

AWARD RECOMMENDATION

Notice of Intent to Award Number: 240000000294

The Department of Technology, Management & Budget’s Procurement office has completed the evaluation of RFP 230000003021, for vehicle hauling and transporting services and cleaning and prep (when requested) for DTMB Surplus Services MIBid vehicles within the state of Michigan and has recommended awards to Gary’s Towing and Repair LCC and Official Towing, Inc. in the total amount of \$900,000, pending State Administrative Board approval, if applicable. More information on the State Administrative Board can be found at: [State Administrative Board](#).

Bidders who were not recommended for the award are encouraged to schedule a debriefing session with the Solicitation Manager. The debriefing session will provide the bidder with the State’s rationale on why the bidder was not recommended for the award. The Solicitation Manager may be contacted as follows:

Melissa Beck, Solicitation Manager.

BeckM3@michigan.gov

517-897-1502

Background Information:

This Request for Proposal (RFP) was to solicit responses for selection of a Contractor to provide vehicle hauling and transporting services and cleaning and prep (when requested) for DTMB Surplus Services MIBid vehicles with the state of Michigan. The term of this contract is three-year, with two one-year renewal options.

Bidders:

The RFP was posted on SIGMA VSS on Tuesday October 31, 2023, and posted for 36 days. The following bidders submitted proposals by the published due date of Wednesday December 6, 2023.

Bidder	Address, City, State, Zip Code	SDVOB*	GDBE**
Gary’s Towing & Repair LLC	2005 S Michigan Ave, Saginaw MI 48602	No	No
Official Towing, Inc.	19801 Pleasant St., St. Clair Shores, MI 48080	No	No
Local Towing Service LLC	1805 Greenwood Rd, Prescott MI 48756	No	No
Transit One LLC	56146 Chesapeake Trail, Shelby Township MI 48316	No	No

*SDVOB: Service-Disabled Veteran Owned Business

**GDBE: Geographically Disadvantaged Business Enterprise

EVALUATION SYNOPSIS

I. Evaluation Process

A Responsible Vendor is a vendor that demonstrates it has the ability to successfully perform the duties identified by the solicitation. A Responsive proposal is one that is submitted in accordance with the solicitation instructions and meets all mandatory requirements identified in the solicitation.

Proposal Instructions: Evaluation Process

The State will evaluate each proposal based on the following factors:

	Technical Evaluation Criteria	Weight
1.	Product Quality – Schedule A, Statement of Work, Sections 1- 9	70
2.	Vendor Questions Worksheet	30
	Total	100

A total score of 80 passes technical.

The full evaluation process is stated in the RFP Proposal Instructions.

II. Evaluation Method

Responses to this solicitation were reviewed by a Joint Evaluation Committee, which consisted of the following individuals:

Voting	Advisory
Ron Turner, Departmental Supervisor, DTMB/Logistics and Operations Support/Surplus Services	Scott Poyer Fleet Specialist MDOT
Melissa Beck, Solicitation Manager DTMB-CPS	Joy Nakfoor, Manager DTMB-CPS

III. Evaluation Results

A. Gary’s Towing & Repair Inc.

The Evaluation Team determined that Gary’s Towing & Repair Inc. based on a score of 100, did meet the requirements of this RFP This determination was accomplished by evaluating their responses to the Technical Evaluation Criteria.

- Exhibit A Statement of Work, Section 1-9. 70/70
 The Evaluation Team determined that overall, the responses were satisfactory for these sections.
- Vendor Questions Worksheet 30/30
 The Evaluation Team determined that overall, the responses were satisfactory for this section.

Total Score: 100/100

B. Official Towing, Inc.

The Evaluation Team determined that Official Towing, Inc. based on a score of 95, did meet the requirements of this RFP. This determination was accomplished by evaluating their responses to the Technical Evaluation Criteria.

- 1. Schedule A - Statement of Work, Sections 1 – 9. 65/70
 - a. Section 2.2 Delivery, Bidder did not indicate the ability to meet timeline requirement.
- 2. Vendor Question Worksheet 30/30

The Evaluation Team determined that overall, the responses were satisfactory for this section.

