



GRETCHEN WHITMER
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MICHIGAN
DEPARTMENT OF LICENSING AND REGULATORY AFFAIRS
LANSING

MARLON I. BROWN, DPA
DIRECTOR

MICHIGAN BOARD OF REAL ESTATE APPRAISERS SEPTEMBER 17, 2024, MEETING

APPROVED MINUTES

In accordance with the Open Meetings Act, 1976 PA 267, as amended, the Michigan Board of Real Estate Appraisers met on September 17, 2024, at 611 West Ottawa Street, Upper-Level Conference Room 4, Lansing, Michigan 48933.

CALL TO ORDER

Jumana Judeh, Chairperson, called the meeting to order at 9:07 a.m.

ROLL CALL

Members Present: Jumana Judeh, Certified Real Estate Appraiser, Chairperson
Catherine Quayle, Certified Residential Real Estate Appraiser,
Vice Chairperson
Joey Barash, Certified Residential Appraiser
Nicholas Krieger, Public Member
Jake Lew, Certified Residential Appraiser
Jordan Wernette, Certified General Real Estate Appraiser

Members Absent: None

Staff: Laury Brown, Senior Analyst, Compliance Section
Kimmy Catlin, Board Support, Boards and Committees Section
Dena Marks, JD., Departmental Specialist,
Boards and Committees Section
Jennifer Fitzgerald, Assistant Attorney General
Kim Smith, Board Support, Boards and Committees

APPROVAL OF AGENDA

MOTION by Krieger, seconded by Quayle, to approve the agenda as presented.

A voice vote was held.

MOTION PREVAILED

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

MOTION by Krieger, seconded by Lew, to approve the minutes from June 11, 2024, as presented.

A voice vote was held.

MOTION PREVAILED

REGULATORY CONSIDERATIONS

Hearing Reports

MOTION by Quayle, seconded by Krieger, to receive the Hearing Reports.

A voice vote was held.

MOTION PREVAILED

Timothy Michael Fennema

MOTION by Krieger, seconded by Lew, to untable the matter.

A voice vote was held.

MOTION PREVAILED

MOTION by Lew, seconded by Krieger, to discuss the matter.

A voice vote was held.

MOTION PREVAILED

Discussion was held.

MOTION by Quayle, seconded by Krieger, to place the Respondent on probation for a minimum of 1 day, not to exceed 1 year until satisfactory evidence of successful completion of the deficient continuing education hours is provided to the department. The Respondent is fined \$350 to be paid within 60 days. Failure to comply results in suspension of license until compliant.

A roll call vote was taken: Yeas: Barash, Krieger, Lew, Wernette, Quayle, Judeh
 Nays: None

MOTION PREVAILED

Scott Richard Gailey

MOTION by Lew, seconded by Quayle, to discuss the matter.

A voice vote was held.

MOTION PREVAILED

Discussion was held.

MOTION by Quayle, seconded by Krieger, to fine the Respondent \$350 to be paid within 60 days. Failure to comply results in suspension of license until compliant.

A roll call vote was taken: Yeas: Barash, Krieger, Lew, Wernette, Quayle, Judeh
 Nays: None

MOTION PREVAILED

Daniel Kammer

MOTION by Krieger, seconded by Quayle, to discuss the matter.

A voice vote was held.

MOTION PREVAILED

Discussion was held.

MOTION by Barash, seconded by Krieger, to fine the Respondent \$400 to be paid within 60 days. Failure to comply results in suspension of license until compliant.

A roll call vote was taken: Yeas: Barash, Krieger, Lew, Wernette, Quayle, Judeh
 Nays: None

MOTION PREVAILED

Russell Raymond Raftary

MOTION by Lew, seconded by Quayle, to discuss the matter.

A voice vote was held.

MOTION PREVAILED

Discussion was held.

MOTION by Quayle, seconded by Krieger, to fine the Respondent \$500 to be paid within 60 days. Failure to comply results in suspension of license until compliant.

A roll call vote was taken: Yeas: Barash, Krieger, Lew, Wernette, Quayle, Judeh
 Nays: None

MOTION PREVAILED

Consent Order and Stipulation

John Shea

Judeh recused herself from the matter and Quayle acted as Chair.

MOTION by Lew, seconded by Krieger, to discuss the matter.

A voice vote was held.

MOTION PREVAILED

Discussion was held.

MOTION by Barash, seconded by Wernette, to accept the Consent Order and Stipulation.

A roll call vote was taken: Yeas: Barash, Krieger, Lew, Wernette, Quayle
 Nays: None
 Recuse: Judeh

MOTION PREVAILED

OLD BUSINESS

None

NEW BUSINESS

2025 Public Notice

Discussion was held regarding the 2025 meeting dates.

Chair Report

Judeh stated that it seemed that there was an increase in cases regarding failure to complete continuing education.

Judeh requested data to see if they have increased over the years.

Department Update

Marks explained the promulgation process and timeline and stated that the draft is currently at JCAR.

Brown reminded the board of the FAQ page on the LARA website.

Wernette stated that on the FAQ webpage there is Real Estate Broker information listed.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

Beth Graham recommended having public comment in the beginning of the meeting and stated that fining licensees isn't problematic but the mark on their license is.

Tim Fennema agreed with Graham's comment and stated that licensees should be able to speak on their case.

Fennema stated that the licensee being the record keeper makes it difficult.

ANNOUNCEMENTS

The next regularly scheduled meeting will be held November 25, 2024, at 9:00 a.m. at the Ottawa Building, 611 West Ottawa Street, Upper-Level Conference Room 4, Lansing, Michigan.

ADJOURNMENT

MOTION by Wernette, seconded by Quayle, to adjourn the meeting at 10:12 a.m.

A voice vote was held.

MOTION PREVAILED

Minutes approved by the Board on November 25, 2024.

Prepared By:
Kimmy Catlin, Board Support
Bureau of Professional Licensing

September 19, 2024