City of Lincoln Park

Receivership Transition Advisory Board Meeting Minutes

Tuesday, May 17, 2016

Lincoln Park City Hall

Council Chambers

1355 Southfield Road

Lincoln Park, Michigan 48146

RTAB MEMBERS PRESENT:
KEVIN BONDS, CHAIR
JOHN ZECH
BRANDEN DUNLEAVY
JESSICA THOMAS
GENELLE ALLEN

ALSO PRESENT: MATT COPPLER, City Manager

DREW VAN DE GRIFT Michigan Department of Treasury

Reported by:
Nina Lunsford (CER 4539)
Modern Court Reporting & Video, LLC
SCAO FIRM NO. 08228
101-A North Lewis Street
Saline, Michigan 48176
(734) 429-9143/krs-ajsn

1	Tuesday, May 17, 2016
2	Lincoln Park, Michigan
3	* * * *
4	CALLED TO ORDER AT 1:00 p.m.
5	MR. BONDS: Let's call this meeting to order, and
6	we'll begin with roll call.
7	MR. VAN de GRIFT: Genelle Allen.
8	(No response.)
9	MR. VAN de GRIFT: Absent.
10	Kevin Bonds?
11	MR. BONDS: Here.
12	MR. VAN de GRIFT: Branden Dunleavy.
13	MR. DUNLEAVY: Here.
14	MR. VAN de GRIFT: Jessica Thomas.
15	MS. THOMAS: Here.
16	MR. VAN de GRIFT: John Zech.
17	MR. ZECH: Here.
18	MR. VAN de GRIFT: A quorum is present.
19	MR. BONDS: All right. I will entertain a motion
20	to approve the agenda as presented.
21	However, before us we have an additional item
22	which is the certified copy of Resolution 2016-128 that we
23	need to add.
24	MS. THOMAS: I will make a motion to add the
25	Resolution 2016-128 to the agenda.

1	MR. BONDS: A motion has been made. Is there a
2	second?
3	MR. DUNLEAVY: I second.
4	MR. BONDS: Any further discussion?
5	(No response.)
6	MR. BONDS: Hearing none, all those in favor
7	signify by stating aye. Aye.
8	MR. ZECH: Aye.
9	MS. THOMAS: Aye.
10	MR. BONDS: Any opposed?
11	(No response.)
12	MR. BONDS: Hearing none, motion passes.
13	Just a friendly reminder, public must sign up to
14	speak during the public comment portion of the meeting.
15	Okay, we're going to move right to Item C, which
16	is the approval of RTAB minutes. This is from the regular
17	meeting of April 19, 2016, which is Attachment 1 in your
18	packs.
19	The chair will entertain a motion to approve the
20	April 19th, 2016 RTAB minutes as presented.
21	MR. ZECH: I make a motion that we approve them.
22	MR. DUNLEAVY: Second.
23	MR. BONDS: The motion has been made and properly
24	seconded. Any discussion on that motion?
25	(No response.)

```
MR. BONDS: Hearing none, all those in favor
 1
 2
         signify by stating aye?
                  MR. ZECH: Aye.
 3
                  MS. THOMAS: Aye.
 4
 5
                  MR. DUNLEAVY: Aye.
 6
                  MR. BONDS: Aye.
 7
                  No opposed; motion passes.
                  Old business.
 8
 9
                  MR. DUNLEAVY: Oh, I think special meeting.
10
                  MR. BONDS: Oops. My apologies. I should say
11
         old eyes.
12
                  All right, the Item 2 is special meeting of April
13
         26, 2016, which is Attachment 2 in your packets. The
14
         chair will entertain a motion to approve the April 26,
15
         2016 RTAB minutes as presented.
16
                  MR. DUNLEAVY: Motion to approve.
17
                  MR. BONDS: Motion has been properly made.
                                                                Ιs
18
         there a second?
19
                  MR. ZECH: Support.
20
                  MR. BONDS: And supported.
21
                  Any further discussion to the motion?
22
                  (No response.)
23
                  MR. BONDS: Hearing none, all those signify by
24
         stating aye.
25
                  MR. ZECH: Aye.
```

1	MS. THOMAS: Aye.
2	MR. DUNLEAVY: Aye.
3	MR. BONDS: Aye.
4	And no opposed.
5	All right, now we are down to old business, which
6	is the budget update. And at this time we'll ask Mr.
7	Coppler to please provide the update for the board,
8	please.
9	MR. COPPLER: Good afternoon.
10	MR. BONDS: Good afternoon.
11	MR. COPPLER: So we had our public hearing last
12	night on the budget, the requested budget. We had a few
13	people speak during the public hearing. Council has set
14	meetings for next Monday, the 23rd and the 24th, Tuesday.
15	So our anticipation is we'll have the budget adopted
16	through the council process by the 24th, which will allow
17	us to get it into your hands according to Order 60 thirty
18	days prior to the beginning of the fiscal year.
19	MR. BONDS: Okay.
20	Any questions by any members of the board?
21	(No response.)
22	MR. BONDS: Hearing none thank you, Mr.
23	Coppler.
24	We're going to move on to new business. And why
25	don't we, if it's okay

1	MR. ZECH: Mr. Coppler?
2	MR. BONDS: Yes, sir.
3	MR. ZECH: Just one second. I kind of lost my
4	train of thought there.
5	MR. BONDS: Yes, sir.
6	MR. ZECH: Did you give us the dates of the
7	public hearings, Matt? Please?
8	You said there's two public hearings on the
9	budget?
10	MR. COPPLER: No, there's just one public hearing
11	on the budget; that was last night. So May 16th was the
12	public hearing.
13	MR. ZECH: Okay, and then it comes up for
14	approval when?
15	MR. COPPLER: We're going to have a meeting on
16	the 23rd with council to discuss any of the amendments and
17	changes that they're going to recommend.
18	MR. ZECH: Okay.
19	MR. COPPLER: And then May 24th, which is Tuesday
20	of next week council will be, if everything goes right,
21	voting to approve that.
22	MR. ZECH: Okay.
23	MR. BONDS: All right.
24	MR. ZECH: Thank you very much.
25	MR. BONDS: Thank you.

