STATE ASSESSORS BOARD MEETING
Approved Minutes of September 14, 2006
Meeting Held at the Michigan Townships Association Building
512 Westshire Drive, Lansing, Michigan

www.michigan.gov/treasury/
Local Government
State Assessors Board
Executive Secretary's E-Mail Address – peoplesj@michigan.gov
State Assessors Board Phone Number – (517) 373-8320

CALL TO ORDER: The meeting was called to order at 9:30 a.m., September 14, 2006, in a Conference Room, at the Michigan Townships Association Building, located at 512 Westshire Drive, in Lansing, Michigan.

ROLL CALL: Members Present:
Henry O. Allen, Chairperson
Lisa A. Hobart, Vice Chairperson
Maxine J. McClelland, Member
Frederick W. Morgan, Member
Raman A. Patel, Member
Joan E. Peoples, Executive Secretary

Others Present:
Mike Bell, Asst. Attorney General
Ross Bishop, Asst. Attorney General
Frank Fisher, Colon Township Supervisor
Marie Fisher, Colon Township
Steven B. Flancher, Asst. Attorney General
Terry Katz, Sturgis Journal Reporter
Judy Nelson, St. Joseph Co. Equal. Dir.
Richard Sharland, Plymouth, Michigan

APPROVAL OF MINUTES:

The minutes of August 7 and 8, 2006, State Assessors Board meeting were reviewed by each Board Member prior to the meeting. Motion by Patel to approve the minutes as received. The motion was seconded by Hobart and unanimously approved.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Marie Fisher was present to request a dismissal of the two-year suspension of her certification in assessment administration. A copy of the Suspension Order and a copy of the State Field Investigator's report were delivered to Ms. Fisher. She stated that she had made corrections to the violations that are listed in the Suspension Order and the suspension should be dismissed. She further stated that other assessors have been found guilty of violations but their certification in assessment administration was not revoked. The Chairperson called for a motion to alter the Suspension Order. There was no motion; the status of the suspension of the certification in assessment administration issued in the name of Marie Fisher is unchanged.

PUBLIC COMMENT (cont.):

Gregory Pitoniak, Deputy Treasurer, sent his regrets; due to a scheduling conflict, he is unable to attend the meeting. He wanted the Board to know that the secretarial position to provide assistance to the Executive Secretary is being processed by the Human Resources Division of the Treasury Department.

Richard Sharland made an inquiry about the January 2006 State Assessors Board meeting minutes that contained an amendment between the proposed meeting minutes and the official meeting minutes.

FINANCIAL REPORT:

Motion by Patel to receive and file the financial report with a July 31, 2006, balance of $402,113.70. The fiscal year projections are as follows: Income $350,000.00, Expenses $325,000.00, Carryover (rounded) at the end of the fiscal year $250,000.00. The motion was seconded by Hobart and unanimously approved.

EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMS:

1) Motion by Patel, seconded by McClelland, and a unanimous vote to approve the following requests (items a-e) for continuing education for assessor certification:

   a) 6 hours for Course 1330-Apartment Appraisal offered in Grand Rapids on February 9-10, 2006

   b) 6 hours for Relocation Appraisal Training Program, an online course, offered by Worldwide Employee Relocation Council (ERC)

   c) 6 hours for Small Hotel/Motel Valuation: Limited-Service Lodging, an online course, by the Appraisal Institute

   d) 6 hours for Michigan Tax Tribunal-Effective Advocacy at the Tribunal by current and former Tribunal members, sponsored by Northwest Michigan Assessor Association on September 14, 2006

   e) 1 hour for Analysis of 1-Year & 2-Year Sales Studies & Assessor Updates sponsored by the Oakland County Assessors Association

   f) Motion by Morgan was seconded by McClelland to award State Assessors Board assessor renewal educational credit for attendance at Education, Test, Narrative Grader, and Assessment Administration Compliance Committee meetings. The program held today will provide 2 hours of 2007 renewal credit. The motion was unanimously approved.

EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMS (cont.):

2) Assessor educational renewal program evaluations were reviewed by the Board. Motion by Hobart was seconded by McClelland to receive and file. The motion was unanimously approved.

3) Amendments to the Open-Book Exercise recommended by the Assessment Administration Compliance Committee were approved. The Executive Secretary was directed to notify the county equalization directors of the October 1, 2006, mailing of the Open-Book Exercise so that they can inform the assessing officers in their counties. Motion by Patel was seconded by Hobart and unanimously approved.

4) Motion by Hobart was seconded by Morgan to approve the letter drafted to the candidate on subject property located at 836 Polaris Crescent Drive, Garfield Township. The motion was unanimously approved.

5) Status of demonstration narrative appraisal reports submitted for level 4 assessor certification was reviewed.

