



STATE OF MICHIGAN ENTERPRISE PROCUREMENT

Department of Technology, Management & Budget
525 W. Allegan Street Lansing, MI 48933
P.O. Box 30026 Lansing, MI 48909

Recommendation of Award

The Department of Technology, Management, & Budget's Procurement office has completed the evaluation of RFP # 230000000230, Full -size Vans with or without Lift, and has recommended an award to Hoekstra Transportation, pending State Administrative Board approval, if applicable. More information on the State Administrative Board can be found at: [State Administrative Board](#).

Bidders who were not recommended for the award are encouraged to schedule a debriefing session with the Solicitation Manager. The debriefing session will provide the bidder with the State's rationale on why the bidder was not recommended for the award. The Solicitation Manager may be contacted as follows:

Yvon Dufour, Solicitation Manager
dufoury@michigan.gov
(517) 249-0455

Background Information:

This Request for Proposal (RFP) was to solicit responses for selection of a Contractor(s) to provide Full-size Vans with or without Lifts for local transit agencies. The term of this contract is two (2) years, with up to two (2), one (1) year renewal options.

Bidders:

The RFP was posted on www.michigan.gov/SIGMAVSS on 11/17/2022 for fifty (50) days. The following bidders submitted proposals by the published due date of 1/6/2023.

Bidder	Address City, State Zip	SDVOB*
Transportation Equipment Sales Corp. (TESCO)	Oregon, OH 43618	No
Hoekstra Transportation Inc.	Grand Rapids, MI 49548	No
Feldman Ford LLC	Detroit, MI 48210	No

*SDVOB: Service-Disabled Veteran Owned Business

Evaluation Synopsis

I. Evaluation Process

A Responsible Vendor is a vendor that demonstrates it has the ability to successfully perform the duties identified by the solicitation. A Responsive proposal is one that is submitted in accordance with the solicitation instructions and meets all mandatory requirements identified in the solicitation.

Solicitation Instructions and Vendor Questions, Section 7, Mandatory Minimum Requirements.

7. MANDATORY MINIMUM REQUIREMENTS.

	Required Documents
A	Signed Agreement with Federal Transit Administration (FTA) Clauses (Schedule E)
B	Current Valid Motor Vehicle Dealer License
C	Completed Affidavit for Driver Delivery (Schedule F)

Only proposals meeting the mandatory minimum requirements will be considered for evaluation.

8. EVALUATION PROCESS. The State will evaluate each proposal based on the following factors:

	Technical Evaluation Criteria	Weight
1.	Specifications – Schedule D – Full-size Vans with or without Lift Specifications, and Schedule A – Statement of Work sections 1.1 and 1.1.1	50
2.	Company & Prior Experience and Key Personnel – Vendor Questions Worksheet , Section 2, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9 & 10 and Schedule A , all of Section 3	20
3.	Warranty – Schedule A , Sections 1.2	10
4.	Service – Schedule A , Sections 2.3 to 2.6	5
5.	Delivery – Schedule A , Sections 2.1, 2.2, 6.1, and 6.2	5
6.	Acceptance, Inspection and Testing– Schedule A , all of section 7.	10
	Total	100

Proposals receiving 80 or more technical evaluation points will have pricing evaluated and considered for award.

The State may utilize all bidder information, without regard to a proposal’s technical score, to determine fair market value for goods or services sought. The State is not obligated to accept the lowest price proposal. If applicable, the State’s evaluation will include consideration of a bidder’s qualified disabled veterans/service-disabled veteran owned business(QDV/SDVOB) status under MCL 18.1261(8). Additional information on the SDVOB preference is available at: Michigan.gov/SDVOB.

The State strongly encourages strict adherence to the Contract Terms. The State reserves the right to deem a bid non-responsive for failure to accept the Contract Terms. Nevertheless, the bidder may submit proposed changes to the Contract Terms in track changes (i.e., visible edits) with an explanation of the bidder’s need for each proposed change. Failure to include track changes with an explanation of the bidder’s need for the proposed change constitutes the bidder’s

acceptance of the Contract Terms. General statements, such as that the bidder reserves the right to negotiate the terms and conditions, may be considered non-responsive. Failure to respond timely to requests for proposed changes to Contract Terms during ongoing negotiations may be cause for disqualification.

The State may but is not required to conduct an on-site visit to tour and inspect the bidder’s facilities; require an oral presentation of the bidder's proposal; conduct interviews, research, reference checks, and background checks; and request additional price concessions at any point during the evaluation process.

