City of Hamtramck

Receivership Transition Advisory Board Meeting Minutes

Tuesday, February 27th, 2018

Hamtramck City Hall

Council Chambers - 2nd floor

3401 Evaline

Hamtramck, Michigan 48212

**RTAB MEMBERS PRESENT:** 

DEBORAH ROBERTS KAREN YOUNG MARK STEMA

ALSO PRESENT:

R. ERIC CLINE Michigan Department of Treasury

Reported by: NINA LUNSFORD (CER 4539) Modern Court Reporting & Video, LLC SCAO FIRM NO. 08228 101-A North Lewis Street Saline, Michigan 48176 (734) 429-9143/nel

1 Called to order at 1:00 p.m. 2 Tuesday, February 27, 2018 3 MS. ROBERTS: Good afternoon. It is 1:00, on 4 5 Tuesday, February 27th, 2018, and I will call the City of 6 Hamtramck Receivership Transition Advisory Board meeting 7 to order. Mr. Cline, would you do roll call please? 8 9 MR. CLINE: Deb Roberts. 10 MS. ROBERTS: Here. 11 MR. CLINE: Mark Stema. 12 MR. STEMA: Here. 13 MR. CLINE: Karen Young. MS. YOUNG: Present. 14 15 MR. CLINE: And we do have a quorum. 16 Mr. Bogdan and Mr. McInerney both have excused 17 absences. 18 MS. ROBERTS: Thank you. 19 Just a reminder to the public, if anyone would 20 like to speak, please sign up at the podium. The first item on the agenda is approval of the 21 22 agenda. I would entertain a motion to approve the agenda 23 as presented. 24 Motion to approve. MR. STEMA: 25 MS. YOUNG: Second.

1 MS. ROBERTS: Any discussion? 2 (No response) MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor 3 4 say aye. 5 MR. STEMA: Aye. MS. YOUNG: Aye. 6 7 MS. ROBERTS: Aye. 8 Opposed, the same. 9 (No response) 10 MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries. 11 Next on the agenda is to approve the January 12 23rd, 2018, regular meeting RTAB minutes. I would 13 entertain a motion to approve the minutes as presented. 14 MR. STEMA: Motion to approve. MS. YOUNG: 15 Second. 16 MS. ROBERTS: Any discussion? 17 (No response) 18 MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor 19 say aye. 20 MR. STEMA: Aye. MS. YOUNG: Aye. 21 22 MS. ROBERTS: Aye. 23 Opposed, the same. 24 (No response) MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries. 25

1 Next on the agenda is public comment. Mr. 2 Cline, has anyone signed up for public comment? MR. CLINE: Yes, we have four individuals. 3 First one, Carrie. 4 5 MS. ROBERTS: As a reminder it's two minutes. 6 MS. LASLEY: Mm-hm. If it is true you are 7 leaving today, I ask why? Under your helm, we have been guided from a 8 9 government to an interim government with no foreseeable 10 expiration. Charter revision, it took two-and-a-half years last time. Denial of the current CM candidate was 11 12 inevitable. There is no reason to expect that this 13 council would accept any qualified candidate from a search process; they conducted their own search. 14 Took a car 15 accident to allow the votes for the search process to be 16 initiated this time; this, after rejected an unqualified candidate and ordered council to search, it still took 17 18 another two meetings. The majority of council has determined -- is 19 20 determined to -- that they want to appoint who they want. So if you leave, you should respect their decision, and 21 22 you should appoint Mr. Terzog or Ms. Angerer. Council is 23 going to do that tonight, or whenever you walk away 24 anyway. 25 Council has met the bar of competence that you