1	Okay, so Item 3, which is new business, or
2	Section 3.
3	MR. DUNLEAVY: A point of order?
4	MR. BONDS: Yes, sir.
5	MR. DUNLEAVY: Do we need to recognize that we've
6	been joined?
7	MR. BONDS: Absolutely.
8	(At this time, Board Member Allen present)
9	MR. DUNLEAVY: Okay. Welcome Board Member Allen.
10	MS. ALLEN: Thank you.
11	MR. DUNLEAVY: Thank you.
12	MR. BONDS: We now have a full board quorum.
13	Thank you very much.
14	So on the new business, in this section we're
15	going to add the Resolution 2016-128 following Item 3 in
16	the section. So we'll start off with the approval of
17	Resolutions and ordinances for city council meetings.
18	The first item is the Resolution from the regular
19	city council meeting of April 4th, 2016, which is
20	Attachment 3 in your packet. The chair will entertain a
21	motion to approve all Resolutions from the April 4, 2016
22	regular city council meeting.
23	MR. ZECH: I move approval.
24	MR. DUNLEAVY: Second.
25	MR. BONDS: It's been properly made and seconded

1	second.
2	Any further discussion on the motion?
3	(No response.)
4	MR. BONDS: Hearing none, all those in favor say
5	signify by stating aye.
6	MS. THOMAS: Aye.
7	MR. DUNLEAVY: Aye.
8	MR. ZECH: Aye.
9	MS. ALLEN: Aye.
10	MR. BONDS: Any opposed?
11	(No response.)
12	MR. BONDS: Hearing none, motion passes.
13	Number 2, which is a Resolution from the regular
14	city council meeting of April 18, 2016, which is
15	Attachment 4 in your packet. The chair will entertain a
16	motion to approve all Resolutions from the April 18, 2016
17	regular city council meeting.
18	MS. ALLEN: So moved.
19	MS. THOMAS: Support.
20	MR. BONDS: Properly moved and second.
21	Any discussion on the motion?
22	(No response.)
23	MR. BONDS: Hearing none, all those in favor
24	signify by stating aye.
25	MR. DUNLEAVY: Aye.

MS. THOMAS: Aye. 1 MS. ALLEN: 2 Aye. MR. BONDS: Aye. 3 MR. ZECH: 4 Aye. 5 MR. BONDS: Hearing no opposed, motion passes. 6 Resolutions from the special city council meeting 7 of April 25th, I believe that should be 2016. MR. DUNLEAVY: Uh-huh. 8 MR. BONDS: Which is Attachment 5. The board 9 10 took action on the items for this council meeting last 11 month, therefore no action items is necessary. 12 So let's move to the walk on, which is Resolution 13 2016-128 before you. And Mr. Coppler, do you want to give 14 us a quick summary on this? 15 MR. COPPLER: Yeah, this is actually going to be 16 in place of Item Number 1 under city manager items, which 17 is the budget amendment moving money from the police 18 budget under their computer equipment to the capital 19 expenditures to allow us to purchase an animal control 20 vehicle. 21 As I think I've said in the past, we've had very 22 bad luck with the equipment, one being age and two just 23 not lasting more than, you know, what is it, 15 years I 24 They just don't make them like they used to. But quess.

what we realized after the fact after it was adopted that

25

1	we picked up the wrong number. We picked up what was in
2	the proposed budget rather than what is in the existing
3	budget. So those numbers were incorrect and wouldn't
4	allow us to undertake another purchase that we needed to
5	take through the computer, a line item, which you'll be
6	seeing next month. So we went back to council last night.
7	They repealed the original amendment and replaced it with
8	the one that's in front of you.
9	MR. BONDS: All right. The chair will entertain
10	a motion to approve Resolution 2016-128, which this
11	Resolution repeals the Resolution dated May 2nd, 2016, and
12	a substitute is followed with the correct budget
13	information and the proposed budget amendment.
14	MR. DUNLEAVY: Question.
15	MR. BONDS: Yes, sir?
16	MR. DUNLEAVY: Just a question
17	MR. BONDS: Go ahead. We don't have a motion so
18	
19	MR. DUNLEAVY: Okay, motion to approve and
20	discuss.
21	MR. ZECH: Support.
22	MR. BONDS: Okay, and supported.
23	The discussion?
24	MR. DUNLEAVY: Just a quick question. Was it
25	your computer system that wouldn't allow the transaction?
	f 1

I mean do you have controls built into this system that 1 when you say it wouldn't allow it, I mean were their 2 3 controls that caught this? MR. COPPLER: No, because -- because the numbers 4 5 were picked up wrong, so the -- we have a grant through 6 the justice assistance funding program from Department of 7 Justice that allows us -- through that we can buy computers, and the chief was planning on purchasing three 8 9 computers through that grant for this year. And so 10 unfortunately because we picked up next year's numbers 11 there was about \$6,000 less in next year's numbers than 12 this year's numbers, so it wouldn't allow us to make that 13 -- that ultimate purchase we're going to be making next month when it comes here. So that's what kind of flagged 14 15 it that there was issues because of that request to make 16 those purchases. 17 MR. DUNLEAVY: Okay. So it would have just 18 thrown off the budget line item and --19 MR. COPPLER: Yeah, I mean because --20 MR. DUNLEAVY: -- that's how it was caught. 21 Okay, that was all I had on my question. 22 MR. COPPLER: Yeah, because of our processes --23 MR. DUNLEAVY: Yes. 24 MR. COPPLER: -- you know --25 MR. DUNLEAVY: Okay.

```
MR. COPPLER: -- they submit the request, not
 1
         enough money there; wait. There should be enough money
 2
         there. You go back and look and see what happened with
 3
         it.
 4
 5
                  MR. DUNLEAVY: Just the former auditor in me.
                                                                   Ι
         understand that.
 6
 7
                  MR. COPPLER: The process worked in that case.
                  MR. DUNLEAVY: Great.
                                          That's what I --
 8
 9
                  MR. COPPLER: Exactly the way it was supposed to.
10
                  MR. DUNLEAVY: That's what I wanted to recognize.
11
                  MR. COPPLER: Yes.
                  MR. BONDS: Any further discussion?
12
13
                   (No response.)
14
                  MR. BONDS: Hearing none, all those in favor
15
         signify by stating aye.
16
                  MR. ZECH: Aye.
17
                  MS. THOMAS: Aye.
18
                  MS. ALLEN:
                             Aye.
19
                  MR. DUNLEAVY:
                                 Aye.
20
                  MR. BONDS: Any opposed?
21
                  (No response.)
22
                  MR. BONDS: Hearing none, motion passes.
23
                  Thank you.
24
                  Moving on, moving right along to the city
25
         manager's Items which is Attachment 6 in your packet.
```

City manager's Item 1 and 2, while action on these items 1 occurred during a council meeting outside the normal 2 review period for today's board meeting, the city manager 3 is requesting to bring them forward for early review. 4 5 Items 1 and 2 have been approved by the city council at their May 2nd, 2016 council meeting. 6 7 So 1 we've just taken care of. So we're going to actually move down to Item two, which is the approval of 8 9 Resolution 2016-109, which is waiving bid and allow 10 purchase of 2016 Ford F-150 Super Cab Pick-up from the 11 state bid, which is Attachment 6b. 12 Mr. Coppler? 13 MR. COPPLER: Yeah, this is the companion to the 14 budget amendment. This authorized us not to go out to bid 15 but actually purchase the vehicle off the state bid. 16 MR. BONDS: Okay. 17 MR. DUNLEAVY: That, actually, the state has went 18 out on bid for these items. I just want to --19 MR. COPPLER: Yes. Yes. Yeah. 20 MR. DUNLEAVY: So the state isn't -- it isn't 21 like it's a waiver; it hasn't gone through some bid 22 process. 23 MR. COPPLER: Right, right. 24 MR. DUNLEAVY: What you're doing is you're 25 attaching on to the state's purchase order, if you will.

