



GRETCHEN WHITMER
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MICHIGAN
DEPARTMENT OF
ENVIRONMENT, GREAT LAKES, AND ENERGY
LANSING



LIESL EICHLER CLARK
DIRECTOR

MICHIGAN COUNCIL ON CLIMATE SOLUTIONS MEETING
Meeting Minutes

Tuesday, August 24, 2021 – 3:00 to 5:00 p.m.
Virtual Meeting via Microsoft Teams
Find meeting information at Michigan.gov/Climate

Attendees

| | |
|---------------------|-------------------------|
| Niles Annelin | Phyllis Meadows |
| Frank Beaver | Quentin Messer |
| Liesl Eichler Clark | Jonathan Overpeck |
| Mary Draves | Tanya Paslawski |
| Kerry Duggan | Cynthia Render-Williams |
| Dan Eichinger | Joseph Rivet |
| Rachel Eubanks | Phillip Roos |
| Meghan Groen | Dan Scripps |
| James Harrison | Derrell Slaughter |
| Judson Herzer | Samuel Stolper |
| Brandon Hofmeister | Ron Voglewede |
| Marnese Jackson | |

MEETING GOALS

- Build a shared understanding of equity regarding climate and energy

Meeting Notes

- **Welcome, Attendance (Liesl Clark, Director, EGLE)**
 - The meeting commenced at 3:00 p.m.
 - There is a request to get the Council together in person. EGLE will continue monitoring COVID levels and assess if it's possible to meet in-person in the future.
 - Attendance was taken.
 - Council members received pre-read materials prior to today's meeting.
- **Council Business (Liesl Clark, EGLE)**
 - Ron Voglewede moved and Brandon Hofmeister seconded a motion to approve the agenda. The agenda was approved unanimously by voice vote.

- Derrell Slaughter moved and Phyllis Meadows seconded a motion to approve minutes from the July 27 council meeting. The minutes were approved unanimously by voice vote.
 - Correction to the minutes, Marnese Jackson did not attend the July 27 meeting
- In September, Council members will receive an email regarding additional meeting dates.

- **Overview: Equity in Matters of Climate and Energy (Liesl Clark, EGLE)**
 - Our goal is to keep people at the front and center. Part of Governor's Whitmer's executive order includes identifying solutions to resolve impact disparities across Michigan and recommending targeted solutions for communities disproportionately impacted by the changing climate.
 - We can see these impacts in real-life, present-day.
 - The Climate Justice Braintrust will be vital in providing feedback for the Healthy Climate Plan.
 - Questions to consider as we think about how to reduce GHG emissions:
 - How will the recommendations impact labor markets?
 - What populations could benefit most or carry the biggest burden?
 - How should the State consider impacts?
 - How will the recommendations impact public health?

- **Presentation: MI Demographics: Implications for Energy Transition, Dr. Richelle Winkler, Michigan Technological University**
 - Population: Characteristics, distribution, and changes
 - Michigan population is growing, but slowly – anticipate this trend will continue
 - West side, SE suburbs are growing
 - East side is declining
 - Surpassed 10 million in the 2020 census
 - Increasing diversity, especially in Latinx
 - 28% Black, Indigenous, People of Color (BIPOC)
 - Population is aging, and will continue to age as birth rate is declining
 - Population change
 - Growth in Grand Rapids and Traverse City
 - Flint and Detroit lost population (although could be issues with the census)
 - Greatest population decline areas were in the UP, only Houghton Co. had growth