1 They attended meetings, they earned MML set for them. points; just forget all those vendettas that you had to 2 overturn that are going to be spent of taxpayer money. 3 They earned their points, they earned the right to make 4 5 that decision. 6 So, if you leave, please appoint Terzog or Ms. 7 Angerer, so that the residents at least have some peace and council can ride the coattails of their appointed one. 8 Not leaving? Please appoint a city manager 9 10 that's qualified, or we can sit around and let council try 11 and try and try, and it's just never going to happen; they 12 have made their decision. Thank you. 13 MR. CLINE: Bob. 14 MR. ZWOLAK: Good evening. 15 I guess maybe if I, final comments, if this is going to be our final meeting, is that I would really like 16 17 to deeply express my appreciation to the members of the 18 TAB board for the time they spent in helping to oversee 19 the financial. 20 As by the recommendation of our state treasurer, 21 I see that you have complied, fulfilled your duties and 22 obligations. Too bad you didn't have any more authority, 23 but that's the law. 24 In event, I'm here to say I'm sorry to see you 25 go, but again, I want to express my deep appreciation for

1 the time and what you've accomplished. Thank you. 2 THE BOARD: Thank you. 3 MR. CLINE: Andrea. 4 MS. KARPINSKI: Hello. I initially planned to 5 come to plead to you to not to leave. I think the status 6 of our city council is disgusting, with lack of a better 7 word. We clearly can't manage a city. Although our 8 finances may look good on paper, that's only because we 9 had the leadership of Katrina Powell and her department 10 heads and employees. I don't know; I'm just totally disgusted with 11 12 being on council. 13 I don't know. I guess, I too, appreciate what It's a thankless job. Just like city council. 14 you do. Ι 15 just think it's a mistake if the state leaves right now. 16 Thank you. 17 MR. CLINE: Bill? 18 MR. MEYER: Meyer? 19 MR. CLINE: Yes. 20 MR. MEYER: Yes, hello. My name's Bill Meyer. I'm with OneHamtramck organization which is dedicated to 21 22 fighting for social justice in the city. I actually came 23 here to ask you to set a timetable to leave the city, but 24 discovered you're leaving today. So I'm glad to see your 25 organization go; I'm not glad to see you individuals go,

of course. It's a different thing. It's just the board is a imposed board onto our democratic system here, and I think it's undemocratic to have a group imposed on us that make our decisions when we have local people who are elected to do that. I invite you to stay in town. If you already live here, move here, be part of us; that's great. Just the organization is what I'm against; the structure of the emergency manager and the TAB board. You did good work and I appreciate what you did while you were here and for volunteering to do this.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11 I want to remind you once again, that what you 12 see in this room here, the makeup of this room, is not the makeup of the city. It is -- the city is at least 66, two 13 thirds percent non-white, and the council is two thirds 14 15 non-white. They're not here. They're not being fairly represented, I feel, and that's what we're fighting for, 16 that there are very few, if none, of the elected official 17 18 -- of the employees of the city are non-white, which is a 19 very important factor we have to address, and those are 20 the social concerns we have, and they're not your 21 concerns; yours are financial, and I appreciate what you 22 did, and thank you for allowing me to speak to you. 23 MR. CLINE: Saad. MR. ALMASMARI: Hello, good afternoon, 24 25 everybody. Councilman Almasmari from Hamtramck.

Just want to appreciate your job. You guys have done a great job for Hamtramck. Thank you so much for doing that.

1

2

3

4

5

6

14

My colleague mentioned that she can't manage the city. If she can't, she can just resign. I think we believe in ourselves. I believe in my colleagues.

7 We're doing fine, the City of Hamtramck. We have a surplus in our general fund, 6.5 million. So if 8 9 you guys leave us, I think we're going to do good. We're 10 going to do great. If we need any help, definitely going 11 to be in touch, with our previous councilmembers, people 12 who work in the city. I think you're going to see some 13 amazing work in the future. Thank you so much.

MR. CLINE: No one else.

MS. ROBERTS: We have no old business before the
board, so we'll move to new business.