6) LXR training on the computer-testing program was discussed. The Executive Secretary was directed to contact the Department of Labor and Economic Growth (DLEG) to see if they can train our staff in the use of LXR. Motion by Patel was seconded by Hobart to table the discussion. The motion was unanimously approved.

OLD BUSINESS:

1) Motion by Hobart was seconded by McClelland to approve the minutes of the June 23, 2006, meeting of the Assessment Administration Compliance Committee. The motion was unanimously approved.

2) Motion by McClelland was seconded by Patel to approve the minutes of the August 7, 2006, meeting of the State Assessors Board Education Committee. The motion was unanimously approved.

NEW BUSINESS:

1) Motion by Hobart was seconded by McClelland to ask the assessor that had state equalized value (SEV) in excess of that allowed for level 2 assessor certification to forward to the State Assessors Board a copy of his contract with the largest township where he was shown in our records as being the assessor, to determine what his responsibilities are in that township. The motion was unanimously approved.

NEW BUSINESS (cont.):

2) Test Committee meeting follows this meeting at 1:30 p.m. where 100 level 3 and level 4 examination questions will be reviewed by the committee.

3) The tentative 2007 meeting schedule was reviewed. Motion by Morgan was seconded by Patel to table the meeting schedule until the next meeting. The motion was unanimously approved.

4) Motion by Hobart was seconded by Patel to deny the application for renewal of a certification that expired on December 31, 2004, because the applicant did not meet the educational renewal requirement for the period between October 1, 2004, and September 30, 2005. The motion was unanimously approved.

CERTIFICATIONS:

1) Motion by McClelland to approve amendments to the certification list as shown below. The motion was seconded by Patel and unanimously approved.

LEVEL 1

Baker, Dorothy L.	Dahlquist, John P.	Smith, Justin A.
Cage, Decarlo	Pless, Lu Ann	

LEVEL 2

Anderson, Scott E.	Dahlquist, John P.	Lindberg, Tammy
Bentley, Karen A.	Davis, Jennifer L.	Tait, Timothy P.
Busscher, Brian	LaBaumbard, Jo Ann	Whittker, Katherine

LEVEL 3

Heaslip, James B.

CERTIFICATION TOTALS AS OF 08/29/2006:

LEVEL 1	661
LEVEL 2	978
LEVEL 3	882
LEVEL 4	152
TOTAL	**2,673**

CLOSED MEETING:

Motion by Hobart was seconded by Patel to go into closed meeting to discuss revocation petitions 06-0015, 06-0025, and 06-0026. The closed meeting minutes of August 7, 2006, examination results of the Michigan Assessors Association (MAA) Novi School, and the grading of demonstration narrative appraisal report number 197 were also reviewed. There was a roll call vote: Allen-yes, Hobart-yes, McClelland-yes, Morgan-yes, Patel-yes. The motion was unanimously approved.

Closed meeting is permitted under Act 15.243 and 15.268, which are the Freedom of Information Act and the Open Meetings Act.

Motion by Hobart was seconded by Patel to return to open meeting. There was a roll call vote: Allen-yes, Hobart-yes, McClelland-yes, Morgan-yes, Patel-yes. The motion was unanimously approved.

REVOCATIONS:

1) Motion by Patel was seconded by Morgan to dismiss revocation petition 06-0015 because there is no evidence that the assessing officer named in the revocation petition has violated any rule or statute pertaining to assessment practices. The motion was unanimously approved.

2) Motion by McClelland to dismiss revocation petition 06-0025 because exemptions are a valuation matter that is not under jurisdiction of the State Assessors Board. Michigan Administrative Code R211.447 Rule 47 (1) reads in part, "the board shall reject any petition if it determines that the aggrieved party had or has an adequate remedy under another statute." The motion was seconded by Morgan and unanimously approved.

3) Motion by McClelland was seconded by Morgan to ask the assessor named in revocation petition 06-0026 to answer the allegations for clarification purposes. The motion was unanimously approved.

CLOSED SESSION MINUTES:

Motion by Hobart was seconded by Patel to approve the minutes of the August 7, 2006, State Assessors Board closed meeting. The motion was unanimously approved.

TESTING:

1) Motion by Patel was seconded by Morgan to approve the grader's failing grade for demonstration narrative appraisal report number 197. The motion was unanimously approved.

TESTING (cont.):

2) The examination results for the MAA School in Novi were reviewed. Motion by Hobart was seconded by Morgan to mail candidates the exam results, to discuss the examination results with the Michigan Assessors Association, and to request a copy of MAA instructor evaluations. The motion was unanimously approved.

ANNOUNCEMENTS:

The next meeting is scheduled for October 20, 2006, in Lansing.

ADJOURNMENT:

Motion by Hobart was seconded by Patel to adjourn the meeting at 12:15 p.m. The motion was unanimously approved.

Respectfully submitted,

Lisa A. Hobart

LISA A. Hobart, Vice-Chairperson

Joan E Peoples

Joan E. Peoples, Executive Secretary