- Economics & socioeconomic dimensions
 - Inequality is a core issue
 - Large and growing population in poverty
 - 38% of Michigan households in 2019 fell below ALICE (Asset Limited, Income Constrained, Employed)
 - Cost of essentials are rising and wages for low-income people are low and stagnant
 - About 50% of households across the UP, central Michigan, and Wayne Co. are in poverty
 - Poverty is concentrated overtime
 - Unemployment rates are generally low – 5% and falling around the state
 - Northern part of the state has higher unemployment rate
 - There is a lot of fluctuation recently due to the pandemic
 - Housing affordability:
 - About 19% of homeowners spend 30% of their income on housing costs (housing cost burdened) – these percentages would be higher for renters
 - 8% spend over half their income on housing costs
- Housing: development & characteristics
 - Characteristics of housing matter for efficiency and energy use
 - Size & materials
 - Year build
 - Single vs multifamily vs mobile
 - Housing size:
 - Average size is decreasing (2.5 people per house), there are more people living alone/aging population
 - Nationwide, the average sq. footage for houses is increasing, which also increases the energy use – although more recently millennials are going smaller
 - Housing development: About half of new housing units were built in Oakland, Kent, Macomb, and Ottawa counties.
 - Older housing:
 - Median year built = 1971
 - 22% of housing built before 1950
 - 35% of seniors live in housing units built before 1960
 - Built x value would give a clearer picture of housing needs
 - Could look into how disadvantages layer

- Multifamily housing: 72% are single family detached homes and 5% are mobile homes
- 71% of people are owners – differs with age group
- Residential Energy Demand & Sources
 - 55% of household energy was spent on space heating
 - Layering data to explore energy burdens
 - Average retail price for electricity has been increasing for residential users
 - Primary heating source
 - 76% Natural gas
 - 10% electric
 - 8% propane
 - 3% wood
 - Transportation
 - 8% of households do not have a vehicle – differs with age groups
 - The majority of people drive alone to work, a smaller percentage carpool
- Questions:
 - In planning for the future, how should we be thinking about future trends in population (migration to Michigan due to climate change impacts)?
 - There are a lot of anecdotal stories, and the forecasts we have are based on historical trends. Births and deaths are fairly stable, migration is the unknown factor. Thus far, climate change has had very little impact on migration. We might see changes, but I don't expect them to be dramatic or come in the near term.
 - Trends show people are moving regional, not long distances, when facing climate stress
 - When you look at ALICE how does that map to living wage calculators?
 - They would be related in the sense that they are both looking at the cost of living, but not perfectly related because they have to do with income levels.
- **Presentation: Addressing climate injustice: Centering People in the Solutions, Dr. Jalonne White-Newsome, Empowering a Green Environment and Economy, LLC**

- Can't talk about achieving climate justice without looking at and addressing historical climate injustices
- Michigan has been experiencing more flood and heat risks, typically impacting the same – the systems and infrastructure have made them more vulnerable
- Environmental injustice, climate injustice, and health inequities are all related
 - We need systems and infrastructure to be resilient, not just people
 - Recognize pre-existing conditions
 - Lack of access to resources
- Questions to be asking:
 - Are residents experiencing an energy burden, particularly during extreme weather events?
 - Does the current city climate plan (if it exists) adequately provide adaptation practices, policies, and procedures?
 - Is there adequate access to affordable, clean energy options?
 - How to resource and repair communities burdened by multiple environmental stressors?
- Syndemic: refers to multiple interrelated epidemics happening at the same time
 - Black residents are hit harder by COVID, housing cost burdened, energy burdened, etc.
 - People of color are more exposed to a range of emission sources
 - Redlined communities are vulnerable to and are more exposed to heat events – cumulative disinvestment
- Equitable decarbonization and Energy democracy
 - These need to be considered along with health
 - Extreme heat, poor air quality, reduced food and water quality, changes in infectious agents
 - Social and behavioral context provide exposure pathways
- How do we develop solutions that center the needs of people as you strive for decarbonization mobility and energy democracy?
 - A- Acknowledge the harm (legacy pollution, existing health disparities, hot spots of disruption)
 - D- demand accountability (New Jersey example: gives the state department the ability to deny permits in certain neighborhoods if it will have detrimental effects)
 - Demanding accountability also builds trust within communities

