

# Michigan Independent Citizens Redistricting Commission

Virtual Meeting via Zoom Webinar. Full agenda, presentations, and video recordings are available at [www.Michigan.gov/MICRC](http://www.Michigan.gov/MICRC)

**Wednesday, February 28, 2024  
9:00 a.m. – 3:44 p.m.**

## MINUTES

**PRESENT** Elaine Andrade (*remotely from Imlay City, MI*)  
Donna Callaghan (*remotely from Mexico*)  
Juanita Curry (*remotely from Detroit, MI*)  
Anthony Eid (*remotely from Detroit, MI*)  
Brittini Kellom (*remotely from Wayne Co, MI*)  
Rhonda Lange (*remotely from Osceola Co, MI*)  
Steven Terry Lett (*remotely from Lee Co, Florida*)  
Marcus Muldoon (*remotely from Carleton, MI*)  
Cynthia Orton (*remotely from Battle Creek, MI*)  
Rebecca Szetela (*remotely from Wayne Co, MI*)  
Janice Vallette (*remotely from Highland Twp, MI*)  
Erin Wagner (*remotely from Eaton Twp, MI*)  
Richard Weiss (*remotely from Saginaw Twp, MI*)

**ABSENT** Commissioners: None

**OTHERS PRESENT** Edward Woods III, Executive Director  
Michigan Department of State (“MDOS”) Staff  
Nate Fink, Fink Bressack  
John Morgan, EDS  
Mark Braden, VRA Legal Counsel  
Patrick Lewis, Litigation Counsel

### **CALL TO ORDER AND WELCOME**

Commissioner Orton, Chair, called the meeting of the Michigan Independent Citizens Redistricting Commission (MICRC) to order at 9:00 a.m.

### **ROLL CALL**

MDOS staff called roll. A quorum was met.

## **ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA**

**MOTION:** Approve the agenda. Moved by Commissioner Lett. Seconded by Commissioner Weiss. Commissioner Orton, Chair, held a vote by show of hands.  
**MOTION APPROVED.**

## **PUBLIC COMMENT PERTAINING TO AGENDA TOPICS**

Commissioner Vallette, Vice Chair, submitted a motion “to begin public comment pertaining to agenda topics portion of the agenda” forward without objection. **MOTION APPROVED.**

Four (4) individuals provided remote public comment:

1. James Gallant (spoke during initial public comment & second public comment)
2. Mona Mawari
3. Christian Grant
4. Robert Dindoffer (spoke during initial public comment & second public comment)

A complete inventory of live and written public comment is available at:  
[www.Michigan.gov/MICRC](http://www.Michigan.gov/MICRC).

**MOTION:** Commissioner Lange moved to initiate a second public comment for members of the public from this point forward. Seconded by Commissioner Szetela. Commissioner Orton, Chair, held a roll call vote. By a vote of **4-9**, **MOTION FAILS.**

<b><u>Commissioner</u></b>	<b><u>Vote</u></b>
<b>Elaine Andrade</b>	<b>No</b>
<b>Donna Callaghan</b>	<b>No</b>
<b>Juanita Curry</b>	<b>Yes</b>
<b>Anthony Eid</b>	<b>No</b>
<b>Brittni Kellom</b>	<b>No</b>
<b>Rhonda Lange</b>	<b>Yes</b>
<b>Steve Lett</b>	<b>No</b>
<b>Marcus Muldoon</b>	<b>No</b>
<b>Cynthia Orton</b>	<b>No</b>
<b>Rebecca Szetela</b>	<b>Yes</b>
<b>Janice Vallette</b>	<b>No</b>
<b>Erin Wagner</b>	<b>Yes</b>
<b>Richard Weiss</b>	<b>No</b>

**MOTION:** Commissioner Eid moved to add a second public comment just for today. Seconded by Commissioner Callaghan. Commissioner Orton, Chair, held a roll call vote. By a vote of **11-2**, **MOTION APPROVED.**

<u>Commissioner</u>	<u>Vote</u>
Elaine Andrade	Yes
Donna Callaghan	Yes
Juanita Curry	Yes
Anthony Eid	Yes
Brittni Kellom	Yes
Rhonda Lange	Yes
Steve Lett	No
Marcus Muldoon	Yes
Cynthia Orton	Yes
Rebecca Szetela	Yes
Janice Vallette	No
Erin Wagner	Yes
Richard Weiss	Yes