The first item on the -- under new business, is 17 18 resolutions from the city council organizational meeting 19 of January 2nd, 2018. I would entertain a motion to 20 approve, deny, or postpone ordinances and resolutions from the January 2nd, 2018, city council organization meeting. 21 22 MR. STEMA: Motion to approve. 23 MS. YOUNG: Second. 24 MS. ROBERTS: Any discussion? 25 (No response)

1 MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor 2 say aye. 3 MR. STEMA: Aye. 4 MS. YOUNG: Aye. 5 MS. ROBERTS: Aye. 6 Opposed, the same. 7 (No response) MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries. 8 9 Next on the agenda is resolutions from the 10 regular city council meeting of January 9th, 2018. Please note that we approved Resolution 2018-6 at our last board 11 12 I would entertain a motion to approve, deny, or meeting. 13 postpone remaining ordinances and resolutions from January 9th, 2018, regular city council meeting. 14 15 MS. YOUNG: Motion to approve. 16 MR. STEMA: Second it. MS. ROBERTS: Any discussion? 17 18 (No response) 19 MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor 20 say aye. MR. STEMA: 21 Ave. MS. YOUNG: 22 Aye. 23 MS. ROBERTS: Aye. 24 Opposed, the same. 25 (No response)

1 MS. ROBERTS: Next on the agenda is resolutions 2 from the regular city council meeting of January 23rd, 2018. I would entertain a motion to approve, deny, or 3 4 postpone ordinances and resolutions from the January 23rd 5 regular city council meeting. 6 MS. YOUNG: Motion to approve. 7 MR. STEMA: Second it. MS. ROBERTS: Any discussion? 8 9 (No response) 10 MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor 11 say aye. 12 MR. STEMA: Aye. 13 MS. YOUNG: Aye. 14 MS. ROBERTS: Aye. 15 Opposed, the same. 16 (No response) MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries. 17 18 Next on the agenda is resolutions from the 19 special city council meeting of February 5th, 2018. Ι 20 would entertain a motion to approve, deny, or postpone ordinances and resolutions from the February 5th, 2018, 21 22 special city council meeting. 23 MS. YOUNG: Motion to approve. 24 MR. STEMA: Second it. 25 MS. ROBERTS: Any discussion?

1 (No response) 2 MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor 3 say aye. 4 MR. STEMA: Aye. 5 MS. YOUNG: Aye. 6 MS. ROBERTS: Aye. 7 Opposed, the same. 8 (No response) 9 MS. ROBERTS: Next on the agenda is the claims 10 and accounts from the regular city council meeting draft minutes of February 12th, 2018. I would entertain a 11 12 motion to approve, deny, or postpone the claims and 13 accounts from the regular city council meeting draft 14 minutes of February 12th, 2018. 15 MS. YOUNG: Motion to approve. 16 MR. STEMA: Second it. 17 MS. ROBERTS: Any discussion? 18 (No response) 19 MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor 20 say aye. 21 MR. STEMA: Aye. 22 MS. YOUNG: Aye. 23 MS. ROBERTS: Aye. 24 Opposed, the same. 25 (No response)

1 MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries. 2 Next on the agenda would be approval of invoice register preapproved expenditures. I would entertain a 3 4 motion to approve, deny, or postpone the invoice register 5 of preapproved expenditures. 6 MR. STEMA: Motion to approve. 7 MS. YOUNG: Second. 8 MS. ROBERTS: Any discussion? 9 (No response) 10 MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor 11 say aye. 12 MR. STEMA: Aye. 13 MS. YOUNG: Aye. 14 MS. ROBERTS: Aye. 15 Opposed, the same. 16 (No response) MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries. 17 18 Next on the agenda is approval of budget to 19 actual and cash flow reports. Ms. Angerer, would you 20 please provide a summary of this item for the board? MS. ANGERER: Thank you. And I would call at 21 22 this time our chief financial officer, Susan Hendricks, to 23 give you an overview of that item. 24 MS. HENDRICKS: You have all the reports that 25 you've been getting from me for the past few months, plus

1 2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

one this time, and that is, we've added a cash balance report to our monthly reports.

Because our treasurer is going to be now beginning some investment activities, one of the things that you've just approved is a list of depository institutions so that we can start some investing. We did do one small investment in January, with Talmer Bank, which is the only we that we had available at the time, and it was only a 14 day CD, but it was \$271. So, that number is definitely going to be going up, and I wanted to make sure we had a report, to bring that in to you. So that's a new report, which did require that I modify the cash flow statement.