1	MR. COPPLER: Yeah.
2	MR. DUNLEAVY: And receiving whatever discount
3	they receive, correct?
4	MR. COPPLER: Correct. Yeah, the way that the
5	ordinances are written here within Lincoln Park to take
6	advantage of that purchasing consortium we have to waive
7	our bid requirement.
8	MR. DUNLEAVY: Okay.
9	MR. COPPLER: That allows us then to piggyback on
10	the state bid. But absolutely correct.
11	MR. DUNLEAVY: Well, I commend you on that,
12	because I actually wrote a report once that said the
13	county should look into this.
14	MR. BONDS: Well, you're on a roll today,
15	Branden. Fantastic. Thank you.
16	So is there
17	MS. ALLEN: I have a question.
18	MR. BONDS: Yes, ma'am.
19	MS. ALLEN: This is along the same lines. Is
20	this part of the state's cooperative purchasing program?
21	MR. COPPLER: Correct.
22	MS. ALLEN: Actually the county does use this
23	MR. ZECH: They read your memo.
24	MR. DUNLEAVY: They didn't when I was there.
25	Maybe they read my report.

1	MR. BONDS: Action and progress; like that.
2	So with that having been said, the chair will
3	entertain a motion to approve, deny, or post excuse me.
4	I'm jumping ahead of myself.
5	Entertain a motion to approve, deny, or postpone
6	Resolution 2016-109, which is waiving the bid and allow
7	purchase of the 2016 F-150 Super Cab from the state bid.
8	MR. DUNLEAVY: I move approval.
9	MR. BONDS: A motion has been moved for approval.
10	Is there a second?
11	MR. ZECH: Support.
12	MR. BONDS: And supported.
13	Any further discussion?
14	MR. ZECH: One quick question.
15	MR. BONDS: Yes, sir.
16	MR. ZECH: Mr. Coppler, is this fairly often that
17	you utilize the consortium, state bids on police cars, or
18	trucks or other things? Or is this kind of unusual?
19	MR. COPPLER: No, I think it's a practice that
20	the city's been doing for quite a while.
21	MR. ZECH: Okay.
22	MR. COPPLER: I'm not sure exactly when they put
23	that within their ordinance to be able to allow it, but
24	they've been taking advantage of it, and you're going to
25	see more of it coming up.

1	MR. ZECH: DUNLEAVY: Yeah.
2	MR. COPPLER: In future meetings.
3	MR. ZECH: I found that to be the best way to go
4	in my tenure as manager of Wayne because they had better
5	bids than we could get.
6	MR. BONDS: Any further discussion?
7	(No response.)
8	MR. BONDS: Okay, all those in favor signify by
9	stating aye.
10	MR. ZECH: Aye.
11	MS. ALLEN: Aye.
12	MR. DUNLEAVY: Aye.
13	MS. THOMAS: Aye.
14	MR. BONDS: Aye.
15	All those opposed?
16	(No response.)
17	MR. BONDS: Hearing none, motion passes. Thank
18	you.
19	Now we're going to move down to the, let's see.
20	We are at the city manager Items 3 through 9 which are
21	appointments which you will find as Attachment 6c in your
22	packet. And the chair is going to entertain a motion to
23	approve, deny, or postpone all of the appointments. And
24	as you see, we have, you know, the list that has not only
25	the department but also the individuals attached. So we'd

1	want to do it as a group.
2	MR. DUNLEAVY: Move approval.
3	MR. BONDS: It's been moved for approval. Is
4	there a second?
5	MS. ALLEN: Second.
6	MR. BONDS: And a second.
7	Any discussion on this motion?
8	(No response.)
9	MR. BONDS: Hearing none, all those in favor
10	signify by stating aye.
11	MR. ZECH: Aye.
12	MS. ALLEN: Aye.
13	MR. DUNLEAVY: Aye.
14	MS. THOMAS: Aye.
15	MR. BONDS: Aye.
16	Any opposed?
17	(No response.)
18	MR. BONDS: Hearing none, motion passes.
19	City manager Items 10 through 15. The following
20	reports have been received and filed, which is Budget-to-
21	Actual Report, cash flow on balance sheet, check
22	disbursement, the overtime report, tax collection and
23	timing of revenue report, and the monthly report.
24	These do not require a formal motion, but I think
25	I'll open it up for active discussion. Are there any

Τ	questions?
2	MS. THOMAS: I had a question. Yeah, I was just
3	reviewing it and overall when I look at the percent budget
4	used, pretty much everything is 100 or above. And
5	obviously we're not through to the year. What are, you
6	know, how are we addressing that or are we? When I look
7	at the numbers here.
8	MR. COPPLER: This would include the amendment,
9	right?
10	So there are a number that are at 100 percent,
11	and there's a few above; I wouldn't say all of them are.
12	MS. THOMAS: Okay.
13	MR. COPPLER: But I think, again, the ones that
14	are 100 percent are generally because we had gone through
15	and looked at it are the ones where we aren't anticipating
16	any additional expenditure.
17	MS. THOMAS: All right.
18	MR. COPPLER: I know there are a couple, or I'll
19	said a couple; I'm using city manager speak for a
20	couple, so it could be a lot from that perspective.
21	MS. THOMAS: Yeah, auditor speak is like, "A
22	couple? That's two."
23	MR. COPPLER: Right. Yeah. There are some.
24	There are some. Primarily they are in the benefit and/or
25	the salary line items, and so one of the issues with the

way that we split out, especially public works numbers, so that's I think, especially in the general fund where I see a lot of that, is they haven't, I mean, they just -- they put a number in there and then they start charging to it.

And, you know, if that employee is working more in buildings and grounds than in water and sewer, you're going to have that offset that needs to be adjusted later on. But, you know, we hopefully have corrected how we're doing that going forward so we won't have those issues, because we're going to be charging them to, you know, rather than do it on a daily, weekly, monthly basis, we're going to set up what that percentage charge is so it's already in the budget and we won't be able to exceed that.

MS. THOMAS: So you're automating the process in so many words so that it -- we will mitigate the risk of error.

MR. COPPLER: Yeah. You know, usually I would be wanting to do cost accounting to the N-th degree, but I think with, you know, the issues that we have it's better to try to set a budget that we're going to live within rather than, you know, go the full boat with the cost accounting on it.

MR. BONDS: Can I ask a quick question on, it would be, for the board members it would Attachment 6e, which actually is the balance sheet?