**MOTION:** Commissioner Szetela moved to accept the changes from today on the Motown Sound map (named Motown Sound E2) and to submit for VRA analysis. Seconded by Commissioner Weiss. Commissioner Orton, Chair, held a roll call vote. By a vote of **5-8**, **MOTION FAILS.**

<u>Commissioner</u>	<u>Vote</u>
Elaine Andrade	No
Donna Callaghan	No
Juanita Curry	No
Anthony Eid	No
Brittni Kellom	Yes
Rhonda Lange	Yes
Steve Lett	No
Marcus Muldoon	Yes

<b>Cynthia Orton</b>	<b>No</b>
<b>Rebecca Szetela</b>	<b>Yes</b>
<b>Janice Vallette</b>	<b>No</b>
<b>Erin Wagner</b>	<b>Yes</b>
<b>Richard Weiss</b>	<b>No</b>

**MOTION:** Commissioner Lange moved to end discussion on adopting the map changes to Motown Sound E2 Map and called the question. Seconded by Commissioner Wagner. Commissioner Orton, Chair, held a roll call vote. Unanimously approved. **MOTION APPROVED.**

<u><b>Commissioner</b></u>	<u><b>Vote</b></u>
<b>Elaine Andrade</b>	<b>Yes</b>
<b>Donna Callaghan</b>	<b>Yes</b>
<b>Juanita Curry</b>	<b>Yes</b>
<b>Anthony Eid</b>	<b>Yes</b>
<b>Brittini Kellom</b>	<b>Yes</b>
<b>Rhonda Lange</b>	<b>Yes</b>
<b>Steve Lett</b>	<b>Yes</b>
<b>Marcus Muldoon</b>	<b>Yes</b>
<b>Cynthia Orton</b>	<b>Yes</b>
<b>Rebecca Szetela</b>	<b>Yes</b>
<b>Janice Vallette</b>	<b>Yes</b>
<b>Erin Wagner</b>	<b>Yes</b>
<b>Richard Weiss</b>	<b>Yes</b>

**UNFINISHED BUSINESS**

**a. MAPPING DELIBERATIONS**

**MOTION:** Commissioner Szetela moved to vote on removing Bergamot, Bergamot 2, Water Lily, and Tulip maps. Seconded by Commissioner Kellom. **MOTION WITHDRAWN** by Commissioner Szetela.

**MOTION:** Commissioner Orton moved to disregard (remove) the Tulip Map from consideration. Seconded by Commissioner Weiss. Commissioner Orton, chair, held a roll call vote. By a vote of **13-0**, **MOTION APPROVED**.

<u>Commissioner</u>	<u>Vote</u>
Elaine Andrade	Yes
Donna Callaghan	Yes
Juanita Curry	Yes
Anthony Eid	Yes
Brittni Kellom	Yes
Rhonda Lange	Yes
Steve Lett	Yes
Marcus Muldoon	Yes
Cynthia Orton	Yes
Rebecca Szetela	Yes
Janice Vallette	Yes
Erin Wagner	Yes
Richard Weiss	Yes

**MOTION:** Commissioner Szetela moved to disregard (remove) the Daisy 2 Map from consideration. Seconded by Commissioner Lange. Commissioner Orton, Chair, held a roll call vote. By a vote of **9-4**, **MOTION APPROVED**.

<u>Commissioner</u>	<u>Vote</u>
Elaine Andrade	Yes
Donna Callaghan	Yes
Juanita Curry	Yes
Anthony Eid	No
Brittni Kellom	Yes
Rhonda Lange	Yes
Steve Lett	Yes
Marcus Muldoon	Yes
Cynthia Orton	No

<b>Rebecca Szetela</b>	<b>Yes</b>
<b>Janice Vallette</b>	<b>No</b>
<b>Erin Wagner</b>	<b>Yes</b>
<b>Richard Weiss</b>	<b>No</b>

Commissioner Orton, Chair, moved for the Commission to break for lunch and return at 2:00 p.m., without objection. MOTION APPROVED.

**ROLL CALL – Return from Lunch**

Commissioner Orton, Chair, asked the Michigan Department of State to please call the roll.