II. Evaluation Method

Responses to this solicitation were reviewed by the *Solicitation Manager in collaboration with Subject Matter Experts*, which consisted of the following individuals: Yvon Dufour – Solicitation Manager, Jeff Turner – MDOT Vehicle Analyst, and Fred Featherly – MDOT Office of Passenger Transportation, Project Manager.

III. Evaluation Results

Step 1 - Mandatory Minimums

Bidder	Meets	Deficiency
Transportation Equipment Sales Corp. (TESCO)	YES	NA
Hoekstra Transportation Inc.	YES	NA
Feldman Ford, LLC	NO	Vendor did not submit a completed “Signed Agreement with Federal Transit Administration (FTA) Clauses (Schedule E)”.

Step 2 – Technical Evaluation

A. Transportation Equipment Sales Corp. (TESCO)

The Evaluation Team determined that TESCO, based on a score of 98/100, did meet the requirements of this RFP. This determination was accomplished by evaluating their responses to the Technical Evaluation Criteria.

- 1. **Specifications** – Schedule D – Full-size Vans with or without Lift Specifications, and Schedule A – Statement of Work sections 1.1 and 1.1.1 SCORE 48/50

The Evaluation Team determined that overall, the responses were mostly satisfactory, but the following deficiencies were noted:

- A) Bidder does not offer alternate wheelchair lift manufacturer or recessed wheelchair securement system Page 26, IV. EQUIPMENT OPTIONS, sections 13.d. and 14.c.

- 2. **Company & Prior Experience and Key Personnel** – Vendor Questions Worksheet, Sections 2, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, & 10 and Schedule A, all of Section 3. SCORE 20/20

The Evaluation Team determined that overall, the responses were satisfactory.

3. Warranty – Schedule A, Section 1.2. SCORE 10/10

The Evaluation Team determined that overall, the responses were satisfactory.

4. Service – Schedule A, all of sections 2.3 to 2.6 SCORE 5/5

The Evaluation Team determined that overall, the responses were satisfactory.

5. Delivery – Schedule A, Sections 2.1, 2.2, 6.1, and 6.2. SCORE 5/5

The Evaluation Team determined that overall, the responses were satisfactory.

6. Acceptance, Inspection and Testing – Schedule A, all of section 7. SCORE 10/10

The Evaluation Team determined that overall, the responses were satisfactory.

Total Score: 98/100

B. Hoekstra Transportation Inc. (Hoekstra)

The Evaluation Team determined that Hoekstra, based on a score of 100/100, did meet the requirements of this RFP. This determination was accomplished by evaluating their responses to the Technical Evaluation Criteria.

1. Specifications – Schedule D – Full-size Vans with or without Lift Specifications, and Schedule A – Statement of Work sections 1.1 and 1.1.1 SCORE 50/50

The Evaluation Team determined that overall, the responses were satisfactory.

2. Company & Prior Experience and Key Personnel – Vendor Questions Worksheet, Sections 2, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, & 10 and Schedule A, all of Section 3. SCORE 20/20

The Evaluation Team determined that overall, the responses were satisfactory.

3. Warranty – Schedule A, Section 1.2. SCORE 10/10

The Evaluation Team determined that overall, the responses were satisfactory.

4. Service – Schedule A, all of sections 2.3 to 2.6 SCORE 5/5

The Evaluation Team determined that overall, the responses were satisfactory.

5. Delivery – Schedule A, Sections 2.1, 2.2, 6.1, and 6.2. SCORE 5/5

The Evaluation Team determined that overall, the responses were satisfactory.

6. Acceptance, Inspection and Testing – Schedule A, all of section 7. SCORE 10/10

The Evaluation Team determined that overall, the responses were satisfactory.

Total Score: 100/100

IV. Technical Evaluation Summary

	Weight	TESCO	Hoekstra
1. Specifications	50	48	50
2. Company & Prior Experience/Key Personnel	20	20	20
3. Warranty	10	10	10
4. Service	5	5	5
5. Delivery	5	5	5
6. Acceptance, Inspection and Testing	10	10	10
Total:	100	98	100

VI. Pricing Summary

Pricing was evaluated for the bidders who passed technical. The following is a summary of their price proposals:

Description	TESCO		HOEKSTRA	
	Round 1	Round 2	Round 1	Round 2
*Base Vehicle	623,000.00	617,800.00	633,801.00	633,801.00
**Equipment Options	228,649.00	228,649.00	143,682.00	143,682.00
GRAND TOTALS	851,649.00	846,449.00	777,483.00	777,483.00

*Hoekstra base vehicle pricing is for a total of 10 models (average cost per vehicle = \$63,380.10). TESCO base vehicle pricing is for 8 models (average cost per vehicle = \$77,225.00).