Historically, we had not been including funds 14 15 that the city held -- holds the funds in trust; biggest one being our property tax collection fund. 16 We weren't 17 including it in our cash flow summary, but I wanted to make sure it balanced with the investment summary, so I 18 19 did put it in there, even though it's not the city's 20 money, necessarily. So that's what the change is that you 21 see.

Other than that, we have a list that will be coming to council and TAB of budget adjustments for the current year. Happy to report that some of those are going to include increases to revenues, not just increases

1 to expenditures. So, I think we'll be real close to the 2 budget that had been approved for this year. We also begin meeting next week with council at 3 4 budget workshops for next year's budget. So we've got 5 those close to ready to go to council, and we'll see what 6 happens with them from there. If there's any specific 7 questions on the revenue and expenditures, I'd be happy to 8 help you. 9 MS. ROBERTS: Thank you. 10 MS. HENDRICKS: Thank you. MS. ROBERTS: I would entertain a motion to 11 12 approve, deny, or postpone the budget to actual and cash 13 flow reports. 14 MS. YOUNG: Motion to approve. 15 MR. STEMA: Second it. 16 MS. ROBERTS: Any discussion? 17 (No response) 18 MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor 19 say aye. 20 MR. STEMA: Aye. MS. YOUNG: 21 Aye. 22 MS. ROBERTS: Aye. 23 Opposed, the same. 24 (No response) 25 MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries.

1 MS. ANGERER: Madam Chair, if I may? 2 I just wanted to point out to the TAB board and to those in attendance what an excellent job this chief 3 financial officer's been doing. We meet, if not daily, at 4 5 least four times a week, to go over the policies that we 6 have in the city currently, and make sure that we're doing 7 things in the appropriate way, and I appreciate the fact that the council has been getting thorough reports, you've 8 9 been getting thorough reports, and as you saw today, those 10 are expanding. That's part of the good work of not only 11 the treasurer, but the whole financial team, including 12 payroll, purchasing, et cetera, and I just want to commend 13 them today. 14 MS. ROBERTS: Thank you. Next on the agenda is 15 approval of Resolution 2018-10, Community Development 16 Block Grant funds for PY, prior year, 2018? MS. ANGERER: 17 Program year. 18 MS. ROBERTS: Program year, okay. I'm like, I 19 know appropriation years, I know fiscal years. 20 While action on this item occurred during a city council meeting outside the normal review period for 21 22 today's board meeting, the city manager is requesting to 23 bring this item forward for early review. City council 24 approved this item at their February 12th, 2018, meeting. 25 Ms. Angerer, would you please provide a summary

of this item for the board?

1

2

3

4

5

6

22

MS. ANGERER: Certainly, thank you.

And the annual allocation is determined by a formula, set forth by Wayne County. These are HUD funds that are distributed throughout the county. We anticipate being the recipient of \$213,143.

7 In addition to the required public hearings and public postings, there was also a community meeting held 8 9 this year, that was organized strictly by the community. 10 I did attend that meeting and shared the ideas that were 11 formulated there, as well with the county; we're required 12 to provide all of the public participation to the county. So our application was submitted as a draft prior to this. 13 If approved today, I will let them know that the RTAB did 14 15 approve this resolution.

The budget calls for continued involvement in code enforcement, but the general fund will be picking up part of that expense this year in our budget. Parks investment to continue cleanup of the city, and then there is an allowance for administration of the grant. And so that is the budget presented to you.

MS. ROBERTS: Okay, thank you.

I would entertain a motion to approve, deny, or
 postpone Resolution 2018-10, Community Development Block
 Grant.

1 MS. YOUNG: Motion to approve. 2 MR. STEMA: Second it. Any discussion? 3 MS. ROBERTS: 4 (No response) 5 MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor 6 say aye. 7 MR. STEMA: Aye. 8 MS. YOUNG: Aye. 9 MS. ROBERTS: Aye. 10 Opposed, the same. 11 (No response) 12 MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries. 13 Next on the agenda is approval of Resolution 2018-11, the 2018 poverty guidelines. While action on 14 15 this item occurred during a council meeting outside the 16 normal review period for today's board meeting, the city 17 manager is requesting to bring this item forward for early 18 review. 19 Ms. Angerer, would you please provide a summary 20 of this item for the board? MS. ANGERER: Certainly, and as the assessor 21 22 comes forward to answer any questions you might have, this 23 is something that's required by the Michigan Tax 24 Commission. We exceed the federal guidelines, and if you 25 have any questions, the city assessor, Jay Singh, is here,

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

23

24

25

to answer those.

