



RICK SNYDER
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MICHIGAN
DEPARTMENT OF TREASURY
LANSING

R. KEVIN CLINTON
STATE TREASURER

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE STATE TAX COMMISSION

***Holiday Inn Express and Okemos Conference Center,
Okemos A & B Rooms
2187 University Park Drive, Okemos, Michigan***

***Monday, October 13, 2014
9:00 a.m.***

***PRESENT: Douglas B. Roberts, Chair STC
Barry S. Simon, Member STC
W. Howard Morris, Member STC (Arrived at 9:07 a.m.)***

***Kelli Sobel, Executive Director
LaNiece Densteadt, Recording Secretary***

The item numbers referred to in the minutes correspond to the agenda items as numbered.

It was moved by Simon, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to adopt the minutes of August 26, 2014. (Item 1 on agenda)

It was moved by Simon, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved Bulletin 11 of 2014 Exemption of Partially Completed New Construction. (Item 2 on agenda)

It was moved by Simon, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved Bulletin 12 of 2014 Tax Calendar for 2015. (Item 3 on agenda)

It was moved by Simon, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to release Bulletin 13 of 2014 Inflation Rate Multiplier for 2015 and Bulletin 14 of 2014 Procedural Changes for 2015 once the final CPI information is available after October 22, 2014. (Item 4 and 5 on agenda)

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved the 2015 STC Meeting Schedule. (Item 6 on agenda)

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved to allow the reconsideration of classification appeal 14-00002 but retained the prior determination of Residential Real. The Commission allowed the reconsideration of classification appeal 14-00004 but retain the prior determination of Commercial Real. The Commission allowed the reconsideration of classification appeal 14-00028 but retained the prior determination of

Residential Real. The Commission allowed the reconsideration of classification appeal 14-00030 but retained the prior determination of Residential Real. The Commission allowed the reconsideration of classification appeal 14-00044 but retained the prior determination of Residential Real. The Commission allowed the reconsideration of classification appeal 14-00044 but retained the prior determination of Residential Real. The Commission allowed the reconsideration of classification appeal 14-00048 but retained the prior determination of Residential Real. The Commission allowed the reconsideration of classification appeals 14-00063, 14-00064 and 14-00065 but retained the prior determination of Residential Real. The Commission allowed the reconsideration of 14-00066 and 14-00067 but retained the prior determination of Residential Real. The Commission allowed the reconsideration of classification appeals 14-00068 and 14-00069 but retained the prior determination of Residential Real. (Item 7 on agenda)

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved staff's recommendation and formally accept the Cass County Commercial and Industrial Reappraisal. (Item 8 on agenda)

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved to approve special consideration request for four local units and deny one local unit to allow the December Board of Review to grant the Disabled Veteran's Exemption for the 2013 year. (Item 9 on agenda)

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved the updated AMAR Review Sheet. (Item 10 on agenda)

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved Memorandum 3 of 2014 regarding Hydroponics Facilities and that large hydroponic facilities, defined as greater than 1 million square feet, may suffer from economic obsolescence that would warrant an economic obsolescence adjustment up to 60%. (Item 11 on agenda)

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved to adopt the official order to certify and return the 2013 assessment roll to Freeman Township, Clare County. (Item 12 on agenda)

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved to adopt the staff recommendation on the Re-certifications and New Certifications of Computerized Tax Rolls for the following: (Item 13 on agenda)

These certifications will expire on **May 1, 2017**.

New Certifications:

Oceana County
Grant Township

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved the updated forms for 2015: 1019 – Notice of Assessment, Taxable Valuation, and Property Classification, 3128 – Taxable Value Calculations Worksheet, 4093 – Notice of Assessment, Taxable Valuation (including Leasehold Improvements) and Property Classification. (Item 14 on agenda)

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved the updated Personal Property Forms for 2015: 632 – Personal Property Statement, 2698 – Idle Equipment, Obsolete Equipment, and Surplus Equipment Report, 2699 – State of “Qualified Personal Property” by a “Qualified Business” (as of 12-31-14), 2807 – State of “Qualified Personal Property” by a “Qualified Business”, 3589 – Cable Television and Utility Personal Property Report, 3966 – Taxpayer Report of Personal Property “Move-Ins” of Used Equipment, 5076 – Affidavit of Owner of Eligible Personal Property Claiming Exemption from Collection of Taxes. (Item 15 on agenda)

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved to adopt the staff recommendation on the Special Exemptions Agenda. (Item 16 on agenda) ([See attached link for file identification.](#))

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved to adopt the staff recommendation on the Exemptions Agenda. (Item 17 on agenda) ([See attached link for file identification.](#))

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved to adopt the MCL 211.154 **Concurrences**. (Item 18 on agenda) ([See attached link for file identification](#))

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved to adopt staff recommendations on the MCL 211.154 petitions on the **Special Items Agenda** except for 154-14-0163 where the Commission approved the concurrence for the 2012 and 2013 tax years and dismiss the 2014 tax year. (Item 19 on agenda) ([See attached link for file identification](#))

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved to **amend** the following MCL 211.154 petition. (Item 20 on agenda)

City of Southfield, Oakland County

154-14-0257 HOME DEPOT #2711; 76-99-64-420-750; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2014 AV from \$ 661,540 to \$ 721,270 TV from \$ 661,540 to \$ 721,270

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved to **postpone** the following MCL 211.154 petition until **December 16, 2014**. (Item 20 on agenda)

City of Detroit, Wayne County

154-13-0869 GENERAL ELECTRIC CAPITAL CORP.; 25990431.00; Personal Property

2011 AV from \$ 2,837,500 to \$ 2,424,660 TV from \$ 2,837,500 to \$ 2,424,660

City of Detroit, Wayne County

154-14-0106 FERROUS PROCESSING & TRADING; PERSONAL PROPERTY

AV from \$ to \$ TV from \$ to \$

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved to **deny** the following MCL 211.154 petition. (Item 20 on agenda)