**Hoekstra options pricing is for a total of 75 items (average cost per item = \$1,916). TESCO pricing is for 76 items (average cost per item = \$3,009).

UNIT PRICING

DESCRIPTION	TESCO	HOEKSTRA
	Unit Price	Unit Price
Class III – 148" W.B. – Vinyl Seat Covers		
13 passenger plus driver low roof without lift	74,711.00	56,563.00
13 passenger plus driver medium roof without lift	75,573.00	61,875.00
13 passenger plus driver high roof without lift	76,934.00	63,189.00
13 passenger plus driver high roof extended length without lift	0.00	67,301.00
Class III – 148" W.B. – Fabric Seat Covers		
13 passenger plus driver low roof without lift	74,965.00	57,119.00
13 passenger plus driver medium roof without lift	75,826.00	62,431.00
13 passenger plus driver high roof without lift	77,186.00	63,746.00

13 passenger plus driver high roof extended length without lift	0.00	67,857.00
Class IV – 148" W.B. – Dual Rear Wheel - Vinyl Seat Covers		
14 passenger plus driver high roof extended length without lift	81,176.00	66,559.00
Class IV – 148" W.B. – Dual Rear Wheel - Fabric Seat Covers		
14 passenger plus driver high roof extended length without lift	81,429.00	67,161.00
Equipment Options		
Alternate Adjustable Seating and Floor System I	10,277.00	7,053.00
Alternate Adjustable Seating and Floor System II	12,695.00	4,937.00
Aluminum L Track Flooring System	9,672.00	5,059.00
Alternate Lift with Power Sliding Side Door 1,000 pound capacity	12,695.00	9,068.00
Power Sliding Side Cargo Door	3,411.00	1,008.00
Emergency Roof Exit	2,519.00	232.00
Emergency Egress Window (Requires Privacy Tinted Windows)	1,814.00	1,310.00
Cross View Mirror	423.00	301.00
Destination Sign - LED	6,650.00	5,038.00
Donation box (in lieu of farebox – deduct)	252.00	453.00
Running Boards	1,451.00	1,209.00
Farebox	1,984.00	1,562.00
Farebox Electrical Prep Only (less farebox- deduct)	91.00	171.00
Limited Slip Differential	350.00	353.00
Paint - Different Full body	218.00	202.00
Paint - One 6" Stripe	1,330.00	705.00
Reflective 6" Vinyl Belt Stripe	786.00	705.00
Rear Side Entry Wheelchair Lift	0.00	9,999.00
Lift – Type I – (34 inch wide 800 pound capacity side mounted)	4,921.00	3,023.00
Lift – Type I – (37 inch wide 1,000 pound capacity rear mounted)	6,734.00	5,340.00
Lift – Type II – 800 pound Capacity, Powered outer barrier (in lieu of type I lift)	5,283.00	3,023.00
Lift - Folding Platform 800# Capacity (in lieu of lift)	7,097.00	3,023.00
Alternate Lift Manufacturer	7,097.00	504.00
Wheelchair Single Point Securement System (in lieu of one L-Track position)	1,082.00	370.00
Additional Wheelchair Position – L Track System	1,324.00	940.00
Additional Wheelchair Position – Single Point System	1,082.00	1,310.00
Recessed Wheelchair Securement Station	961.00	5,038.00
Two-way radio prep package	242.00	252.00
Radio - AM/FM stereo system w/6 speakers	224.00	0.00
Public Address (PA) System Only w/ two speakers	302.00	303.00
Entry Stepwell Heater (Bi-fold Entrance Door Only)	181.00	364.00
Bi-fold Entrance Door	8,886.00	8,060.00
Handrails & Stanchions	665.00	403.00
Adjustable Flooring Single Forward Facing Flip Seat - Vinyl	3,088.00	1,058.00
Adjustable Flooring Single Forward Facing Flip Seat - Cloth	3,088.00	1,108.00
Adjustable Flooring Double Forward Facing - Vinyl	2,285.00	1,562.00

