she might speak out on him. That plan that he
12 has, what does Capital Theatre have to do with our
13 water crisis? Because of the fact it is owned by
14 Uptown Development and that's how they funnel the money
15 with people who they paying off.

16 Just like here with Genesee Towers where they
17 closed for \$1, he got \$4.8 million, then got a
18 community grant for \$800,000 to tear it down and, two
19 weeks later, gave Governor Snyder a campaign fundraiser
20 at the Farmers Market that the State helped build.

21 Now, two people quit because they said they
22 did not want to be public because of the simple fact
23 Flint was not ready to go out of receivership. What
24 I'm saying right now, just like with LAN, an
25 engineering firm that caused this travesty, had to get

1 another consulting firm, engineering firm, to pay for
2 that.

3 How are you all doing financial
4 responsibility when you buying -- when you approving
5 consulting firms for an engineering firm that we
6 supposed to have? That doesn't make sense.

7 Why don't you just pay you all money to the
8 people that we need instead of going and finding a
9 consulting firm to take over for -- or to look over
10 another person's shoulder? That doesn't make sense
11 here. I don't understand it.

12 Why are we still spending a lot of money when
13 you're saying that we don't have any money and then
14 Blue Cross/Blue Shield -- Blue Cross/Blue Shield sat
15 next to me at the hearing. That is Governor Snyder's
16 biggest campaign donor. How did they get the contract?
17 How is he going through them?

18 Then my major issue is that you all put --
19 that he put an age limit on the people, the kids that
20 get seen for lead; that's six years old. What if my
21 son turns seven today? He doesn't get it because he
22 put an age limit on it.

23 Instead of saying, "Okay. You know what?
24 What we're going to do, all the kids that are sick, at
25 this time period, we're going to go all the way through

1 watching them", instead of just saying "six years old"
2 because my kid turned seven today so my kid does not
3 get seen. Thank you.

4 THE CHAIRPERSON: Thank you.

5 MR. CLINE: Last individual is
6 Tony Palladino.

7 MR. PALLADINO: Palladino.

8 MR. CLINE: Sorry.

9 MR. PALLADINO: Good to see you guys, I
10 think.

11 Real quick to touch on Arthur, what are we
12 doing with the Capital Theatre? You know where that
13 money is coming and where it's going; it's ridiculous.
14 And he's right about the youth. But what about our old
15 people that are hurt from this, too? I want you guys
16 to understand that, across the board, I don't care if
17 you're six or 106, they need to be accountable for all
18 of us. You understand what I'm saying?

19 Another thing I'd like you to look at is the
20 streetlight assessment that you all put on us, not me
21 necessarily. This was a tax assessment that we didn't
22 have a say in. They said we did. It should be a
23 payment of \$10 million now that is going to the Master
24 Plan that, like everything else, we're not going to
25 see, not at our age, and it's killing me.

1 Now, here's another thing you guys did: You
2 took the two buildings downtown and you froze their
3 taxes and Council said, "No, let's not do this."
4 They're getting a tax break to make millions. This
5 needs to be looked at, as I'm losing my houses on the
6 east side. Not only the churches are getting exempt,
7 now the rich people in town are getting exempt.

8 They're saying downtown Flint needs to grow.
9 I think you guys need to look. The hub is built, it's
10 time to come out here on the sprockets -- on these
11 spokes, I mean. I'm suffering over here; my kids, all
12 of us.

13 These fast resolutions that you pass in front
14 of City Council mean nothing. I stood there and
15 watched the Community Foundation get granted the
16 privilege to take all the money that's being donated
17 through this water crisis that's not coming down to
18 where we're at, from the county or whenever, it's not
19 reaching the residents. We're not getting jobs from
20 this.

21 You've got 81 people passing out water. They
22 give 28 million, Snyder said, not to mention what the
23 county got. When we passed that out, they had \$499,000
24 that they got to pass out water for one week. That was
25 three months ago. I wonder what it is now.

1 And, with that said, when the community
2 foundation has a list of monies that they are getting
3 from around the world, we go to ask them how much is
4 it, how do we know? We don't even know where it's
5 going. We don't even know how much it is. Why aren't
6 we being informed of this?

7 If you guys are going to run after City
8 Council, which you do -- I stood here for four hours --
9 six hours the other night to pass two million. You
10 guys give that away in one visit, 400,000. You forgave
11 Salem Housing. Did you forget that? 400,000, you
12 forgave a debt. You give away that. Would you give
13 away all our assets? You're going to tear down hubs.
14 All these things are supposed to be a tax base, through
15 the emergency manager, through Rick Snyder. Please,
16 you guys, it's killing us.

17 THE CHAIRPERSON: Did you express your
18 concerns at the meeting?

19 MR. PALLADINO: My concern is, first and
20 foremost, we don't know what the Community Foundation
21 is getting. And why are they the only organization
22 that's getting it? I mean, you know, they're nonprofit
23 and everybody else is exempt. Even when they're
24 getting opus from the Land Bank to approve the Master
25 Plan, the streetlight assessment that was put on us, I

1 have seven lots, I paid for the towers.

2 I can't even walk by there now. I worked for
3 The Journal and watched them take that building and
4 turn it into a Farmers Market where an apple cost you
5 \$6. What's wrong with you people? Serious, you aren't
6 even thinking of the residents. I stood here for two
7 years now doing this, 15 in total. You need to
8 consider us. We are the spoke. The hub is built.

9 As far as Capital Theatre, you know and I
10 know, it's coming from Whiting, it's coming from the
11 Mott Foundation. I don't mind all that but spread the
12 wealth.