1	This balance sheet represents the period ending
2	April 30th, 2016, and I think that I want to make sure
3	that I'm reading this correctly, because when I get to,
4	like the first column which is general fund, which is fund
5	101, and we get down to the latter part where you start
6	with the total fund balance at six-thirty-fifteen, and the
7	figures there, where is is it can we adjust this so
8	that because this is the period ending April 30th, and
9	it will be moving forward, is there a way to put that date
10	next to the balance?
11	Because I'm assuming that the fund ending balance
12	for April 30th is reflected in the net. Or am I
13	misreading this?
14	MR. COPPLER: Yeah, where
15	MR. BONDS: Because I'm not seeing the current
16	values. You know, if I look at the June 30, '15, where is
17	the April 30th period reflected?
18	MR. COPPLER: So that is the ending fund balance,
19	so it's the third line. You have a beginning fund
20	balance.
21	MR. BONDS: Okay. Oh, the ending fund balance
22	MR. COPPLER: You have revenues
23	MR. BONDS: of 3.9?
24	MR. COPPLER: Yeah. So that and we're going
25	to update this so next month's we'll see the ending period

1	for that.
2	MR. BONDS: Okay. So we'll put it in, so what
3	will happen is the ending fund balance in parenthesis will
4	be that okay. Fantastic. Because I was having a
5	little difficulty in tying it all together.
6	Just, does everybody see what I was referring to?
7	MS. THOMAS: Uh-huh.
8	MR. ZECH: Uh-huh.
9	MR. BONDS: Okay. All right, thank you very
10	much.
11	MR. COPPLER: Sure.
12	MR. BONDS: I believe we had some open-ended
13	discussion, and I guess I'll be the one to bring it up
14	this time, is on the overtime report.
15	MR. ZECH: Uh-huh.
16	MR. BONDS: I think my question is with the
17	appointments that the board has approved today, and a
18	large share of those in the police department, which are
19	internal promotional opportunities, what's going to be
20	I mean what are we what's our plan with the overtime,
21	particularly in those larger line items?
22	Because those are things that, you know, can
23	either make or break the budget projections. What kind of
24	dialogue is happening at this stage?
25	MR. COPPLER: So the way it was set up with the

police, and this was under the Emergency Manager's tenure, was that he gave authorization to the police department for their what they call the SCAT, the set team which are actually drivers of court revenue and so it's actually the chief that provides the report to me and so we can get to you to show kind of the hours spent versus the fines that are — and fees that are coming and being generated by that work and so as the — well, when the emergency manager was here you know, his philosophy on that was as long as the revenue being generated by the overtime was in excess of the cost he was allowing that. And so that's kind of continued into this time period as well.

I think that may be a good thing to get to you to just have the police chief come in and explain how all that works because we look at that on a monthly basis.

MR. BONDS: Yeah, I think that would be very helpful because I know you've included it in the department reports but I think for me I'd like to see an updated report kind of the stats from the public protection area.

MR. COPPLER: Sure.

MR. BONDS: Number of calls, cases, things of that nature because I think that will help us, you know, frame that discussion.

MR. COPPER: And I think in looking at the

overtime although there is a certain amount of what I call you know, the staffing overtime, non-planned overtime I think that's something that the emergency manager kind of reduced a lot of it with some of the changes he made that affect the bargaining agreements in terms of leave time. So a lot of that was locked down in the area that was allowed to continue was in those planned SCAT or set traffic type of details as well.

MS. THOMAS: So -- if I may.

In response to some of the new hires because there's what, three, three or four. Are there any -- will they fall in the same category as trying to manage the overtime with the new hires as well? Are we paying attention to that as we bring people more on?

MR. COPPLER: I think, you know, the impact of the new hires and they're still a number of the new hires are still either in FTO or in the training mode so they're -- we're probably not seeing the benefit of those new hires for awhile put it that way. But the benefit is going to be in that unplanned type of overtime so and when I refer to the unplanned if there's sick leave or injury leave by individuals, vacation causing short staffing on different shifts so we're going to see less of that because these new bodies are coming on. But again, unless we change philosophy on those planned overtimes, you know

we're going to see a certain amount of that. And again, I think it's something that I know in talking with the emergency manager before he left we were going to keep on it to make sure that there was always going to be a positive revenue to that expenditure.

MS. THOMAS: So what's the, is it just a monthly report?

MR. COPPLER: Yeah, we get information from the courts that he then provides as an update in terms of here's our overtime, here's the court proceeds from that.

MS. THOMAS: Thank you.

MR. COPPLER: One other thing, so you know, in approving our ability to appoint as quickly as possible the sergeant, that is going to definitely you know, help us control the overtime because you know that sergeant actually left, this week is I think his last week. So we'll be able within a few weeks to have that appointment made. That type of thing would drive overtime if we didn't have the appropriate oversight on the shift. We'd have to, you know, bring someone in on overtime. So those type of things.

And then the other one, with the detective because of the backlog you know, some of the cases require immediate attention so that kind of drives some of our unplanned overtime as well and so now we'll have another

body working on that to hopefully reduce that. 1 MR. BONDS: Mr. Zech. 2 3 MR. ZECH: Mr. Coppler, thank you, Mr. Chairman. Mr. Coppler, just kind of a couple of questions about 4 5 police and fire? If I could? 6 MR. COPPLER: Sure. 7 MR. ZECH: You probably have told us this but and maybe it goes back to January and February and I'll have 8 already forgotten it, but in the police department how do 9 10 you work your shifts? Eight hour shifts, twelve? 11 MR. COPPLER: Twelve. Twelve. 12 MR. ZECH: Okay. So somebody who is supposed to 13 work a 12-hour shift and they call in sick, how do you -do you bring somebody in that's off duty or do you ask 14 15 people that are already on duty to work a little more to 16 kind of -- or do you bring somebody in earlier, somebody 17 stays later? How do you do that? 18 MR. COPPLER: It's going to depend what impact 19 that individual's going to have on the staffing of it. 20 Because there is a certain level that you know, we can 21 absorb maybe one or two people not coming in. But again, 22 I think it's probably a mix of both. 23 If they can't find someone that is able to work 24 that shift coming up or it happens right at the time you

know, like five minutes before the shift starts they're

25

1	probably going to ask someone to stay over or try to bring
2	the other shift person in a little bit earlier as well.
3	So.
4	MR. ZECH: Okay. So if somebody if
5	MR. COPPLER: I didn't realize that the chief is
6	here.
7	MR. ZECH: Oh.
8	MR. COPPLER: He probably can answer these
9	questions a lot better than I can.
10	MR. ZECH: I wrestled with this a little in my
11	time and I was curious as to how you're doing it and
12	hopefully you're doing it better than I do.
13	CHIEF WATTERS: So with our schedule it's kind of
14	confusing. We do work 12 hours but we work 7:00 in the
15	morning to 7:00 at night, and 7:00 at night to 7:00 in the
16	morning. But then we have like a power shift in between
17	that works 3:00 p.m. to 3:00 a.m. So we have minimum
18	manning.
19	MR. ZECH: Okay.
20	CHIEF WATTERS: So, as Mr. Coppler said it all
21	depends on; so if a guy calls in sick last minute on day
22	shift we only may need him for there may only be a
23	shortage for "X" amount of hours, eight hours because we
24	have somebody come in at 3:00.
25	MR. ZECH: Okay.