MS. ROBERTS: Do you want to come up and give us an overview?

MR. SINGH: Hardship of property tax assistance is provided under state law, Section 211.7u(1). Under that, every local legislative elective body is supposed to draft a policy so as to administer it uniformly. So the starting line is that the federal guidelines for the income levels, under which a person can qualify for assistance. So the assistance is determined based on number of variable factors in case of each and every property owner that comes forth for.

13 So the City of Hamtramck has set up the poverty 14 guidelines is slightly higher than the minimum standards. 15 Just recognizing the fact that it's not been setting and 16 having ideas generally have -- plus also we have higher 17 tax rates in Hamtramck, so questions, and those who meet those basic guidelines, and then there is an asset test 18 19 also; so that assistance is provided mainly in case of 20 where a person has -- suffers a sudden and temporary 21 reduction in their financial situation, where they cannot 22 meet their obligations.

So, we have been drafting this policy since 2014, since I got here, so just to make sure that we administer this on a uniform and equitable manner.

1 MS. ROBERTS: Thank you. 2 Any questions? MR. STEMA: No. 3 I would entertain a motion to 4 MS. ROBERTS: approve, deny, or postpone Resolution 2018-11, 2018 5 Poverty Guidelines. 6 7 MS. YOUNG: Motion to approve. Second it. 8 MR. STEMA: 9 MS. ROBERTS: Any discussion? 10 (No response) 11 MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor 12 say aye. 13 MR. STEMA: Aye. 14 MS. YOUNG: Aye. 15 MS. ROBERTS: Aye. 16 Opposed, the same. 17 (No response) 18 MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries. Next on the agenda is approval of the citywide 19 overtime report. 20 Ms. Angerer, would you like to provide a summary 21 22 of the progress the city's making on this issue? 23 MS. ANGERER: Certainly. 24 And, as you review the overtime report, that 25 both chiefs are here, as well as the director of building

and grounds; what's listed on this is actually our department of public services, if you'd like them to come to the podium.

1

2

3

You can see that we do have an increase in the 4 5 overtime due to snow removal this month, and hopefully 6 that will not appear on the next report. But we continue 7 to chip away at the police and fire, you know, you 8 remember in past months hearing that we had an individual 9 that was out on leave, and so we've, did temporary 10 promotions so that we don't have as high of an overtime 11 count in the fire department, and that we're still doing 12 training of new officers in police, so you're going to see 13 some overtime until those officers are able to be on the road, on their own. 14

15 So at this point it's steady, but we are 16 watching it closely. And if you have any specific 17 questions for department heads, they'll come forward. 18 Thank you. 19 MS. ROBERTS: Thank you. 20 I would entertain a motion to approve, deny, or 21 postpone the citywide overtime report. 22 MS. YOUNG: Motion to approve. 23 MR. STEMA: Second it. 24 MS. ROBERTS: Any discussion? 25 (No response)

1 MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor 2 say aye. 3 MR. STEMA: Aye. 4 MS. YOUNG: Aye. 5 MS. ROBERTS: Aye. 6 Opposed, the same. 7 (No response) MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries. 8 Next on the agenda, we have the district court 9 10 report for the month; that does not require anything. Did anybody have any questions on that? 11 12 MS. YOUNG: Uh-uh. 13 MS. ROBERTS: Okay. 14 Next agenda item is approval to hire a part time 15 police dispatcher. 16 Ms. Angerer, would you please provide a summary of this item for the board? 17 18 MS. ANGERER: Certainly. And I'll bring the police chief up for that one. But as we always do, the 19 20 background checks are complete, the interviews were completed, and this is a budgeted item. 21 22 MS. MOISE: Second that. Everything is, yeah, 23 Mark Collins has been interviewed, successfully completed 24 the background. And it's a part time position with no 25 fringe benefits, maximum of 29 hours per week. And it is