<u><b>Commissioner</b></u>	<u><b>Present/Absent</b></u>
<b>Elaine Andrade</b>	<b>Present</b>
<b>Donna Callaghan</b>	<b>Present</b>
<b>Juanita Curry</b>	<b>Present</b>
<b>Anthony Eid</b>	<b>Present</b>
<b>Brittini Kellom</b>	<b>Present</b>
<b>Rhonda Lange</b>	<b>Present</b>
<b>Steve Lett</b>	<b>Present</b>
<b>Marcus Muldoon</b>	<b>Present</b>
<b>Cynthia Orton</b>	<b>Present</b>
<b>Rebecca Szetela</b>	<b>Present</b>
<b>Janice Vallette</b>	<b>Present</b>
<b>Erin Wagner</b>	<b>Present</b>
<b>Richard Weiss</b>	<b>Present</b>

13 Commissioners present. A quorum was met.

**MOTION:** Commissioner Lett moved to vote for final selection of a final remedial State House plan map to move forward to the U.S. District Court for the Western District of Michigan in the *Agee* litigation. Seconded by Commissioner Weiss. Commissioner Orton, Chair, held a roll call vote.

By a vote of **9-4**, **MOTION FAILS**.

The political party affiliation vote breakdown is as follows:

- 4 Democratic votes for Motown Sound FC E1
- 1 Republican vote for Motown Sound FC E1
- 4 unaffiliated votes for Motown Sound FC E1
- 1 Republican vote for Water Lily
- 1 Republican vote for Willow
- 1 Republican vote for Szetela 4 map
- 1 unaffiliated vote for Szetela 4 map.

<u>Commissioner</u>	<u>Vote by Stating Name Of Map</u>
<b>Elaine Andrade (D)</b>	<b>Motown Sound FC E1</b>
<b>Donna Callaghan (D)</b>	<b>Motown Sound FC E1</b>
<b>Juanita Curry (D)</b>	<b>Motown Sound FC E1</b>
<b>Anthony Eid (U)</b>	<b>Motown Sound FC E1</b>
<b>Brittni Kellom (D)</b>	<b>Motown Sound FC E1</b>
<b>Rhonda Lange (R)</b>	<b>Water Lily</b>
<b>Steve Lett (U)</b>	<b>Motown Sound FC E1</b>
<b>Marcus Muldoon (R)</b>	<b>Motown Sound FC E1</b>
<b>Cynthia Orton (R)</b>	<b>Willow</b>
<b>Rebecca Szetela (U)</b>	<b>Szetela 4</b>
<b>Janice Vallette (U)</b>	<b>Motown Sound FC E1</b>
<b>Erin Wagner (R)</b>	<b>Szetela 4</b>
<b>Richard Weiss (U)</b>	<b>Motown Sound FC E1</b>

**MOTION:** Commissioner Lett moved to call for the 2nd vote on map selection by the Commission as a constitutional requirement was not met in Vote #1 to approve a plan. Seconded by Commissioner Weiss. Commissioner Orton, Chair, held a roll call vote. By a vote of **10-3**, the Motion Sound FC E1 moves forward to the U.S. District Court for the Western District of Michigan in the *Agee* litigation. **MOTION APPROVED.**

The political party affiliation vote breakdown is as follows:

- 4 Democratic votes for Motown Sound FC E1
- 2 Republican votes for Motown Sound FC E1
- 4 unaffiliated votes for Motown Sound FC E1
- 1 Republican vote for Water Lily

1 Republican vote for Szetela 4 map  
 1 unaffiliated vote for Szetela map.

<u>Commissioner</u>	<u>Vote by Stating Name Of Map</u>
<b>Elaine Andrade (D)</b>	<b>Motown Sound FC E1</b>
<b>Donna Callaghan (D)</b>	<b>Motown Sound FC E1</b>
<b>Juanita Curry (D)</b>	<b>Motown Sound FC E1</b>
<b>Anthony Eid (U)</b>	<b>Motown Sound FC E1</b>
<b>Brittini Kellom (D)</b>	<b>Motown Sound FC E1</b>
<b>Rhonda Lange (R)</b>	<b>Water Lily</b>
<b>Steve Lett (U)</b>	<b>Motown Sound FC E1</b>
<b>Marcus Muldoon (R)</b>	<b>Motown Sound FC E1</b>
<b>Cynthia Orton (R)</b>	<b>Motown Sound FC E1</b>
<b>Rebecca Szetela (U)</b>	<b>Szetela 4</b>
<b>Janice Vallette (U)</b>	<b>Motown Sound FC E1</b>
<b>Erin Wagner (R)</b>	<b>Szetela 4</b>
<b>Richard Weiss (U)</b>	<b>Motown Sound FC E1</b>

**REPORTS**

Executive Director Report. Executive Director Woods requested to change Kristen Taylor from contracted employee to part-time employee status, retroactive to February 19, 2024. Requested a motion and support from the Commission regarding same.