1	CHIEF WATTERS: So we can we'll do a call in
2	to try and get somebody that's off to come in for a few
3	hours or we'll just hold over somebody for four hours and
4	we can ask somebody to come in early for four hours. Or
5	we do have the opportunity to work short too for "X"
6	amount of hours.
7	MR. ZECH: Okay. Your union contract, if
8	somebody is working already and you ask them to stay,
9	they've already worked 12 but you ask them can you stay
10	four more hours versus somebody that's off duty that you
11	ask to come in to fill that 12-hour shift. Is there a
12	difference in what you pay in the way of overtime?
13	CHIEF WATTERS: No, same thing.
14	MR. ZECH: Same thing. So if somebody's home and
15	you can get them to come in, same hourly rate even though
16	it's overtime if somebody has to stay late?
17	CHIEF WATTERS: Correct.
18	MR. ZECH: Okay. Would you know, is that the way
19	it works in fire as well?
20	CHIEF WATTERS: That I don't know.
21	MR. ZECH: You don't know. Okay.
22	CHIEF WATTERS: I don't know. I think they're a
23	little different because their shifts are 24-hour shifts
24	and we're twelves.
25	MR. ZECH: Okay. I'm curious, without letting

out a city secret as far as crime fighting etcetera, roughly how many cars on the road do you have like through the course of the day?

approximately four between 7:00 in the morning and then 3:00 we'll get two more guys come in. So depending on right now we have a couple guys in training. Some of them have to double up so we could have up to six from 7:00 -- from although we have about four from 7:00 to 3:00 and then 3:00 to 7:00 right around 6:00 and then from our power shift stays on; our midnight -- or night shift comes on at 7:00 so we'll have another five cars so we'll have five cars from 7:00 at night until 3:00 in the morning and then we dropped out our minimal manning is only three guys.

MR. ZECH: Okay.

CHIEF WATTERS: So at that point it's either three cars or two guys -- or two cars depending on how long that person's been on, if he can work alone or not.

MR. ZECH: Okay. So when it comes to the overtime is that like for specific assignments if like you have somebody who's on a drug task force or someone who's doing traffic and writing speeding tickets or whatever, is that where your overtime goes or is it mostly just to cover having enough people on the road?

CHIEF WATTERS: No. A majority of our overtime right now is our SET which is our Selective Enforcement Traffic or our SCAT unit which is our undercover drug enforcement unit. And basically and I could show you -- provide you guys the numbers next month and I think you'll be amazed at the difference between what we pay out and what is brought in. And it's a very successful program both of them and what you -- not only does it bring in revenue which we're not supposed to say revenue for tickets but it is what is, that's what it does.

MR. ZECH: Right.

CHIEF WATTERS: And it also brings -- so it's tickets. We have booking fees. Every person that comes through our station pays a booking fee to be booked in and if their car is towed we have fees that go on those. There's all kinds of different things that we clocked off that kind of makes up for those. Also if it's a narcotic unit that brings in a car, if we seize that car we're getting approximately \$750 for each car if it's pushed off, if it's the first offense and it doubles and triples and goes on.

MR. ZECH: What I'm hearing here is and again I'm not trying to be smart here and all that, is this is very common amongst the tri-county area we'll say, police departments. Again, the fire chief isn't here but this is

1	fairly common where traffic and drug enforcement, narcotic
2	enforcement is where most of your police departments
3	whether it's little cities, big cities, medium cities find
4	themselves and the revenue issue is key.
5	CHIEF WATTERS: Uh-huh.
6	MR. ZECH: And if the revenue weren't there I
7	think you'd have to be in a situation where you'd have to
8	hold the overtime down?
9	CHIEF WATTERS: Yeah.
10	MR. ZECH: And all. But thank you for your
11	information.
12	MR. BONDS: Thank you.
13	MR. DUNLEAVY: Just so I understand, some of the
14	revenue or some of the overtime is a result of court time,
15	too, isn't that correct?
16	CHIEF WATTERS: Yes.
17	MR DUNLEAVY: Because somebody gets a ticket in
18	the afternoon, they have to appear in court whenever the
19	person is there?
20	CHIEF WATTERS: Occasionally, yes. So what we do
21	now is we set up our schedule, the officer's schedule,
22	send it over to the court so they make every attempt to
23	schedule their court during their working hours.
24	MR. DUNLEAVY: Okay.
25	CHIEF WATTERS: Occasionally, you know, the

midnight guys they're occasionally get court but it's been
limited down quite a bit.
MR. DUNLEAVY: The question I would have related
to this is and you can't answer it; it seems to me there
was some real improvement in overtime in the fire
department if you look at last year versus this year.
CHIEF WATTERS: Uh-huh.
MR. DULEAVY: Was that the result of changes in
contracts or
CHIEF WATTERS: Yes.
MR. DUNLEAVY: Okay.
CHIEF WATTERS: Yeah, it's a minimum manning
issues that they were changed.
MR. DUNLEAVY: Okay.
MR. ZECH: Perhaps at a future meeting the fire
chief could be present and we could speak with him a
little bit about his the way in which he or she
operates the department?
MR. COPPLER: Yeah. Definitely.
MR. BONDS: Thank you very much. Appreciate it.
I have another question.
MR. COPPLER: Sure.
MR. BONDS: I'm in the city of parks monthly
performance report and it's the treasurer section. Do you
get a I don't know, if the treasurer is here? Okay.

MR. COPPLER: Yeah. 1 MR. BONDS: If you could talk about the 2 collection process for delinquent property? Because I'm 3 4 looking -- I mean it looks like it's a challenge to say 5 the least what's delinquent and what's been collected as 6 of March 1st. Are they currently utilizing any third 7 party collection agency or is this all internal? MR. COPPLER: Yeah, I think right now it's all 8 internal. All those that know better than me, speak. 9 10 MS. GRIGGS: In general. I'll try not to 11 overstep. But they do go delinquent to the county as of 12 March 1st for real properties so those are being collected 13 by Wayne County now at this point but the personal 14 property the treasurer does collect in house. We don't 15 hire a third party at this point. 16 MR. ZECH: Mr. Chairman? 17 MR. BONDS: Yes, sir? 18 MR. ZECH: If I could comment. That's probably 19 something that you will have to take a look at, Mr. 20 Manager. I realize the treasurer is an elected position. 21 And we have to --you have to concern yourself with that. 22 And that the treasurer is a separate elected person and 23 but with the help of the city council and just looking at

the numbers here, the getting some outside help, you're

foregoing that and it will most of the communities have

24

25

had to go that route to try to get that number closer to 1 that zero. 2 MR. COPPLER: I don't know historically if the 3 city's every tried that or not. I know other places I've 4 5 been, you know, it is a difficult tax to collect. 6 MR. BONDS: Yeah. 7 MR. COPPLER: But again, if you know, you put the right people in place and I think, you know, Ms. Lulko who 8 is our treasurer, you know, has a lot of concern about 9 10 this as well and so I think she's been looking at different --11 12 MR. ZECH: I'm not suggesting that --13 MR. COPPLER: Yeah, no, -- just want to make sure 14 you know she's on our team so. 15 MR. ZECH: I hate to say it but sometimes when 16 you have the situation and you seize some personal 17 property that you're going to sell to cover what's owed by 18 the owner of that personal property it has a way of 19 circulating out within the community, "Oh, boy, the city 20 has now seized somebody's personal property" and people 21 suddenly get religion. 22 MR. COPPLER: I know the city clerk kind of 23 whispered in my ear that Ms. Lulko has done some 24 extraordinary-type collection where she actually goes on

site with police officers to help incentivize that.

25

1 MR. ZECH: Uh-huh. Uh-huh.

MR. COPPLER: She is here. If you want we can have her come up and address this anymore or we can have her at the next meeting.

