

STATE OF MICHIGAN

IN THE CIRCUIT COURT FOR THE COUNTY OF WASHTENAW

ATTORNEY GENERAL FOR THE STATE  
OF MICHIGAN ex rel. MICHIGAN  
DEPARTMENT OF NATURAL RESOURCES  
AND ENVIRONMENT,

Case No. 88-34734-CE  
Hon. Timothy P. Connors

Plaintiff,

And

THE CITY OF ANN ARBOR,  
Intervenor,

And

WASHTENAW COUNTY,  
Intervenor,

And

WASHTENAW COUNTY HEALTH  
DEPARTMENT,  
Intervenor,

And

WASHTENAW COUNTY HEALTH OFFICER,  
JIMENA LOVELUCK,  
Intervenor,

And

THE HURON RIVER WATERSHED COUNCIL,  
Intervenor,

And

SCIO TOWNSHIP,  
Intervenor,

V.

GELMAN SCIENCES, INC., a Michigan  
Corporation,  
Defendant.

---

**REPLY OF INTERENORS CITY OF  
ANN ARBOR AND SCIO TOWNSHIP  
TO CORRECT MISSTATEMENTS  
IN BRIEFS FILED BY THE BY STATE  
AND GELMAN RELATED TO  
MOTION FOR STAY OF ORDER**

BRIAN J. NEGELE (P41846)  
Michigan Dept of Attorney General  
Attorney for Plaintiff EGGLE  
525 W. Ottawa Street  
P.O. Box 30212  
Lansing, MI 48909-7712  
(517) 373-7540

MICHAEL L. CALDWELL (P40554)  
KAREN E. BEACH (P75172)  
Zausmer, P.C.  
Attorney for Defendant  
Gelman Sciences, Inc.  
31700 Middlebelt Road, Suite 150  
Farmington Hills, MI 48334  
(248) 851-4111

FREDERICK J. DINDOFFER (P31398)  
NATHAN D. DUPES (P75454)  
Bodman PLC  
Attorneys for City of Ann Arbor  
1901 St. Antoine, 6<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Detroit, MI 48226  
(313) 259-7777

ROBERT CHARLES DAVIS (P40155)  
Davis Listman PLLC  
Attorney for Washtenaw County,  
Washtenaw County Health Department,  
and Washtenaw County Health Officer,  
Jimena Loveluck  
10 S. Main Street, Suite 401  
Mt. Clemens, MI 48043  
(586) 469-4300

STEPHEN K. POSTEMA (P38871)  
ABIGAIL ELIAS (P34941)  
Ann Arbor City Attorney's Office  
Attorneys for City of Ann Arbor  
301 E. Huron, Third Floor  
Ann Arbor, MI 48107  
(734) 794-6170

NOAH D. HALL (P66735)  
ERIN E. METTE (P83199)  
Great Lakes Environmental Law Center  
Attorney for HRWC  
444 2<sup>nd</sup> Avenue  
Detroit, MI 48201  
(313) 782-3372

BRUCE T. WALLACE (P24148)  
WILLIAM J. STAPLETON (P38339)  
Hooper Hathaway P.C.  
Attorneys for Scio Twp.  
126 S. Main Street  
Ann Arbor, MI 48104  
(734) 662-4426

---

**REPLY OF INTERVENORS CITY OF ANN ARBOR AND SCIO TOWNSHIP  
TO CORRECT MISSTATEMENTS IN BRIEFS FILED BY THE STATE  
AND GELMAN RELATED TO MOTION FOR STAY OF ORDER**

Intervenors City of Ann Arbor and Scio Township, by their undersigned attorneys, feel compelled to reply to statements made in the Response Brief filed by the State on February 1,

2021, and in the Reply Brief filed by Gelman on February 3, 2021. The Washtenaw County Intervenor and Intervenor Huron River Watershed Council concur.

Both briefs make incorrect statements, without basis, that the reason or primary reason the governing bodies of the Intervenor rejected the negotiated and proposed Fourth Amended Consent Judgment was that it did not include aquifer restoration. (State Response Brief p. 2; Gelman Reply Brief p. 4) The record of the reasons for rejection are clear that was not the reason—or even a reason. These misstatements are misleading and even offensive.

The reasons for rejection are not relevant to the Court’s decision on the pending Motion for Stay, and the City and Scio Township are confident the Court understands the Intervenor are working diligently to provide the Court with comprehensive legal and scientific support for the various modifications of response activities the Intervenor seek—which do not include aquifer restoration. Therefore, in the context of this Motion, the City and Scio Township will not burden the record with documentation of the several reasons for the rejections, which did not include the absence of aquifer restoration.

The City and Scio Township request this Court to ignore those misrepresentations.

**By: /S/ Stephen K. Postema (P38871)  
STEPHEN K. POSTEMA (P38871)  
Abigail Elias (P34941)  
Ann Arbor City Attorney’s Office  
Attorneys for City of Ann Arbor  
301 E. Huron, Third Floor  
Ann Arbor, MI 48107  
(734) 794-6170**

Dated: February 3, 2021

**By: /S/ Fredrick J. Dindoffer  
FREDERICK J. DINDOFFER (P31398)  
Nathen D. Dupes (P75454)  
Bodman PLC  
Attorneys for City of Ann Arbor  
1901 St. Antoine, 6<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Detroit, MI 48226  
(313) 259-7777**

Dated: February 3, 2021

By: /S/ William J. Stapleton  
**WILLIAM J. STAPLETON (P38339)**  
Hooper Hathaway P.C.  
Attorneys for Scio Twp.  
126 S. Main Street  
Ann Arbor, MI 48104  
(734) 662-4426

Dated: February 3, 2021

**PROOF OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on February 3, 2021, I electronically filed the foregoing document with the Clerk of the Court using the MiFile System which will send notice of such filing to the following: all registered parties, and I hereby certify that I have mailed by US Mail the document to the following non-MiFile participants: None.

/s/ Dawn M. Bagozzi  
Legal Assistant  
Ann Arbor City Attorney's Office