**MOTION:** Commissioner Lett moved to approve the employment status of Kristin Taylor from contracted employee to part-time employee status retroactive to February 19, 2024. Seconded by Commissioner Weiss. Commissioner Orton, Chair, held a roll call vote. By a vote of **12-1**, **MOTION APPROVED.**

<u>Commissioner</u>	<u>Vote</u>
<b>Elaine Andrade</b>	<b>Yes</b>
<b>Donna Callaghan</b>	<b>Yes</b>
<b>Juanita Curry</b>	<b>Yes</b>

<b>Anthony Eid</b>	<b>Yes</b>
<b>Brittini Kellom</b>	<b>Yes</b>
<b>Rhonda Lange</b>	<b>No</b>
<b>Steve Lett</b>	<b>Yes</b>
<b>Marcus Muldoon</b>	<b>Yes</b>
<b>Cynthia Orton</b>	<b>Yes</b>
<b>Rebecca Szetela</b>	<b>Yes</b>
<b>Janice Vallette</b>	<b>Yes</b>
<b>Erin Wagner</b>	<b>Yes</b>
<b>Richard Weiss</b>	<b>Yes</b>

Legal Liaison Report. Commissioner Lett asked Attorney Nate Fink to present information to the Commission regarding adopting a resolution for the Remedial State House plan. Nate Fink explained that the resolution would indicate that the plan the Commission adopted, will be in effect for the 2024 election cycle, assuming the Court approves it, and in subsequent years unless the Supreme Court or another Court vacates or otherwise reverses the District Court's injunction related to the Hickory plan.

**MOTION:** Commissioner Lett moved to suspend the 24-hour rule for Commission to receive documents in advance before voting on same, for this meeting only. Seconded by Commissioner Weiss. Commissioner Orton, Chair, held a vote by roll call. **10-3, MOTION APPROVED.**

<u>Commissioner</u>	<u>Vote</u>
<b>Elaine Andrade</b>	<b>Yes</b>
<b>Donna Callaghan</b>	<b>Yes</b>
<b>Juanita Curry</b>	<b>Yes</b>
<b>Anthony Eid</b>	<b>Yes</b>
<b>Brittini Kellom</b>	<b>Yes</b>
<b>Rhonda Lange</b>	<b>No</b>
<b>Steve Lett</b>	<b>Yes</b>
<b>Marcus Muldoon</b>	<b>Yes</b>
<b>Cynthia Orton</b>	<b>Yes</b>
<b>Rebecca Szetela</b>	<b>No</b>
<b>Janice Vallette</b>	<b>Yes</b>
<b>Erin Wagner</b>	<b>No</b>

**Richard Weiss**                      **Yes**

**MOTION:** Commissioner Lett moved to the adopt the proposed resolution related to the adoption of the remedial state house plan. Second by Commissioner Weiss. Commissioner Orton, Chair, held a vote by roll call. **9-4. MOTION APPROVED.**

<u><b>Commissioner</b></u>	<u><b>Vote</b></u>
<b>Elaine Andrade</b>	<b>Yes</b>
<b>Donna Callaghan</b>	<b>Yes</b>
<b>Juanita Curry</b>	<b>Yes</b>
<b>Anthony Eid</b>	<b>Yes</b>
<b>Brittini Kellom</b>	<b>No</b>
<b>Rhonda Lange</b>	<b>No</b>
<b>Steve Lett</b>	<b>Yes</b>
<b>Marcus Muldoon</b>	<b>Yes</b>
<b>Cynthia Orton</b>	<b>Yes</b>
<b>Rebecca Szetela</b>	<b>No</b>
<b>Janice Vallette</b>	<b>Yes</b>
<b>Erin Wagner</b>	<b>No</b>
<b>Richard Weiss</b>	<b>Yes</b>

MDOS Report. MDOS provided updates to the Commission.

**ADJOURNMENT**

**MOTION:** Commissioner Lett moved to Adjourn the Meeting. Seconded by Commissioner Weiss. Commissioner Orton, Chair, held a vote by show of hands. **MOTION UNANIMOUSLY APPROVED.**

The meeting was adjourned at 3:44 p.m.