MR. ZECH: I just look at that number and you know, and I think that perhaps -- I applaud her efforts. But perhaps she needs to or you and the rest need to think about putting full court press on to try and bring that number down.

MR. COPPLER: Sure.

MR. BONDS: Thank you. Appreciate that. You actually said exactly what my follow up was.

MR. ZECH: Okay.

MR. BONDS: I that you know, just to reiterate the RTAB and one of our top priorities is obviously in conjunction with the city government because I know that you all are doing as well which is looking at every possible revenues so that we make sure that we keep the budget projections on target and looking for relief where we can find it. And this seems to be up here a pocket a where as Board Member Zech has rightly so pointed out some due diligence could be applied. So we'll probably -- well not probably but at the next meeting if we could have, you know, kind of make sure the treasurer is present because we'd probably like to have an active discussion on this as

well.

MR. COPPLER: Sure.

MR. BONDS: I think I have one more question and again it's open to any of the other fellow board members.

On your report on page 16 and it's in the fire section I'm -- kind of want to -- if you could expand a little bit where the third bullet talks about the development of a billing process for the fire code enforcement team's activities?

MR. COPPLER: So one of the new initiatives that was put in place under the emergency manager is the inspection bureau. We have hired a part-time marshal to do inspections and actually have I believe six firefighters trained now in doing building inspections, fire inspections. We've -- they've slowly started doing that process and of course a part of all this is going to be the billing for those inspections. And, you know, right now trying to remember exactly where that discussion has been left but I think we're going to be doing it internally in the same manner that we're doing it I think through the building department to handle the building on that. I think it's more just from his perspective closing the loop on that to make sure everything's in place so we can start the billing once we get full swing.

MR. ZECH: Okay, so the billing is billing of

1	stat time against this or is this billing of outside
2	parties?
3	MR. COPPLER: Yes.
4	MR. ZECH: What does the term billing actually
5	mean?
6	MR. COPPLER: So we will have a fee for the fire
7	inspection and so that's what they were referring to so
8	we'll be billing the property owner for the inspection
9	that we'll be conducting on an annual basis.
10	MR. BONDS: Okay. So we'll be getting a new fee
11	schedule from the city?
12	MR. COPPLER: Correct. Well, I think actually we
13	bring - It's already
14	MR. BONDS: Oh, it's already built in?
15	MR. COPPLER: Yeah, it was already built in to
16	that. What I was thinking you were going to say and that
17	I anticipated was that you'll start seeing revenue coming
18	in from that, yeah.
19	MR. BONDS: Well I just want to make sure it was
20	in the fee schedule that we have been provided.
21	Yes, sir.
22	MR. ZECH: Mr. Chairman, thank you.
23	Mr. Copper, is the fire inspections done by the
24	fire marshal's etcetera, is the is there sort of a goal
25	of like you're going to visit every commercial building or

industrial building, like for every apartment complex or motel let's say, like once a year, every other year? Is there a program?

MR. COPPLER: Trying to remember exactly -- it's been a few months since I've talked about this. I think the intention is on a two-year cycle to have all the buildings -- I think that's the goal. It's probably going to take a few years to get there. You know this program we've actually hired the part-time inspector back in December so it's been a slow build up and that's why you really are not seeing a lot, if any, revenue coming in yet. His work's been more on the complaint basis. Maybe a couple preventative inspections. But we're going to see that as part of next year more.

MR. ZECH: And so is the getting to every other year inspection, is that a new goal? Or is an old goal that you're trying to meet?

MR. COPPLER: Well, I can't speak in whether it's an old goal or not but it's a goal that the fire department put in place for this program.

MR. ZECH: Does the city of Lincoln Park, do you when someone sells their home does it have to be certified before it can be passed to a new owner? A city inspection program for that?

MR. COPPLER: The city does require a pre-sell

inspection. It's just an exterior inspection. It's not 1 an interior inspection. 2 MR. ZECH: Okay. Is it being considered for it 3 to be an interior as well to have a plumber or electrical, 4 5 the furnace certified etcetera? 6 MR. COPPLER: I know I've thought about it. 7 have had some discussions with our building department about it but we haven't really got to the point where 8 9 we're looking to change the code yet on it. 10 MR. ZECH: Has that been discussed in the past 11 and it's been kind of passed over because of being 12 politically sensitive or didn't feel there was the 13 manpower to do it and why make it a program and not be 14 able to fulfill it? 15 MR. COPPLER: And there may be a council member 16 in here right now that I know have had a conversation 17 about this. But I think, you know, and actually there is 18 another council member I've talked to about this. You 19 know look to some of our neighbors. I think Wyandotte is one of the communities that does the full inspection upon 20 21 So I think there, you know, at the council level there's been discussion. And I can't speak to why the 22 23 code is the way it is. 24 MR. ZECH: Okay.

MR. COPPLER: Whether they've thought about it or

spoke about it in the past. I think it--

MR. ZECH: What about rentals? Like apartment complexes and/or a single family home that's a rental. Do you require them to be inspected on an every other year basis or do they have to register that it's a rental home for instance?

MR. COPPLER: We do have a rental registration program that also is -- requires an inspection to go along with that. I think, you know, the trouble we've had and the challenge we're having is getting a good handle on all the rentals. You know the more obvious ones are easy but you know, we're constantly finding new rentals that aren't registered within the system.

MR. ZECH: Yeah. That's a common issue.

Watching the water billing is a way and/or else watching who own -- what shows up on the role as far as who owns the place and then who comes in with the check to pay the water bill sometimes is an indicator of -- or water turn on and turn offs and new names. But it's difficult. Is there some concern amongst the council or amongst the staff of about this seems to be more and more single family homes are going to renter occupied and less single-and less owner occupied?

MR. COPPLER: Well, there is concern. I think we had that period probably from 2008 up until here very

recently where we've seen, you know, through the foreclosure process and you know, the sale by the county where you have large numbers of properties being bought by you know, a single individuals. And I think we're starting to turn that tide. Council also had a presentation of one the initiates that the emergency manager had was taking the first right of refusal foreclosures and conveyed those through an RFP process to a developer. And we had our first big report on that. I think the first 16 parcels that was acquired through that process are out for sale and most of them are under -- or pending right now to sell and he's getting a lot higher values than what they anticipated in that.

You know, if you give every one of those on the agreement I think the vast majority, I should say, are to be sold as single family. And it looks like based upon, you know, his investment which is averaging about \$27,000 per home and we're seeing the sale pending prices to be in the -- the, you know upper sixties to low eighties which are far above what the values were before this.

MR. ZECH: So the city of Allen Park does try to when the county offers property to it you do try to buy it and then either vacant land or occupied buildings or occupied homes and you try to buy it?

MR. COPPLER: Yeah, this first -- this past year

was the first time I believe that the city in the scale 1 that they did it, took the first right of refusal. And 2 it's something that based upon what we're hearing now 3 they're going to have to -- council will have to make a 4 5 decision whether to continue that program going forward. 6 But again, early returns, you know, in terms of the amount 7 of money that's being invested and they're averaging about \$27,000 investment per home, and overseeing in terms of 8 9 the sale price which is going to have a cumulative effect 10 on all the properties across the city especially when they 11 go to sell. And the fact that they're putting single 12 families back into them, they're not turning into rentals 13 like we saw over the last four or five years. I think 14 there's value in attempting to do that again.