13 THE CHAIRPERSON: Mr. Cline?

14 MR. CLINE: No other individuals.

15 MR. PALLADINO: Give me a tax freeze, sir.
16 Give me a tax freeze. I've been a resident for 54
17 years. It's ridiculous.

18 THE CHAIRPERSON: Is there any further
19 business before this Board this afternoon?

20 No?

21 MR. FINNEY: Now, Mr. Chairman, I do have a
22 couple comments.

23 THE CHAIRPERSON: Yes.

24 MR. FINNEY: I certainly appreciate the
25 comments that were shared by each one of the residents

1 who came forward to communicate with this group. I do
2 think it's important to understand that there is -- you
3 know, there's a couple major things that has to happen
4 here in the City of Flint, going forward.

5 The first, of course, is solving the water
6 crisis. I think we all understand that that has to get
7 resolved and I trust that there is now enough momentum
8 behind the effort, particularly with all the actions
9 that the Mayor and the Governor are taking, that we
10 will get the water problem resolved.

11 The second major thing I think that has to
12 happen is I think we have to have economic recovery for
13 Flint. I grew up in Flint in the '50s and '60s and I
14 vividly remember just how robust the City of Flint's
15 economy was during that time. And I remember taking
16 the bus down Industrial Street, coming to downtown and
17 the Downtown Sidewalk Days and all the other things
18 that happened back in those days. And it's -- it would
19 be exciting to get back to that here in Flint.

20 And so we have to also focus some of our time
21 and effort on the economic recovery of the City. And
22 the two compete for resources, no doubt about it.
23 Obviously, we have to have water and a lot of resources
24 are being directed toward that.

25 And I think, in addition to the resources

1 that are being placed in projects like the ones that
2 were mentioned where there's the Capital Theatre, the
3 Farmers Market or others, there is still a need for a
4 dramatic amount of additional resources to help with
5 the economic recovery. And that will, in fact, I
6 think, help all the citizens of the City of Flint in
7 return.

8 Because, if we get an economic recovery,
9 we'll also see property values increasing and
10 everything else. That should help everybody overall.
11 So, you know, jobs and economic recovery, I think, is a
12 very important aspect that we all need to keep in mind
13 but certainly not more important than fixing the water
14 problem but it is another important piece that has to
15 come together so that, when this thing is all done,
16 when the water crisis is beyond us -- and I don't know
17 what the timeframe is for that -- but we will also have
18 vibrant economic and thriving community as well.

19 MR. PALLADINO: 360 residents now are gone or
20 dying, Man. I can't believe this.

21 THE CHAIRPERSON: I'll echo Mr. Finney's
22 point. Mr. Palladino and others --

23 MR. PALLADINO: It just hurts.

24 THE CHAIRPERSON: -- we're not unsympathetic
25 to any comments that may be made. But I do think it's

1 important to realize, as we say at almost every
2 meeting, that we're not the City Council so we play a
3 different role. One reason why our meetings probably
4 proceed more quickly.

5 And, by the time issues get to us, either
6 items undertaken by the Mayor or by the City Council,
7 it's typically fairly easy for us to proceed because
8 the main discussion has already taken place at City
9 Council meetings or elsewhere. And the issues are
10 fairly clear-cut for us as to whether or not to approve
11 or not approve a particular resolution.

12 So we will continue to provide anybody from
13 the public who wishes to address us a professional
14 courteous hearing. We may not proceed with disposing
15 of any particular issue that may be on your mind
16 because it may be beyond our purview.

17 As an RTAB, I don't want you to think that
18 we're not at least listening or that we're not
19 sympathetic to your points of view. If appropriate, we
20 may forward concerns that we might have on what we
21 think is an appropriate forum to address that.

22 But, again, our role is not to operate the
23 City day-to-day or make administrative or operational
24 decisions; those really are up to the Mayor and the
25 City Council. And I'm not suggesting we haven't

1 expressed points of view in those forums.

2 But I will continue to encourage you to do so
3 in the future.

4 MR. PALLADINO: If I may?

5 THE CHAIRPERSON: Yes.

6 MR. PALLADINO: I've seen you guys make the
7 final statement even after everything's been done and
8 said, i.e. these two buildings. I am sitting in a tax
9 realty investment and it's not just because of water,
10 it's because of bad county and city workings and -- and
11 I've bumped my head everywhere, sir. And I'm
12 frustrated watching this money just get blown off, and
13 you guys did that.

14 So, for you to say you have no role and
15 nothing to do with this, you do have the final say; we
16 know this. And, until you guys are gone, you're going
17 to keep hearing from residents that are not happy. I
18 am not the Mott Foundation. God bless it they're here.
19 But this trickle-down system, you know and I know it
20 stops.

21 So I appreciate you listening to us. I would
22 love to get some action or even a reaction because
23 everything I've come to you in the last six years has
24 been moot. I am that loud-mouthed man, I don't intend
25 to be. I believe from my heart, you know, the

1 scripture's right, I just haven't seen it. And I
2 appreciate you even listening. Thank you.

3 THE CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Is there any
4 further business?

5 Is there a motion we adjourn?

6 MR. FERGUSON: So support.

7 MR. FINNEY: Support.

8 THE CHAIRPERSON: Without objection, we're
9 adjourned. Thank you.

10 (Meeting was concluded at 2:35 p.m.)

11 * * * *

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

I, Mona Storm, do hereby certify that I have recorded stenographically the proceedings had and testimony taken in the meeting, at the time and place hereinbefore set forth, and I do further certify that the foregoing transcript, consisting of (26) pages, is a true and correct transcript of my said stenographic notes.

Date

Mona Storm
CSR-4460

APPROVED - 4-13-16