Adjustable Flooring Double Forward Facing - Cloth	2,285.00	1,612.00
Seating – Forward Facing Standard Single Seat – Vinyl	632.00	101.00
Seating – Forward Facing Standard Single Seat – Cloth	632.00	101.00
Seating – Forward Facing Standard Single Seat – Vinyl (Deduct)	-227.00	-498.00
Seating – Forward Facing Standard Single Seat – Cloth (Deduct)	-227.00	-574.00
Seating – Forward Facing Standard Double Seat - Vinyl	997.00	101.00
Seating – Forward Facing Standard Double Seat - Fabric	997.00	101.00
Seating – Forward Facing Standard Double Seat – Vinyl (Deduct)	-408.00	-705.00
Seating – Forward Facing Standard Double Seat – Fabric (Deduct)	-408.00	-806.00
Seating – Forward Facing Single Fold-A-Way – Vinyl	1,560.00	1,162.00
Seating – Forward Facing Single Fold-A-Way – Cloth	1,560.00	1,208.00
Seating – Forward Facing Double Fold-A-Way - Vinyl	1,879.00	1,612.00
Seating – Forward Facing Double Fold-A-Way - Fabric	1,879.00	1,713.00
Seating – Forward Facing Double Fold-A-Way – Vinyl (Deduct)	-1,330.00	-1,612.00
Seating – Forward Facing Double Fold-A-Way –Fabric (Deduct)	-1,330.00	-1,713.00
Seating – Double Flip-up – Vinyl	1,560.00	1,511.00
Seating – Double Flip-up - Fabric	1,560.00	1,511.00
Seating – Double Flip-up – Vinyl (Deduct)	-927.00	-1,612.00
Seating – Double Flip-up – Fabric (Deduct)	-927.00	-1,713.00
Seating – Double w/Single Integrated Child Seat (ICS) - Vinyl	1,535.00	1,411.00
Seating – Double w/Single Integrated Child Seat (ICS) – Fabric	1,535.00	1,511.00
Seating – Double w/Single Integrated Child Seat (ICS) – Vinyl (Deduct)	-957.00	-1,411.00
Seating – Double w/Single Integrated Child Seat (ICS) – Fabric (Deduct)	-957.00	-1,511.00
Seating – Double w/Double Integrated Child Seat (ICS) - Vinyl	2,048.00	1,370.00
Seating – Double w/Double Integrated Child Seat (ICS) - Fabric	2,048.00	1,463.00
Driver’s Power Seat Base (Class One Only)	942.00	1,108.00
Alt. Engine - Propane	17,325.00	8,060.00
Alt. Engine - CNG	21,375.00	16,120.00
Alt. Engine – Diesel	0.00	0.00
Battery Electric Propulsion	34,820.00	13,173.00
Back-up Sensor System	318.00	554.00
Video Surveillance – Two Camera System	2,739.00	1,735.00
Video Surveillance - Four Camera System	3,215.00	2,519.00
Video Surveillance - Six Camera System	3,959.00	2,821.00
Video Surveillance - DVR System Upgrade	725.00	907.00
Video Surveillance – Extra Interior Cameras	240.00	252.00
Video Surveillance – Extra Exterior Cameras	264.00	252.00
Video Surveillance Preparation Package	453.00	504.00
Bike Rack	1,511.00	2,922.00
Rear HVAC without OEM Heat and A/C	3,143.00	3,023.00
Cruise Control	544.00	353.00
Overhead Compartment	907.00	0.00

VII. Negotiations: Bidders with a passing technical score were asked to submit second round pricing. The awarded contracts will reflect maximum purchase quantities for 400 vehicles, which is reflected in the following savings costs:

TESCO lowered their base vehicle pricing by an average of \$650.00 per vehicle (0.84%): Potential Savings for 400 vehicles = $400 \times \$650 = \$260,000$. No other relevant pricing changes were submitted in second round pricing.

VIII. Award Recommendation:

Award recommendation is made to the responsive and responsible Bidder who offers the best value to the State of Michigan. Best value is based on the proposal meeting the minimum point threshold and offering the best combination of the factors stated in the *Proposal Instructions Evaluation Process* section, and price.

Hoekstra provided the best value to the State. Best value factors for Award Recommendation include:

1. Provides all 10 base vehicles.
2. Provides best price.

The Buyer recommends that **Hoekstra** be awarded a contract for the Full -size Vans with or without Lift. All purchasing Transit Agencies shall be fully funded by MDOT for Full -size Vans with or without Lift included on this contract.

Funding for this contract shall be as follows:

***Award amount: \$42,593,880.00

***Award amounts are based on a 400-vehicle total with an average purchase of 30% of option costs per vehicle.