MR. ZECH: So when you say first right of refusal so the city indicates to the county that if you can't sell this at the auction we will buy it?

MR. COPPLER: No, we --

MR. DUNLEAVY: What happens is the delinquent properties go back to the treasurer.

MR. ZECH: Uh-huh.

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

MR. DUNLEAVY: And the treasurer collects the money on behalf of it and also charges a fee. If the bills aren't paid and this isn't 100 percent exact, but if the bills aren't paid within a certain period of time it

turns the delinquency back over to the county. But what 1 it does it advances the city full collection of the money. 2 3 MR. ZECH: Sure. MR. DUNLEAVY: And then it credits back next year 4 5 for the ones it didn't collect and it allows the local 6 cities to budget a little bit better because they know the 7 revenue is coming in, not how the revenue is coming in. MR. ZECH: And then --8 9 MR. DUNLEAVY: The treasurer goes out and bonds 10 for that. 11 MR. ZECH: Yes. 12 MR. DUNLEAVY: What happens is once it goes into 13 delinquency the city has the first right of purchasing the 14 property or acquiring the property. If the city doesn't 15 wish to purchase the property then it goes on to the 16 county's auction. 17 MR. ZECH: To the auction. Okay. 18 We found and some of my -- some of the 19 neighboring communities around Wayne, we found it --20 because as Brendan was describing, of course you work with 21 the treasurer on getting the revenue etcetera. 22 found that taking a proactive approach and buying the 23 homes before they go to auction -- again, you have to 24 have somebody go out and take a look at them, you gotta

analyze whether they're occupied or not. And is the

occupant the person who's losing the house perhaps. Or is
it their tenant that's occupying it? Is it a vacant store
front? Is it a vacant tool and dye shop and what could be
maybe the ramifications of environmental issues. But we
found that it was to our advantage and we saw that in our
neighboring communities were doing that as well to try to
have the city become proactive in that because what was
going on here in Lincoln Park with the drop of housing
values and the foreclosures etcetera was going on all over
the place and the percentage of renter occupied was
growing in all the communities and it was creating some
difficulty in terms of appearance and maintenance of
properties and that's why it was so important to have a
rental inspection program. A registration program and an
inspection program because some of the people were buying
them were not very diligent about what they were doing
with the property and so you found a lot of complaints
from the people that were renting them. They would come
to the city and say I've contacted my landlord ten times
about this and I can't get any help and so you know,
you've got to instruct them to go to the court and deal
with it in court as far as putting their rent money in
escrow and it gets quite involved but I applaud what
you're doing and I would suggest that you might find that
going further what you're doing be more advantageous in

terms of pleasing to the residents and to the city council.

MR. COPPLER: I think again based upon the early you know, review of what's been going on I think council is hopefully impressed with what the developer has done thus far and sees the benefit of continuing that. From I guess the good side, you know, we've received some of the numbers on what we're looking at for the upcoming process and where we had about 89 to 90 homes last year, right now the number is about 60. So that number is declining a little bit. It's still early. You know June. When July comes around that number may bounce up if people haven't met their payment obligations in June. But it's a little bit you know, encouraging at this point.

MR. ZECH: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

MR. BONDS: Thank you. And thank you for the technical.

Yes, sir?

MR. DUNLEAVY: Just one other comment. In another life the city of Port Huron has a pretty active -- I used to audit the city of Port Huron. They have a pretty active program in trying to make sure property stays up and passes and also as a commercial I kind of always commend Wyandotte because they're militant on before a property is sold that it's up to code and that

everything's up to snuff and as a result I think 1 Wyandotte's a pretty solid community and the homes are 2 pretty solid also. 3 MR. COPPLER: Yeah, I think that's, the challenge 4 5 going forward is how to not just elevate the housing stock 6 but at least keep the housing stock at a certain and 7 level. MR. DUNLEAVY: That being Wyandotte would be a 8 9 good example. 10 MR. BONDS: Yeah, Wyandotte with its properties. MR. COPPLER: And I think that's where the full 11 12 inspection on a purchase is necessary. So. 13 MR. BONDS: Okay. Great discussions. And I feel 14 like I have driven all this. But I do have one more 15 revenue question and it's on page 18 of the police report. 16 And it's two-fold. One is on the value of narcotics 17 seized. For my own edification can you please help me to 18 understand how is value assessed and to which budget line 19 does this -- is this applicable? Because I'm looking at 20 the budget area of 305 in the police department and I'm 21 not seeing it unless it's rolled into either miscellaneous 22 or whatever. But if you can help me understand one, how 23 is the value assessed and then two, what budget line do 24 these monies fall into?

CHIEF WATTERS: So, the value we get from the

narcotics seizures would be from our push off vehicles, 1 our seized vehicles or seized money. 2 3 MR. BONDS: Okay. Okay. We just, you know --4 CHIEF WATTERS: So it's a combination of --5 MR. BONDS: We just, you know, it's not just 6 CHIEF WATTERS: 7 It's a whole different recipe of different things that we get from off the street. What we do, we'll go on 8 a search warrant and they'll hit -- they just recently I 9 10 think it was two weeks ago it was a grow operation, an 11 illegal grow operation. So there's the seizures that 12 they'll get from cash and then they'll get supplies used, 13 those type of things and those are later sold at auction 14 and those proceeds, too. But there's all kinds of 15 different proceeds. We'll get cash. Push off, 16 forfeiture, but that's all what it is. 17 MR. BONDS: Great. 18 And which budget line? Because I'm not seeing --19 I mean I'm probably seeing it, I just don't know. 20 I don't see a forfeiture line. 21 MS. GRIGGS: So there's actually a separate fund. 22 It's 265 is the fund number. 23 MR. BONDS: Oh, 265. 24 MS. GRIGGS: So it's going to be more back. So 25 that's where all the drug and forfeiture funds go.