City of Howell, Livingston County

154-14-0490 LELAND J. & JULIE R. KEY; 4717-25-405-010; REAL PROPERTY

2012 AV from \$ 118,500 to \$ 226,100 TV from \$ 118,500 to \$ 226,100

2013 AV from \$ 119,700 to \$ 227,300 TV from \$ 119,700 to \$ 227,300

2014 AV from \$ 119,800 to \$ 227,400 TV from \$ 119,800 to \$ 227,400

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved to **withdraw** the DTE MCL 211.154 petitions 154-14-0283 through 154-14-0285, 154-14-0437 through 154-14-0456 and 154-14-0459 through 154-14-0478. (Item 20 on agenda) ([See attached link for file identification.](#))

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved the following MCL 211.154 petitions as **concurrences**, initially noticed as non-concurrences. (Item 20 on agenda)

Parma Township, Jackson County

154-12-1534 HERBERT W. & IRIS L. FERREL; 000-06-28-376-001-04; REAL PROPERTY

2010 AV from \$ 62,843 to \$ 75,730 TV from \$ 62,654 to \$ 75,730

2011 AV from \$ 62,843 to \$ 75,730 TV from \$ 62,843 to \$ 75,730

154-12-1549 JAMES L. & DOLORES M. MANTHEI; 000-06-31-176-007-00; Real Property

2010 AV from \$ 44,419 to \$ 48,543 TV from \$ 25,366 to \$ 28,679

2011 AV from \$ 31,109 to \$ 34,279 TV from \$ 25,797 to \$ 29,167

City of Farmington Hills, Oakland County

154-14-0497 GENTHERM INC; 22-99-51-216-802; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2013 AV from \$ 217,810 to \$ 418,690 TV from \$ 217,810 to \$ 418,690

2014 AV from \$ 272,260 to \$ 600,380 TV from \$ 272,260 to \$ 600,380

City of Port Huron, Saint Clair County

154-14-0502 METALOR TECHNOLOGIES; 74-06-999-0616-700; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2013 AV from \$ 50,000 to \$ 1,149,000 TV from \$ 50,000 to \$ 1,149,000

2014 AV from \$ 55,000 to \$ 1,149,000 TV from \$ 55,000 to \$ 1,149,000

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved to adopt all other MCL 211.154 petitions. ([See attached link for file identification.](#)) (Item 20 on agenda)

Linda Stevenson, President of Michigan Assessors Association and Margaret Ford, President elect for 2015 appeared before the Commission. Ms. Stevenson stated the following: I would like to state that MAA would like to show their support to the Commission's certification programs, this of course consists of the MMAO, MAAO, MCAO and MCAT program. In addition, we would like to state that we would like to continue our partnership with the STC providing quality education, training and renewal programs that are well suited to Michigan assessors. I would also like to extend an invitation to any of you here to attend our monthly meetings if you would like and we are here to continue our partnership.

Chairman Roberts stated: Thank you both very much. I think all three of us think and we take great pride in professionalizing assessing and it does take time.

Public Comment (Item 22 on agenda):

John Lauve appeared before the Commission to discuss selling bonds for the Detroit Hockey Arena and the City of Detroit not obeying the act of the DDA. Mr. Lauve stated the City of Detroit would be sending the bonds to the Commission for enforcement and approval. Mr. Lauve also mentioned there was no documentation of the development plan and there have been no public hearings on this matter. Mr. Lauve also asked the Commission to compel enforcement of the act by requiring approvals and public hearings as noted in the act.

Dean Babb, assessor for Chesterfield Township, appeared before the Commission regarding the Disabled Veteran's Exemption. Mr. Babb stated in February at the direction of the STC that he was chastised for the handling of the 2013 Disabled Veteran's Exemptions that were applied for after the BOR. Mr. Babb also stated the Michigan Tax Tribunal ruled the July Board of Review had no jurisdiction to grant a 2013 Disabled Veteran's Exemption. Mr. Babb asked for clarification of handling the veteran's exemption after the MTT ruling.

It was moved by Simon, supported by Morris, and unanimously approved to adopt Executive Director Sobel's staff recommendation to send out a ListServ asking all assessing officers to review their personal property accounts and ensure that each physical location has a separate personal property account number, and not a single personal property account number for multiple physical locations. This will become critically important as we move into 2016 and businesses begin claiming personal property exemptions and those businesses transition to paying the Essential Services Assessment. (Add on to agenda)

The Commission received a letter from Ernest Beren thanking them for allowing him to place his certification into escrow while dealing with medical issues. Mr. Beren stated that his 53 year history of assessing was one he never imagined would be so rewarding and fulfilling. Mr. Beren stated his career path initially began by becoming a Field Staff Appraiser with the STC and then representing the City of Southfield as a Deputy and City Assessor for 29+ years. Mr. Beren also stated he met Commissioner Roberts in 1961 and was fortunate enough to hire Commissioner Simon back in 1967. The Commission congratulated Mr. Beren on his retirement and thanked him for his 53 years of service. (Add on to agenda)

The next Commission meeting will be held December 16, 2014 at the Okemos Conference Center in the Okemos A & B Rooms, 2187 University Park Drive, Okemos.

It was moved by Roberts, supported by Simon, and unanimously approved to adjourn the meeting of the State Tax Commission at 10:55 a.m.

DATE TYPED: October 14, 2014

DATE APPROVED: December 16, 2014

**Douglas B. Roberts, Chair
State Tax Commission**

**Barry N. Simon, Member
State Tax Commission**

**W. Howard Morris, Member
State Tax Commission**