- A- Address Racism
 - P- Prioritizing equity through an equity analysis
 - T- Transform systems (Justice40 Initiative or the Green Amendment Movement)
- **Presentation: Paul Francis, KIGT (Keep It Green Tech)**
 - KIGT has EV charging projects across seven states
 - Frontline communities often have faith-based community centers – perfect areas for EV charging and microgrids
 - The real problem: Same old, same old
 - Older infrastructure (old powerlines and transformers) needs to be upgraded
 - There is no incentive for upgrading older infrastructure over areas with newer developments that don't require as much upgrading
 - Grid problems
 - Permitting is a bottle neck
 - Equitable funding can be a reinvestment and an opportunity for jobs and ownership
 - Green jobs, and workforce empowerment
 - EVs will require less maintenance but the charging infrastructure will require more maintenance than gas pumps
 - Empowering the next generation that's going to take on this infrastructure
 - Partnering with schools for education
- **Q&A for Presenters:**
 - Could you talk about the challenge of multiuse dwelling and EV charging infrastructure and potential solutions?
 - There is no single solution. We are working to understand incentives for installing the chargers and helping building owners understand the benefits.
 - Example: EV car-sharing programs – property owners could earn income off of this
 - Regarding the importance of having impacted communities at the table for decision making, some groups try to provide stipends for community groups to participate. Do you have any other best practices or ways to honestly value the communities and include their voices?

- Valuing community members' time is important. It is also important to make the date, time, and place accessible. That may be having childcare services, translators, etc.
- It is also not a one-off event. Work to build trust and converse as equals by creating a memorandum of understanding that all parties agree to.
- Make sure you acknowledge the communities' ideas – don't take their ideas and run.
- Can you provide advice on how we can advance equity while working with industry as we move these recommendations forward? Understanding that we need all the voices at the table, be recognizing the need to center equity.
 - Industry is there to make money, and people are not always on their mind. How do we bring people into the value system, making it the first thing to think about, not the last? People need to be a part of the industries mission. What is the thing that is going to change the culture?
 - Think about the cost of not including people up front – ex: the cost of protests – the cost of inaction beyond just fines
 - Figuring out how to incorporate accountability practices in how these organizations do their work.
 - Having dedicated buckets of funding for permitting/infrastructure will create stability
 - Focusing the incentive structure on equity and recognize that this is a time of uncertainty for utilities.
 - It's important these entities hire people from the community
 - A community advisory board to advise industry
- What are the things that would help Michigan be the leader in green jobs for people of color?
 - It is about ownership, not just an opportunity
 - Regarding potential vandalism, if the community puts it in, they police it
 - Working to train/retrain or create training programs – creating certainly for the community
 - When talking about putting green infrastructure in communities, some of the barriers are the cost of training and certification. How do we make sure we have community members who are skilled to take those jobs?
 - Example of getting a stipend after completing training programs

- It is important that industries hire people from the community, so the industry looks like the community or having a community advisory board.
 - Many community groups want to shift the burden of climate change and its cost to industries and utilities. This is hard to talk about but seems important.
 - Thinking about redistribution through prices.
 - Thinking about the unintentional consequences such as increased rates for communities that have new infrastructure. Providing protections and baselines.
- **Next Steps (Liesl Clark, EGLE)**
 - The next meeting is September 28 (fourth Tuesday of every month) from 3 p.m. to 5 p.m.
 - Meeting materials and recordings are available at Michigan.gov/climate.
- **Adjournment**
 - The meeting adjourned at 5:00 p.m.

Additional comments/questions from the meeting chat:

- In addition to people of color, people with disabilities are one of the largest disadvantaged communities. How will this Council address needs of people with physical limitations not addressed by most EVs?
- I also heard there are opportunities to be pro-active, planning and engaging for community, before decisions about investments are made. We also need to take time to look at building practices and impacts on climate change. I would emphasize the important need in upcoming equity discussions to look at existing energy policies and practices that have historically been inequitable – we need to analyze these also.

Approved at September 28, 2021, Council on Climate Solutions meeting.