MR. BONDS: 1 Okay. Thank you very much. 2 MS. GRIGGS: You're welcome. 3 MR. BONDS: Both of you. Thank you. 4 5 Any other questions from the board? 6 Thank you for those answers. 7 City administrator's report which is the look ahead memo which is attachment 7 of the packets. 8 9 MR. COPPLER: Real quick, we already talked about 10 the budget. The second thing is that you'll be seeing at 11 the next meeting quite a bit of activity relating to 12 public works. It'll be public works month next month. We 13 have the contracts or the awards for the road projects 14 coming in. As well as some of the items for the last 15 night in terms of purchase of equipment and vehicles. 16 MR. BONDS: Any questions? Yes, sir. 17 MR. ZECH: Thank you again, Mr. Chairman. 18 Mr. Coppler, I'm kind of curious. Earlier in the 19 agenda we -- there were approvals made of certain 20 individuals to be hired or promoted or whatever. Is it 21 the tradition of the city of Lincoln Park that the name be 22 shared with the council and with this board to say John 23 Doe or Mary Smith is being hired or promoted or changing 24 from this title to that title? Is that part of the

tradition or maybe in the ordinance about hiring that the

1	name is shared or is that something that you like to do
2	that was how, you know?
3	MR. COPPLER: I can't speak to the history
4	exactly how it was done but I think you know, depending
5	well, I can't I'm not even going to try to speak for
6	how it was done.
7	MR. ZECH: I know some communities have nepotism
8	rules in their charter or in their, we'll call it bylaws
9	and rules and so just to try to keep everybody on the up
L 0	and up they'll say the name realizing that, you know, it
1	could be an in-law of somebody and all that would get
12	thwarted. But I was just curious if it's required by your
L3	council or by your charter that the name of an individual
L 4	be stated?
15	MR. COPPLER: I don't know if there's any
L 6	requirement. I think it's something that I know in
L7	talking with different council members they like to be
L 8	aware of these type of actions
L 9	MR. ZECH: Okay.
20	MR. COPPLER: of the city so we're trying to
21	again, you know, provide them as we provide to you the
22	same information.
23	MR. ZECH: Yeah, okay.
24	MR. COPPLER: So they can see what
25	MR. ZECH: Because I know it's not a privacy

MR. COPPLER: It's all public record.

matter particularly.

1

2

25

MR. ZECH: It's all public and transparent and 3 all but I was just wondering about that because different 4 5 communities have different traditions. 6 Thank you, Mr. Chairman. 7 MR. BONDS: Thank you. MS. THOMAS: Mr. Coppler, I do just have one 8 9 quick question in regard to the forms that have been 10 submitted. You know, just out of curiosity as I read 11 through many of these it says "Budget neutral" but I guess 12 in theory if someone's moving from a part-time position to 13 a full-time position I quess I'm not following how that 14 would be budget neutral given that they are potentially 15 receiving benefits now at that point. Can you help 16 explain that or help me understand that? MR. COPPLER: Yeah. Yeah, I'll use that when we 17 18 already have that position. Not the person but the 19 position's already budgeted so if we have an authorization 20 for, you know, 40 police officers and we have a vacancy 21 you know, promoting one up from a part-time into a full-22 time position that's already been budgeted it would be 23 budget neutral. 24 MS. THOMAS: Okay. So you're going off FTEs?

MR. COPPLER: Yeah. So if we're creating a new

1	position, you know, that's not going to be a budget
2	neutral transaction. There's going to be an inactive.
3	That's where we would say, you know, for instance I think
4	for the detective, you know, there's you know,
5	historically there's been that position but what was
6	contemplated in the budget that the EM put in there, that
7	position wasn't in there. So even though we're not
8	increasing the number of FTEs in doing that, it is
9	increasing what the salary wage piece is for it but it
L 0	wouldn't impact the benefits in terms of the health care
L1	type of thing. So that's where you know, I think we've
L2	put in there that it's going to be about a \$4,000 increase
L3	because of that. So if it's budgeted it's going to be
L 4	budget-neutral from our perspective.
L5	MR. BONDS: Any other questions?
L 6	(No response)
L7	MR. BONDS: Hearing none, let's move into public
L8	comment please.
L 9	MR. VAN de GRIFT: City councilmember Kelsey.
20	COUNCILMEMBER KELSEY: Thank you.
21	Nice discussion. Have you hear the term
22	clawback, that the county uses? You're aware that we lose
23	money in them, am I correct?
24	UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Uh-huh.
25	COUNCILMEMBER KELSEY: Is anybody doing anything

about that? We're talking about that? We're talking about finances. We're talking about looking the money, you're talking about buying houses and all that. I mean that's a big -- when we went through the change in 2008 as well as everybody else, a lot of money was lost. A lot of water fund money was lost. It was not made up. The county took their share, we got absolutely nothing. Go ahead and comment. Is what I'm saying, it's just -- just so we're all on the same page here.

MR. ZECH: Well, clawback has several meanings. But I'm familiar with meanings in terms of tax abatement but I'm not sure I'm following this.

COUNCILMEMBER KELSEY: From what I understand is that the --

MR. BONDS: I'm sorry, this is not an open discussion.

COUNCILMEMBER KELSEY: I'm sorry. Then I've got three minutes so I'll go. What I understand and I'm calling the county now to understand from Andrio Condrevas (sic) which is the A.A. to Mr. Evans. Is what happens is that we lose or the house is lost to foreclosure. The city loses it to the county, the county turns around and sells it and they lose on it. They take their money, whatever they get. The water fund money that we throw on the taxes, we lose it. The tax money that's our portion

that goes to the city is lost. There's not ten cents on the dollar, there's not two cents on the dollar. Nothing. It's called a clawback. I talked to Paul Clement from the State House and he explained that to me, too. I guess that's common in Wayne County. I don't know about Oakland and all that.

The other comment I'd like to make is that you are aware and I know you read the papers as well as I do, is that the cities were sued for the issue of right of first refusal when they gave them to the person to do those house renewals. And it still went to court.

So the council was sued as well as the rest of the cities for doing that, okay?

And it still went to court to process to be determined whether that's legal or not. Okay.

So some of the stuff sounds great but on the receiving end where I sit out there just like you do. It's not all what it seems to be.

The last comment I'll make is that the Highland Park has not paid its water bill. And in the paper all the communities, suburban communities by court order back in 1995 or 1999, according to the paper we will all be assessed an amount of money for the non-payment of Highland Park and they're in a lawsuit with the state.

So some of these things, gentlemen, that are not

```
-- and ladies, are not in our control. Just so you
 1
         understand that. We are a small entity and I'm not giving
 2
         you a civics lesson but you know as well as I do we're a
 3
         small city that has a county and has a state that we
 4
 5
         interact with. And some things are not even in our
 6
         control for money so I would just wish you would keep that
 7
         in mind when you do things like that. There are other
         pieces to the puzzle and the need to be looked at besides
 8
 9
         what you look at here. And thank you for your time.
10
                  MR. VAN de GRIFT:
                                     That concludes public comment.
11
                  MR. BONDS: Okav.
                                     Board comments?
12
                  (No response.)
13
                  MR. BONDS: Any board comment?
14
                  (No response.)
15
                  MR. BONDS: Hearing none, is there a motion for
16
         adjournment?
17
                  MR. ZECH:
                             So moved.
18
                  MS. THOMAS: Support.
19
                  MR. BONDS: All those in favor signify by stating
20
         aye?
21
                  MR. ZECH: Aye.
22
                  MS. THOMAS: Aye.
23
                  MR. DUNLEAVY: Aye.
24
                  MR. BONDS: Aye. Good meeting. Thank you.
25
                  (At 2:00 p.m. meeting concluded.)
```

STATE OF MICHIGAN

COUNTY OF WASHTENAW).ss

I certify that this transcript is a complete, true, and correct transcript to the best of my ability of the RTAB meeting held on May 17, 2016 at the City of Lincoln Park. I also certify that I am not a relative or employee of the parties involved and have no financial interest in this case.

RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED:

May 27, 2016

s/Amy Shankleton-Novess

Amy Shankleton-Novess (CER 0838)

Certified Electronic Reporter