Total Score: 95/100

C. Local Towing Service LLC

The Evaluation Team determined that Local Towing Service LLC based on a score of 68, did not meet the requirements of this RFP. This determination was accomplished by evaluating their responses to the Technical Evaluation Criteria.

- 1. Schedule A - Statement of Work, Sections 1 – 9. 40/70

The Evaluation Team determined that overall, the responses were mostly satisfactory. The following deficiencies were noted:

 - a. Section 1.1 General Requirements/B. Contractor’s Responsibilities for the Requesting State Agency. The Bidder did not sufficiently describe how they would comply with the listed requirements.
 - b. Section 2.2 Delivery, Bidder did not indicate the ability to meet timeline requirement.
 - c. Section 4.7 Security. Bidder did not explain what other security measure were in place to ensure the security of the State and its facilities.
 - d. Section 4.9 Reporting. Bidder did not explain their reporting capabilities.

- 2. Vendor Question Worksheet 28/30

The Evaluation Team determined that overall, the responses were satisfactory for this section. The following deficiencies were noted:

 - a. Vendor question worksheet, Experience, deducted 1 point for not sufficient evidence of doing business in Michigan.
 - b. Experience 3 – Hilltop Auto LLC deducted 1 point because this is a company Bidder has part ownership of.

Total Score: 68/100

D. Transit One LLC

Transit One LLC has not met the requirements of being responsive and responsible due to company being a transporter of temperature-controlled produce and meats. This does not align with this RFP.

IV. Technical Evaluation Summary

	Selection Criteria	Gary's Towing & Repair LLC	Official Towing, Inc.	Local Towing Services LLC	Transit One LLC
1	Schedule A – Statement of Work Sections 1-9	70	65	40	X
2	Vendor Question Worksheet	30	30	28	X
	Total	100	95	68	X

V. Oral Presentations/Demonstrations

The State requested oral presentations with bidders that passed the Technical Evaluation, Gary's Towing & Repair LLC and Official Towing, Inc.

VI. Pricing Summary

Pricing was evaluated for the bidders who passed technical. The following is a summary of their price proposals:

	Deliverable	Gary's Towing & Repair LLC	Official Towing, Inc.
1	Per Mile Rate - Passenger/Truck & Heavy Equipment	\$5.00/10.00	\$3.00/6.00
2	Hourly Rate - Passenger/Truck & Heavy Equipment	\$150.00/200.00	\$110.00/150.00
3.	Cleaning Price (optional)	Passenger: \$110.00 Truck & Heavy Equipment: \$200.00	Passenger: \$125.00 Truck & Heavy Equipment: \$250.00
4.	Quick Payment Terms	1% (10 days)	1% (15 days)

VII. Negotiations

The State requested clarifying and second round pricing from Bidders that passed the Technical Evaluation. Gary's Towing and Repair LLC pricing is based on round trip. Official Towing, Inc. pricing is based on from point A to B.

VIII. Award Recommendation

Award recommendation is made to the responsive and responsible Bidders who offer the best value to the State of Michigan. Best value is based on the proposal meeting the minimum point threshold and offering the best combination of the factors stated in the *Proposal Instructions Evaluation Process* section, and price. Gary's Towing & Repair LLC and Official Towing provided the best value to the State. Best value factors for Award Recommendation included technical score, price, regional zone service, availability and acceptance of the State's Standard Contract Terms as identified in the RFP.

As part of the best value determination, overall economic impact to the State of Michigan was considered and is not a determinative factor in making this award.

A total award of \$900,000.00 is awarded as follows:

Gary's Towing & Repair LLC – \$450,000.

Awarded zones Upper Peninsula, Norwest, Northeast, West Michigan, East Central, South Central, Southwest, Passenger Vehicles and Trucks & Heavy Equipment.

Official Towing, Inc. – \$450,000.

Awarded zones East Michigan, Southeast and Metro Detroit for Passenger Vehicles and Trucks & Heavy Equipment.