1 within the budget. 2 MS. ROBERTS: Does this get us to full? MS. MOISE: 3 No. 4 MR. STEMA: Someday, right? 5 MS. MOISE: Someday, hopefully. 6 MS. ROBERTS: Anybody have any questions? 7 (No response) 8 MS. MOISE: Thank you. 9 MS. ROBERTS: Thank you. 10 I would entertain a motion to approve, deny, or 11 postpone hiring of one part time police dispatcher. 12 MR. STEMA: Motion to approve. 13 MS. YOUNG: Second. 14 MS. ROBERTS: Any discussion? 15 (No response) 16 MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor 17 say aye. 18 MR. STEMA: Aye. 19 MS. YOUNG: Aye. 20 MS. ROBERTS: Aye. Opposed, the same. 21 22 (No response) 23 MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries. 24 Next on the agenda is RTAB Resolution 2018-1. 25 Since the appointment of the RTAB, the City of Hamtramck

has increased operational efficiencies and improved its financial stability.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

25

The mayor and the members of the city council are experienced officials, and the appointment of an acting city manager is providing stable and solid administrative leadership. Sound financial management is being practiced by the new city controller, and improvements to the city's internal financial management policies and practices are underway.

The city's 2017 audit was submitted timely and without issues, and shows that the city ended its 2017 fiscal year with a general fund balance of 6.5 million. As such, it has been recommended that the RTAB be dissolved, and so we have a resolution before us that would do that.

So the first step in doing that is for the RTAB 16 17 members to approve this resolution; it will be presented 18 to the governor. The governor, with his consensus, the 19 treasurer can then dissolve the RTAB. So that's kind of 20 the -- the steps. The first step is our resolution, so I 21 would entertain a motion to approve, deny, or postpone RTAB Resolution 2018-1. 22 23 MR. STEMA: Motion to approve. 24 MS. YOUNG: Second.

MS. ROBERTS: Any discussion?

1 MR. STEMA: I would just like to say one thing. I appreciate everybody's comments, but unfortunately the 2 power that this board was given can't fix the issues this 3 city currently has. And really this board, unfortunately, 4 5 cannot fix those problems, and that's the only reason I'm voting yes, and that for it -- it's not that I think the 6 7 city is being run great and everything there. The issues that you currently have as a city, we don't have the power 8 9 to correct that. 10 So unfortunately, while I appreciate everybody's 11 passion that they gave, and would like us to stay, there's 12 really no more value this board can add. So, thank you. 13 MS. ROBERTS: Okay, the motion before us is to approve Resolution 2018-1. All those in favor say aye. 14 15 MR. STEMA: Aye. MS. YOUNG: Aye. 16 17 MS. ROBERTS: Aye. 18 Opposed, the same. 19 (No response) 20 MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries. 21 Next on the agenda is board comment. Anybody --22 Karen, do you have any comments? 23 MS. YOUNG: No comment. 24 MS. ROBERTS: I would just like to thank my 25 fellow board members. It's been a pleasure serving with

1	you. I'd also like to thank the Hamtramck employees and
2	residents. It's been a pleasure to serve on this board,
3	but our time is done.
4	And with that, I will adjourn the meeting.
5	Thank you all.
6	(At 1:23 p.m., proceedings concluded; off the
7	record.
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

1	STATE OF MICHIGAN
2	COUNTY OF WASHTENAW ).ss
3	
4	
5	
б	
7	I certify that this transcript is a complete, true, and
8	correct transcript to the best of my ability of the RTAB
9	meeting held on February 27th, 2018, City of Hamtramck. I
10	also certify that I am not a relative or employee of the
11	parties involved and have no financial interest in this case.
12	
13	
14	
15	RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED: March 6th, 2018
16	s/Amy Shankleton-Novess
17	
18	Amy Shankleton-Novess (CER 0838)
19	Certified Electronic Reporter
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	